

KEY INFORMATION

Ward Craigebank

Proposal

Upgrading of bedroom accommodation and insertion of dormer windows

Address

Tayview Hotel
214 Broughty Ferry Road
Dundee

Applicant

Mr Stuart Hill
Tayview Hotel
214 Broughty Ferry Road
Broughty Ferry
DD4 6LD

Agent

Registered 24 Jan 2006

Case Officer C Walker



Proposed Attic Bedrooms in Tayview Hotel

The upgrading of bedroom accommodation and insertion of dormer windows is **RECOMMENDED FOR REFUSAL**. Report by Director of Planning and Transportation

RECOMMENDATION

The proposed dormers are of unsatisfactory design and would detract from the visual appearance of the building and the wider residential area contrary to both Policies 1 and 55 of the Plan. It is therefore recommended that planning permission is **REFUSED**.

SUMMARY OF REPORT

- Planning permission is sought to erect flat roofed box dormer extensions on the front and rear elevations of the building to provide enhanced bedroom accommodation.
- The Tayview Hotel is an attractive stone and slate one and a half storey building which sits in a very elevated position above Broughty Ferry Road. The existing dormers are modest in scale and fit neatly within the roofscape.
- Policy 1 and 55 of the Local Plan encourage good design quality.
- No objections were received but at the request of Bailie Corrigan this application is being put before the Development Quality Committee for its decision.
- The proposed dormers are of functional design and their only purpose appears to be to maximise the space within the upper floor of the building. Their box like shape and extensive areas of walling contrast sharply with the elegance of the existing dormers. It is considered that the proposed dormers are of unsatisfactory design and would detract from the visual appearance of the building and the wider residential area contrary to both Policies 1 and 55 of the Plan.

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL

Planning permission is sought to erect flat roofed box dormer extensions on the front and rear elevations of the building. On the south elevation, which overlooks Broughty Ferry Road, it is proposed to link two existing small splayed dormers with a box dormer some 4.5 metres in length. On the north elevation, which faces Murray St and the vehicular access to the site, it is proposed to form 2 box dormers, one of some 4 metres and the other of some 4.5 metres in length. In all cases it is proposed to clad the front and sides of the dormers in slate to match the existing roof.

Internally the proposed dormers would increase the upper floor area of the building so that 5 substantial bedrooms, each with en suite bathrooms, could be formed. The current layout provides 6 rooms, 5 of which are very small, and a common bath room and shower room.

SITE DESCRIPTION

The site comprises the Tayview Hotel, an attractive stone and slate one and a half storey building which sits in a very elevated position above Broughty Ferry Road. The south facing elevation commends extensive views over the Tay and would have been the principal elevation but now only pedestrian access is taken from Broughty Ferry Road. The north elevation, which has been rendered and painted white, faces Murray St and overlooks the hotel car park.

There are dormer windows on the roof of the building, 3 on the front (south) and 2 on the back (north). These dormers are modest in scale and fit neatly within the roofscape. They dormers on the south elevation comprise 2 splayed dormers at either end and a small eye dormer in the centre. The dormers on the north elevation have side walls. All the dormers, other than the small eye dormer on the front elevation, have hipped slated roofs.

A single storey extension has been constructed on the Murray Street elevation to provide a new entrance and toilets.

To the east, west and north of the site are dwellings on Broughty Ferry Road and Murray Street.

POLICY BACKGROUND

Dundee and Angus Structure Plan 2001-2016

There are no policies relevant to the determination of this application.



Dundee Local Plan Review 2005

Policy 1: Vibrant and Sustainable Communities seeks to safeguard the amenity of residential areas in terms of design as well as layout, parking and traffic movement, and noise and smell issues.

Policy 55: Urban Design places an emphasis on design quality.



Policy 30: Visitor Accommodation supports new facilities in the City Centre and Central Broughty Ferry and contains a presumption against additional out of centre hotel accommodation.

Scottish Planning Policies, Planning Advice Notes and Circulars

There are no statements of Government policy relevant to the determination of this application.

Application No 06/00060/FUL

Non Statutory Statements of Council Policy

There are no non-statutory Council policies relevant to the determination of this application.

LOCAL AGENDA 21

The proposal does not comply with Key Theme 13, "Places, spaces and objects combine meaning and beauty with utility" or Key Theme 15, "Diversity and local distinctiveness are valued and protected".

SITE HISTORY

The premises have operated as a hotel for a considerable period of time. Planning permission for the new entrance extension on the north elevation of the building was granted in June 2001 - application 01/25171/D refers.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

The applicant carried out the statutory notification of neighbours and no response was received. However at the request of Bailie Corrigan this application is being put before the Development Quality Committee for its decision.

CONSULTATIONS

No comments were received from Statutory Consultees.

OBSERVATIONS

In accordance with the provisions of Section 25 of the Act the Committee is required to consider:

- a whether the proposals are consistent with the provisions of the development plan; and if not
- b whether an exception to the provisions of the development plan is justified by other material considerations.

The Development Plan

The provisions of the development plan relevant to the determination of this application are specified in the Policy background section above.

The sole issue for consideration here is whether the design of the proposed dormer extensions is satisfactory taking into account the terms of Policy

1 which seeks to safeguard the amenity of residential areas in terms of design and Policy 55 which places an emphasis on design quality.

The existing building is of attractive design and commands a very prominent and elevated position. The roof is particularly prominent and the existing dormers are modest in scale and fit well within the roofscape.

The proposed dormers are of functional design and their only purpose appears to be to maximise the space within the upper floor of the building. Their box like shape and extensive areas of walling contrast sharply with the elegance of the existing dormers. It is considered that the proposed dormers are of unsatisfactory design and would detract from the visual appearance of the building and the wider residential area contrary to both Policies 1 and 55 of the Plan. Although the north elevation is less prominent, it is still clearly visible from Murray Street and the elevated houses on the north side of the street.

Policy 30 contains a presumption against additional out of centre hotel accommodation but the preamble to the policy suggests that this presumption should not prevent small scale extensions to existing facilities.

It is concluded from the foregoing that the proposal does not comply with the provisions of the development plan.

Other Material Considerations

The other material consideration to be taken into account is that the proposed development involves the provision of good quality bedroom accommodation for an existing hotel. However this accommodation could be provided within the existing layout although the scale of development would need to be reduced to provide 4 bedrooms rather than 5, and 2 of them would be slightly smaller and 2 slightly larger than the proposed layout.

It is not considered that the provision of this enhanced accommodation on the scale proposed is sufficient to overcome the concerns about the design of the proposed dormer extensions. It is concluded from the foregoing that insufficient weight can be placed on the provision of enhanced accommodation to justify the grant of planning permission. It is therefore

recommended that planning permission be refused.

Design

The proposed dormers are of functional design and their only purpose appears to be to maximise the space within the upper floor of the building. Their box like shape and extensive areas of walling contrast sharply with the elegance of the existing dormers. It is considered that the proposed dormers are of unsatisfactory design and would detract from the visual appearance of the building and the wider residential area.

CONCLUSION

The proposed dormers are of unsatisfactory design and would detract from the visual appearance of the building and the wider residential area contrary to both Policies 1 and 55 of the Plan. It is therefore recommended that planning permission is refused.

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that planning permission be REFUSED for the following reason:

Reason

- 1 The proposed dormers are of unsatisfactory design and their box like shape and extensive areas of walling contrast sharply with the elegance of the existing dormers. As such they would detract from the appearance of this visually prominent building and the wider residential area contrary to both Policies 1 and 55 of the adopted Dundee Local Plan Review 2005. There are no material considerations that would justify a departure from the policies of the development plan in this instance.