**KEY INFORMATION** 

#### Ward

Riverside

#### Proposal

2 storey extension to west elevation and erection of swift rooftop energy system turbine

#### Address

7 Rockfield Crescent Dundee DD2 1JE

#### Applicant

Prof Blow and Mrs Blow 7 Rockfield Crescent Dundee DD2 1JE

Agent

Registered	13 Mar 2006
Case Officer	S Cooper

# RECOMMENDATION

It is considered that the proposed extension complies with the provisions of the Development Plan. The proposed wind turbine would be situated on the rooftop on a prominent elevation of the house. However, as a form of renewable energy provision, the proposed wind turbine complies with wider objectives of the Council and the Government regarding sustainable development. This is in accordance with the provisions of Policy 77 of the Dundee Local Plan Review 2005, and National Planning Policy Guidance and Advice contained within NPPG6 and PAN45. It is considered that this outweighs the visual impact of the proposal and accordingly this application is recommended for APPROVAL.



Item 10

# House Extension and Domestic Wind Turbine Proposed in Rockfield Crescent

An extension and erection of a rooftop turbine is **RECOMMENDED FOR APPROVAL subject to conditions.** Report by Director of Planning and Transportation

# SUMMARY OF REPORT

- Planning permission is sought for the erection of a 2 storey extension on the west gable of the house. It is proposed to install a rooftop wind turbine on the roof of the proposed extension.
- The proposal raises issues in terms of Policies 1, 14 and 77 of the Dundee Local Plan Review 2005. Also relevant is the National Planning Policy Guidance and Advice contained within NPPG6 and PAN 45.
- Objection letters were received from 3 objectors. The grounds of objection raised include visual impact and noise emissions.
- The proposed extension is of an acceptable design and would not be detrimental to the amenity of neighbouring residential properties. It is also considered that the proposed wind turbine would not be detrimental to neighbouring properties by way of noise. The wind turbine would be visually prominent, however as a form of sustainable development, it is considered that there are material considerations that would justify the granting of planning permission.

Page 45

#### Page 46

# DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL

Planning permission is sought for the erection of a 2 storey extension on the west elevation of the house. The proposal also incorporates a rooftop wind turbine on a flat section of the roof of the proposed extension.

The proposed extension would have three levels of accommodation, with a staircase on all three levels to provide access to the roofspace. The extension would also accommodate a utility room on ground floor and an en suite on the first floor.

The external walls of the proposed extension would have a wet dash rendered finish. The roof of the proposed extension would have sloped sides and a flat top. The roofslopes would be clad with slate.

It is proposed to erect a rooftop wind turbine on the flat section of the roof of the proposed extension. The wind turbine would have a diameter of some 2 metres.

### SITE DESCRIPTION

The application relates to a detached 2 storey and attic house at 7 Rockfield Crescent, Dundee. There is garden ground to the front and rear of the house. The ground floor level of the house is approximately 1.5 metres higher than street level. There is mature planting along the boundaries

houses with Rockfield of providing Crescent soft landscaping and partial screening of houses. The property is bounded by residential properties to the east and west, by Rockfield Crescent to the south and by Middlebank Road to the north. 7 Rockfield Crescent is not listed as being of special architectural or historic interest, and is not located within a Conservation Area.

## POLICY BACKGROUND

#### Dundee and Angus Structure Plan 2001-2016

There are no policies relevant to the determination of this application.

#### Dundee Local Plan 2005

The following policies are of relevance:

Policy 1: Vibrant and Sustainable Communities.

Policy 14: Alterations and Extensions to Houses.

Policy 77: Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency.



SOUTH ELEVATION

Scottish Planning Policies, Planning Advice Notes and Circulars

The following are relevant:

- NPPG 6: Renewable Energy
- PAN 45: Renewable Energy Technologies.



# Non Statutory Statements of Council Policy

There are no non statutory Council policies relevant to the determination of this application.

## Application No 06/00235/FUL

# LOCAL AGENDA 21

The proposed rooftop wind turbine would provide energy from a renewable source and as such is considered to be sustainable, in accordance with the aims of Local Agenda 21.

### SITE HISTORY

There is no planning history of relevance.

# PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

The applicant has carried out the Statutory Neighbour Notification procedures. Objection letters have been received from 3 objectors.

The grounds of objection are:

- Noise from the wind turbine;
- Visual impact of the wind turbine; and
- Impact of the movement of the wind turbine on the stability of the building.

It is intended to comment on these issues in the "Observations" section of this report. Copies of these letters are available for inspection in the Members Lounges.

#### CONSULTATIONS

No adverse comments were received from consultees. The Head of

Environmental Health and Trading Standards has no objection to the proposed wind turbine.

#### **OBSERVATIONS**

In accordance with the provisions of Section 25 of the Act the Committee is required to consider:

(a) whether the proposals are consistent with the provisions of the development plan; and if not

(b) whether an exception to the provisions of the development plan is justified by other material considerations

#### The Development Plan

The provisions of the development plan relevant to the determination of

#### Application No 06/00235/FUL

this application are specified in the Policy background section above.

Policy 1 aims to promote vibrant and sustainable communities whilst minimising the environmental quality enjoyed by residents by virtue of design, layout, parking and traffic movement issues, noise or smell.

In terms of Policy 1 the proposed extension and wind turbine raise issues in terms of design and noise. Accordingly issues regarding layout, parking and traffic movement and smell can be discharged.

In terms of design it is considered that the architectural form and style of the extension is designed to complement the existing that of house. Furthermore, it is considered that the proposed extension would be finished in materials that would complement the finish of the existing house. By virtue of its size and positioning it is considered that the extension would not adversely impact on the daylight or sunlight received by neighbouring residential properties.

The wind turbine would be positioned on the flat section of the roof of the The turbine itself is extension. designed to optimise energy gain from the wind. It would have a diameter of 2 metres. The turbine is designed to minimise noise. It has a ring diffuser to prevent violent vortices at blade tips, 5 blades to reduce rotation speed, a gearless motor and specifically designed mounting brackets incorporating rubber dampening systems to further reduce noise.

By its nature the wind turbine has to be located at a high, fairly open point in order to maximise energy capture. As such, the turbine would be fairly prominent within the streetscene, although some screening would be afforded to it by the planting in the front garden of the applicant's house.

Although the wind turbine would be prominently positioned its purpose is to provide energy from a renewable source. As such it is considered to comply with the Council's and also the Government's goals of promoting sustainable development. It is therefore considered that this material consideration outweighs the impact that the proposed wind turbine may have on the character and appearance of the streetscene.

Literature supplied by the applicant give rise to over neighbouring properties. **Dundee City Council Development Quality Committee** 

produce less than 35dB(A) at a height of 8 metres to the hub of the turbine, with wind speeds of 10 metres per second. The proposed turbine would be higher than that at around 10 metres to the hub. The Head of Environmental Health and Trading Standards has advised that the information supplied demonstrates that even at 35Db(A) the proposal would not be detrimental to the environmental quality enjoyed by residents by way of noise emissions. In the event that complaints were received, the turbine can be investigated under the Environmental Protection Act 1990 in terms of statutory noise nuisance and where appropriate, action taken.

It is therefore considered that the proposal accords with the provisions of Policy 1 of the Dundee Local Plan Review 2005.

In terms of Policy 14, the main issues for consideration are the impact of the proposal in terms of the character and appearance of the house and area, impact on garden ground, and residential amenity of neighbouring properties.

In terms of the proposed extension, its impact on the character and appearance of the house in terms of design and materials has been discussed above. It is considered that the design of the extension and its finishing materials would complement the existing building and as such the proposed extension accords with this requirement of Policy 14.

The proposed extension would have a fairly modest footprint and would not result in the loss in more than 50% of the useable garden ground in accordance with the provisions of Policy 14.

There would be high level 'porthole' windows in the west gable wall of the proposed extension. Those windows would be to provide natural light to the staircase. Given the position and height of those windows, and that they are to serve a staircase, it is considered that they would not give rise to harmful overlooking of the neighbouring property to the west. There are no other windows in the proposed extension that would directly face windows of other residential properties at a distance of less than 18 metres. Accordingly it is considered that the proposed extension would not give rise to overlooking of neighbouring properties. By virtue of the size, form and positioning of the proposed extension it is considered that it would not give rise to such a degree of overshadowing of neighbouring properties so as to be detrimental to the residential amenity of them.

It is therefore considered that the proposed extension accords with the provisions of Policy 14 of the Dundee Local Plan Review 2005.

The proposed wind turbine also raises issues in terms of Policy 14 in terms of its impact on the character and appearance of the building and surrounding area. This issue is discussed above. Due to the nature of the proposal it is inevitable that it will be positioned in a prominent position in order to maximise energy gain. As such the proposed wind turbine would prominent within the appear streetscene. However, as a form of sustainable development the proposal is in line with wider aims of the Council and the Government. This issue is covered by Policy 77 of the Dundee Local Plan Review 2005, as well as National Planning Policy Guideline 6: Renewable Energy, and Planning Advice Note 45: Renewable Energy Technologies.

Policy 77 is generally supportive of small scale wind energy developments where they are consistent with the Environmental Policies of the Local Plan and have no significant adverse impact on neighbouring residential occupiers, other users or road safety by reason of visual disturbance, noise emission, shadow flicker, reflected light or electro magnetic influences; landscape; and aircraft activity or known flight paths of migratory birds.

The issues of visual impact and noise emission have been fully discussed above.

The proposal is for a small scale domestic wind turbine. It is considered that due to the small scale nature of the proposal it would raise no issues in terms of the wider landscape, aircraft activity or known flight paths of migratory birds.

The supporting documentation submitted with the application states that as a result of the small size of the turbine, it would have no effect on TV/radio reception, mobile telephone reception or microwave communication links. The system generates electricity as low voltages

### Page 47

#### Page 48

and as such emits electromagnetic radiation comparable to common household goods.

Similarly, due to the small scale of the proposal and its position on the building relative to neighbouring residential properties, it is considered that the proposed development would not create a significant degree of shadow flicker such as to be detrimental to the amenity of neighbouring properties.

It is therefore considered that the proposed wind turbine complies with the provisions of Policy 77 of the Dundee Local Plan, and with National Planning Policy Guidance and Advice contained within NPPG 6 and PAN 45

It is concluded from the foregoing that the proposal does not accord with the provisions of the development plan in terms of the visual impact of the proposed wind turbine. It is inevitable that in order to maximise energy gain from the wind, the turbine will be visually prominent. However as a form of renewable energy and thus sustainable development the proposal is in line with wider aims of the Council and the Government to promote sustainable development. In of sustainable the context development, renewable energy offers many advantages. Scotland has one of the best wind regimes in Europe, and as an unlimited resource, can contribute to the energy supply without depleting non-renewable sources such as fossil fuels. It is considered that this material consideration outweighs the visual impact of the proposed wind turbine.

Accordingly, it is recommended that planning permission be granted.

#### Other Material Considerations

The other material considerations to be taken into account are the views of the objectors.

The grounds of objection relating to visual impact and noise emissions have been discussed in detail above.

The impact of the wind turbine on the stability of the building is not a material consideration in the determination of this application.

It is concluded from the foregoing that insufficient weight can be accorded to any of the material considerations such as to justify the refusal of planning permission contrary to the provisions of the development plan. It is therefore recommended that planning permission be granted with conditions.

#### Design

It is considered that the proposed extension has been designed to complement the design of the existing house. Furthermore, the finishing materials would complement the existing finish of the house. The wind turbine would be visually prominent. However, it is designed to minimise impact on residential amenity of neighbouring properties in terms of noise. Some screening would also be afforded by the trees in front of the applicant's house.

## CONCLUSION

It is considered that the proposed extension complies with the provisions of the development plan. The proposed wind turbine would be visually prominent, on a prominent elevation of the house. However, as a form of renewable energy provision, the proposed wind turbine complies with wider objectives of the Council and the Government to promote sustainable development and the use of renewable energy systems. This is in accordance with the provisions of Policy 77 of the Dundee Local Plan Review 2005, and National Planning Policy Guidance and Advice contained within NPPG6 and PAN45. It is considered that this outweighs the visual impact of the proposal and accordingly it is recommended that planning permission be granted.

## RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that planning permission be GRANTED subject to the following condition:

1 The development hereby permitted shall be commenced within five years from the date of this permission.

#### Reason

1 To comply with Section 58 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997.

## Dundee City Council Development Quality Committee