

**KEY INFORMATION****Ward** Broughty Ferry**Proposal**

Erection of proposed new scout halls and residential development

**Address**Land east of David Street/West of Ambrose Street, Broughty Ferry  
Dundee DD5 2BS**Applicant**Broughty Ferry Scouts  
Group, c/o Mr W Barry  
2 Hamilton Street  
Barnhill  
Dundee DD5 2NR**Agent**KDM Architects  
15 Camperdown Street  
Broughty Ferry  
Dundee DD5 3AA**Registered** 16 Sept 2003**Case Officer** Julie Finlay

## New Scout Hall and Housing Proposed at Ambrose Street

A proposed new scout hall and residential development is **RECOMMENDED FOR APPROVAL** subject to conditions. Report by Director of Planning and Transportation

**RECOMMENDATION**

The proposed development complies with the Development Plan Policies and provides an acceptable standard of residential amenity for the occupants of the proposed houses. The application is therefore recommended for **APPROVAL** with conditions.

**SUMMARY OF REPORT**

- Planning permission is sought for the development of new scout halls and 4 houses on land to the east of David Street and west of Ambrose Street, Broughty Ferry, Dundee.
- The application was advertised as potentially contrary to Policy H10 of the Dundee Local Plan 1998 due to the lack of parking spaces within the curtilage of the houses. However the applicant has provided a private courtyard for parking and this will have a gated entrance to ensure its use solely for the residents. Three parking spaces will also be provided within the courtyard for scout staff and these will have lockable bollards to ensure only staff can use them.
- Three letters of objection, one letter of concern and one letter of support were received to the application. The grounds of objection raised are parking and traffic issues; design and height of buildings; adverse impact on conservation area and residential amenity issues.
- It is considered that the demolition of the existing scout halls is acceptable due to the deteriorating condition of the interior structure and the excessive costs to repair and replace the structure. The design of the new halls and houses are considered acceptable and comply with development plan policies.

## DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL

Planning permission is sought for the development of new scout halls and 4 houses (one detached and three terraced) on the site of existing derelict scout halls, which it is proposed to demolish. The scout hall will be finished in a tinted wetdash render, reconstituted stone to basecourse, natural stone from duntakings for features, profiled metal cladding to resemble white painted timber boarding and natural slate roof. The houses will have a tinted wetdash render, reconstituted stone basecourse, painted timber boarding and natural slate roof. Each garden area is over 50 square metres and will have timber fences of various heights from 1.2m to 1.8m high along the boundaries.

## SITE DESCRIPTION

The application site is located on the east side of David Street and west side of Ambrose Street. The entrance to the scout halls is accessed from David Street and there is currently space within the site on this elevation for staff parking. There are parking spaces and a carport directly in front of the halls on David Street, which are used by residents from a sheltered housing complex immediately to the north of the site. The current halls are single storey and built in stone with a slate roof. There is a mixture of single, two storey, two and a half and three storey residential properties on both Ambrose Street and David Street. Vehicular access to Ambrose Street is by King Street to the north and there is a turning head at the east side of the halls. David Street is not a through road.

## POLICY BACKGROUND

### Dundee and Angus Structure Plan 2001-2016

There are no policies relevant to the determination of this application.

### Dundee Local Plan 1998

The following policies are of relevance:

H1: Existing Residential Areas

H10: Design of New Housing. This Policy sets out the guidelines for the design and layout of new housing.

BE1: Design Quality

BE11: Development in Conservation Areas

### Dundee Urban Nature Conservation Subject Local Plan 1995

There are no policies relevant to the determination of this application.

### Finalised Dundee Local Plan Review

The following policies are of relevance:

Policy 1: Vibrant and Sustainable Communities

Policy 4: Design of New Housing



Policy 61: Development in Conservation Areas

Policy 88: Residential Parking

### Scottish Planning Policies, Planning Advice Notes and Circulars

The following policies are of relevance:

NPPG 18: Planning and the Historic Environment

### Non Statutory Statements of Council Policy.

There are no non statutory Council policies relevant to the determination of this application.

## LOCAL AGENDA 21

Key Theme 12 states that opportunities for culture, leisure and recreation are readily available to all.

Key Theme 13 states that places, spaces and objects should combine meaning and beauty with utility.

Key Theme 15 is of relevance to the application and it seeks to ensure that diversity and local distinctiveness are valued and protected.

## SITE HISTORY

There is no site history directly relevant to the application site. However, planning permission was previously approved for the development of scout halls on the site of a C(s) listed shelter at The Esplanade on 13.3.00.

The project to replace or upgrade the halls began back in 1995. A Committee was formed to examine the condition of the building and bring forward a proposal for upgrading it. The project slowed to a halt and was resurrected again in 1998. Four alternative sites were offered to the scouts from Dundee City Council. Only one of the sites was found to be suitable and this was a site on The Esplanade with a derelict, listed shelter. Planning permission was granted in March 2000, but a partner listed building application for the demolition of the shelter was refused after an appeal to Historic Scotland.

## PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Statutory neighbour notification was carried out and 3 letters of objection were received. The main points of objection were:

- 1 Adverse effect on street scene and conservation area;
- 2 Overlooking and overshadowing;
- 3 Design and height;
- 4 Traffic and parking.

A letter of concern was also received from a neighbour to the north of the development site who want assurances that either the existing north wall will be used as a divider or something inoffensive will be built in its place.

In addition, there was a letter of support for the demolition of the existing halls as they are considered an "eyesore".

## CONSULTATIONS

The relevant Council Departments and outside bodies have been consulted with regard to the proposed development and no adverse comments were received.

## OBSERVATIONS

In accordance with the provisions of Section 25 of the Act the Committee is required to consider:

- a whether the proposals are consistent with the provisions of the development plan; and if not
- b whether an exception to the provisions of the development plan is justified by other material considerations.

## Background

Several options were considered for the site including reuse of the existing building and site, with major repairs, refurbishment and modernisation; partial demolition or complete demolition of the buildings. A detailed cost appraisal was carried out and complete demolition was chosen as being the most viable option.

The applicant has been successful in receiving funding for the redevelopment of the scout halls. However further financial assistance is required and so they have proposed housing within the site. The sale of these will generate funding which is required for the redevelopment of the halls.

## The Development Plan

The provisions of the development plan relevant to the determination of this application are specified in the Policy background section above.

## Dundee Local Plan 1998

Policy H1 states that developments will be permitted within existing residential areas where they do not adversely affect the environmental quality enjoyed by local residents by virtue of design, layout, parking and traffic movement issues, noise or smell. The proposal is to replace existing scout halls with new ones and to build four houses within the site. A new use is not being introduced into this established residential area and issues such as parking and traffic

movement have been addressed. Both staff parking for the scout halls and residential parking have been proposed within a courtyard which is accessed from Ambrose Street. 3 staff spaces have been provided and 6 spaces for residential parking and this number is considered acceptable. The staff parking spaces will have lockable bollards to ensure they are kept solely for staff use. The car parking courtyard will have a boundary treatment of a 1.8m high close boarded type vertical slatted timber fences around the car park area with a mix of 1.5m and 1.2m high timber fences between garden areas. The Council encouraged the applicant to include the installation of gates at the entrance to the pend from Ambrose Street to ensure privacy for residents and scout staff parking provision.

The layout, design and use of materials for the proposed scout halls are considered appropriate. The halls will be entered on the David Street elevation, as presently. There will be two fire exits on the Ambrose Street elevation and facing into the courtyard. The halls will be finished in a tinted wetdash render, reconstituted stone basecourse, natural stone for features, profiled metal cladding to resemble white painted timber boarding and slate roof. These materials will blend in appropriately with the surrounding buildings and area, which is within a conservation area. The design and layout of the houses are considered acceptable and this will be discussed further in the following paragraph.

Policy H10 requires specific criteria to be met when housing development is proposed. It specifies that each house should have 50sqm of garden ground, 100% parking, 30% visitor parking and 18m between facing habitable rooms. A large proportion of the houses should have three bedrooms or more. The proposal meets these requirements as two of the houses have 3 bedrooms, each private garden area is over 50sqm and there is more than 18m between any facing habitable rooms. Although the parking is not within the curtilage of each house, it is considered acceptable as it is within a private courtyard, which will have a gated entrance and will be separate from the scout staff parking spaces.

Policy BE1 states that the Council will expect the highest standards of composition and design in all new

development and its careful integration with its surroundings as regards scale, form, siting, alignment, materials and landscaping. There was pre-application discussion regarding the proposals and design and it is considered acceptable as it will blend in with the immediate and surrounding environment.

Policy BE11 states that within conservation areas all development proposals will be expected to complement and enhance the character of the surrounding area. It is considered that the scale and design of the proposed halls and housing blends in with the surrounding buildings.

It is concluded from the foregoing that the proposal complies with the provisions of the development plan.

## Other Material Considerations

The other material considerations to be taken into account are as follows:

## Finalised Dundee Local Plan Review

Policies 1 and 4 reiterate Policy H1 and H10 of the Adopted Plan and as discussed above it is considered that the proposal complies with these policies.

Policy 61 provides advice on development in Conservation Areas and as discussed above, it is considered that the proposals complement the surrounding buildings and environment.

Policy 88 states that new residential developments will be required to provide parking in accordance with the revised Roads and Parking Standards Document. The parking provision is considered acceptable.

## NPPG 18: Planning and the Historic Environment

Paragraph 13 refers specifically to conservation areas and indicates that under section 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas)(Scotland) Act 1997 planning authorities are required to pay special attention to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of the relevant designated area. Paragraph. 47 states that in all cases of demolition prior consideration should be given to the

scope for recycling buildings which have clear historic or architectural significance. A justification was provided for the demolition of the existing scout halls due to the poor condition of the buildings and cost implications and this is considered acceptable.

## The Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas

The Memorandum sets out the Scottish Ministers' views on development affecting listed buildings and conservation areas. Paragraph 4.28 indicates that if anyone wishes to demolish a building within a conservation area, planning authorities should take account of the importance of the building to the character or appearance of any part of the conservation, and of proposals for the future of the cleared site. If the building is considered to be of any value, a positive attempt should always be made by the planning authority to achieve its retention, restoration and sympathetic conversion to some other compatible use before proposals to demolish are seriously investigated. In some cases, demolition may be thought appropriate, for example, if the building is of little townscape value, if its structural condition rules out its retention at reasonable cost, or if its form or location makes its re-use extremely difficult.

Paragraph 4.29 continues to say that in instances where demolition is to be followed by re-development of the site, consent to demolish should in general be given only where there are acceptable proposals for the new building.

The applicant has provided an acceptable justification for the demolition of the scout halls, with the main reasons given as cost due to existing structural and decay problems with the building. The new scout halls and housing are considered an acceptable design for the site and will blend in appropriately with the surrounding area.

## Objections

Traffic and parking.

At present there are three options which the public use for drop off/pick up points.

- 1 Some parents drive up David Street and drop off/pick up children at the entrance. They then carry out a manoeuvre to turn their cars that involves a five point turn in and out of the site entrance and opposite lane. Given the number of children and the narrowness of David Street, this can be unsafe.
- 2 Pick up/drop off children from the Ambrose Street side of the building. This involves driving down Ambrose Street and turning at the bottom and parking temporarily while drop off/pick up occurs. The existing hammerhead which is used for turning is often blocked with parked cars. Again there are a lot of children about and cars parked on both sides of the street and it makes an unsafe environment.
- 3 Some parents temporarily park in Fisher Street and drop off/pick up children from here. This is considered the safest option as Fisher Street is substantially wider than both David and Ambrose Street and there are a few spaces available to enable safe, temporary parking.

## Overshadowing and overlooking

Due to the orientation and height of both the proposed halls and houses it is not considered there will be a huge degree of overshadowing that would justify refusal of the application.

## Design and height of buildings

There is currently a mixture of one, two, two and a half and three storey buildings on both David Street and Ambrose Street. It is not considered that the proposed buildings will be out of character or context with the surrounding buildings.

It is concluded from the foregoing that insufficient weight can be accorded to any of the material considerations such as to justify the refusal of planning permission contrary to the provisions of the development plan. It is therefore recommended that planning permission be granted with conditions.

## Design

The design and layout of the proposed development has been the subject of pre-application discussion. The

design, appearance, form, scale, style and materials of the development are considered appropriate for this location.

## CONCLUSION

The proposals comply with the relevant adopted and revised policies of the Local Plan and will complement and enhance the immediate and surrounding area. There are no material considerations that would justify the refusal of the application in these circumstances.

## RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that planning permission be GRANTED subject to the following conditions:

- 1 The development hereby permitted shall be commenced within five years from the date of this permission.
- 2 Samples of the finishing materials proposed to be used shall be submitted to the Council for approval before any development is commenced and if approved the development shall be carried out only in full accordance with such approved detail.
- 3 Details of the proposed gates into the courtyard area at Ambrose Street shall be submitted to the Council for approval before any development is commenced and if approved the development shall be carried out only in full accordance with such approved details.
- 4 Details of the windows and doors of the proposed houses shall be submitted to the Council for approval before any development is commenced and if approved the development shall be carried out only in full accordance with such approved details.

## Reason

- 1 To comply with Section 58 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997.
- 2 To ensure that the proposed development has a satisfactory external appearance in the interests of the visual amenities of the area.

- 3 To ensure a satisfactory standard of appearance of the development.
- 4 To ensure a satisfactory standard of appearance of the development.