

KEY INFORMATION

Ward West End

Proposal

16 bedroom extension to existing hotel, additional car parking and relocation of waste compound

Address

Invercarse Hotel
371 Perth Road
Dundee

Applicant

Redwood Leisure Ltd
Dunsinane House
Kilspindie Road
Dunsinane Industrial Estate
Dundee DD2 3JP

Agent

ARKTX Chartered Architects
187 Strathmartine Road
Dundee
DD3 8BL

Registered 19 Dec 2007

Case Officer Eve Jones



Proposed Extension to Invercarse Hotel

A bedroom extension to an existing hotel, additional car parking and relocation of waste compound is **RECOMMENDED FOR APPROVAL** subject to conditions. Report by Director of Planning and Transportation

RECOMMENDATION

The development complies with Policy 1 of the Dundee Local Plan Review 2005. Many objections relate to non-planning matters and the planning issues raised are of insufficient weight to justify refusal of the application. It is therefore recommended that planning permission be granted with conditions.

SUMMARY OF REPORT

- Planning permission is sought for the erection of a two-storey, 16 bedroom extension to the north of the existing hotel wing, the formation of 17 additional car parking spaces and the relocation of the existing waste management compound to the west of the site. The materials will be coloured masonry block and render with a curved grey membrane roof.
- This is a large well established hotel occupying a large site on the north side of Perth Road with the main car park to the rear. It is surrounded by residential properties and those to the east and north are at higher levels.
- Dundee Local Plan 2005 - Policy 1 Vibrant and Sustainable Communities is of relevance. The development complies with Policy 1 as it seeks to minimise any affect on the environmental quality enjoyed by local residents.
- Six objections were received from neighbouring residents on grounds of loss of privacy and overlooking; increased noise; loss of security; trees; light pollution; traffic and parking problems in Dunmore Drive and construction issues.
- It is concluded that insufficient weight can be accorded to the objections such as to justify the refusal of planning permission contrary to the provisions of the development plan. Some issues raised are matters for the management of the hotel to seek to address, they are not planning issues.

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL

Planning permission is sought for the erection of a 16 bedroom extension to this hotel, the formation of additional car parking and the relocation of the existing waste management compound. The extension will be two storey and provide 16 en suite rooms, including 2 family rooms and 1 disabled room. The materials will be coloured masonry block and render with a curved grey membrane roof. It will be located at the north of the existing bedroom wing.

The car parking will be increased by 17 spaces provided by an extension to the north of the existing car park including the area of the existing waste management compound. The compound will be relocated to a site on the west side of the site, closer to the hotel and enclosed by stone walls. It will contain the existing enclosed waste crusher and glass recycling bins

SITE DESCRIPTION

This is a large well established hotel occupying a large site on the north side of Perth Road. It is surrounded by residential properties on all sides. The site slopes up to the north and the houses to the north and east of the site are at a higher level than the car park. There is a high stone wall along the western boundary of the site.

The hotel comprises an original house which has been extended on several occasions to provide a bedroom wing to the north and a large function suite to the west.

The car parking is predominantly to the north and is accessed via a one way system with entry along the east side of the building and exit on the west via Dunmore Drive. Due to the slope, the car parking is at a higher level than the main hotel building.

The existing enclosed waste management compound lies on the side of the car park and is separated from the adjacent housing by a landscaped embankment with scrub vegetation. The compound currently contains the enclosed waste crusher, the glass recycling bins and two storage containers.

POLICY BACKGROUND

Dundee and Angus Structure Plan 2001-2016

There are no policies relevant to the determination of this application.

Dundee Local Plan 2005

The following policies are of relevance:

Policy 1 Vibrant and Sustainable Communities.



Scottish Planning Policies, Planning Advice Notes and Circulars

There are no statements of Government policy relevant to the determination of this application.

Non Statutory Statements of Council Policy

There are no non statutory Council policies relevant to the determination of this application.

SUSTAINABILITY ISSUES

There are no specific sustainability policy implications arising from this application.

SITE HISTORY

The site has been the subject of a number of planning permissions for extensions, elevational alterations and amendments to the car parking since 1985. The last extension to provide 12 en-suite rooms was approved in 1997. An earlier application for this proposed 16 bed extension was submitted on 8 October 2007 but was withdrawn before it could be registered as the applicant changed the car park layout and location of the waste management compound thus requiring the submission of a new application.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

The application was the subject of statutory Neighbour Notification and six objections were received from neighbouring residents on grounds of loss of privacy and overlooking; increased noise; loss of security; trees; light pollution; traffic and parking problems in Dunmore Drive and construction issues. Copies of the objections are available in Members' Lounges and the issues will be considered in the Observations below.

CONSULTATIONS

There were no adverse comments from consultees.

OBSERVATIONS

In accordance with the provisions of Section 25 of the Act the Committee is required to consider

- a whether the proposals are consistent with the provisions of the development plan; and if not
- b whether an exception to the provisions of the development plan is justified by other material considerations.

The Development Plan

The provisions of the development plan relevant to the determination of this application are specified in the Policy background section above.

Policy 1: Vibrant and Sustainable Communities - the City Council will promote vibrant communities, encouraging the development of an appropriate range of services and facilities close to and within housing areas. New development should be in accordance with other policies in the Plan and seek to minimise any affect on the environmental quality enjoyed by local residents by virtue of design, layout, parking and traffic movement issues, noise or smell.

This is an existing, well established hotel which is also a popular venue for weddings and other events.

The application will be considered in respect of the different elements:

- 1 the hotel extension
- 2 the extension to the car park
- 3 the relocation of the waste management area.

The Hotel Extension

The proposal is for the erection of a two storey extension to the existing two storey accommodation wing to provide 16 additional bedrooms. The extension is proposed to be built at right angles to the existing building which is at a lower level than the car parking area to the rear. This means that the upper floor will be at the same level as the main car park and this will minimise the impact of the building to the surrounding properties. The design of the roof which is a shallow curve also seeks to minimise the visual impact of the building.

The bedrooms windows are predominantly on the north and south

elevations of the extension looking on to the car parks. Only two bedroom windows are on the east elevation. The ones on the ground floor are below the level of the houses to the east. The upper window is 5 metres from the boundary and 10.6 metres from the nearest house to the east. This is exactly the same distance from the bedrooms windows of the existing accommodation wing and does not result in any significant loss of privacy.

The nearest neighbour who has objected on grounds of loss of privacy is 14 metres from the east facing windows and 11 metres from the north facing windows although in both cases it is an oblique angle of view rather than directly facing. The other objector is 21 metres away to the north, at a higher level and the direct view is blocked by garages.

It is considered that given the transient nature of hotel occupation it is likely that there will be a greater perception of loss of privacy from the neighbours' point of view rather than actual loss of privacy sufficient to warrant refusal of the application. Accordingly it is considered that the design and layout meet the requirements of Policy 1.

The Extension to the Car Park

The car park is proposed to be extended northwards by 5.5 metres to provide an extra 18 spaces. The car parking will also incorporate the site of the current waste management compound which lies beyond the car park. Neighbours to the north and east object to the additional car parking because of the noise impact of the existing car park. This relates to the noise of patrons as they leave functions in the early hours rather than the noise of cars. This is a management rather than a planning issue and increasing the size of the hotel does require the provision of additional car parking to try to prevent parking overspill into adjacent streets.

The Relocation of the Waste Management Area

The existing waste management area lies to the north of the car park at some distance from the hotel. It is large and includes two storage containers as well as bottle banks and a mechanical waste crusher. It is proposed to relocate the bottle banks and crusher to a site west of the down ramp, closer to the hotel in

an area enclosed by stone walls and proposed to be partly roofed over. It is considered that this will result in improved supervision of the area and the walls will screen any noise from nearby houses.

It is considered that the design and layout of the proposed hotel extension; additional car parking and relocated waste compound complies with Policy 1 as it seeks to minimise any affect on the environmental quality enjoyed by local residents.

It is concluded from the foregoing that the proposal complies with the provisions of the development plan.

Other Material Considerations

The other material considerations to be taken into account are as follows:

Objections

Six objections were received from neighbouring residents on grounds of loss of privacy and overlooking; increased noise; loss of security; trees; light pollution; traffic and parking problems in Dunmore Drive and construction issues.

Privacy and overlooking issues have been addressed in the policy section above. Noise created by patrons is a management issue for the hotel.

Loss of security. The existing north boundary of the car park is concrete panels which provide security to the adjoining houses. The proposed extended car park is to be bounded by a landscaped embankment. It is considered that the provision of a more secure boundary to the extended car park would enhance neighbours security and details can be the subject of a condition.

The plans indicate that existing trees will be retained and additional planting can be covered by condition. Similarly details of any additional lighting which may be required can be agreed prior to development to assess the impact of lights on residents.

Dunmore Drive.

Two residents from Dunmore Drive have objected on the basis that the existing hotel results in overspill parking which causes obstruction and during the construction period this would be likely to increase. On street parking is a matter for the police if residents driveways are obstructed and

similarly, construction traffic would require to comply with the law. These are matters for the management of the hotel and the construction process if Members are minded to agree with the recommendation of this report.

It is concluded that insufficient weight can be accorded to the objections such as to justify the refusal of planning permission contrary to the provisions of the development plan. Some issues raised are matters for the management of the hotel to seek to address, they are not planning issues.

Design

The design is a modern interpretation of the previous flat roofed bedroom extension with a more acceptable curved roof and improved elevation details and materials. Its construction, at right angles to the existing bedroom extension, will provide a "stop" to the building and will make any future extensions less likely.

CONCLUSION

The proposed development complies with Policy 1 as the extension to this well established hotel is designed to minimise impact on the environmental quality enjoyed by local residents. Many aspects of the objections relate to non-planning matters and the planning issues raised are of insufficient weight to justify refusal of the application. It is proposed to ensure that the additional car parking is provided prior to the development to minimise car park overspill in surrounding streets. This is the subject of appropriate conditions. It is therefore recommended that planning permission be granted with conditions.

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that consent be GRANTED subject to the following conditions:

- 1 The development hereby permitted shall be commenced within five years from the date of this permission.
- 2 Samples of the finishing materials proposed to be used shall be submitted to the Council for approval and if approved the development shall be carried out only in accordance with such approved samples.

- 3 Prior to the commencement of works for the construction of the extension hereby approved, the waste management compound shall be relocated in accordance with the approved plans.
- 4 Prior to the commencement of works for the construction of the extension hereby approved, the extension to the car park shall be constructed in accordance with the approved plans and the spaces shall be made available for occupation by hotel patrons.
- 5 Prior to the commencement of development, tree protection fencing in accordance with BS5837:2005 shall be erected on site around the trees to the north of the car park which are to be retained and such fencing shall be retained in place throughout the construction period. Relocation of any fencing to allow construction works to proceed shall be agreed with the Forestry and Enforcement officers prior to any movement of the fencing. No excavations, site works or services shall be carried out within the protected tree area and no soil, waste or materials shall be deposited within the tree area in such a position as to be likely to cause damage to the trees by affecting their root structure.
- 6 Details of any additional lighting which may be required within the car park shall be submitted to the City Council for approval prior to its installation and if approved, the works shall be carried out only in accordance with such approved details/
- 7 Prior to the commencement of development of the extension, a landscaping scheme for the north embankment shall be submitted for approval and if approved, the works shall be carried out only in accordance with such approved details.
- 8 The landscaping scheme approved in accordance with Condition 07 shall be fully implemented within 6 months of the completion of the extension hereby approved unless agreed in writing with the Planning Authority. Any trees which are planted and which die within 5 years of planting shall be replaced with trees of the same

species and size as previously approved.

- 9 Full details of a boundary enclosure to the proposed car park extension shall be submitted prior to the commencement of development and if approved, the works shall be carried out in accordance with such approved details prior to completion of the car parking area.

Reasons

- 1 To comply with Section 58 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997.
- 2 To ensure that the proposed development has a satisfactory external appearance in the interests of the visual amenities of the area.
- 3 In order to allow the extension of the car parking area as detailed in Condition 4.
- 4 In order to provide car parking to compensate for the temporary loss of spaces, elsewhere on the site, which will result from the construction of the extension.
- 5 To protect those trees which are of significant amenity value to the area and which would ensure an enhanced and satisfactory standard of appearance of the development.
- 6 In order to ensure that surrounding neighbours will not be adversely affected by light pollution.
- 7 To ensure a satisfactory standard of appearance of the development in the interests of the visual amenities of the area.
- 8 To ensure a satisfactory standard of appearance of the development in the interests of the visual amenities of the area.
- 9 In order to improve the security of the surrounding residential properties.