

REPORT TO: EDUCATION COMMITTEE - 26 JANUARY 2009

REPORT ON: SCHOOL ESTATE IMPROVEMENTS IN THE LOCHEE AREA OF THE CITY

REPORT BY: DIRECTOR OF EDUCATION

REPORT NO: 68-2009

1.0 PURPOSE OF REPORT

1.1 The purpose of this report is to advise the Committee of a proposal to improve the school estate in the Lochee area of the City and thereby enhance the delivery of the Education Service as outlined in this report and to seek approval to consult on this proposal.

2.0 RECOMMENDATIONS

2.1 It is recommended that the Committee:

- i) note the content of this report
- ii) approve the proposal to build 2 x 1 stream primary schools with 4 additional classrooms on a shared site adjacent to the existing St Clement's Primary School building to replace Charleston Primary School, Lochee Primary School and St Clement's Primary School.
- iii) instruct the Director of Education to formally consult on the proposal contained in recommendation (ii) above in terms of the Education (Publication and Consultation etc) (Scotland) Regulations 1981 and to report back to Committee in due course on the outcome of the consultation so that a final decision on the proposal can be made.

3.0 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

3.1 The estimated cost of building 2 x 1 stream primary schools with 4 additional classrooms on a shared site with a child and family centre, nursery and full ancillary accommodation totalling approximately 4180m² is £9.42m based on a start date of Q1 2010 and a completion date during Q2 2011. This project can be funded from capital receipts (£4.12m) and prudential borrowing from revenue savings (£5.3m).

3.2 The revenue savings of £325,000 are detailed in Appendix 1 and will support the loan charges on the prudential borrowing outlined above in 3.1.

4.0 BACKGROUND

4.1. The effect of population decline continues to impact on primary schools in Dundee and rolls continue to fall. The Dundee Schools PPP Project and the proposed Whitfield regeneration programme go some way towards addressing this issue. There is, however, still scope for further rationalisation of primary schools within the City.

4.2 There is an identified need to address the falling rolls in the Lochee area where Lochee Primary School, Charleston Primary School and St Clement's Primary School are located. These schools are currently operating at 33%, 50% and 52% capacity respectively. In addition, two of these schools are nearly 50 years old and one is thirty-seven years old. Significant sums of money would require to be spent to keep them at a reasonable standard.

4.3 Current roll projections for the three primary schools in the proposal are detailed below.

	2008/ 2009	2009/ 2010	2010/ 2011	2011/ 2012
Lochee Primary School	92	87	89	90
Charleston Primary School	132	137	142	155
St Clement's Primary School	177	171	157	156
Total	401	395	388	401

4.4 There is the potential for new house build in the Lochee/Charleston area over the next seven years. This could see the school roll rising by 60 over this period. The proposed project could contain this increase.

4.5 In terms of travel distances from home to the location of the proposed new shared site schools, the Council's Geographical Information System (GIS) identifies that 91.26% of the total pupil population live within 0 – 1 miles. A further 6.17% live between 1 – 2 miles away. The remainder reside 3 – 6 miles distant and represent pupils who have made placing requests to attend these schools.

5.0 **OPTION APPRAISAL**

5.1 A detailed option appraisal has been undertaken before arriving at the recommendations included in this report. The options considered were:

Option 1

Do minimum to maintain all three primary schools to present standards.

Option 2

Build a new two stream primary school plus a one stream primary school with some shared facilities. Include a nursery and a child and family centre. The new schools to be built on a shared site on the site of Dryburgh Resource Centre.

Option 2a

As for option 2 above but on the site of St Clement's Primary School.

Option 3

Build two one stream primary schools with 4 additional classrooms with some shared facilities. Include a nursery and child and family centre. The new schools to be built on a shared site on the site of Dryburgh Resource Centre.

Option 3a

As for option 3 above but on the site of St Clement's Primary School.

Option 4

Refurbishment of three schools to increase the life of the buildings by approximately 25 years.

5.2 **Capital Costs of Each Option (at outturn prices)**

Option 1 £ 1,230,000

Option 2 £12,370,000

Option 2a	£12,370,000
Option 3	£ 9,420,000
Option 3a	£ 9,420,000
Option 4	£ 6,470,000

5.3 Annual Property Costs and Staff Costs of Each Option (at current prices)

	<i>Property</i>	<i>Staff</i>
Option 1	£215,000	£1,594,500
Option 2	£175,000	£1,337,220
Option 2a	£175,000	£1,337,220
Option 3	£150,000	£1,337,220
Option 3a	£150,000	£1,337,220
Option 4	£215,000	£1,594,500

5.4 Net Present Values

The net present values for each option over 25 years at a discount rate of 3.5% are as follows:-

Option 1	£34,850,790
Option 2	£33,642,900
Option 2a	£33,084,050
Option 3	£31,680,980
Option 3a	£31,012,860
Option 4	£38,223,470

5.5 The table below shows in summary how each option "scores against the non-monetary objectives for the project.

	Option 1	Option 2	Option 2a	Option 3	Option 3a	Option 4
1 Meets short term needs	√	√	√	√	√	√
2 Satisfies long term demand (capacities)	X	X	X	√	√	X
3 Satisfies long term demand (property)	X	√	√	√	√	X
4 Deliverable while schools operational	X	√	√	√	√	X

5.6 Conclusion

- 5.6.1 Options 1 and 4 produce the highest Net Present Value and only meet one of the non-monetary objectives. Overall they are not viable options.
- 5.6.2 Options 2 and 2a produce lower Net Present Values, but only meet three of the non-monetary objectives. Overall they are not the better options.
- 5.6.3 Options 3 and 3a both meet the non-monetary objectives. Option 3a the proposal described in this report, has the lowest Net Present Value and is therefore the preferred option.
- 5.6.4 The Revenue costs of the proposed new build option are detailed in Appendix 1.

6.0 PROPOSAL

- 6.1 It is proposed to build 2 x 1 stream primary schools with 4 additional classrooms with a child and family centre, nursery and full ancillary accommodation on a shared site adjacent to the existing St Clement's Primary School. The overall size of the St Clement's Primary School site is sufficient to allow for the construction of the new buildings to take place alongside a fully operational St Clement's Primary School. A site plan is attached as Appendix 2.
- 6.2 The new schools will offer purpose - built learning and teaching environments for the delivery of a "Curriculum for Excellence" and state of the art nursery facilities.

7.0 ACCOMMODATION SCHEDULES

- 7.1 The new shared site schools would each be designed to accommodate 1 stream of primary age pupils and between them the full range of facilities associated with nursery provision. Accommodation for the Child and Family Centre currently located within Charleston Primary School would also be provided. An overall accommodation schedule for the schools would include:

- 18 classrooms
- 70 place nursery and associated accommodation
- child and family centre facilities
- dining/assembly hall
- production kitchen
- assembly hall
- gym hall
- administration areas and associated accommodation
- drama/stage/music room
- staffrooms
- group rooms and break-out spaces
- storage

Detailed schedules of accommodation will be provided in due course.

8.0 PROPOSALS FOR SHARED ACCOMMODATION AREAS

- 8.1 Productive discussions are currently underway with a senior Church Representative to identify areas of accommodation that may be shared between the two schools as well as establishing those areas which are appropriately designated as "sole use".
- 8.2 Although these discussions are still on-going it is evident that resolutions can be arrived at within the overall 4180 m² footprint of the building.

9.0 DESIGN SOLUTION

- 9.1 Following the approval of finalised schedules of accommodation, early design solution proposals will incorporate well-defined adjacencies, creative use of circulation space and ideas for construction techniques which will ensure that the buildings are flexible and responsive to current and future teaching methodologies and space requirements for both schools.

10.0 EDUCATION SERVICE IMPROVEMENTS

10.1 The new shared site schools would enable the Education Department to:

- create flexible learning and teaching spaces which will enhance the delivery of a "Curriculum for Excellence"
- promote the integration of the arts into the curriculum
- provide future - proofed IT infrastructure for both curricular and management functions.
-

11.0 **POLICY IMPLICATIONS**

11.1 This report has been screened for any policy implications in respect of Sustainability, Strategic Environmental Assessment, Anti-Poverty, Equality Impact Assessment and Risk Assessment. There are no major issues.

12.0 **CONSULTATIONS**

12.1 The Chief Executive, Depute Chief Executive (Finance), Depute Chief Executive (Support Services) and Head of Finance have been consulted in the preparation of this report.

12.2 It will be necessary to carry out statutory consultation procedures in terms of the Education (Publication and Consultation etc) (Scotland) Regulations 1981 in respect of the proposal to merge Charleston Primary School and Lochee Primary School and change the site of the merged school. There is also a requirement to consult on the proposal to build a replacement school for St Clement's Primary School on the adjacent shared site.

12.3 The statutory consultation procedures apply to the parents/carers of every pupil in attendance at all three primary schools affected by the proposal, all staff, trade union representatives and Parent Councils where they are established.

12.4 The Right Reverend Bishop Vincent Logan will also be formally consulted in respect of this proposal.

13.0 **BACKGROUND PAPERS**

13.1 None.

SCHOOL ESTATES IMPROVEMENTS LOCHEE AREA**APPENDIX 1****OPTION 3A - TWO NEW ONE STREAM SCHOOLS ON ST CLEMENT'S PS SITE****REVENUE BUDGET 2008/09**

<u>Expenditure</u>	<u>Current Budgets</u>			<u>Total</u>	<u>New Builds</u>	<u>Movement</u>
	<u>Lochee</u>	<u>Charleston</u>	<u>St Clements</u>			
	<u>£</u>	<u>£</u>	<u>£</u>	<u>£</u>	<u>£</u>	<u>£</u>
Staff Costs	426,894	525,404	642,180	1,594,478	1,337,220	(257,258)
Property Costs :-						
Rates	20,000	15,000	20,000	55,000	40,000	(15,000)
Repairs	2,000	2,000	2,000	6,000	4,000	(2,000)
Cleaning Service	30,000	30,000	30,000	90,000	60,000	(30,000)
Water/Sewerage	7,000	6,000	6,000	19,000	12,000	(7,000)
Gas	7,000	7,000	11,000	25,000	17,000	(8,000)
Electricity	6,000	6,000	8,000	20,000	14,000	(6,000)
Supplies & Services	<u>9,000</u>	<u>13,000</u>	<u>14,000</u>	<u>36,000</u>	<u>36,000</u>	-
Income	<u>-</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>-</u>
Net Operating Expenditure	<u>507,894</u>	<u>604,404</u>	<u>733,180</u>	<u>1,845,478</u>	<u>1,520,220</u>	<u>(325,258)</u>



