

REPORT TO: DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL EDUCATION COMMITTEE -
16 DECEMBER 2002

REPORT ON: DUNDEE SCHOOLS PPP PROJECT – REPORT ON THE OUTCOME
OF THE FORMAL CONSULTATION PROCESS

REPORT BY: DIRECTOR OF EDUCATION

REPORT NO: 898-2002

1.0 PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 1.1 This report details the representations made during the formal publication and consultation exercise on the proposed Dundee Schools PPP Project and seeks instruction on how to proceed with the individual and inter-related projects therein.

2.0 RECOMMENDATIONS

- 2.1 It is recommended that the Committee:-

- (i) note the representations made during the formal consultation exercise on the proposed Dundee Schools PPP Project. A summary table of the key recurring issues raised at the public meetings is contained at Appendix 1 to this report. Copies of the full notes taken at the public meetings along with other written submissions received are available in the Councillors' Lounge and from the Members' Secretariat.
- (ii) instruct the Director of Education to implement the recommendations relating to the projects described at paragraphs 7.1 to 7.8 below.
- (iii) instruct the Director of Education to undertake new formal consultation procedures associated with any recommendation that has not been consulted on as part of the current formal consultation exercise.
- (iv) remit to the Policy and Resources Committee for their authorisation any financial implications arising from changes to the project.

3.0 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- 3.1 The Education Committee, on 16 September 2002, approved the revised Outline Business Case, and that OBC required Level Playing Field Support (LPFS) of £5.52m per annum, and had an affordability gap of £837,000 per annum. It is expected that this affordability gap will be closed by a combination of accessing funds from the European Development Fund and other bodies and by the application of Capital receipts from the sale of sites, including the former Linlathen High School site.
- 3.2 The recommendations to proceed with individual projects as they were previously reported to the Education Committee on 16 September 2002, will mean that the figures for LPFS and affordability will remain as previously reported.
- 3.3 However, there are two projects where the proposals are not exactly as reported at the Education Committee on 16 September 2002. Firstly, the project covering Douglas Primary School and Powrie Primary School now has an identified site (Paragraph 7.1). The effect of building on either site will have no effect on the LPFS and affordability gap that were reported at the Education Committee on 16 September 2002.
- 3.4 The second project is that for Downfield Primary School, Macalpine Primary School, Kirkton Nursery, St Columba's RC Primary School and St Margaret's RC Primary School (Paragraph 7.4). The report recommends a different solution for this project and this has an effect on overall LPFS and affordability gap of the entire project. Notwithstanding this, the Director of Finance and Chief Executive are still convinced that the overall affordability gap of the PPP for Schools Project can be met by accessing funds from ERDF and other bodies, and by the application of capital receipts from the sale of sites.

4.0 LOCAL AGENDA 21 IMPLICATIONS

- 4.1 A PPP Schools project would facilitate the creation of stimulating learning and teaching environments thereby ensuring that all learners can access the skills, knowledge and information needed to enable them to play a full part in society. Such a project would aim to ensure that resources are maximised and used efficiently to open up opportunities for culture, leisure and recreation to the wider community as well as providing a setting for day school education.

5.0 EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES IMPLICATIONS

- 5.1 The revitalised teaching and learning environment in these new and refurbished schools will help combat disadvantage, promote social inclusion and have a positive effect on raising pupil achievement.

6.0 BACKGROUND

- 6.1 At its meeting of 16 September 2002, the Education Committee considered a joint report by the Chief Executive and the Director of Education entitled "Dundee Schools PPP Project" and resolved to formally authorise the Director of Education to proceed with the appropriate statutory consultations (Report No 672-2002 paragraph 2.8 refers).

- 6.2 The Director of Education subsequently published and consulted on the proposals contained within the Project in terms of the "Education (Publication and Consultation etc) (Scotland) Regulations 1981" during the period 4 October – 29 November 2002 and held public meetings for all statutory consultees during that time. A timetable of all meetings held and notes taken at them are available in the Councillors' Lounge and from the Members' Secretariat. In addition and beyond the requirements of the statutory consultations, the Director of Education met with the staffs from all schools. A timetable of those meetings and notes taken at them are also available at the locations described above.

- 6.3 In addition, a summary table of key recurring issues raised at the formal consultation meetings is attached at Appendix 1. These issues covered the following topic areas:

- Health and Safety
- Travel/Distance
- Site
- Ethos
- Staffing
- Nursery Provision
- Out of School Provision
- Community Facilities
- PPP/Joint Venture
- Technical matters
- Timescale for the project

A commentary on each of the above is made at paragraph 8.0.

7.0 STATUS OF THE PROPOSED PROJECTS POST FORMAL CONSULTATION

7.1 Project Proposal Covering Douglas Primary School and Powrie Primary School

The Proposal

It is proposed that Douglas Primary School and Powrie Primary School are merged, and that the new school is housed in a new build primary school to be built on either the present site of Douglas Primary School or the present site of Powrie Primary School

Main Issues

The main issue undoubtedly continues to be the need for a decision in respect of the choice of site. In spite of two meetings additional to the timetabled public formal consultation meetings, neither school community could concede to the other in terms of site although each fully appreciated the

advantages and disadvantages put forward by the other. Consequently the Director of Education resolved to ballot the two communities as to their preferred site. The ballot arrangements are described at Appendix 2. The result of this ballot will be announced at the Education Committee on 16 December as responses are awaited from nursery parents at these schools.

Other Issues

Questions were responded to on the following topic areas:

- Road safety of pupils
- Drop off/pick up arrangements for cars
- Car parking
- Transport provision
- Out of school use of the building
- Proposed size of the school
- Ethos of the new school eg name and uniforms
- Staffing levels
- Number of support staff
- Surplus Head Teacher
- Nursery provision
- Out of school care provision
- Community facilities
- Joint venture and technical issues
- Timescale for the project

Recommendation

Proceed with this proposal on the identified site once the full ballot results are available.

7.2 Project Proposal Covering Fintry Primary School and Fintry Nursery School

The Proposal

It is proposed that Fintry Primary School and Fintry Nursery School will be replaced by a new build primary school to be built on the same site, adjacent to the present primary school.

Main Issues

No significant issues

Other Issues

Questions were responded to on the following topic areas:

- Safety of pupils during the build period
- Road safety
- Drop off/pick up arrangements for cars
- Size of the school
- Ethos of the new school eg name and uniforms
- Community facilities
- Joint venture and technical issues
- Timescale for the project

Recommendation

Proceed with this proposal as it stands.

7.3 Project Proposal Covering Mossgiel Primary School and Mid Craigie Primary School

The Proposal

It is proposed that Mossgiel Primary School and Mid Craigie Primary School are merged and that the new school is housed in a new build primary school to be built on a site at Glenconnor Drive.

Main Issues

No significant issues.

Other Issues

Both schools would prefer not to merge, but are clear that they want a new school.

Questions were responded to on the following topic areas:

- Size and location of the proposed new school
- Future catchment area
- Proximity of St Vincent's Primary School
- Ethos of the new school eg name and uniforms
- Staffing levels
- Number of support staff
- Surplus Head Teacher
- Nursery provision
- Community facilities
- Joint venture and technical issues

Recommendation

Proceed with this proposal as it stands.

7.4 Project Proposal Covering Downfield Primary School, Macalpine Primary School, and Kirkton Nursery and St Columba's RC Primary School and St Margaret's RC Primary School

The Proposals

It is proposed that Downfield Primary School and Macalpine Primary School are merged, and that the new school is housed in a new build primary school to be built on the present site of St Columba's Primary School in Kirkton Road. It is further proposed that Kirkton Nursery School is merged with the merged Downfield Primary School and Macalpine Primary School on this Kirkton Road site.

and

It is proposed that St Columba's RC Primary School and St Margaret's RC Primary School are merged and that the new school is housed in a new build primary school to be built on the present site of Macalpine Primary School.

Main Issues

Downfield Primary School community supports the proposal as it stands; the Macalpine Primary School community does not. So strong has been the feeling within the Macalpine community in respect of opposition to the proposed site at Kirkton Road that the Macalpine Primary School Board balloted its parent body on the matter. An overwhelming majority of parents voted against the move to the Kirkton Road site, indicating that they preferred instead to have the merger go ahead on the Macalpine site, failing which they indicated a wish to withdraw from the PPP project proposals at this stage but give consideration to coming forward again at a future round of PPP. Full details of the outcome of this ballot are available at Appendix 3 to this report. Subsequently officers of the Council met with both the Macalpine Primary School Board and the Downfield Primary School Board. The Macalpine Primary School Board indicated that they wished to retain the position taken in line with the outcome of the ballot with a proviso that they could review and possibly amend their stance up to 16 December. At this meeting they further indicated their opposition to the merged St Margaret's RC Primary School and St Columba's RC Primary School being co-located on the Macalpine site in the event that they finally opted to withdraw from the proposed PPP project and remain where and as they are.

Officers of the Council met again with the St Margaret's School Board and parent representatives of St Columba's Primary School to ascertain their views on the outcome of the Macalpine Primary School ballot.

St Margaret's Primary School Board are wholly in favour of the proposal as it stands, as are the St Columba's parents, albeit with underlying concerns about the distance to walk/travel to the new school.

Other Issues – (Downfield Primary School, Macalpine Primary School and Kirkton Nursery School)

Questions were responded to on the following topic areas:

- Road safety of pupils
- Drop off/pick up arrangements for cars
- Car parking
- Transport provision

- Proposed size of the school
- Ethos of the new school – eg name and uniforms
- Staff levels
- Number of support staff
- Surplus of head Teacher
- Out of school provision
- Community facilities
- Joint venture and technical issues
- Timescale for the project

Other Issues – (St Columba's and St Margaret's)

Questions were responded to on the following topic areas:

- Road safety of pupils
- Drop off/pick up arrangements for cars
- Transport provision
- Site location
- Ethos of new school eg name and uniforms
- Staffing levels
- Surplus of Head Teacher
- Out of school provision
- Community facilities
- Joint venture and technical issues
- Timescale for the project

Recommendation

- i) proceed with the proposal to merge St Margaret's Primary School and St Columba's Primary School in a new build primary school to be built on the present site of Macalpine Primary School.
- ii) instruct the Director of Education to continue discussions on transport issues with the St Columba's parents
- iii) consult on a new proposal to change the catchment area for Downfield Primary School to include part of the Macalpine Primary School catchment and for the remainder of the Macalpine catchment to be added to that for Brackens. Build a new school to replace Macalpine Primary School and Brackens Primary School on either the Macalpine Primary School or Brackens Primary School site.
- iv) build a new primary school to house Downfield Primary School and Kirkton Nursery on the St Columba's site.

7.5 Project Proposal Covering Kingspark School and Jessie Porter Nursery School

The Proposal

It is proposed that a new Kingspark School incorporating Jessie Porter Nursery School be built on the Kingspark site adjacent to the present school.

Main Issues

No significant issues

Other Issues

Questions were responded to on the following topics:

- Safety of pupils during the build period
- Road Safety
- Size and location of proposed new school
- Ethos of the merged nursery
- Size and type of nursery provision
- Technical issues relating to design

Recommendation

Proceed with this proposal as it stands. However, it should be noted that only two sets of parents were able to attend the public formal consultation meeting on 19 November due to the care needs of their children and the wide geographical spread of their home locations. Consequently it is felt necessary to identify other ways of entering into discussions with them.

7.6 Project Proposal Covering Forthill Primary School

The Proposal

It is proposed that Forthill Primary School will be reconfigured, refurbished and extended from a 2-stream to a 3-stream school.

Main Issues

No significant issues

Other Issues

Questions were responded to on the following topics:

- Road safety of pupils
- Drop off/pick up arrangements for car
- Size of the proposed extension and its specific location on the site
- How the increase in the size of the building and the pupil intake may affect the ethos of the school
- Staffing levels
- Nursery provision
- Community facilities
- Joint venture and technical issues
- Timescale for the project

Recommendation

Proceed with this proposal as it stands.

7.7 Project Proposal Covering Barnhill Primary School

The Proposal

It is proposed that Barnhill Primary School will be reconfigured, refurbished and extended from a 2-stream to a 3-stream school.

Main Issues

No significant issues

Other Issues

Questions were responded to on the following topics:

- Safety of pupils during build period
- Road safety of pupils
- Drop off and pick up arrangements for cars
- Car parking
- Out of school use of the building
- Proposed size of the extension and its specific location on the site
- How the increase in the size of the building and the pupil intake may affect the ethos of the school.
- Staffing levels
- Nursery provision
- Community facilities
- Joint venture and technical issues
- Timescale for the project.

Recommendation

Proceed with this proposal as it stands.

7.8 Project Proposal Covering Grove Academy

The Proposal

It is proposed that Grove Academy will be reconfigured, refurbished and extended to accommodate a roll of 1250-1300 pupils.

Main Issues

No significant issues

Other issues

Questions were responded to on the following topic areas:

- Safety of pupils during the build period
- Car parking
- Community facilities
- Location of proposed swimming pool and arrangements for its use
- Joint venture and technical issues

Recommendation

Proceed with this proposal as it stands

8.0 COMMENTARY ON TOPIC AREAS DISCUSSED

8.1 Health and Safety

The contractor will, in accordance with Construction (Design and Management) (CDM) Regulations 1994, produce a safety plan for each location.

8.2 Travel/Distance

These issues, including road safety and safer routes to school will be the subject of ongoing discussions between the individual communities, Education Department staff and representatives from the Department of Planning and Transportation.

8.3 Site

Site issues have been addressed as required in the body of this report.

8.4 Ethos

Where schools are merging, Head Teachers have given a firm commitment to work together with the children and communities involved to make transition arrangements smooth. The children can work together to devise new "golden rules" for the school, design a new school badge and consider colours etc for uniforms.

8.5 Staffing

All issues relating to teaching and support staff are being discussed on an on-going basis with the trade unions involved.

8.6 Nursery Provision

Matters relating to nursery, 0-3 provision, extended hours and out of school care are being addressed by the Early Years and Childcare Team in co-operation with the Council's partner providers and the client group at each location.

8.7 Community Use of Premises

Further views will be sought from local community groups as to the best use they feel can be made of community spaces within each school. Staff from the Departments of Leisure and Arts, Neighbourhood Resources and The Health Board are fully involved in this process.

8.8 PPP/Joint Venture

More detailed information on the Special Purpose Vehicle (SPV) to deliver the Dundee Schools PPP

Project will be given once the Scottish Executive has reached its decision on the matter.

8.9 Technical

Proposed arrangements for future consultation mechanisms for design briefs, plans etc are described in Report No 899-2002.

8.10 Timescale

It was confirmed that at present the timescale for delivering the project remained as August 2006. Any alteration to the proposed timescale or phasing of works to be made known by way of the future consultation mechanisms as described at 8.9 above.

9.0 CONSULTATION

- 9.1 In the event that the Committee is minded to select an option for a project which is different from the formal proposal consulted upon, then this option will require to be the subject of a new formal consultation process.

10.0 BACKGROUND PAPERS

- 10.1 No background papers, as defined by Section 50D of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973 (other than any containing confidential or exempt information), were relied on to any material extent in preparing the above Report.

ANNE WILSON
Director of Education

2 December 2002

AW/GRP/EAG

DUNDEE SCHOOLS PPP PROJECT

**SUMMARY TABLE OF KEY RECURRING ISSUES RAISED AT THE FORMAL
CONSULTATION MEETINGS 22 OCTOBER – 26 OCTOBER 2002**

* Asterisk denotes the number and frequency of questions asked under a particular topic heading.

Issues	Health and Safety Inc. - safety of pupils during construction - drop off/pick up - car parking (staff)	Travel/Distance Inc - road safety - transport provision - out of school use	Site Inc - size - location/access - catchment - geographical spread of RC school	Ethos Inc - general ethos of school - school name/uniforms - size of school/class - community ethos - disruption of education	Staffing Inc - levels of staffing - surplus of HT - support staff - staff merge
Douglas	*		***	*	**
Powrie	*	****	***** **	**	**
Fintry & Fintry N.S.	*		**	*	
Macalpine & Kirkton N.S.		***** **	***** *	*****	**
Downfield & Kirkton N.S.	**	*	*****	****	**
Mid Craigie			*****	**	***
Mossgiel			***	*	
St Columba's	*	***	*****	**	
St Margaret's	**		*	**	**
Kingspark & Jessie Porter N.S.		**	*	**	
Forthill	*	**	*****	*****	**
Grove Academy	*				
Barnhill	*****	*****	*	***	*

Issues	Nursery Provision Inc - pre-fives - integration of SEN - staffing	Out of School Provision Inc - access -travel distance	Community Facilities Inc - access - cost of lets - competition - security	PPP/Joint Venture Inc - principle of PPP - finance issues - timescale - building maint. - final decision (who) - other options	Technical Inc - consultation re Design with staff/ pupils/community - availability of plans	Timescale Inc - timetable - change of admin.
Douglas			*			* *
Powrie	*	*		* * * * *	*	*
Fintry & Fintry N.S.			* * *	*	* *	*
Macalpine & Kirkton N.S.		*		* * * * * **	* *	*
Downfield & Kirkton N.S.		*	* *	* * * * * * *	*	*
Mid Craigie				* *		
Mossgiel	* * *		* * *	*	*	
St Columba's					*	
St Margaret's		*	*	* * * * *	* * *	* *
Kingspark & Jessie Porter N.S.	* * * * * *				*	
Forthill	* * * * *		* * *	* * * * * * * * *	*	*
Grove Academy			* * * *	* * * * *		
Barnhill	*		*	* * * * * * * * * *	* *	* *

APPENDIX 2

To the Parent/Carer of

If calling please ask for
Anne Wilson - 01382 433088
E-mail anne.wilson@dundeecity.gov.uk

Our Ref AW/NJ
Your Ref
Date 20 November 2002

Dear Parent/Carer

SITE OF A NEW SCHOOL TO HOUSE THE MERGED DOUGLAS/POWRIE PRIMARY SCHOOL

As you will be aware, at its meeting of 16 September 2002 the Education Committee of Dundee City Council unanimously agreed to formally consult on a Public Private Partnership (PPP) Project which includes the proposed merger of Douglas and Powrie Primary Schools in a new school.

As part of the formal consultation process, the City Council is keen to find out the views of parents of Douglas and Powrie Primary Schools on the site that should be used as the location of the new school. Therefore you are asked to use the slip below to indicate which site you think should be taken forward.

All replies to this survey must be received by Monday 2 December 2002. To return the survey please place it into the envelope provided. A stamp is not required. Please note that only surveys returned in the enclosed envelope will be accepted.

The City Council appreciates that parents may have more than one child attending a school. The method of distribution means that you may receive more than one questionnaire but **the City Council would request that each family return only one questionnaire regardless of how many you receive.**

Yours sincerely



ANNE WILSON
Director of Education

Below are the two options for the site of the new school. You are asked to mark a cross in the box opposite the option you prefer.

The new school should be on the present site of Douglas Primary School

☐

The new school should be on the present site of Powrie Primary School

☐

APPENDIX 3



School Board Macalpine Primary School

21 November 2002

Dear Parents

PPP Merger of Macalpine and Downfield Primaries: Questionnaire Results

As you are aware, the Macalpine School Board issued a questionnaire to all our parents from Nursery to P7 asking for your views on the proposal to merge Macalpine and Downfield Primaries on the present St Columba's site.

The results of that questionnaire are now available and the following results were obtained:

Total number of families issued with questionnaire	=	292
Total number of responses made	=	227
% of parents who returned their questionnaires	=	78%

Results obtained:

Section 1

Option 1	I favour the merger of Macalpine and Downfield Primaries on the St Columba's site - as proposed in the present scheme.	3 (1% of returned votes)
Option 2	I favour the merger of Macalpine and Downfield Primaries on the Macalpine site - not proposed in the present scheme.	224 (99% of returned votes)

Should the decision of the Council be to go ahead with the merger on the St Columba's site, what would your opinion be in those circumstances?

Section 2

Option 1	I believe Macalpine should be withdrawn from the present PPP proposals and not considered for merger in the future.	14 (6% of returned votes)
Option 2	I believe Macalpine should be withdrawn from the present PPP proposals, but would be willing to consider merger with another school in the future to meet the needs of pupils in the northern areas of Dundee.	211 (93% of returned votes)

The School Board would like to thank all Macalpine parents, from Nursery to P7, for the keenness you have shown to express your views and in such a clear manner. As you will see from the results above, Macalpine parents have voted overwhelmingly to have a merger of the two schools on the superior Macalpine site and, should that not be the decision of the Council, to ask that Macalpine be withdrawn from the present proposals but be considered for a merger with another school to serve the northernmost areas of Dundee at some time in the future.

With such a clear mandate, the School Board will now form a detailed submission to the Director of Education based on the votes above. It will include the many letters received from parents. A copy of the submission will be made available to parents at a later date, on request.

Thank you for your support of Macalpine School and Nursery.

School Board
Macalpine Primary School

