

REPORT TO: POLICY AND RESOURCES COMMITTEE – 23 FEBRUARY 2023

REPORT ON: CITY DEVELOPMENT – SUBSIDISED REGISTERED BUS SERVICES

REPORT BY: EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF CITY DEVELOPMENT

REPORT NO: 35-2023

1 PURPOSE OF REPORT

1.1 To inform committee of the savings proposed for financial year 2024-25 regarding the Supported Registered Bus Services.

2 RECOMMENDATIONS

- 2.1 It is recommended that Committee:
- a discontinues the subsidy of registered bus service 206, 204, 202, 236, and 51 from 2024/25 and;
 - b remits the Head of Sustainable Transport and Roads to liaise with bus operators to consider potential changes to the commercial network.

3 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

3.1 The removal of subsidies from services 206, 204, 202, 236, and 51 would result in a full year saving of approximately £122,500 from 2024/25.

3 MAIN TEXT

4.1 The contracts for supported bus services were awarded following approval by the City Development Committee on 10 May 2021 (report 144-2021, item X of the minute refers). Contracts commenced in August 2021 and were awarded for two years with an option to extend for up to three further years.

4.2 Dundee City Council currently supports seven commercially unviable bus services through revenue subsidy. The provision of subsidy to registered bus services is a discretionary function. The following paragraphs detail the subsidy costs of each service. The costs presented are the current financial year costs and from 1 April 2023 these contracted services are forecast to incur a further 14% contractual inflationary uplift.

4.3 Service 206 detailed below has operated since 2011 connecting Craigie Drive, central Broughty Ferry, Barnhill and Dobbies. The service is primarily used by over 60s and the number of passengers using the service has decreased by 17% since 2019.

Service 206	Annual passengers carried pre-pandemic	30,000
Stagecoach	Annual passengers – calculated on data from Autumn 2022	25,564
	Subsidy per trip 2019	£2.10
	Subsidy per trip 2022	£1.54
	FYE cost of subsidy 2022	£39,369.00

4.4 Service 204 detailed below is a new service introduced in August 2021, connecting the city centre with the Perth Road, Lochee and Dryburgh.

Service 204	Annual passengers carried pre-pandemic	No data
Stagecoach	Annual passengers – calculated on data from Autumn 2022	20,944
	Subsidy per trip 2019	No data
	Subsidy per trip 2022	£2.01
	FYE cost of subsidy 2022	£42,097.00

- 4.5 Service 202 has operated since 2011 connecting Kirkton, the Glens and Lawside with the city centre. Although primarily used by over 60s, passenger numbers have recovered since the pandemic.

Service 202	Annual passengers carried pre-pandemic	48,000
M&W	Annual passengers – calculated on data from Autumn 2022	49,240
	Subsidy per trip 2019	£1.30
	Subsidy per trip 2022	£0.22
	FYE cost of subsidy 2022	£10,833.00

- 4.6 Service 236 connects Mill O Mains, Morrisons and Mid Craigie with the city centre. Comparison with 2019 data records fewer passenger numbers however prior to August 2021 Service 236 also operated in the morning and afternoon peak periods. Passenger data is therefore not a like for like comparison. Xplore Dundee Service 18 now terminates at Claverhouse (adjacent to Mill O Mains Primary School) which reduces reliance on this subsidised service.

Service 236	Annual passengers carried pre-pandemic	57,000
M&W	Annual passengers – calculated on data from Autumn 2022	27,940
	Subsidy per trip 2019	£0.82
	Subsidy per trip 2022	£1.35
	FYE cost of subsidy 2022	£37,719.00

- 4.7 Service 10 (Sunday) is the subsidised Sunday daytime operation of the service previously known as the Outer Circle. The service operates around the north of the city connecting Ninewells to Broughty Ferry via St Mary's, Kirkton, Fintry and Douglas.

Service 10	Annual passengers carried pre-pandemic	43,000
Sunday	Annual passengers – calculated on data from Autumn 2022	40,000
Xplore	Subsidy per trip 2019	£0.36
	Subsidy per trip 2022	£0.53
	FYE cost of subsidy 2022	£21,200.00

- 4.8 Service 10 (evenings) is the subsidised Monday to Saturday evening operation of the service previously known as the Outer Circle. The service operates around the north of the city connecting Ninewells to Broughty Ferry via St Mary's, Kirkton, Fintry and Douglas. Data records a growth in patronage which can be attributed to the introduction of free travel for under 22s.

Service 10	Annual passengers carried pre-pandemic	93,000
Evenings	Annual passengers – calculated on data from Autumn 2022	112,000
Xplore	Subsidy per trip 2019	£0.76
	Subsidy per trip 2022	£0.77
	FYE cost of subsidy 2022	£86,240.00

- 4.9 Service 51 is a route extension subsidised by Dundee City Council which extends a Moffat & Williamson service subsidised by Angus Council to serve the new housing development at Dykes of Gray. The service extension commenced in May 2022 and accordingly there is currently no patronage data for comparison purposes.

Service 51	FYE cost of subsidy 2022	£6,160.00
M&W	No passenger data held, contract with Angus Council	

5 POLICY IMPLICATIONS

- 5.1 This report has been subject to an Integrated Impact Assessment to identify impacts on Equality & Diversity, Fairness & Poverty, Environment and Corporate Risk. An impact, positive or negative, on one or more of these issues was identified. An appropriate senior manager has checked and agreed with this assessment. A copy of the Integrated Impact Assessment showing the impacts and accompanying benefits of/mitigating factors for them is included as an Appendix to this report.

6 CONSULTATIONS

- 6.1 The Council Leadership Team were consulted in the preparation of this report.

7 BACKGROUND PAPERS

- 7.1 None.

Ewan Macnaughton
Head of Sustainable Transport & Roads

Author: John Berry

Robin Presswood
Executive Director of City Development

Dundee City Council
Dundee House
Dundee

EM/KM

9 February 2023

Integrated Impact Assessment

Committee Report Number: 35-2023

Document Title: Subsidised Registered Bus Services

Document Type: Other

Description:

Report to inform committee of the savings proposed for financial year 2023-24 regarding the supported registered bus services

Intended Outcome:

Subsidy of registered bus services is ceased.

Period Covered: 01/04/2023 to 31/03/2024

Monitoring:

N/A

Lead Author:

John Berry, Team Leader - Parking & Sustainable Transport, City Development,
john.berry@dundee.gov.uk , 01382 433537,
50 North Lindsay Street, Dundee DD1 1QE

Director Responsible:

Robin Presswood, Executive Director of City Development,
robin.presswood@dundee.gov.uk, 01382 433610
50 North Lindsay Street, Dundee DD1 1QE

Equality, Diversity and Human Rights

Impacts & Implications

Age: Negative

Bus services are predominantly used by passengers over the age of 60, many of whom may have restricted mobility.

Disability: Negative

Bus services are predominantly used by passengers over the age of 60, many of whom may have restricted mobility.

Gender Reassignment: No Impact

Marriage & Civil Partnership: No Impact

Pregnancy & Maternity: No Impact

Race / Ethnicity: No Impact

Religion or Belief: No Impact

Sex: Negative

Women are more likely to be a non-driver or not have access to a car and are therefore more reliant on public transport.

Sexual Orientation: No Impact

Are any Human Rights not covered by the Equalities questions above impacted by this report?

No

Mitigations

The Council would require to liaise with Bus Companies to consider opportunities for potential changes to the commercial network resulting from removal of adjacent subsidised routes. The Scottish Government have targeted increasing journey share by public transport and initiatives such as free bus travel for under 22's and over 60's may increase patronage in the affected areas to a level whereby Bus Companies can viably operate services unsubsidised.

Justification

The Council has a legal duty to set a balanced budget every year. Given the financial climate, difficult decisions need to be taken with regards to prioritisation of budgets. This will inevitably result in impacts on funding and/or services that are of a discretionary nature for the Council as it will need to continue to fund its statutory services.

Fairness & Poverty

Geographic Impacts & Implications

Strathmartine:	Negative
Lochee:	Negative
Coldside:	Negative
Maryfield:	Negative
North East:	Negative
East End:	Negative
The Ferry:	Negative
West End:	Negative

Negative Implications & Mitigations (Strathmartine) The bus services proposed to be withdrawn operate across all parts of the city and therefore all wards will be affected.
Some communities where the supported network provides additional bus services will likely be more impacted than others.

Negative Implications & Mitigations (Lochee) The bus services proposed to be withdrawn operate across all parts of the city and therefore all wards will be affected.
Some communities where the supported network provides additional bus services will likely be more impacted than others.

Negative Implications & Mitigations (Coldside) The bus services proposed to be withdrawn operate across all parts of the city and therefore all wards will be affected.
Some communities where the supported network provides additional bus services will likely be more impacted than others.

Negative Implications & Mitigations (Maryfield) The bus services proposed to be withdrawn operate across all parts of the city and therefore all wards will be affected.
Some communities where the supported network provides additional bus services will likely be more impacted than others.

Negative Implications & Mitigations (North East/Whitfield) The bus services proposed to be withdrawn operate across all parts of the city and therefore all wards will be affected.
Some communities where the supported network provides additional bus services will likely be more impacted than others.

Negative Implications & Mitigations (East End/Mid Craigie) The bus services proposed to be withdrawn operate across all parts of the city and therefore all wards will be affected.
Some communities where the supported network provides additional bus services will likely be more impacted than others.

Negative Implications & Mitigations (The Ferry) The bus services proposed to be withdrawn operate across all parts of the city and therefore all wards will be affected.
Some communities where the supported network provides additional bus services will likely be more impacted than others.

Negative Implications & Mitigations (West End)

The bus services proposed to be withdrawn operate across all parts of the city and therefore all wards will be affected.

Some communities where the supported network provides additional bus services will likely be more impacted than others.

Household Group Impacts and Implications

Looked After Children & Care Leavers: No Impact

Carers: No Impact

Lone Parent Families: No Impact

Single Female Households with Children: No Impact

Greater number of children and/or young children: No Impact

Pensioners - single / couple: Negative

The network of supported bus services are predominantly used by passengers over the age of 60.

Unskilled workers or unemployed: No Impact

Serious & enduring mental health problems: No Impact

Homeless: No Impact

Drug and/or alcohol problems: No Impact

Offenders & Ex-offenders: No Impact

Socio Economic Disadvantage Impacts & Implications

Employment Status: No Impact

Education & Skills: No Impact

Income: Negative

Journeys that must be made may transfer to taxi.

Caring Responsibilities (including Childcare): No Impact

Affordability and accessibility of services: Negative

Services provided in the community may become less accessible and may cost more to attend if travelling by taxi.

Fuel Poverty: No Impact

Cost of Living / Poverty Premium: Negative

Loss of services may increase travel costs.

Connectivity / Internet Access: No Impact

Income / Benefit Advice / Income Maximisation: No Impact

Employment Opportunities: Negative

Loss of services may make it harder to commute to employment.

Education: No Impact

Health: Negative

Attendance at health care appointments may be affected by loss of bus services.

Life Expectancy: No Impact

Mental Health: No Impact

Overweight / Obesity: No Impact

Child Health: No Impact

Neighbourhood Satisfaction: Negative

Neighbourhoods which lose their bus services will see reduced satisfaction with public services.

Transport: Negative

Reduce opportunity to travel and access services and amenities.

Mitigations

The Council would require to liaise with Bus Companies to consider opportunities for potential changes to the commercial network resulting from removal of adjacent subsidised routes. The Scottish Government have targeted increasing journey share by public transport and initiatives such as free bus travel for under 22's and over 60's may increase patronage in the affected areas to a level whereby Bus Companies can viably operate services unsubsidised.

Justification

The Council has a legal duty to set a balanced budget every year. Given the financial climate, difficult decisions need to be taken with regards to prioritisation of budgets. This will inevitably result in impacts on funding and/or services that are of a discretionary nature for the Council as it will need to continue to fund its statutory services.

Environment

Climate Change Impacts

Mitigating Greenhouse Gases: Negative

Potential for more car journeys to be made.

Adapting to the effects of climate change: Negative

Potential for more car journeys to be made.

Resource Use Impacts

Energy efficiency & consumption: No Impact

Prevention, reduction, re-use, recovery or recycling of waste: No Impact

Sustainable Procurement: No Impact

Transport Impacts

Accessible transport provision: Negative

Loss of bus services may lead to social isolation.

Sustainable modes of transport: Negative

More car and taxi journeys to replace journeys previously made by bus.

Natural Environment Impacts

Air, land & water quality: No Impact

Biodiversity: No Impact

Open & green spaces: No Impact

Built Environment Impacts

Built Heritage: No Impact

Housing: No Impact

Is the proposal subject to a Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA)?

No further action is required as it does not qualify as a Plan, Programme or Strategy as defined by the Environment Assessment (Scotland) Act 2005.

Mitigations

The Council would require to liaise with Bus Companies to consider opportunities for potential changes to the commercial network resulting from removal of adjacent subsidised routes. The Scottish Government have targeted increasing journey share by public transport and initiatives such as free bus travel for under 22's and over 60's may increase patronage in the affected areas to a level whereby Bus Companies can viably operate services unsubsidised.

Justification

The Council has a legal duty to set a balanced budget every year. Given the financial climate, difficult decisions need to be taken with regards to prioritisation of budgets. This will inevitably result in impacts on funding and/or services that are of a discretionary nature for the Council as it will need to continue to fund its statutory services.

Corporate Risk

Corporate Risk Impacts

Political Reputational Risk: Negative

Reduction in bus services is likely to generate negative feedback.

Economic/Financial Sustainability / Security & Equipment: No Impact

Social Impact / Safety of Staff & Clients: No Impact

Technological / Business or Service Interruption: No Impact

Environmental: Negative

This would be contrary to climate action plan.

Legal / Statutory Obligations: No Impact

Organisational / Staffing & Competence: No Impact

Corporate Risk Implications & Mitigation:

The risk implications associated with the subject matter of this report are "business as normal" risks and any increase to the level of risk to the Council is minimal. This is due either to the risk being inherently low or as a result of the risk being transferred in full or in part to another party on a fair and equitable basis. The subject matter is routine and has happened many times before without significant impact.

Mitigations

The Council would require to liaise with Bus Companies to consider opportunities for potential changes to the commercial network resulting from removal of adjacent subsidised routes. The Scottish Government have targeted increasing journey share by public transport and initiatives such as free bus travel for under 22's and over 60's may increase patronage in the affected areas to a level whereby Bus Companies can viably operate services unsubsidised.

Justification

The Council has a legal duty to set a balanced budget every year. Given the financial climate, difficult decisions need to be taken with regards to prioritisation of budgets. This will inevitably result in impacts on funding and/or services that are of a discretionary nature for the Council as it will need to continue to fund its statutory services.