REPORT TO: POLICY AND RESOURCES COMMITTEE - 23 APRIL 2018

REPORT ON: LOCAL GOVERNMENT BENCHMARKING FRAMEWORK PERFORMANCE INDICATORS 2016-2017

REPORT BY: CHIEF EXECUTIVE

**REPORT NO: 65-2018** 

#### 1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

1.1 This report is to advise elected members of the performance of Dundee City Council including functions delegated to the Integration Joint Board for the financial year 2016-2017, as defined by the performance indicators compiled by the Improvement Service for the Local Government Benchmark Framework and, in particular, in relation to the other peer local authorities in our Family Group which have similar characteristics such as urban density and deprivation.

#### 2. **RECOMMENDATIONS**

It is recommended that members:-

- (i) note the results contained in this report.
- (ii) remit the report to the Scrutiny Committee for further consideration.
- (iii) remit the Council Management Team to continue to seek improvement to the indicators contained in this report.
- (iv) publish this Local Government Benchmarking Framework report on the Council's website.

#### 3. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

None.

#### 4. BACKGROUND

- 4.1 The Improvement Service has recently published the Local Government Benchmarking Framework (LGBF) performance data for all 32 local authorities in Scotland. This is now in its sixth year and provides valuable trend based insights as well as robust comparisons.
- 4.2 Each authority is allocated a Family Group of similar authorities based on factors such as deprivation and urban density in order that each authority could compare its performance to similar authorities and seek performance improvement where appropriate.
- 4.3 This report analyses Dundee's performance compared to its Family Group under the categories within the LGBF. Selected performance highlights are noted together with areas for performance improvement.

#### 5. RATIONALE

5.1 The Council Plan 2017 – 2022 includes a target of finishing in the top half of performances of its peer authorities also known as Family Group for 55% of the Local Government Benchmarking Framework indicators. In 2016/2017, the Council obtained an overall performance rate of 47% which is comparable with previous performances. Overall breakdown by service is:-

Service	Top Half	Total Measures	%
Children and Families	5	27	18.5%
Social Care	4	6	66.6%
Housing	1	5	20%
Environment	6	9	66.6%
City Development	11	12	91.6%
Culture and Leisure	5	8	62.5%
Corporate Services	3	8	37.5%
TOTAL	<u>35</u>	<u>75</u>	<u>47%</u>

- 5.2 It should be noted for Housing indicators that a top two finish is required as opposed to top four as only five local authorities in our Family Group report performance levels to the Improvement Service.
- 5.3 The overall aim of a benchmarking process is continuous improvement. Another benchmark the Council uses to measure performance is the five year performance trend. This reveals that over the five year period to March 2017, the Council has maintained or significantly improved performance for 83% of the Local Government Benchmarking Framework indicators. This is highlighted in the attached appendix by a green indicator where the change is greater than a 5% improvement and a red indicator where the performance has worsened by more than 5%. This breaks down by service as follows:-

Service	Improved Measures	Total Measures	%
Children and Families	20	27	74%
Social Care	5	6	83%
Housing	4	5	80%
Environment	7	9	77.7%
City Development	12	12	100%
Culture and Leisure	7	8	87.5%
Corporate Services	7	8	87.5%
TOTAL	<u>62</u>	<u>75</u>	<u>83%</u>

5.4 A further benchmark which the Council regularly uses is that of how Dundee performs in relation to the other main cities of Aberdeen, Edinburgh and Glasgow as regards top performance finishes (ranked 1 out of four):-

	Rank 1	Total Measures	%
Dundee	21	75	28%
Edinburgh	30	75	40%
Aberdeen	11	75	15%
Glasgow	13	75	17%

5.5 Dundee performs well compared to the other cities and it should be noted that Aberdeen and Edinburgh are not in the same family group as Dundee for Social Care, Children and Families and Housing where deprivation factors are a significant influence.

#### 6. COMPARATIVE PERFORMANCE REVIEW

6.1 For Children and Families Services, 5 out of 27 of the performance indicators were better than the Family Group average. It is noted that both cost per primary school pupil and cost per pre-school registration are ranked highly. Of existing attainment indicators, all but one improved performance levels since the 2012 baseline. Significant new indicators have been added to this section covering early year's development, child protection, exclusions and school attendance.

- 6.2 The Adult Social Care functions within the National Benchmarking Framework are delegated to the Integrated Joint Board and data from the framework forms part of the evidence to show the extent to which the integration of Health and Care can improve services. Out of 6 indicators, only one was behind the Council's Family Group average.
- 6.3 The Housing Service profile will show, based on current performance, that all Council dwellings meet the Scottish Household Quality Standard joining the percentage of dwellings that are rated as energy efficient in the standard used by the Benchmarking Framework. The report has highlighted the improvement the percentage of dwellings that are energy efficient.
- 6.4 Neighbourhood Services continues to review and improve services based on comparative benchmark performance. The section of the report on the Environment shows 7 out of the 9 indicators in Dundee are better than the Family Group average. This includes high levels of customer satisfaction and by comparison a more efficient net cost of waste collection per premise.
- 6.5 11 out of the 12 indicators concerned with City Development and Property Assets are ahead of the group average. Two of these concern the quality of the Council's buildings. One of the other indicators concerns employability and the Council will be aware a review has been undertaken on how to improve the percentage of unemployed people assisted through the employability programme. Planning application performance data has recently been included as have the Procurement and Business Gateway indicators.
- 6.6 The Cultural and Leisure Services section of the report shows 5 out of 8 of the benchmark performance indicators are better than the Family Group average. An area for improvement the Council will be aware of is the review undertaken to address the cost of parks and open spaces per population.
- 6.7 The Corporate Services section of the report shows that 3 of the indicators of the 8 collected are better than the Family Group average. Significant improvements will be sought for sickness absence and Council Tax indicators.

#### 7. SELECTED HIGHLIGHTS

The following are particular areas where we are performing better than our peer Councils:-

- (i) cost per pre-school registration place (page 10)
- (ii) % children reaching positive destinations (page 10)
- (iii) older person's homecare costs per hour (page 13)
- (iv) % of dwellings that are energy efficient (page 15)
- (v) net cost and % of adults that are satisfied with street cleaning. (pages 17 and 18)
- (vi) % of unemployed assisted into work (page 21)
- (vii) cost of parks and open spaces (page 22)
- (viii) % of invoices pad in 30 days (page 25)

#### 8. SELECTED AREAS FOR IMPROVEMENT

The following are particular areas where actions to evaluate and improve performance should be prioritised and the report at the following pages includes a section - 'what the council is doing to improve':-

- (i) school attainment (page 11)
- (ii) cost of Looked after children (page 11)
- (iii) Self-Directed Support Payments (page 14)
- (iv) average time taken to complete non-emergency repairs (page 16)
- (v) % total household waste arising that is recycled (page 18)
- (vi) Floor space of operational buildings in a satisfactory condition (page 21)
- (vii) Cost per museum visit (page 23)
- (viii) sickness absence (pages 25 and 26)
- (ix) cost per dwelling of collecting Council Tax and % income in year (page 27)

#### 9. POLICY IMPLICATIONS

This report has been subject to an assessment of any impacts on Equality and Diversity, Fairness and Poverty, Environment and Corporate Risk. A copy of the Impact Assessment is available on the Council's website at <a href="http://www.dundeecity.gov.uk/iia">www.dundeecity.gov.uk/iia</a>.

#### 10. CONSULTATIONS

The Council Management Team were consulted in the preparation of this report.

#### 11. BACKGROUND PAPERS

Improvement Service Performance Indicator Metadata.

David R Martin Chief Executive 7 February 2018

**APPENDIX 1** 



# **DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL**

## LOCAL GOVERNMENT BENCHMARKING FRAMEWORK PUBLIC PERFORMANCE REPORT 2016-2017

#### **CONTENTS**

1	Children and Families Services	8
2	Social Care	12
3	Neighbourhood Services	15
4	Environmental Services	16
5	City Development and Corporate Assets	19
6	Cultural and Leisure Services	21
7	Corporate Services	23

#### NB SCOTTISH HOUSEHOLD SURVEY DATA

Within this report there are a number of performance indicators which make use of the above survey as raw data. It is well known that this survey is based on small samples and therefore the percentages calculated are not regarded as reliable. Local surveys consistently return higher satisfaction levels than the ones in this report.



#### Benchmarking & Public Performance Reporting

#### THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT BENCHMARKING FRAMEWORK

The Local Government Benchmarking Framework has been developed with representatives from SOLACE, the Improvement Service, COSLA and Scotland's 32 local authorities. It is a new approach to comparing performance and outcomes and involves a new set of performance indicators. The indicators include performance information, customer satisfaction results and unit cost information for key service areas. This is the fifth year of published data for the framework covering the seven financial years up to 31 March 2017.

Dundee City Council has worked closely with SOLACE and the Improvement Service on the development of this project, and this approach to benchmarking will help us deliver better services more efficiently and improve outcomes for communities and individuals.

The framework has already helped us to work more closely with other Councils, to gain a more rounded picture of how we are performing nationally and to learn from others. We will be using this information to identify where we can improve service delivery.

#### NATIONAL DATA SET

All data relating to Dundee City Council and all Councils in Scotland is available here:-

http://www.improvementservice.org.uk/benchmarking/

#### DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL'S PUBLIC PERFORMANCE REPORT FOR 2016-2017

The report below is based on the Local Government Benchmarking Framework service categories and the headings under each of the categories are:-

- Snapshot profile provides an overview of the indicators in each category and the service responsible for this category.
- Our Performance is a summary of our performance for this category, it then provides further information on indicators which are performing well and ones that are for improvement.
- What we are doing to improve this section details what we are doing to improve performance for the identified area for improvement indicator.

The service categories are: Children's Services, Adult Social Care, Housing, Environment, Culture and Leisure, City Development and Corporate Services.

The data within this report is for financial year 2016-2017 (1 April 2016 to 31 March 2017).

#### **CHILDREN AND FAMILIES SERVICES**

#### Snapshot Profile

There are 26,729 children aged 0-17 in Dundee and Dundee's schools serve a total of 18,217 pupils, including 3,140 nursery aged children at a mixture of Dundee Nursery Schools/classes, Dundee Early Learning and Childcare (ELC) Centres and partner providers. In April 2016, Education, Children's Social Work and Criminal Justice Services merged under Children and Families Services to allow closer collaboration for families.

The Council Plan 2017-2022 sets the strategic priorities for the Children and Family Services as being to achieve the following:-

### Our children and young people will have the best start in life and Dundee will be the best place in Scotland to grow up.

#### **Priorities**

- Our children will have the best start in life improve early years outcomes
- Close the attainment gap
- Improve physical, mental and emotional health for children and young people
- Improve health and wellbeing outcomes for children and young people who experience inequalities, including looked after children
- Increase safety and protection of young people

Dundee is undertaking a review of its school estate to ensure improved educational outcomes and the most efficient provision of school places in the best possible environments for all of our children and young people. In addition, strengthened integrated service delivery within a developing locality model of working is central to the evolution of the Children and Families Service and the achievement of improved outcomes for children, young people and families.

Dundee's Children and Families Services recognises that narrowing the poverty-related attainment gap is particularly challenging during a time of budget cuts and is therefore seeking to radically change ways of working on the basis of better understanding the key challenges and possible solutions with the help of four major initiatives:-

- Improving Children's Outcomes by using stronger evidence data from the school survey of all 9-17 year olds and household survey of representative sample of households with 0-8 year olds has been used to identify priority needs for all children in Dundee as well as more detailed profiles for local community planning.
- The Dundee Attainment Challenge aims to close the poverty-related attainment gap by improving educational outcomes for children and young people living in Dundee's most deprived communities. A range of universal and targeted interventions in priority areas including literacy, numeracy and health and wellbeing are underway with the express purpose of improving educational outcomes for children living in the Scottish Index of Multiple Deprivation (SIMD) Deciles 1 and 2. Throughout 2015-2016, the Dundee Attainment Challenge has involved 11 primary schools and 5 nursery schools: a total of 2,600 primary pupils and 985 nursery pupils.
- **Building on the Lochee Pathfinder Total Place** approach work now includes the development of a 'one stop' family and community hub, a multi-agency integrated team, an early years practitioners network, provision of affordable and accessible physical activities for families with children under 8 and a growing school holiday provision
- The Neglect Improvement Programme supported by Celcis (Centre for Excellence for Looked after Children in Scotland) will systematically strengthen what works well to reduce neglect in the City in order to meet the needs of children at an earlier stage and to reduce the number of children requiring social work services.

Indicator	Group Rank	2016/17 Data	Group Average	Scottish Average	*Rate of Change	Colour Code
Cost per primary pupil	2	£4,445	£5,492	£4,804	1.5	amber
Cost per secondary pupil	7	£7,319	£7,332	£6,817	7.6	red
Cost per pre-school registration place	1	£3,734	£5,507	£4,207	30.3**	red
% adults satisfied with schools	7	67	82	75	9.9	red
Achieving 5 or more awards Level 5	7	54	59	60	14.9	green
% achieving 5 or more awards Level 6	7	26	31	34	13.0	green
% SIMD achieving 5 or more awards Level 5	7	37	43	41	27.6	green
% SIMD achieving 5 or more awards Level 6	7	11	14	16	37.5	green
% pupils entering positive destinations	3	94.20	93.60	93.70	0.4	amber
Overall average total tariff	8	768	847	886	6.2	green
Average total tariff SIMD Quintile 1	7	542	563	624	15.6	green
Average total tariff SIMD Quintile 2	8	713	821	750	7.5	green
Average total tariff SIMD Quintile 3	8	859	985	880	4.4	amber
Average total tariff SIMD Quintile 4	7	939	1,086	999	0.6	amber
Average total tariff SIMD Quintile 5	7	1,103	1,207	1,207	7.9	red
% children meeting developmental milestones*	2	77.83	68.43	72.38	2.6	amber
% early years provision graded good or better	5	94	95	92	0.0	amber
School Attendance Rate	8	92.30	93	93	0.0	amber
School Exclusion Rate per 1,000 pupils	6	41	28	27	57.3	green
School Attendance Rate (LAC)*	6	90	91	92	2.3	amber
School Exclusion Rate per 1,000 pupils (LAC)*	8	229	77	94	52.4	green
% participation for 16-19 year olds	6	88	90	91	0.0	amber
% child protection re-registrations <18 months	2	1.40	5.78	6.46	76.2	green
% LAC with > 1 placement in last year	5	18	23	21	47.1	green
Gross cost of LAC - residential accommodation	8	£4,626	£3,438	£3,404	31.0	red
Gross cost of LAC - community settings	8	£527	£231	£313	69.5	red
% children LAC in community	5	89	90	90	5.4	red

\* Rate of change is the five years from 2012/13 to 2016/17.

Key improved by more than 5% GREEN between + or – 5% amber worse by more than 5% red

\*<u>NB</u> - this is 2015-2016 data \*\* Cost per pre-school place includes the planned increase over the past few years.

#### **Council Performance - Attainment Indicators**

It is important to note that for all existing attainment indicators all bar one has improved significantly since the 2012 baseline. A 28% improvement in Dundee since 2011-2012 in the tariff score for pupils in the SIMD Quintile 1 (20% most deprived areas) shows policies targeting closing the attainment gap are working. Plans are in place to further improve performance in the coming years and Dundee's children and young people continue to benefit from additional investment of the Scottish Attainment Challenge and Pupil Equity Fund.

Within Children and Families Services two indicators as highlights have been identified (i.e. areas of service delivery where comparatively we are performing well) and two indicators as areas for improvement (ie areas of service delivery where action is required to improve our performance).

#### **Our Performance Highlights**

#### Cost per pre-school registration



As a result of implementation of the children and young people (Scotland) Act 2014 and specifically the increase in children's entitlement to free early learning and childcare from 420 hours to 600 there has been an increase in the cost per pre-school child registration place from £2,865 in 2013 to £3,734 in 2017. This equates to an increase of 30% on the 2013 figure. This is still the lowest figure in the Council's Family Group of similar local authorities, and is well below the Family Group average of £5,507.



Pupils entering positive destinations

The initial school leaver destinations figures for 2016/17 have been published and show Dundee has 94.2% of leavers entering a positive destination, above the national average of 93.7%. Dundee is now 3<sup>rd</sup> in its family group for this measure. Over the past six years whilst individual years have fluctuated up and down the overall trend for Dundee has been one of steady improvement.



Areas for Improvement - Gross Cost of Looked After Children - Community Settings

There has been a real increase in costs due to the following three factors:-

- 1. increase in the number of children with external foster carers.
- 2. equal pay for kinship carers (who are now paid the same as internal foster carers).
- 3. increasing number of 12-17 year olds looked after, who usually require the highest level of support.

#### What the Council is doing to improve

The Looked After Children figures cover a period to March 2017 and in the last 12 months we have carried out extensive work on returning young people from external placements to suitable local alternatives. The service are in the process of building local accommodation capacity for Looked After Children through negotiations with a Third Sector provider on a building they currently own and discussions with Property Services on a possible new build The service are about to start work on a new Edges of Care programme, involving increased targeted support to children and young people assessed by Named Persons and Team Around The Child processes as being at risk of entering the care system.



#### Overall Average Total Tariff

#### What the Council is doing to improve

The new multi-agency Children and Young People's Plan (2017-2020), which forms a significant section of the Council's Local Outcomes Improvement Planning – the City Plan, builds on data from the Dartington Improving Children's Outcomes survey and the Joint Inspection feedback to form clear priority areas for all children in Dundee. Individual children's and young people's needs will be addressed through an increasingly consistent GIRFEC compliant single planning process including a single Child's/Young Person's Plan so that each child or young person is supported by people they already know (eg health visitors or school staff). This will ensure that the best people to help the children, young people and their families are identified and should lead to a reduction in the number of professionals involved and hence to a more consistent approach as well as a reduction in costs.

Children and Families Services aim to build on strengths in the family and community and to reduce the extent to which children and families rely on services. The one service we do want all children to experience, however, is the educational service. In continuing to aspire towards the delivery of a quality educational experience in which all children and young people fully realise their highest possible levels of attainment and achievement the Children and Families Service will:-

- have a sustained focus on early intervention and improvements in children's literacy, numeracy and health and wellbeing from the early years.
- strive to improve school-led self-improvement particularly in the key area of quality learning and teaching.
- continue to support teacher professionalism and workforce development in areas including the new qualifications and associated assessment standards in partnership with head teachers, provide additional support and interventions for young people on the cusp of achieving National 5 and Higher qualifications.
- through the Dundee Attainment Challenge, maintain a heightened focus in supporting schools address the poverty-related attainment gap between the most and least disadvantaged children.

For children who do require social work services, stronger evidence is being gathered of what works well and what has the longest term positive impact, especially regarding the smooth transition from children relying on universal services, such as schools, to adding additional services from health and the third sector or social work. By keeping children and their families at the centre, strengths in the families can be built on with decreasing reliance on social work services except for families most in need.

For those children who do become looked after there is an increased effort on the recruitment of Dundee based local authority foster carers and the securing of satellite flats which allow young care leavers supported independent living rather than remaining in foster or residential care.

Dundee City Council is working with the third sector to update the Strategic Commissioning Plan so that services reflect Dundee's priorities as outlined in the Children and Young People's Plan (2017-2020) and the current financial circumstances.

#### SOCIAL CARE

#### Snap Shot Profile

The Health and Social Care Partnership provides services for a wide variety of needs and people in different situations, in some cases commissioned from the third and independent sector. Services can include helping people to live independently in their own home, helping with day care, if necessary, or providing enablement to help with daily living.

The Dundee Integration Joint Board was established on 1st April 2016 to integrate the planning and delivery of health and social care services. A range of adult social work and social care services previously overseen by the Council were delegated into the Health and Social Care Partnership at this time.

The Council Plan 2017-2022 sets out the priorities in this service as Social Care and Wellbeing.

#### **Priorities**

- 1. Health inequalities these actions are about stopping unfair differences between people's health.
- 2. Early intervention/prevention these actions will help support people early to stop them getting worse.
- 3. Person Centred Care and Support this will help DHSCP provide support that people want and need.
- 4. Carers these actions will help people who give care and support to family and friends.
- 5. Localities and Engage with Communities these actions will help DHSCP to make services closer to people's homes.
- 6. Building Capacity these actions will support local people to develop and build better communities.
- 7. Models of Support/Pathways of Care this is about how services and supports are delivered.
- 8. Managing our Resources effectively this is about getting the best value for money.

The social care category consists of 6 indicators, covering unit cost, satisfaction and performance data. A summary of our 2016-2017 data, as well as the Family Group average has been provided below.

Indicator	Group Rank	2016/17 Data	Group Average	Scottish Average	*Rate of Change	Colour Code
Older persons homecare cost per hour	1	£18.70	£27.09	£22.54	26.8	green
SDS spend on adults as a %	8	0.98	5.14	6.48	18.1	green
% of older people with intensive care needs receiving care at home	3	38.42	34.23	35.27	28.3	green
% adults receiving care who rate it excellent or good*	4	84	83	81	5.6	red
% adults supported at home who agree service impacted on their quality of life*	3	88	86	84	0.0	amber
Net residential cost per week for older people 65+	5	£407	£442	£375	3.8	amber

\* Rate of change is the five years from 2012/13 to 2016/17.

	Key	improved by more than 5%	GREEN	between + or - 5%	amber	worse by more than 5%	red
--	-----	--------------------------	-------	-------------------	-------	-----------------------	-----

We have identified 1 indicator as a highlight (ie area of service delivery where comparatively we are performing well) and 1 as an area for improvement (ie area of service delivery where action is required to improve our performance).

#### **Our Performance Highlight - Older Person's Homecare Costs Per Hour**



We continue to identify efficiencies and review models of service delivery in line with the review of Homecare. Dundee has significantly improved the level of homecare hours, which have grown by 47% since 2012 compared to a growth of 6% across Scotland making Dundee above the national average for the balance of care provided in the home. Over the same period there was a real terms growth of 6% in expenditure on homecare across Scotland, which combined with the higher growth in homecare hours in Dundee has led to Dundee having the best homecare productivity ratio in its Family Group.

Additionally, the number of people with intensive needs receiving homecare has also increased, with Dundee providing a large proportion of complex packages than both the Scottish and Family Groups.

Since the re-tendering of homecare services in 2016/2017, the National Minimum Wage has been paid to staff. Despite this increased cost in salaries, the number of homecare hours provided has increased at a higher rate than the total homecare spend, demonstrating that we are providing increasing efficient service delivery in our communities.



Area for Improvement - Self-Directed Support Spend On Adults 18+ as a % of Total Spend

Self-Directed Support allows people needing support to choose how their support needs will be met. This indicator calculates the cost of Direct Payment (Option One) spend on adults as a proportion of the total social work spend on adults (aged 18+).

This indicator is important because it allows the Council to monitor Direct Payments as a proportion of total adult social care expenditure, both over time and in comparison with other Councils. Dundee has historically had a low uptake of Direct Payments. Under the Self Directed Support (Scotland) Act 2013, Direct Payments is one of four options that from 1 April 2014 local authorities must offer eligible people assessed as requiring social care.

Dundee ranks 8th out of the above Family Group. Within this Family Group, Glasgow is an outlier in their performance due to their role in piloting this approach. When assessing the average spend of the remaining family members the variation is less.

#### What the Integrated Joint Board is doing to improve

There was an Internal Audit of SDS processes within Dundee Health and Social Care Partnership which demonstrates that processes currently in place support the use of SDS and provides information for the public.

Option 1 training was delivered to all employees as was Option 2 training and delivered alongside multi-disciplinary Outcome Focussed Approaches Workshops. Rolling programmes for all three learning opportunities have been developed.

The new Mosaic IT system has been systematically introduced since November 2016 starting with referral to assessment to planning to outcomes and review pathways. There are still a few remaining sections of the system which have yet to be rolled out and until these are available, not all of the benefits of the system will be achieved. This system embeds the SDS process with both prompts and monitoring systems to ensure staff are following the process so when the system is fully operational, we will be better able to use data to allow us to further explore performance in this area.

### **NEIGHBOURHOOD SERVICES - HOUSING SERVICES**

#### **Snapshot Profile**

The Housing service plays a pivotal role in improving the built environment of the city and in providing housing and support services. It is noteworthy that all the city's Council housing stock has achieved the Scottish Housing Quality Standard. Note the compliance figures below of 94.24% does not take account of abeyances. ). All council dwellings meet the Energy Efficiency measure of the Scottish Housing Quality Standard. In addition, we continue to work towards the enhanced EESSH (Energy Efficiency Standard for Social Housing) target by 2020.

The recent creation of Neighbourhood Services will provide better integration of key Council functions at a neighbourhood level, and provide greater capacity to work jointly with local communities to improve outcomes.

Providing physical improvements such as installation of efficient heating, district heating schemes, insulation, in addition to income maximisation and energy efficiency advice, are key to tackling social inclusion and poverty.

All of this activity will be focused on outcomes of achieving service improvement, efficiency and value for money.

The LGBF Housing category consists of 5 indicators, which measure value for money and quality of stock.

Due to there being only 5 Councils in our peer group, the Housing targets have been set at finishing in the top two rankings.

Indicator	Group Rank	2016/17 Data	Group Average	Scottish Average	*Rate of Change	Colour Code
% gross rent arrears of rent due	3	6.19	6.37	6.49	60.4	red
% of rent due lost to voids	4	1.34	1.25	0.93	24.7	green
% dwellings meeting SHQS	4	94.24	94.97	93.63	27.2	green
Average time taken to complete non-emergency repairs	5	11.56	7.62	8.72	26.1	green
% dwellings energy efficient	1	100.00	98.91	96.62	9.7	green

\* Rate of change is the five years from 2012/13 to 2016/17.

 Key
 improved by more than 5%
 GREEN
 between + or - 5%
 amber
 worse by more than 5%
 red

#### Our Performance Highlight - Percentage dwellings that are energy efficient



The percentage of dwellings that are energy efficient using the Scottish Housing Quality Standard measure is 100%.



#### Area for Improvement - Average Time Taken to Complete Non-Emergency Repairs

#### What the Council is doing to improve

The Council has reviewed activity and performance levels over 2015-2016 through the Repairs Operations Board and this has included consultations with tenants. As a result, the time taken to complete non-emergency repairs significantly improved to 8.95 days. This has fallen back slightly to 11.56 days and we continue to review the balance between emergency and non-emergency repairs to provide a more efficient service.

#### **NEIGHBOURHOOD SERVICES - ENVIRONMENTAL SERVICES**

#### **Snapshot Profile**

The quality of our environment underpins all aspects of city life and is central to the aim of building stronger communities and neighbourhoods It is a major factor in sustaining the health, wellbeing and quality of life of our citizens and ensuring pleasant, clean and safe neighbourhoods. It is a critical factor in the economic development and prosperity of our city.

Located within Neighbourhood Services (NS), the Environment Service manages, maintains and develops the many and varied areas of public open space including parks, play parks, outdoor sporting facilities, areas of urban woodland, allotments and the beach at Broughty Ferry.

The aim is to improve citizens' quality of life and encourage greater participation in outdoor and physical activity.

A diverse range of environmental health issues such as air quality, contaminated land, noise and food safety are tackled within the Community Safety and Protection area of Neighbourhood Services. Consumers are protected in the trading environment also, through the Training Standards Service.

Planning a better environment for future generations is especially relevant to the careful management of household and commercial waste. The Scottish Government's Zero Waste Plan targets are pursued through increasing recycling levels and minimising landfill.

As the rest of this report highlights, these services are highly rated by the public. Waste collection and street cleaning are universal services. For example, 3.84 million uplifts of domestic waste are carried out each year by Dundee City Council and this figure relates to general waste only and does not include recycling uplifts (garden waste, paper, glass, etc).

The LGBF Environmental Services category consists of 9 indicators covering unit and whole service costs; satisfaction indicators and quality performance data.

These three broad indicators should be read together when considering the results of a particular service since a reduction in costs could be accompanied by a decline in quality. In the LGBF only cost indicators are included for environmental health and trading standards services. When the role of these services in protecting people and communities is considered it would be wrong to assume that a reduction in costs represents progress and that a further decline is an achievement.

Both the Environmental Health and Trading Standard's sections are taking part in performance networks with the Association for Public Sector Excellence (APSE). This produces a comprehensive range of performance information which links cost with outputs and outcomes.

The responsibility for the waste collection/recycling, street cleaning, trading standards and environmental health indicators rests with the Neighbourhood Services directorate.

Indicator	Group Rank	2016/17 Data	Group Average	Scottish Average	*Rate of Change	Colour Code
Net cost of waste collection per premises	3	£49.43	£62.54	£64.46	7.2	red
Net cost of waste disposal per premises	4	£94.04	£102.04	£98.84	1.1	amber
Net cost of street cleaning per 1,000 population	5	£17,300	£15,048	£14,726	36.6	green
Cleanliness Score	4	92.35	92.01	93.90	-4.6	amber
Cost of trading standards per 1,000 population	3	£5,065	£5,438	£5,439	36.9	red
Cost of environmental health per 1,000 population	5	£16,335	£17,107	£16,117	5.9	red
% total domestic waste arising that is recycled	7	33.62	42.60	45.20	13.4	green
% adults satisfied with refuse collection	2	86.67	79.67	81.67	-0.9	amber
% adults satisfied with street cleaning	1	81.00	71.72	72.33	0.1	amber

\* Rate of change is the five years from 2012/13 to 2016/17.

Key improved by more than 5% GREEN between + or – 5% Amber worse by more than 5% Red

#### **Our Performance Highlight - Street Cleaning**

#### Net Cost of Street Cleaning per 1,000 Population



7 Year Trend

#### Family Group



#### % of Adults Satisfied with Street Cleaning

According to the LGBF National Benchmarking Overview Report 2016/2017 spending on street cleaning by Scottish local authorities has reduced by 30% since 2010/2011. Any comparisons between Dundee City Council's performance figures and others has to take this into account.

At the outset of the LGBF, family group benchmarking groups were established to explore the performance data. The Overview Report 2106/2017 states that work within the Family Groups for Environmental Services (which includes street cleaning) has identified several factors in understanding the variations between authorities.

These findings read with the Family Group bar chart below highlights the problems associated with Family Group averages, particularly some of the cost indicators which continue to show wide variations.

The 7 year trend graph shows the overall decline in street cleaning costs across Scotland with Dundee moving nearer to the Family Group middle position. This has been accompanied by a reduction in the city's street cleaning score to below the Scottish average.

The Council Plan 2017 to 2022 has set a target of increasing the score to 94 over the next 1 to 3 years.

Dundee's satisfaction levels in the Scottish Household Survey remains above the Family Group and Scottish levels.

#### Area for Improvement - Percentage of Total Domestic Waste Recycled

This PI measures the total percentage of domestic waste that has been recycled in a Council area.



#### What the Council is doing to improve

The Council's most up to date figures indicate a 7% increase in household waste recycled to a new level of 40% at February 2018. These figures need to be verified by the Scottish Environmental Protection Agency. There is a time lag between what is reported in the LGBF and actual current recycling rates.

The roll out of recycling services continue. In April 2018 further changes will be made to bring all areas of the city in line with Scottish Government's Charter for Household Recycling and consequently improve the quality and quantity of materials capable of being recycled.

Dundee has the highest proportion of flats and tenement properties in Scotland. Ensuring that the same level recycling services is provided across all households is a particular challenge.

Dundee continues to have one of the lowest level of household waste landfilled in Scotland and is one of the few authorities to utilise an energy from waste plant for residual waste treatment.

With the support of householders the council will strive to close the gap between current recycling levels and the Scottish Government's Zero Waste Plan of target 60% household waste recycled by 2020.

#### 5 Year Trend Family Group Cost of environmental health per 1,000 Cost of environmental health per 1,000 population population £20,000 30000 25000 £18,000 20000 £16,000 15000 £14,000 10000 £12,000 5000 0 West Dunb Fast Dunb Falkint Aberdeen NorthLan Dundee Edinburgh Glasgow FG median Dundee Citv Scotland

#### Cost of Environmental Health per 1,000 Population

#### What the Council is doing to improve

Environmental health is fundamental to preventing harm, disease and improving our health. It is a low cost high value service providing numerous interventions in all aspect of life.

In 2016/2017, for example, Dundee's environmental health service food team carried out 1,432 food hygiene inspections.

Spending on environmental health services have declined across Scotland. The Scottish Local Government Benchmarking Framework Overview Report 2016/2017 shows a 6.6% per thousand population reduction from £17,248 (2012/2013) to £16,177 (2016/2017).

#### CITY DEVELOPMENT AND PROPERTY ASSETS

#### **Snapshot Profile**

This service covers the Economic Development, Planning and Corporate Assets categories and consists of twelve indicators.

The Council Plan 2017-2022 sets out the priorities as promoting the development of a strong, sustainable and connected local economy which is part of a Tay Cities Region which is more productive, smarter and fairer.

#### **Priorities**

- 1. Close the jobs gap increase the number of people in Dundee in work to the Scottish average
- 2. Reduce unemployment
- 3. Raise productivity to the Scottish average
- 4. Improve traffic and parking prioritised by feedback from Engage Dundee
- 5. Improve public transportation prioritised by feedback from Engage Dundee

A summary of our 2016-2017 data, as well as the Family Group average has been provided below:-

Indicator	Group Rank	2016/17 Data	Group Average	Scottish Average	*Rate of Change	Colour Code
% unemployed people assisted into work on employability programmes	3	15.32	13.48	14.0	-1.4	Amber
% of operational buildings suitable for current use	5	79.27	78.94	79.80	-3.9	Amber
% of floorspace of operational buildings in satisfactory condition	7	77.38	85.96	84.48	-4.4	Amber
Average time per planning application (weeks)	1	7.57	10.66	9.31	0.8	Amber
Cost per planning application (weeks)	5	£4,483	£5,246	£4,636	80.3	Green
%procurement spent on local small/medium enterprises	4	19.0	17.0	20.25	16.5	Green
Number of business gateway start ups per 10,000 population	4	17.0	15.17	16.62	12.0	Red
Cost of maintenance per kilometre of roads	5	£17,469	£20,587	£10,456	57.5	Green
A class roads that should be considered for maintenance	1	17.54	24.87	29.54	10.1	Green
B class roads that should be considered for maintenance	1	18.44	25.09	34.76	3.5	Amber
C class roads that should be considered for maintenance	1	15.38	26.89	34.57	9.5	Green
U class roads that should be considered for maintenance	2	31.95	35.79	39.50	2.3	Amber

\* Rate of change is the five years from 2012/13 to 2016/17.

 Key
 improved by more than 5%
 GREEN
 between + or - 5%
 Amber
 worse by more than 5%
 Red

The responsibility for these indicators sits with City Development. The first indicator relates to Dundee providing more and better employment opportunities for our people and the following two indicators to communities having high quality and accessible local services and facilities. Planning application performance indicators were introduced last year. Procurement and business gateway indicators are also new, and City Development also covers the roads network.



#### Our Performance Highlight - % Unemployed People Assisted into Work of Employability Programmes

#### Explanation for variation in performance:

The Council's performance for this indicator has improved in recent years. The Council is ranked highly at 3rd in the Family Group, having moved from 5th the previous year.





#### What the Council is doing to improve

11 schools and nursery subjects will be closed over the next 12 to 18 months with new facilities being provided to replace them. As a result, existing properties are on essential repairs only and condition results have deteriorated. This is expected to improve over the next 12 months as new facilities are developed.

#### **CULTURE AND LEISURE SERVICES**

#### **Snapshot Profile**

The Culture and Leisure strategy consists of 8 indicators covering unit cost and satisfaction data. A summary of our 2016-2017 data as well as the Family Group average has been produced below.

Under the direction of the Accounts Commission, the Council continues to have a duty to monitor these indicators and improve performance, even in circumstances where they are provided by third parties.

The services are responsible for:-

- Leisure and Culture Dundee contributes significantly to cultural and economic development in Dundee. This service is operated primarily through The McManus: Dundee Art Gallery and Museum, Broughty Castle Museum, McManus Collections Unit, Mills Observatory and The Steeple.
- the Council and LACD provide funding and assistance to the following third parties and their attendance numbers are also included within the Museums indicators: Dundee Heritage Trust (Discovery and Verdant Works) and the Dundee Transport Museum.
- the library service which provides a wide range of services through libraries and one mobile library and housebound service.
- Leisure and Culture Dundee provides leisure and sports facilities at a number of locations across Dundee on behalf of Dundee City Council.
- the Environment Services within the Neighbourhood Services is responsible for the Parks and Open Spaces indicators.

For this category, performance has generally been maintained or improved upon with costs generally decreasing for the majority of the indicators.

Indicator	Group Rank	2016/17 Data	Group Average	Scottish Average	*Rate of Change	Colour Code
Cost per attendance at sports facilities	4	£2.28	£3.40	£2.90	11.6	green
Cost per library visit	5	£3.13	£2.95	£3.13	14.5	green
Cost per museum visit	6	£4.60	£4.34	£3.19	9.8	green
Cost of parks and open spaces per 1,000 population	4	£22,486	£23,972	£21,581	0.1	amber
% of adults satisfied with libraries	5	75.67	77.38	77.33	11.1	red
% of adults satisfied with parks and open spaces	4	88.33	86.14	85.67	2.7	amber
% of adults satisfied with museums and galleries	2	83.33	74.48	74.00	5.9	green
% adults satisfied with leisure facilities	3	78.00	74.52	75.67	3.0	amber

\* Rate of change is the five years from 2012/13 to 2016/17.

Key improved by more than 5% GREEN between + or – 5% Amber worse by more than 5% Red

#### **Culture and Leisure Performance**

We have identified 1 indicators as a highlight (ie areas of service delivery where comparatively we are performing well) and 1 indicator as an area where reported performance has declined (ie areas of service delivery where performance requires to be monitored).

#### Our Performance Highlight - Cost of Parks and Open Spaces per 1,000 Population

This PI measures attendance figures and indicates the extent to which facilities are being used. This indicator calculates the cost of parks and open spaces across the Council per 1,000 population. This indicator reveals how successful Councils are at increasing parks and open space usage. This allows discussion about whether the parks and open spaces in the Council are providing value for money compared with other Councils.

The LGBF Overview Report 2016/2017 identifies that the cost of parks and open spaces vary systematically with the level of deprivation in Councils, with those Councils with higher levels of deprivation spending significantly more on parks and open spaces. The average for Councils with the lowest deprivation by Scottish Index of Multi-Deprivations is £17,125 compared to £27,948 for areas with highest levels of deprivation by SIMD. The report also states that across Scotland the average spend per 1,500 population in parks and open spaces has declined.

Over the 7 year period from 2010/2011 to 2016/2017, this has reduced in real terms by 24.3% from £28,520 to £21,581. There has been a year on year reduction over the period.

The City Plan and Council Plan aims to develop green space which is attractive and used by local people as part of healthy lifestyles and to improve access to those spaces. Dundee has more green and open spaces and parks per head of population than any other Scottish city, occupying 28% of the urban area. For several years, Dundee has led the way in enhancing bio-diversity in open spaces. The establishment of wild flower meadows creates an attractive environment whilst supporting wildlife including birds and insects.



#### **Our Area for Improvement - Cost per Museum Visit**

This PI measures the cost of museum visits in relation to the current population of Dundee. Costs have risen very slightly compared to the previous year and the Council is ranked in 6th place in its Family Group of peer authorities. Cost per museum visit of £4.60 is above the group average of £4.34.

Expenditure on museums is slightly higher than the Group average reflecting the city's regional role. This results in reported higher levels of satisfaction then the Scottish average. Visitors to the V&A museum will be included ad this will significantly alter Dundee's position.



#### **CORPORATE SERVICES**

#### **Snapshot Profile**

The majority of services provided are central support functions to the Council's service directorates, however there are also a number of direct services provided to the public. Corporate Services consists of a number of different services areas as follows:-

- Corporate Finance including Procurement, Internal Audit and Corporate Fraud.
- Human Resources and Business Support including Learning and Organisational Development and Health and Safety.
- Customer Services and IT, including Benefit Delivery, Corporate Debt and Welfare Reform.
- Democratic and Legal Services.

The Council Plan 2017-2022 states this services aims to provide professional, innovative, and dynamic services to support other Council services, deliver significant frontline services to the public and support elected members in carrying out their role.

#### Priorities

- 1. Sustainable financial strategy
- 2. Implementation and delivery of Our People Strategy
- 3. Implementation and delivery of the Digital Strategy
- 4. Delivering a robust and secure corporate IT platform
- 5. Improving income collection
- 6. Developing collaborative partnerships
- 7. Providing assurance of good corporate governance, including effective audit and benchmarking

The Corporate Services category consists of 8 indicators covering:-

Indicator	Group Rank	2016/17 Data	Group Average	Scottish Average	*Rate of change	Colour Code
Support service costs as a % of total gross expenditure	4	4.32	4.65	4.92	18.5	green
% of highest paid 5% of employees who are women	8	42	54	52	3.5	amber
Cost per dwelling of collecting Council Tax	8	£15.24	£9.22	8.98	31.3	green
Sickness absence days per employee - teachers	7	7.60	6.09	6.06	23.2	red
Sickness absence days per employees - other staff	8	11.96	11.23	10.93	0.7	amber
% of income due from CT received by end of the year	8	93.41	95.56	95.80	0.3	amber
% of invoices that were paid within 30 days	1	97.23	93.23	93.06	4.7	amber
Gender pay gap %	3	0.52	2.30	4.14	44.1	green

\* Rate of change is the five years from 2012/13 to 2016/17.

Key	improved by more than 5%	GREEN	between + or – 5%	amber	worse by more than 5%	red

We have identified one area as a highlight and three areas for improvement in the following pages.



#### Our Performance Highlight - % of invoices that were paid within 30 days

#### **Description of our Performance**

We are ranked best in our Family Group for the percentage of invoices that were paid within 30 days. This figure increased from 95.94% to 97.23% which resulted in our group ranking increasing from 4th to 1st.





This PI measures the number of sickness absence days, whether self-certified, certified by a GP, long term illness whether paid or unpaid, industrial injury or injury. It does not include 'other absence' which is recorded separately eg maternity leave, parental leave, special leave etc. Sickness absence is a significant cost pressure for the Council and the number of sickness absence days taken across service and staff groups varies. The ability to benchmark with other Councils is important as is the sharing of information between Councils on methodologies for tackling this issue.

#### Sickness days per employee - other staff



#### **Description of Performance**

• The Council is ranked 7th and 8th in its Family Group for teachers' absence and other staff absence respectively.

#### Explanation for Variation in Comparative Performance and Improvement Measures

Management continues to work collaboratively with the Trade Unions on the health and wellbeing agenda. This has included revising and implementing the Policy on Promoting Health and Attendance which now includes reference to other policies and practices such as Attendance Support plans, Substance Misuse Policy, Managing Stress in the Workplace and the stress discussion document, which aim to support employees remain at or return to work.

Improvement measures include:-

- Training for managers on promoting heath and attendance is being developed and will link to other support measures. It will include e-learning followed by more practical sessions.
- A Health and Wellbeing Framework has been drafted to provide a strategic and holistic approach to health and wellbeing in the workplace and associated action plan.
- The regular reports taken to the Council Management Team and to the Council Management/Trade Union meetings have been amended to provide more meaningful information for consideration by services.
- The Employee Survey results have been analysed to review the well-being indicators and stress indicators and an action plan has been agreed to address areas where issues have been identified.
- Information to be provided to all employees on their average absence and how this compares with Service and Council absence rates, in order to raise awareness of absence levels and costs amongst employees.
- Alternative models in place in other Scottish local authorities for reporting absence to be examined.
- A focus on mental health training planned for all employees and managers.
- The Council has signed up with Macmillan at Work which gives access to a toolkit with guidance and practical tips for managers supporting employees with cancer.

All these measures will be monitored with an expectation that attendance levels gradually improve.

#### Cost per dwelling of collecting Council Tax

This indicator looks at how effective Councils are at collecting the Council Tax due to them by looking at how much it costs the Council, per household to collect Council Tax.



#### Explaining variation in comparative performance

The effectiveness of the Council's collection systems may be affected by the ability of taxpayers to pay, and the extent of enforcement action taken by the Council to recover tax due to it.

#### What the Council is doing to improve

- More efficient use of resources through adopting a corporate debt approach to recovery which is currently being implemented through a restructure within Customer Services and IT.
- Review of all processes to ensure these are streamlined and efficient and result in improved collection of Council Tax.
- Review of overheads associated with Council Tax collection.
- Regular review and reporting of performance monitoring with management and teams.

#### Percentage of Income due from Council Tax Received by the end of the year

The amount of Council Tax payable for the year excluding all water charges and any outstanding Council Tax (or community charge) from previous years. This indicator is important as it allows Councils to compare how effective it is at collecting the current Council Tax which is due.



The Council's approach to the collection of Council Tax is one where we reach an affordable repayment of any outstanding debt. Whilst the Council's in year collection is lower than other Councils, collection of prior year Council Tax debt is higher than other authorities within the Family Group.

#### Explaining variation in comparative performance

While there will be different enforcement action which local authorities will use to recover Council Tax, we recognise we need to improve our collection rates. In reviewing our performance this should be done taking cognisance of the deprivation and poverty levels within the City. We are reviewing our collection on a monthly basis to help identify any patterns.

#### What the Council is doing to improve

- The Council is in the process of moving to a corporate approach to recovery for all debt individuals may have. This will allow for a holistic approach to recovery of debt and an improved service for customers.
- Joint working with Council Advice Services and other third sector agencies ensures early intervention for those who require assistance and advice.
- On-going promotion of the importance of paying Council Tax and where support and assistance relating to Money and Benefit Advice may be found.
- Extended open hours so staff can be contacted outwith the normal working day.
- Targeted initiatives will be undertaken around specific areas of debt ie student liability/Council Tax reduction.
- Using a variety of communication methods such as phone, e-mail, letters and texting to engage with customers.

#### HOW THE PUBLIC CAN GET INVOLVED

Dundee City Council is keen to encourage members of the public to get involved with the services it provides in order that it can continuously improve its services. The views of the Council's service users are paramount.

Below is a selection of the wide variety of areas in which members of the public can influence service provision:-

- feedback via online complaints/compliments/suggestions
- parental, pupil and school staff surveys
- social media of Facebook and Twitter
- Local Community Planning partnership meetings
- attendance at regular and ad hoc Council meetings
- consultation exercises and surveys
- by simply writing a letter to the Council

Each year the Council prepares an extensive report on Improving Services through Listening to Customers and Service Users. Copies of the report are on the Council's website <u>www.dundeecity.gov.uk</u> or by contacting the Chief Executive's Department.