

REPORT TO: SCRUTINY COMMITTEE - 28 JUNE 2017

REPORT ON: 2016/17 INTERNAL AUDIT ANNUAL REPORT

REPORT BY: SENIOR MANAGER – INTERNAL AUDIT

REPORT NO: 179-2017

1.0 PURPOSE OF REPORT

To submit to Members of the Scrutiny Committee the 2016/17 Internal Audit Annual Report. This report summarises the activities of the Council's Internal Audit Service during this period and provides an independent annual opinion on the overall adequacy and effectiveness of the organisation's governance, risk management and control framework based on the work undertaken.

2.0 RECOMMENDATIONS

Members of the Committee are asked to consider and note the contents of this report.

3.0 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

None

4.0 MAIN TEXT

- 4.1** The terms of reference of the Scrutiny Committee, as detailed in Report No 274-2014 (Policy and Resources Committee 10 November 2014, Article V) includes consideration of the strategy, plan and performance of the Council's Internal Audit Service. In addition, the Committee is also required to consider internal audit reports and seek assurance that appropriate action has been taken, monitor the implementation of internal audit recommendations agreed with management and receive the Annual Report of the Senior Manager – Internal Audit.
- 4.2** The Public Sector Internal Audit Standards (PSIAS), which came into effect from 1 April 2013, revised from 1 April 2017, apply to all internal audit service providers within the public sector and set out the requirements in respect of professional standards for these services. Professional Standard 2450, Overall Opinions states that *"the chief audit executive must deliver an annual internal audit opinion and report that can be used by the organisation to inform its governance statement"*. In the context of Dundee City Council, the *"chief audit executive"* is the Senior Manager – Internal Audit and the *"board"* is the Scrutiny Committee.
- 4.3** The PSIAS specifically states that the annual report prepared by the chief audit executive must incorporate:
- the annual internal audit opinion on the overall adequacy and effectiveness of the organisation's framework of governance, risk management and control;
 - a summary of the information that supports that opinion; and
 - a statement of conformance with the PSIAS including the results of the quality assurance and improvement programme.
- 4.4** It should also be noted that the Local Authority Accounts (Scotland) Regulations 2014 became effective in October 2014. Under these regulations *"a local authority must operate a professional and objective internal auditing service in accordance with recognised standards and practices in relation to internal auditing"*. In this context recognised standards and practices are deemed to be those set out in the PSIAS. These Regulations also require that *"the local authority must conduct a review at least once a year of the effectiveness of its system of internal control"*. In respect of this and from an internal audit perspective there is a requirement that *"the findings from assessments must be considered as part of the consideration of the system of internal control"*.
- 4.5** The Internal Audit Annual Report for the 2016/17 financial year, which is attached for consideration by Elected Members, has been prepared on the basis of the requirements outlined above.

5.0 POLICY IMPLICATIONS

This report has been screened for any policy implications in respect of Sustainability, Strategic Environmental Assessment, Anti-Poverty, Equality Impact Assessment and Risk Management. There are no major issues.

6.0 CONSULTATIONS

The Chief Executive, Executive Director of Corporate Services and Head of Democratic and Legal Services have been consulted on the content of this report.

7.0 BACKGROUND PAPERS

None

Pamela Redpath, Senior Manager – Internal Audit

DATE: 9 June 2017

2016/17 INTERNAL AUDIT ANNUAL REPORT

1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

- To summarise the key areas of activity undertaken by the Council's Internal Audit Service and highlight any matters of significance that have arisen as a result of the audit process during the 2016/17 financial year.
- To provide an independent opinion on the overall adequacy and effectiveness of the organisation's governance, risk management and control framework.

2. GOVERNANCE, RISK MANAGEMENT AND CONTROL FRAMEWORK

- The governance framework comprises the systems and processes, as well as the culture and values, by which the Council is directed and controlled and its activities through which it is accountable to, engages with and leads the community. It enables the Council to monitor the achievement of its strategic objectives and consider whether those objectives have led to the delivery of appropriate cost effective services.
- The system of internal control is a significant part of this framework and is designed to manage risk to a reasonable level. It cannot eliminate all risk of failure to achieve policies, aims and objectives and can, therefore, only provide reasonable and not absolute assurance of effectiveness.
- The system of internal control is based on an ongoing process designed to identify and prioritise the risks that may impact on the achievement of the Council's policies, aims and objectives, to evaluate the likelihood of those risks being realised and the impact they may have if they are, and to manage them efficiently, effectively and economically.

3. ROLE OF INTERNAL AUDIT

- Internal audit forms a fundamental element of Dundee City Council's governance and assurance framework. The Internal Audit Service is independent of the activities it audits. This is essential to ensure that the Service provides unbiased judgements and impartial advice to management. Through the provision of a high quality, independent, objective assurance and consulting activity, guided by the philosophy of adding value, the Service aims to bring a systematic and disciplined approach to evaluating and improving the effectiveness of the organisation's business processes. This role includes having an understanding of the key risks to which the Council is exposed.
- The Internal Audit Service, with strict accountability for confidentiality and safeguarding records and information, is authorised full, free, and unrestricted access to all of the organisation's records, physical properties and personnel pertinent to carrying out any engagement and effectively discharging its remit.
- The primary purpose of internal audit work is to review, appraise and report on a diverse range of areas. There requires to be sufficient breadth and depth of work contained within the internal audit plan to enable, in part, the Senior Manager – Internal Audit to fulfil the requirement to provide the annual opinion. The types of review undertaken are assigned to various themes in the plan namely governance, ICT, systems, procurement / contract and financial. In addition, the Service may also provide advice and guidance on governance, risk management and internal control, including during specific investigations.
- The existence of an Internal Audit Service does not, however, diminish the responsibility of management to ensure that resources are utilised appropriately, in a manner and on the activities intended, and the internal control arrangements are sufficient to address the risks that their services are exposed to.
- The Internal Audit Charter, updated in 2016 and presented to the Scrutiny Committee on 29 June 2016 (Report No. 232-2016), sets out in more detail within the context of Dundee City Council the purpose, authority and responsibility of the Internal Audit Service.

4. AUDIT PLANNING

- A vital component in the effective management of internal audit is planning audit work to ensure that objectives are met, priorities are established, resources are targeted and used effectively, best value is achieved and cognisance is taken of the risk(s) associated within each area.

- The Internal Audit Plan is compiled on an annual basis and provides a summary of the areas where it is planned that work will be carried out during the forthcoming year. The Internal Audit Plan for the 2016/17 financial year was submitted to the Scrutiny Committee on 20 April 2016 (Report No. 141-2016). In line with recognised good practice, the Internal Audit Plan was prepared on the best information available at that time.
- The internal audit arrangements are assessed on an annual basis by the Council's External Auditor. In 2016/17 a new External Auditor, Audit Scotland, was appointed. As part of this assessment, the External Auditor considers the activities of internal audit, principally to obtain an understanding of the work carried out and determine the extent to which assurance can be placed on its work. This approach helps to minimise duplication of effort and unnecessary disruption to Council services.

5. AUDIT REPORTS

- Each audit assignment results in an internal audit report, which includes an executive summary as well as audit findings, recommendations and management responses, where appropriate. The audit report provides management with an action plan, which assigns responsibility and details the timetable for implementation of audit recommendations.
- Within all audit reports a judgement is given on the importance of each audit finding i.e. critical, significant or routine. These judgements are utilised to determine the overall level of assurance / opinion to be assigned to the area that has been subject to review. There are generally four overall levels of assurance i.e. full, reduced, limited and no assurance with corresponding standard opinions. The overall opinion is detailed in the executive summary of each report.
- The findings and recommendations arising from the audit assignments reported upon since the last Annual Report have been discussed and agreed with appropriate officers of the Council and action plans have been put in place to address the areas identified for improvement. The executive summary from each report has been submitted to the Scrutiny Committee for consideration.
- To confirm that management is discharging its responsibility in terms of implementing audit recommendations within the agreed timescales, Internal Audit also undertakes formal follow-up work and progress reviews. The outcomes from these exercises are also formally reported to relevant officers and the Scrutiny Committee, with revised implementation dates where appropriate.

6. KEY EVENTS DURING 2016/17

- Key events during 2016/17 impacting directly on the Internal Audit Service include the appointment of a new Principal Internal Auditor in August 2016 following three recruitment drives, tendering for the provision of co-sourced Internal Audit Services and the ongoing development and promotion of the Corporate Fraud Team following its re-positioning the previous year into the Internal Audit Service.
- In addition, key events during 2016/17 that are more strategic in nature include the Dundee Health and Social Care Partnership and its Integration Joint Board starting to deliver adult social care services from 1 April 2016, changes to the way in which the Council delivers its services following new legislation and refreshed Scottish Government plans / priorities including the Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act and A Digital Strategy for Scotland respectively. Other changes will continue to be driven by the Changing for the Future transformational change programme under the three key themes of Assets and Infrastructure, Modern Council and People. The continuous impact of funding cuts and change on Council services has resulted in a challenging environment in which internal audit services require to be planned and delivered. Steps will continue to be taken to ensure that any related potential difficulties are identified and managed timeously.
- During 2016/17, the Internal Audit Service was delivered utilising a mix of in-house and external resources. The external resources were provided, as last year, by PwC who were approved as the Council's co-sourcing partner for the delivery of internal audit services with effect from January 2014 (Report No. 519-2013). This partnership, which is due to end on 30 June 2017, has complemented the skills of the in-house team and provided a number of benefits to the Council including the immediate provision of specialist skills and advice. As a result of the

impending expiry date for the existing contract, the Council initiated a new tendering exercise during 2016/17 for the continued provision of a co-source Internal Audit Service. A report detailing the outcome from that exercise and recommending that Members approve the acceptance of the most economically advantageous tender was presented to the Policy and Resources Committee on 26 June 2017 (Report No. 2014-2017).

- The Internal Audit Service operated in 2016/17 in accordance with the PSIAS. During 2016/17, a self-assessment was undertaken to measure the extent to which the current Internal Audit Service, including policies and procedures conform to expected requirements contained within the PSIAS. The areas that were identified for improvement as a result of this exercise will be formally reported to the Scrutiny Committee in due course. A report was previously submitted to the Scrutiny Committee in December 2014 (Report No. 463-2014) containing a quality assurance and improvement programme / action plan following a similar self-assessment exercise. Whilst a number of these improvement actions have been implemented / partially implemented, the outstanding areas will be taken forward before the end of the calendar year. It should be noted that none of the areas identified as requiring improvement were considered to represent a significant deviation from the requirements contained within the PSIAS. The Council's Internal Audit Service will receive an External Quality Assessment during 2017/18, the results from which will be formally reported to the Scrutiny Committee.

7. PLAN ACHIEVEMENT

- For the 2016/17 financial year there was a total of 706 productive days used for direct audit activities. Although the number of productive audit days was broadly in line with the previous year, it represented a shortfall of 12% against the 800 budgeted productive audit days. This shortfall was primarily due to unforeseen recruitment difficulties following the change in management within the Internal Audit Service. More specifically, the former Chief Internal Auditor retired on 30 September 2015, at which point the Principal Internal Auditor, who had been successful in obtaining the position, took up post. It was not possible to appoint a successor for the Principal Internal Auditor until 15 August 2016, nearly 11 months on, 5 of which were in the 2016/17 financial year. Some of the resource gap was bridged through the co-sourcing arrangement with PwC and the utilisation of an agency member of staff. The level of staff absence was also greater than had been anticipated when the 2016/17 Internal Audit Plan was drafted. In terms of total productive days (audit and non-audit), approximately 75% were spent on direct audit activities and 25% were spent on support activities such as strategic management of the Internal Audit Service, audit planning and staff training and development.
- The 2016/17 Internal Audit Plan included 34 specific internal audit assignments, both at a corporate and service level across the organisation. It also included an allocation of audit days for follow-up reviews, progress reviews, finalisation of audit assignments that commenced in the previous financial year and the provision of advice and guidance to services. Whilst work on the majority of the planned areas for corporate and service reviews included within the plan commenced in 2016/17 there was, due to a number of factors, some re-scheduling of work into the 2017/18 work programme. The reasons behind this varied and included, the area for review not being as well advanced as planned, organisational changes, staff availability and an increasing number of enquires in respect of ad-hoc advice and guidance.
- As part of the co-sourcing arrangement, PwC manages the client feedback questionnaire process on behalf of the Internal Audit Service. Client feedback received via the completed questionnaires is generally positive with responses scoring at least 87.5% across audit approach, communication and conduct and the issue of the audit report. In relation to timing, a small number of less favourable responses were received in relation to the completion of the audit within an acceptable timescale. The issues identified above are partly responsible for any perceived delays in completion of audits. We will use the feedback, where applicable, to improve the quality of the Internal Audit Service going forward.

8. OVERALL ASSESSMENT OF CONTROLS

- Internal Audit activity covered a diverse range of areas including Trade Waste, Financial Systems, Regulation of Investigatory Powers, SEEMIS, Procurement, Employability and Skills, Personal Protective Equipment, Serious Organised Crime, Health and Social Care Integration, Self-directed Support, Pay on Foot Parking, Risk Management, Information Governance, Treasury Management, Communication Strategy, Construction Industry Scheme, Sub-

Contractors, Stocks and Inventories, Grant Claims and Follow-up Reviews. The range of areas covered within the business continues to reflect the changing landscape and nature of internal audit work and focusses upon evaluating and contributing to improving the organisation's governance, risk management and control framework.

- The 2016/17 reviews of corporate and service systems identified that many of the expected controls are in place and operating satisfactorily in the areas examined. However, audit work also identified a number of areas requiring improvement and, consequently, Internal Audit reports included a range of recommendations and action plans (developed in consultation with management), which, once implemented, will improve the internal control framework. In addition, whilst not necessarily directly informed by the planned programme of work, the Internal Audit Service has assisted the Council through the provision of advice and guidance to make a number of improvements during 2016/17 to its internal control environment including risk management arrangements, improvements around the development of a revised corporate Whistleblowing Policy and associated recording and monitoring framework, resilience in general via the Integrity Group and financial controls. A number of areas are identified as requiring further improvement / development during 2017/18 including the Council's risk management arrangements, business continuity planning, grant funding, development of a construction and building services framework and the re-introduction of control self-assessment audits within Education, Housing and former Social Work Service establishments. In addition, a review of the Council's Standing Orders and Schemes of Administration is nearing completion and should be finalised. Senior officers in the Council are aware of these areas requiring improvement and steps are being taken to address them. Some of the more corporate areas should feature alongside other areas requiring improvement in the Continuous Improvement Agenda of the Council's Annual Governance Statement and will be formally reviewed by Internal Audit during the 2017/18 financial year.
- A total of 24 internal audit reports were finalised during the 2016/17 financial year and to date. A summary of these reports is attached at Appendix A, along with a summary of the progress review exercise carried out during 2016/17. In general, these reports have been well received by clients with management agreeing to implement 100% of the recommendations made. A total of 67 recommendations were made in the reports issued. Of these, 2 were categorised as critical, 45 were significant and the remaining 20 were considered to be routine. This compares to the previous financial year where a total of 66 recommendations were made.
- Analysis of the overall audit opinion for the reports issued highlighted that 4% of the areas reported upon were considered to be well controlled (full assurance), 38% were adequately controlled (reduced assurance) and 54% were requiring improvement (limited assurance). In addition, the overall conclusion drawn from one review was that there were significant weaknesses in the system which must be addressed. Since completion of the audit fieldwork for that review, a considerable amount of work has been undertaken by management to take forward the improvements recommended in the audit report. A formal follow-up of this area is scheduled to be undertaken as part of the 2017/18 Internal Audit Plan. A watching brief will continue to be kept on the global profile of the overall audit opinions.
- The PSIAS requires the Senior Manager – Internal Audit to deliver an internal audit opinion on the overall adequacy and effectiveness of the Council's framework of governance, risk management and control and that this opinion be used to inform the Council's Annual Governance Statement. This principle is also affirmed in the Local Authority Accounts (Scotland) Regulations 2014. Attached at Appendix B is the Senior Manager – Internal Audit's opinion which is supported by the audit work carried out by the Internal Audit Service and other relevant information. On the basis of the areas used to inform this process for the year to 31 March 2017, the overall audit opinion reached was that reasonable assurance can be placed upon the overall adequacy and effectiveness of the Council's framework of governance, risk management and control.

Summary of Internal Audit Reports and 2016/17 Progress Review Exercise

Key - Overall Level of Assurance			
F = Full The principal conclusion drawn from this review is that there is a sound system of control designed to achieve the system objectives and that the controls are being consistently applied.	R = Reduced The principal conclusion drawn from this review is that whilst there is basically a sound system of control there are some areas where it is viewed improvements can be made.	L = Limited The principal conclusion drawn from this review is that there are weaknesses in the system which should be addressed.	N = No The principal conclusion drawn from this review is that there are significant weaknesses in the system which must be addressed.

Summary of Internal Audit Reports

Report No.	Area Reviewed	Level of Assurance	Recommendations			
			Total No.	Importance		
				Critical	Significant	Routine
2014/17	Performance Indicators	R	1	-	1	-
2014/31	Trade Waste	L	4	-	2	2
2015/06	Financial Systems	L	3	-	3	-
2015/12	Regulation of Investigatory Powers	L	4	-	3	1
2015/13	SEEMIS	L	3	-	2	1
2015/16	Procurement	L	5	-	3	2
2015/19	Employability and Skills	L	5	-	3	2
2015/20	Communication Strategy *	L	3	-	2	1
2015/22	Construction Industry Scheme *	L	5	-	2	3
2015/24	Personal Protective Equipment	L	3	-	2	1
2015/27	Serious Organised Crime	L	2	-	1	1
2015/28	Health and Social Care Integration	R	1	-	1	-
2015/29	Self-Directed Support	R	2	-	1	1
2015/30	Sub-Contractors *	N	2	2	-	-
2015/32	Pay on Foot Parking	L	8	-	7	1
2015/33	Stocks and Inventories	R	2	-	1	1
2016/01	2015/16 Grant Claim – Air Quality Action Plan	F	0	-	-	-
2016/06	Grant Funding *	R	2	-	2	-
2016/08	Schemes of Administration	R	2	-	1	1
2016/09	Business Continuity *	R	1	-	1	-
2016/10	ICT Risk Management	L	1	-	1	-
2016/13	Information Governance	L	3	-	3	-
2016/16	Pension Fund – Treasury Management	R	4	-	2	2
2016/26	Information Security Management Systems *	R	1	-	1	-

* Submitted to June Scrutiny Committee (*Report 180-2017*)

Summary of 2016/17 Progress Review Exercise

As part of the 2016/17 Audit Plan, a total of 34 internal audit reports, 16 of which were also part of the 2015 Progress Review Exercise, were subject to a progress review. In total there were 80 outstanding recommendations from these audit reports. A copy of each outstanding recommendation was e-mailed to the officer allocated with responsibility for its implementation within a proforma designed to enable them to provide an update on implementation status. A summary of the outcome of the progress review exercise is detailed in the table below. A report on the exercise (296-2016) was presented to Scrutiny Committee in September 2016.

No. of Recommendations Outstanding	Fully Implemented	Partly Implemented	Not Implemented
80	40%	54%	6%

None of the recommendations recorded as 'not implemented' were critical. For the recommendations that were partly implemented or not yet implemented, assurances were provided to Internal Audit by Management that the outstanding areas would be addressed and where feasible revised timelines were provided. In terms of management responses to the progress reviews that were undertaken as part of the 2016/17 Plan, it was evident that there had been slippage in the anticipated original timeframes provided by management for the implementation of the recommendations in full. Whilst the specific reasons for this were varied, there were recurring themes, in particular structural changes that had taken place since the original audit reports were issued, in some instances resulting in the transfer of operational responsibility within or between services, and the ongoing replacement of core IT systems.

An update on progress towards full implementation of the outstanding recommendations will be sought during the 2017/18 Progress Review Exercise and reported to Scrutiny Committee.

To the Members of Dundee City Council, Chief Executive and Executive Director of Corporate Services

As Senior Manager – Internal Audit of Dundee City Council, I am pleased to present my annual opinion for the year ended 31 March 2017. It should be noted that the statement does not include assurances on group activities.

Respective Responsibilities of Management and Internal Audit in Relation to the Control Environment

It is the responsibility of the Council's officers to determine, establish and maintain sound systems of internal control, to ensure that the organisation's resources are properly applied in a manner and on the activities intended and the internal control arrangements are sufficient to address the risks facing their services. This includes responsibility for the prevention and detection of fraud. Management is also charged with monitoring the continuing effectiveness of the internal control environment and taking action as appropriate. It is the responsibility of the Senior Manager – Internal Audit to provide an annual assessment of the overall adequacy and effectiveness of the Council's framework of governance, risk management and control.

Control Environment

This comprises the governance, risk management and control processes in the context of the Council's defined goals and objectives. The key elements include the following:

- Consistency of operations with established goals and objectives.
- Effectiveness and efficiency of operations and deployment of resources.
- Compliance with significant policies, plans, procedures, laws, and regulations.
- Reliability and integrity of management and financial information processes, including the means to identify, measure, classify, and report such information.
- Safeguarding of assets.

A sound control environment reduces, but cannot eliminate, the possibility of poor judgement in decision-making, human error, control processes being deliberately circumvented by employees and others, management overriding controls and the occurrence of unforeseeable circumstances. It therefore provides reasonable but not absolute assurance that control weaknesses or irregularities do not exist or that there is no risk of material errors, losses, fraud or breaches of law or regulations. Accordingly, the Council is continually seeking to improve the adequacy and effectiveness of its control environment.

The Focus of Internal Audit Work

Internal Audit is an independent, objective assurance and consulting activity designed to add value and improve an organisation's operations. Through its work, internal audit helps an organisation accomplish its objectives by bringing a systematic, disciplined approach to evaluating and improving the effectiveness of governance, risk management and control. The Council's Internal Audit Service operates in accordance with the Public Sector Internal Audit Standards (PSIAS) and the Local Authority Accounts (Scotland) Regulations 2014. The requirements under PSIAS represent best practice and these, along with the Regulations, are mandatory.

The Senior Manager – Internal Audit prepares an annual internal audit plan which outlines the work to be undertaken. The internal audit plan is developed utilising a risk-based methodology based on the audit universe and takes into account the requirement placed upon the Senior Manager – Internal Audit to deliver an annual internal audit opinion on the overall adequacy and effectiveness of the organisation's control environment. In compiling the plan, input from Elected Members, senior management and any other relevant parties are sought and cognisance is taken of emerging issues. The plan needs to be flexible to be able to reflect the changing risks and priorities of the organisation. The plan, any material changes to the plan during the course of the financial year and any significant matters that may impact upon the delivery of the plan are reported to the Scrutiny Committee as appropriate.

The Internal Audit Service formally reports upon the areas subject to review. Such reports, which identify system weaknesses and / or non-compliance with expected controls, are issued for the attention of service managers and include appropriate recommendations and agreed action plans. It is management's responsibility to ensure that due consideration is given to internal audit reports. This includes management taking remedial action where appropriate or accepting that there may be a level of risk exposure if the weaknesses identified are not addressed for operational reasons. Internal Audit has a responsibility to ensure that agreed action plans have been implemented. Matters arising from internal audit work are also reported to the Council's Scrutiny Committee, the Chief Executive and the Council's External Auditor.

Summary of Internal Audit Activity

A total of 24 internal audit reports were issued. These covered a diverse range of areas including Trade Waste, Financial Systems, Regulation of Investigatory Powers, SEEMIS, Procurement, Employability and Skills, Personal Protective Equipment, Serious Organised Crime, Health and Social Care Integration, Self-directed Support, Pay on Foot Parking, Risk Management, Information Governance, Treasury Management, Communication Strategy, Construction Industry Scheme, Sub-Contractors, Stocks and Inventories, Grant Claims and Follow-up Reviews. The Internal Audit Service also undertook a comprehensive progress review exercise during the year and provided advice and guidance as required on the Council's control environment.

The 2016/17 audit of corporate and service systems has identified that many of the expected controls are in place and operating satisfactorily. However, the audit work has also identified scope for improvement in some systems which either have weaknesses in them or lack controls. The Internal Audit Service has put forward a range of recommendations in the areas examined and action plans have been developed in consultation with management which, as they are implemented, should result in continued improvement in the control environment.

Limitation of Scope

In the financial year under review there was no limitation of scope or independence placed upon the work undertaken by the Internal Audit Service.

Basis of Opinion

My evaluation of the framework of governance, risk management and control is informed by a number of sources which include the following:

- Audit work undertaken by the Internal Audit Service.
- The assessment of risk completed during the preparation of the 2016/17 and 2017/18 internal audit plans.
- Knowledge of the Council's culture, governance, risk management and performance monitoring arrangements.
- The Self Assessment Checklists completed by the relevant Executive Directors / Heads of Service (including the Checklist received from the Dundee Health and Social Care Partnership for former adult social work services) for providing formal assurances in respect of the general control environment within individual services.
- Reports issued by the Council's External Auditor together with reports from other external review and inspection bodies.

Opinion

It is my opinion, based on the above, that reasonable assurance can be placed upon the adequacy and effectiveness of the Council's framework of governance, risk management and control for the year to 31 March 2017.

Pamela Redpath

**Senior Manager – Internal Audit
Dundee City Council**

DATE

9 June 2017