

REPORT TO: POLICY AND RESOURCES COMMITTEE – 23 FEBRUARY 2023
REPORT ON: SISTEMA SCOTLAND – BIG NOISE DOUGLAS PROGRAMME
REPORT BY: EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF CHILDREN AND FAMILIES SERVICE
REPORT NO: 77-2023

1.0 PURPOSE OF REPORT

1.1 The purpose of this report is to inform committee of the recurring funding being sought for the Big Noise Douglas (BND) programme from 2023-24 to 2025-2026.

2.0 RECOMMENDATIONS

2.1 It is recommended that the Policy and Resources Committee note the contents of this report and agrees that no recurring financial support is provided by Dundee City Council to the Big Noise Douglas programme after the end of academic year 2022/23.

3.0 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

3.1 The overall programme cost for the Big Noise Douglas (BND) programme for 2022/23 is £817,837.

3.2 The overall projected costs to run Big Noise Douglas over the next three financial years total £2,742,252:

- 2023/24 - £882,232
- 2024/25 - £912,012
- 2025/26 - £948,008

3.3 Dundee City Council committed £350,000 to BND for session 2021/22 and £623,353 for session 2022-23. This funding was provided by one-off monies.

3.4 Dundee City Council is expected to directly commit £900,000 over the next three financial years (£300,000 per year) towards the overall costs of BND, as detailed in paragraph 3.2.

3.5 The Big Noise Douglas – Progress Update report agreed at the Children and Families Services Committee on 5 September 2022 notes that there is no recurring provision for the project in the Council's Revenue Estimates (article IV of the minute of the Children and Families Services Committee and report no. 228-2022 refers).

4.0 MAIN TEXT

4.1 Big Noise Douglas (BND) is Sistema Scotland's fourth programme. It was launched in September 2017 and works with children from the Douglas community of Dundee, most of whom attend two local primary schools – St Pius X RC Primary and Claypotts Castle Primary. The programme began by working with children in P1-3 at both schools – approximately 270 children - and expanded this number to include another 150 children attending the nurseries at both schools. The after-school programme began in April 2018 with 52 P3 children out of a possible 87 (60%) from both primary schools. Baby Noise also began around the same time. BND is delivered by Sistema Scotland in partnership with Optimistic Sound and Dundee City Council, and with the support of a range of trusts, foundations, and individuals.

4.2 The BND Programme forms part of a range of work across the expressive arts that support young people's learning and development. This includes the Instrumental Music Service, as well as other projects with specific partners such as the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland, Drake Music Scotland, and the Benedetti Foundation. All these programmes are working together through the expressive arts medium to improve outcomes for children and young people. The organisation of these various projects is co-ordinated to ensure that learning and good practice is shared across the projects and subsequently with all the schools in the city to maximise the benefits of all programmes.

- 4.3 The overall programme cost for BND for 2022/23 is £817,837. Big Noise Douglas has a staff of 27 (16.3 FTE) including a Team Leader. During 2021/22 Big Noise Douglas reports that it has worked regularly with over 550 of our children and young people.
- 4.4 As stated in paragraph 4.2 the BND programme forms part of a range of work across the expressive arts that support young people's learning and developing; much of this is led by the Council's Instrumental Music Service (IMS).
- 4.4.1 The Instrumental Music Service in Dundee is an inclusive, modern, forward thinking music service providing instrumental lessons to as many school pupils from Primary 1 to S6 as possible across all school settings in Dundee including primary schools, secondary schools, special education at Kingspark School, and Offsite Education Service.
- 4.4.2 The total cost of the IMS for the academic session 22/ 23 is £999,300. External funding is received to support the delivery of specific workstreams such as Creative Scotland Youth Music Initiative programmes. Dundee City Council abolished all instrumental tuition fees in 2013/14 and instrumental hire costs in 2017/18. The IMS has a staff of 29 music instructors (22.2FTE) including a Senior Instructor. Currently the IMS works with approximately 4000 children from across the primary, secondary and special sectors. This equates to 18.3% of the children in schools currently receiving a musical input from the Instrumental Music Service. The national average across the country of pupils participating in instrumental music service activities is 9.9%.
- 4.4.3 The service is delivered in schools by professional instrumental music teachers who provide a structured and progressive music curriculum which is encapsulated in the 4 capacities of Curriculum for Excellence to enable each child or young person to be a successful learner, a confident individual, a responsible citizen, and an effective contributor.
- 4.4.4 Weekly lessons are delivered across 7 disciplines including brass, guitar, piano, strings, woodwind, bagpipes, and pipe band drumming. Lessons are delivered in either individual or small groups. There is also a comprehensive offer of extra-curricular activities both at school level, and within the IMS' Central Bands and Orchestras programme.
- 4.4.5 Instrumental staff have unique relationships with the children they teach, as it often spans across many years of a child's education which helps to ensure that the service Gets it Right for Every Child. The Instrumental Music Service is specifically designed along cluster lines to ensure that pupils have the best possible chance of achieving success. In consultation with schools, the Service alters the curriculum should the need arise.
- 4.4.6 The service closely monitors the impact of IMS on outcomes for young people. For example: instrumental pupils receiving weekly lessons from the IMS continue to attain high marks in SQA exams. In the 2022 SQA exam diet the service had 169 pupils undertaking performance exams with a pass rate of 100%. Further details can be found in committee report 29-2023, which was agreed at the Children and Families Services Committee on 23 January 2023 (article VII of the minute of the Children and Families Services Committee and report no. 228-2022 refers).
- 4.4.7 As part of the Children and Families Service 'Every Dundee Learner Matters (EDLM)' improvement strategy, the IMS has embarked upon further partnerships with world renowned organisations to broaden the offer of activities to the children instructors work with in all our schools and to increase the skillset of our instrumental instructors to ensure that this work can continue. This includes, for example: Dundee Schools Music Theatre; Drake Music Scotland, Digital Orchestra; and the National Youth Choir of Scotland.
- 4.4.8 There is no Strings provision from the IMS at Claypotts Castle PS or St Pius RC PS due to an agreement reached in June 2022 with BND. It was agreed to remove the IMS Strings Instructor to allow BND to be the sole provider of Strings tuition in the schools. The IMS currently offer only piano instruction in St Pius RC PS where there are 4 pupils learning to play. The IMS currently operates two P6 Wind Band classes at Claypotts Castle, with 53 children learning to play an instrument. The IMS operates an inclusive approach to learning an instrument using the Band Class method where everyone learns to read music (Treble Clef) using either a Trombone or Clarinet. Choice of instrument is dependent on which suits

the child better. The IMS teamwork with 3 deaf children in collaboration the with the Council's Accessibility and Inclusion Service (AIS) to ensure that the children's educational needs are met. At the end of each year, the pupils from the P6 wind band classes have the option to continue their learning by opting in to mainstream instrumental tuition. Instrumental tuition takes place in smaller groups.

4.4.9 The IMS works in each of the three secondary schools (Craigie, Grove and St Paul's RC) where all young people who were involved in Big Noise Douglas in P7 now attend S1. The IMS works with almost 400 young people across these three schools and the following disciplines: bagpipes, brass, guitar, percussion, piano, pipe band drumming (Grove and St Paul's RC only), strings and woodwind.

5.0 PARTNERSHIP AGREEMENT

5.1 Big Noise Douglas (BND) is a partnership between Sistema Scotland, Optimistic Sound and Dundee City Council. The partnership agreement stipulates that the agreement shall commence on the last day of signature (i.e., 28 October 2016) and shall continue until 30 June 2021.

5.2 The partnership agreement states that there will be a set of key messages created by the BND communication partnership, which could include:

- Big Noise aims to support children to fulfil their potential across all areas of their lives. It is not a music project; it is a social transformation programme that uses music.
- The programme will bring substantial benefits to the children involved, their parents/guardians/ families and their schools, to the wider Douglas community and to the city as a whole.

5.3 The partnership agreement states that, from the outset, Sistema Scotland has recognised the vital importance of demonstrating the outcomes being delivered for the children and the broader community through the BND programme.

5.4 Individual responsibilities of each partner are outlined in the partnership agreement.

5.4.1 Responsibilities for Optimistic Sound include:

- to devise and implement an appropriate fundraising strategy in order to meet its commitment to fund 75% of the BND programme costs.
- to work collectively with Sistema Scotland to ensure full funding for the BND programme.

5.4.2 Responsibilities for Sistema Scotland include:

- manage all aspects of the BND centre and the delivery of the programme.
- to manage the BND budget, ensuring that the programme is delivered efficiently and effectively, consistent with a high-quality, outcomes-focused programme.

5.4.3 Responsibilities for Dundee City Council include:

- Support Optimistic Sound and Sistema Scotland to identify and secure funding for the full BND programme costs (and the associated share of Sistema Scotland core costs) from local and national sources for the five-year term of this partnership agreement).
- Acknowledge the expectation that, subject to the programme delivering the desired outcomes, the Council shall from 2021/22 take on from Optimistic Sound the majority funding obligation for BND programme costs as part of its mainstream budgeting process.

5.5 The partnership agreement states that an evaluation agreement shall be agreed between the partners to monitor the progress of the BND programme against the aims and aspirations of the initiative.

6.0 EVALUATION OF BIG NOISE DOUGLAS

- 6.1 The University of Dundee undertook an evaluation of Big Noise Douglas (BND), which was published in 2021. The Evaluation was led by Professor Divya Jindal-Snape in the School of Education and Social Work at The University of Dundee.
- 6.2 This evaluation focused on BND from 2017 to 2020; it included the in-school (P1-3) and after-school (P3-6) programmes as well as Baby Noise.
- 6.3 The evaluation investigated the impact of Big Noise Douglas (BND) on children, parents, and the community. To do this, data were collected from multiple sources (children, parents, school professionals and BND staff) and multiple data collection methods were used (observations, visual methods, interviews, focus groups and online questionnaires). Data collection was undertaken between October 2020 and February 2021, a period of significant COVID restrictions. This meant that feedback was about both the period before and during adapted COVID delivery.
- 6.4 All children in primary 1-3 in St Pius RC an Claypotts Castle receive the in-school BND programme; this involved around 250 children at the time of the evaluation. However, enrolment in the P4-P6 after-school programme is optional. 92 children were enrolled in the after-school programme at the time of the evaluation. This equates to 37% of children in primary 4-6 at the time who could have attended. 33% of children attended at least once in the three years prior to October 2020 but no longer attended. 30% of children chose not to attend the after-school programme at all.
- 6.5 Overall, the evaluation highlights that BND is having positive impacts. However, the evaluation report recognises that the views of what proportion of children have been impacted differs within and between stakeholder groups. It is recognised that the evaluation was ambitious in seeking views about all impact pathways and indicators, when certain groups may have been unable to comment on them. The report also recognises that this might be reflected in a large number of participants, especially school professionals, choosing 'don't know' in response to several impact pathways and the component impact indicators.
- 6.6 'Chapter 4: Discussion and Conclusions' in the evaluation report highlights some of the impact of BND:
- **Impact of BND: Baby Noise:** The impact of Baby Noise was observed on three parents and four babies/ toddlers. It was reported that sessions were delivered online, so the data need to be considered with caution.
 - **Impact of BND: Children's perspectives:** A small number indicated that they did not like being at BND. Overall, most children were positive about BND and indicated that they were happy and enjoyed their engagement with BND.
 - **Impact of BND: In-school (P1-P3) and after-school (P3-6) provision:**
 - a. Several participants noted for either all, most or some children in relation to determination, communication skills, motivation, listening skills, concentration in class, understanding skills, and oral skills. However, there is less evidence of BND's impact on their numerical, reading and writing skills.
 - b. Parents noted improvements in several aspects of their child including social skills and self-confidence. Fewer school professionals noticed changes.
 - c. In terms of 'encouraging healthy behaviours' it was reported that there seems to be less certainty among two thirds of the school professionals but more certainty from parents and BND staff that the programme was developing healthy behaviours.
 - **Impact of BND on parental involvement:** The impact of their children participating in BND was noticed on parents' involvement in their child's schooling and development to a degree. However, not all school professionals reported a change in involvement.
 - **BND and the community:** There were mixed views about the community's awareness of BND, with half of the school professionals indicating that they were moderately aware and more BND staff indicating higher awareness.
- 6.7 The evaluation also included several strategic and operational recommendations.
- 6.7.1 Strategic recommendations included:

- More steps need to be taken to raise the communities' awareness of BND, beyond the immediate primary school community.
- To ensure robust measurement of changes and impact in future evaluations, it is important to establish a baseline for core indicators of impact.
- A longitudinal, ongoing evaluation is required to be able to see impact over time.

6.7.2 Operational recommendations included:

- Clearer links should be made between the curriculum and the BND.
- Effective communication and feedback loops are required between children, parents, school professionals, and BND staff about children's progress across school, home, community, and BND programme. This might provide more insights into the impacts and any need for (or impact of) differentiated learning provision.
- Training should be provided to BND staff as relevant, to improve their understanding of the additional support needs of children.

6.8 A Big Noise Douglas Local Evaluation Group has been re-established in academic session 2022/ 23. It is still currently agreeing a local evaluation and monitoring framework.

6.9 Big Noise has a generic evaluation and monitoring framework used to guide local evaluations. It is recognised that evidence to answer the question '*does Big Noise improve children and young people's engagement with learning and education, their life skills and their social skills and networks*' should include an analysis of curriculum for excellence levels, as well as attendance and exclusions.

6.10 As the University of Dundee evaluation found, no baseline data has been collected nor has a baseline for core indicators of impact been established, making it challenging to reach firm conclusions about impact at this stage. Officers have however reviewed available data, comparing the two primary schools involved in BND to schools with a similar demographic profile, as well as comparing patterns of progress and impact pre and post introduction of BND. It is not possible to draw any firm conclusions about the impact of BND from examining this quantitative data. As no baseline data or core indicators of impact have been established it is not possible to attribute any positive impact on improving attainment, attendance and exclusion rates to BND alone given other targeted interventions in place in either or both primary schools involved in BND.

7.0 CONCLUSION

7.1 The Council's Instrumental Music Service (IMS) already has a presence in the schools involved in the Big Noise Douglas (BND) programme. Whilst the IMS has a reduced presence in the two primary schools involved, this is only due to an agreement with BND given their involvement in these two schools. However, the IMS responds to the needs of each school across the city at any given time.

7.2 It is recognised that the BND programme is having an impact on some outcomes for some young people and several families. This is particularly evident in relation to softer, albeit important, skills such as confidence. However, there is currently limited empirical evidence to conclude that the BND programme has delivered significantly improved outcomes for children in relation to attainment and attendance after five years of this targeted intervention. Considering this, alongside the reach, impact, and flexibility of the Council's Instrumental Music Service (IMS), it is recommended the Committee agrees that no recurring financial support is provided by Dundee City Council to the Big Noise Douglas programme after the end of academic year 2022/23.

8.0 POLICY IMPLICATIONS

8.1 This report has been subject to an Integrated Impact Assessment to identify impacts on Equality & Diversity, Fairness & Poverty, Environment and Corporate Risk. An impact, positive or negative, on one or more of these issues was identified. An appropriate senior manager has checked and agreed with this assessment. A copy of the Integrated Impact Assessment showing the impacts and accompanying benefits of / mitigating factors for them is included as an Appendix to this report.

9.0 CONSULTATIONS

The Council Leadership Team, Children and Families Service Senior Leadership Team and the Head Teachers of St Pius RC and Claypotts Castle primary schools were consulted in the preparation of this report.

10.0 BACKGROUND PAPERS

10.1 University of Dundee – Sistema Scotland: Evaluation of Big Noise Douglas

Audrey May
Executive Director of Children and Families Service

Paul Fleming
Chief Education Officer

February 2023

Integrated Impact Assessment

Committee Report Number: 77-2023

Document Title: Big Noise Douglas

Document Type:

Service Description:

The purpose of this report is to inform committee of the recurring funding being sought for the Big Noise Douglas (BND) programme from 2023-24 to 2025-2026.

Intended Outcome:

It is recommended that Committee note the contents of this report and agrees that no recurring financial support is provided by Dundee City Council to the Big Noise Douglas programme after the end of academic year 2022/23. Period Covered: 30/06/2023 to 26/06/2026 Monitoring:

Education Manager will work closely with the schools involved to ensure mitigations are in place and to monitor the impact of the supports put in place. Chief Education Officer will monitor impact of proposal.

Lead Author:

Paul Fleming, Head of Service - Education, Learning & Inclusion , Children and Families Service,
paul.fleming@dundee.gov.uk , 01382433246,
5 East City Square

Director Responsible:

Audrey May, Executive Director Children and Families Service , Children and Families Service
audrey.may@dundee.gov.uk, 01382 433071
5, East City Square

Equality, Diversity and Human Rights

Impacts & Implications

Age: Negative

Young people will continue to be offered opportunities to experience different musical instruments and/or to continue to learn the musical instrument they are learning through Big Noise Douglas.

Whilst the young people will continue to be given the choice to continue playing the instrument of their choice, with the Instrumental Music Service (IMS) ensuring access to qualified music instructors, there is likely to be a negative impact initially for some children as they transition to different instructors. This will be considered as part of the transition to minimise any disruption. Furthermore, Head Teachers who know all children well will also consider what other support children may require, and ensure plans are in place.

Disability: Negative

Big Noise Douglas support some deaf young people.

The Instrumental Music Service (IMS) already works with deaf young people in the same school. IMS also works closely with the Accessibility and Inclusion Service (AIS) to support young people with many additional support needs in the schools involved in the Big Noise Douglas (BND) programme.

The IMS works with AIS to ensure that they are equipped to support all young people as needs arise; this would continue.

Gender Reassignment: No Impact

Marriage & Civil Partnership: No Impact

Pregency & Maternity: No Impact

Race / Ethnicity: No Impact

Religion or Belief: No Impact

Sex: No Impact

Sexual Orientation: No Impact

Are any Human Rights not covered by the Equalities questions above impacted by this report?

No

Fairness & Poverty

Geographic Impacts & Implications

Strathmartine:	No Impact
Lochee:	No Impact
Coldside:	No Impact
Maryfield:	No Impact
North East:	No Impact
East End:	Negative
The Ferry:	No Impact
West End:	No Impact

Negative Implications & Mitigations (East End / MidCraigie)

This is a dedicated resource for the Douglas community, and two primary schools in particular. Should Committee agree that no recurring financial support is provided by Dundee City Council to the Big Noise Douglas programme after the end of academic year 2022/23, the Instrumental Music Service (IMS) will enhance support in each of the schools involved and ensure that all young people transition to an IMS qualified musical instructor.

BND also works with a number of families in the Douglas community. Both primary schools involved have School and Family Development Workers who would be able to ensure that any the families had any additional support required. There may be an impact during any transition, but as the schools know all families well this will help minimise the impact. The Head Teachers would monitor this closely.

Household Group Impacts and Implications

Looked After Children & Care Leavers: No Impact

Carers: No Impact

Lone Parent Families: No Impact

Single Female Households with Children: No Impact

Greater number of children and/or young children: No Impact

Pensioners - single / couple: No Impact

Unskilled workers or unemployed: No Impact

Serious & enduring mental health problems: No Impact

Homeless: No Impact

Drug and/or alcohol problems: No Impact

Offenders & Ex-offenders: No Impact

Socio Economic Disadvantage Impacts & Implications

Employment Status: No Impact

Education & Skills: Not Known

The IMS would increase its involvement and support to the primary schools involved in BND. The IMS already works in all the secondary schools that these young people transition into, and is currently working with all S1s who were part of BND in their primary school, and who wish to continue with music provision. The IMS working with young people from primary into secondary “ in partnership with others, including School and Family Development Workers and AIS “ could in fact strengthen the skills development pathway.

Income: No Impact

Caring Responsibilities (including Childcare): Not Known

IMS always offer the opportunities to have “sharing the learning” events in each school to which parents and carers are invited. All family members were welcome, including young children.

Affordability and accessibility of services: Not Known

Socio Economic Disadvantage Impacts & Implications

The IMS will ensure that young people continue to have access to qualified instrumentalists across a range of disciplines.

Dundee City Council abolished all instrumental tuition fees in 2013/14 and instrumental hire costs in 2017/18.

There is no cost to young people or families.

Fuel Poverty: Not Known

IMS will provide support directly to the young people in each school involved.

Cost of Living / Poverty Premium: Not Known

The IMS will ensure that young people continue to have access to qualified music instructors across a range of disciplines.

Dundee City Council abolished all instrumental tuition fees in 2013/14 and instrumental hire costs in 2017/18. There is no cost to young people or families.

Connectivity / Internet Access: No Impact

Income / Benefit Advice / Income Maximisation: No Impact

Employment Opportunities: No Impact

Education: Not Known

As the report outlines the IMS closely monitors the impact of its programmes and interventions, supporting young people to achieve positive outcomes. The IMS would enhance its support to the schools involved in BND. Enhancing IMS involvement in the primary schools would enhance relationships and support transition into secondary schools.

Health: Not Known

The Instrumental Music Service works with young people in all schools involved, but would enhance support as required. The IMS has strong partnerships with personnel in the schools (e.g. School and Family Development Workers) and across the Council (e.g. Accessibility and Inclusion Service) to help ensure a holistic approach to the promotion of health and wellbeing.

Life Expectancy: No Impact

Mental Health: Not Known

The Instrumental Music Service works with young people in all schools involved, but would enhance support as required. The IMS has strong partnerships with personnel in the schools (e.g. School and Family Development Workers) and across the Council (e.g. Accessibility and Inclusion Service) to help ensure a holistic approach to the promotion of health and wellbeing.

Overweight / Obesity: No Impact

Child Health: Not Known

Head Teachers know their children well, and will ensure access to any support that a young person requires.

Neighbourhood Satisfaction: Negative

Big Noise Douglas tutors will have built positive relationships with number of individual parents and families. These people will likely not be satisfied "initially at least" but may appreciate the mitigations put in place to ensure young people are not negatively impacted.

Transport: No Impact

Environment

Climate Change Impacts

Mitigating Greenhouse Gases: No Impact

Adapting to the effects of climate change: No Impact

Resource Use Impacts

Energy efficiency & consumption: No Impact

Prevention, reduction, re-use, recovery or recycling of waste: No Impact

Sustainable Procurement: No Impact

Transport Impacts

Accessible transport provision: No Impact

Sustainable modes of transport: No Impact

Natural Environment Impacts

Air, land & water quality: No Impact

Biodiversity: No Impact

Open & green spaces: No Impact

Built Environment Impacts

Built Heritage: No Impact

Housing: No Impact

Is the proposal subject to a Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA)?

No further action is required as it does not qualify as a Plan, Programme or Strategy as defined by the Environment Assessment (Scotland) Act 2005.

Corporate Risk

Corporate Risk Impacts

Political Reputational Risk: Not Known

With any proposed funding changes that could result in the discontinuation of a service, there are always risks relating to negativity in the press and/or on social media. Given the current political and financial climate however, the general public are aware that difficult decisions do need to be taken with regards to prioritisation of budgets. To mitigate the impacts, it should be highlighted that the IMS provision will target those young people current involved the BND project to allow them to continue with free music tuition, ensuring a smooth pathway from primary into secondary school.

Economic/Financial Sustainability / Security & Equipment: No Impact

Social Impact / Safety of Staff & Clients: No Impact

Technological / Business or Service Interruption: No Impact

Environmental: No Impact

Legal / Statutory Obligations: No Impact

Organisational / Staffing & Competence: No Impact

Corporate Risk Implications & Mitigation:

The risk implications associated with the subject matter of this report are "business as normal" risks and any increase to the level of risk to the Council is minimal. This is due either to the risk being inherently low or as a result of the risk being transferred in full or in part to another party on a fair and equitable basis. The subject matter is routine and has happened many times before without significant impact.