

REPORT TO: EDUCATION COMMITTEE – 20 DECEMBER 2004

REPORT ON: DUNDEE SCHOOLS PPP PROJECT – OUTCOME OF THE FORMAL CONSULTATION PROCESS IN RESPECT OF DECANT ARRANGEMENTS

REPORT BY: DIRECTOR OF EDUCATION

REPORT NO: 836-2004

1.0 PURPOSE OF REPORT

1.1 This report details the representations made during the formal publication and consultation exercise on proposed decant arrangements.

2.0 RECOMMENDATIONS

2.1 It is recommended that the Committee:

- (i) note the content of the findings from the consultations as detailed at para 6.4
- (ii) remit the Director of Education to carry out the statutory consultation procedures in terms of the Education (Publication and Consultation etc) (Scotland) Regulations 1981 in respect of a proposal to merge Powrie Primary School and Douglas Primary School on the Douglas Primary School site at the start of session 2005-2006 for a period of one year or until the new school on the site of Powrie Primary School is ready.
- (iii) instruct the Director of Education to undertake an accommodation review at Douglas Primary School as described at para 8.3 below and consult with the trade unions on staffing issues as described at para 8.4
- (iv) instruct the Director of Education to proceed with the implementation of the decant proposal for Brackens Primary School.

3.0 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

3.1 The costs arising from the recommendations contained in this report are estimated at £160,000. This will require to be met from within the Education Department's provisional revenue budget for 2005-2006.

4.0 LOCAL AGENDA 21 IMPLICATIONS

4.1 None

5.0 EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES IMPLICATIONS

5.1 None

6.0 BACKGROUND

6.1 At its meeting of 20 September 2004, the Committee remitted the Director of Education to carry out the statutory consultation procedures in terms of the Education (Publication and Consultation etc) (Scotland) Regulations 1981 in respect of:

- (i) the proposal to decant Powrie Primary School by placing the nursery and P1 pupils in Douglas Primary School and transporting P2-7 pupils by bus to Mid Craigie Primary School and
- (ii) the proposal to decant Brackens Primary School by placing the nursery and P1-3 pupils in Ardler Primary School and P4-7 pupils in St Fergus RC Primary School (Report No 628-2004 refers).

6.2 These proposals were advertised in the "Courier" on 22 October and all statutory consultees received a copy of the consultation document on that date.

6.3 During the period 8 November – 25 November, evening public consultation meetings were held at each location. Meetings were also held for all staff of each school at the end of the school day.

6.4 An executive summary of issues raised at the formal public consultation and staff meetings is attached as Appendix 1 and copies of the full notes of issues and concerns raised at these meetings are available in the Members' Lounge and with Group secretaries along with copies of written submissions received during the consultation period.

7.0 OUTCOME OF THE POWRIE PRIMARY SCHOOL DECANT PROPOSAL

7.1 This proposal as described at para 6.1 (i) above was met with strong opposition by the parent body. The principal objections centred on the removal of the bulk of the children from their local community and wide-ranging concerns about the issues surrounding transportation by bus.

8.0 RESOLUTION OF THE POWRIE PRIMARY SCHOOL DECANT PROPOSAL

8.1 In light of the strong representations made against the current proposal, it is considered necessary to formally re-consult on an alternative proposal.

8.2 The alternative proposal involves the merger of Powrie Primary School and Douglas Primary School on the Douglas Primary School site at the start of session 2005-2006, ahead of the earliest commissioning date of the start of session 2006-2007 for the new build replacement school on the Powrie site as previously agreed (Report 626-2004 refers).

8.3 A review of accommodation has been undertaken at Douglas Primary School in conjunction with the Head Teachers to identify the number of units of ancillary accommodation required on the Douglas site to facilitate the merger. A requirement for the provision of three double mobile units has been established.

8.4 In addition, consultation will be required with the trade unions in respect of staffing issues arising from the early merger proposal.

9.0 COMMENTARY ON THE ALTERNATIVE POWRIE PRIMARY SCHOOL DECANT PROPOSAL

9.1 The Head Teachers of both Powrie Primary School and Douglas Primary School confirm that, following detailed discussion with their respective staff groups, the alternative decant proposal is both workable and acceptable.

10.0 OUTCOME OF THE BRACKENS PRIMARY SCHOOL DECANT PROPOSAL

10.1 This proposal as described at para 6.1 (ii) above was met with some significant opposition by the parent body. The principal objections centred on the choice of Ardler Primary School and St Fergus RC Primary School for decant purposes and concerns about increased travel distances

to these schools.

11.0 RESOLUTION OF THE BRACKENS PRIMARY SCHOOL DECANT PROPOSAL

- 11.1 It was confirmed that Ardler Primary School and St Fergus RC Primary School were identified as the nearest schools with available accommodation.
- 11.2 An early merger of Brackens Primary School with Macalpine Primary School on the Macalpine site was not deemed feasible in this case due to pupil numbers – (Macalpine Primary School currently has a roll of 334 and Brackens Primary School has a roll of 315). A village of Portacabins would be required on the Macalpine site.
- 11.3 Notwithstanding the acknowledged unsuitability of large scale temporary accommodation as a setting for learning and teaching, a further complication arises with the commencement of the construction of a new two stream primary school to replace St Margaret's RC Primary School and St Columba's RC Primary School on the Macalpine site.
- 11.4 Serious potential pupil safety issues in this regard would necessitate the commissioning of transportation assessments for the surrounding road network and full risk assessments in the context of proximity between the construction site and associated traffic and an anticipated merged roll of 649 pupils in and around the existing Macalpine Primary School.
- 11.5 A table showing current pupil travel distances from home to Brackens Primary School and estimated increased/decreased travel distances from home to Ardler Primary School and St Fergus RC Primary School is attached as Appendix 2. The data for catchment area pupils is shown separately from the data relating to those pupils who reside outwith the current Brackens Primary School catchment area.
- 11.6 Given that Dundee City Council operates a policy of providing transport to all pupils who live more than two miles from their catchment school, then transport would not require to be provided in the context of this decant proposal.
- 11.7 The Staff Tutor, Health Promoting Schools will devise a travel plan for the period of the decant and produce a leaflet for pupils on safe routes to school.
- 11.8 The area around Ardler and St Fergus Primary Schools will be assessed with a view to identifying appropriate school crossing patrol points and School Crossing Patrollers will be re-allocated accordingly.
- 11.9 The timing of the implementation of the previously agreed catchment area change to Downfield Primary School which involves Macalpine Primary School and ultimately Brackens Primary School is the subject of a separate Agenda Note.

12.0 COMMENTARY ON THE BRACKENS DECANT PROPOSAL

- 12.1 A review of accommodation has been undertaken at Ardler and St Fergus Primary Schools in conjunction with the Head Teachers to identify the number of units of ancillary accommodation required on these sites to facilitate the merger. A requirement for the provision of one double mobile unit has been established.

13.0 CONSULTATION

- 13.1 This report has been subject to consultation with the Chief Executive, Depute Chief Executive (Support Services) and the Depute Chief Executive (Finance).

14.0 BACKGROUND PAPERS

14.1 None

ANNE WILSON
Director of Education

10 December 2004

DUNDEE SCHOOLS PPP PROJECT

**SUMMARY TABLE OF KEY RECURRING ISSUES RAISED AT THE FORMAL
CONSULTATION MEETINGS 08 – 25 NOVEMBER 2004**

* **Asterisk denotes the number and frequency of questions asked under a particular topic heading.**

| Issues | Health and Safety Inc. - safety of pupils during construction - drop off/pick up - car parking (staff) | Travel/Distance Inc - road safety - transport provision - out of school use | Site Inc - size - location/access - catchment - geographical spread of RC school | Ethos Inc - general ethos of school - school name/uniforms - size of school/class - community ethos - disruption of education | Staffing Inc - levels of staffing - surplus of HT - support staff - staff merge |
|--------------------|--|---|---|---|--|
| Powrie P. S. | ***** | ***** | **** | ***** | **** |
| Douglas P.S. | * | | ** | ** | * |
| Mid Craigie P.S. | *** | ***** | * | ***** | ** |
| Staff of the above | **** | **** | | ***** | *** |
| | | | | | |
| Brackens P.S. | ***** | ***** | ***** | ***** | ***** |
| Ardler P.S. | ***** | ***** | **** | ***** | ** |
| St Fergus RC P.S. | ** | ** | | ***** | **** |
| Staff of the above | ** | ** | | ***** | *** |
| | | | | | |
| | | | | | |
| | | | | | |
| | | | | | |
| | | | | | |
| | | | | | |
| | | | | | |

| Issues | Nursery Provision Inc - pre-fives - integration of SEN - staffing | Out of School Provision Inc - access -travel distance | Community Facilities Inc - access - cost of lets - competition - security | PPP/Joint Venture Inc - principle of PPP - finance issues - timescale - building maint. - final decision (who) - other options | Technical Inc - consultation re Design with staff/ pupils/community - availability of plans | Timescale Inc - timetable - change of admin. |
|--------------------|---|---|--|--|---|---|
| Powrie P. S. | ***** | *** | | ***** | ***** | **** |
| Douglas P.S. | **** | | * | * | ***** | |
| Mid Craigie P.S. | **** | | | ***** ***** | ***** | |
| Staff of the above | ***** | | **** | ***** | *** | *** |
| | | | | | | |
| Brackens P.S. | ***** | **** | | ***** | ***** | |
| Ardler P.S. | **** | ***** | ***** | *** | | * |
| St Fergus RC P.S. | *** | ***** | | * | * | * |
| Staff of the above | * | | | ***** | | ***** |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |

Brackens Primary School Catchment Area

| | P1 | P2 | P3 | P4 | P5 | P6 | P7 | TOTAL | Distance (miles) to Ardler/St Fergus | Distance (miles) to Brackens | Additional mileage | %Difference |
|---------------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|------------|--------------------------------------|------------------------------|--------------------|-------------|
| Auchinblae Place | | | 1 | | | | 2 | 3 | 1.0 | 0.4 | 0.6 | 150.00 |
| Bower Mill Lane | 1 | | | 1 | | | | 2 | 0.7 | 0.5 | 0.2 | 40.00 |
| Brackens Road | 1 | 1 | 3 | | 2 | | 6 | 13 | 1.2 | 0.4 | 0.8 | 200.00 |
| Burrelton Gardens | | | 1 | | 1 | 2 | | 4 | 1.1 | 0.2 | 0.9 | 450.00 |
| Catterline Crescent | | | | | 1 | | | 1 | 1.0 | 0.3 | 0.7 | 233.33 |
| Clattowoods Drive | 3 | 4 | | 5 | | | 1 | 13 | 0.9 | 0.5 | 0.4 | 80.00 |
| Clattowoods Place | 5 | 1 | 4 | 1 | 1 | 2 | | 14 | 1.0 | 0.5 | 0.5 | 100.00 |
| Clattowoods Road | 2 | | | | 4 | | | 6 | 0.8 | 0.4 | 0.4 | 100.00 |
| Clattowoods Terrace | 1 | | | 1 | | | 1 | 3 | 1.0 | 0.5 | 0.5 | 100.00 |
| Clunie Gardens | | | | 1 | | 1 | | 2 | 1.1 | 0.2 | 0.9 | 450.00 |
| Collace Crescent | | 1 | | 1 | | | | 2 | 1.2 | 0.3 | 0.9 | 300.00 |
| Dunavon Gardens | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1 | | | 1 | 6 | 1.2 | 0.4 | 0.8 | 200.00 |
| Garden Mill Place | | | | | 1 | | | 1 | 0.8 | 0.5 | 0.3 | 60.00 |
| Garvock Place | | | | | 1 | | 1 | 2 | 1.2 | 0.2 | 1.0 | 500.00 |
| Gauldie Court | | | | | | 1 | | 1 | 1.5 | 0.8 | 0.7 | 87.50 |
| Gauldie Crescent | | | | | 1 | | | 1 | 1.6 | 0.9 | 0.7 | 77.78 |
| Gauldie Place | 1 | | | | | | 1 | 2 | 1.6 | 0.8 | 0.8 | 100.00 |
| Gauldie Terrace | | | | | | 1 | | 1 | 1.6 | 0.9 | 0.7 | 77.78 |
| Kettins Terrace | | | | 2 | 1 | | | 3 | 1.5 | 0.8 | 0.7 | 87.50 |
| Kinclaven Drive | | | 1 | 1 | | 1 | | 3 | 1.1 | 0.2 | 0.9 | 450.00 |
| Kinneff Crescent | 1 | | | 1 | | 1 | | 3 | 1.2 | 0.2 | 1.0 | 500.00 |
| Laird Street | 3 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 2 | 13 | 0.8 | 0.3 | 0.5 | 166.67 |
| Macalpine Road | 1 | | 1 | | | | | 2 | 0.6 | 0.3 | 0.3 | 100.00 |
| McLean Place | | | | 1 | | | 1 | 2 | 1.0 | 0.4 | 0.6 | 150.00 |
| McLean Street | 1 | 2 | 1 | | 2 | 1 | 4 | 11 | 0.9 | 0.4 | 0.5 | 125.00 |
| Pitroddie Gardens | | 1 | 2 | | | | | 3 | 1.2 | 0.4 | 0.8 | 200.00 |
| Sidlaw Avenue | | | | 1 | | | | 1 | 0.9 | 0.3 | 0.6 | 200.00 |
| St Albans Terrace | | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 6 | 0.8 | 0.3 | 0.5 | 166.67 |
| St Boswell Terrace | 1 | 2 | | 4 | 2 | | 1 | 10 | 0.9 | 0.1 | 0.8 | 800.00 |
| St Clement Place | 3 | | | 1 | | 3 | | 7 | 0.9 | 0.4 | 0.5 | 125.00 |
| St Clement Terrace | | 1 | | | | | 1 | 2 | 0.9 | 0.4 | 0.5 | 125.00 |
| St Columba Gardens | 1 | 4 | 3 | 1 | 1 | 5 | 3 | 18 | 1.0 | 0.2 | 0.8 | 400.00 |
| St Dennis Place | | 1 | 1 | | 1 | | 1 | 4 | 0.9 | 0.2 | 0.7 | 350.00 |
| St Dennis Terrace | 1 | 4 | 2 | 2 | | 1 | | 10 | 1.0 | 0.3 | 0.7 | 233.33 |
| St Edmund Place | | | | | | | 1 | 1 | 0.8 | 0.4 | 0.4 | 100.00 |
| St Edmund Terrace | | 1 | | | | | | 1 | 0.8 | 0.4 | 0.4 | 100.00 |
| St Kilda Road | 1 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 4 | | 3 | 14 | 0.7 | 0.5 | 0.2 | 40.00 |
| St Leonard Road | | | | | | | 1 | 1 | 0.8 | 0.2 | 0.6 | 300.00 |
| St Mungo Terrace | 2 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 10 | 0.9 | 0.2 | 0.7 | 350.00 |
| St Nicholas Place | | 2 | 2 | 1 | | 2 | 4 | 11 | 0.9 | 0.3 | 0.6 | 200.00 |
| | 30 | 31 | 30 | 33 | 27 | 26 | 36 | 213 | | | | |

Greater Travelling Distance **213 100**
Lesser Travelling Distance **0 0**

Total Residing Within 213 100
Catchment

Brackens Primary School - Outwith Catchment Area

| | P1 | P2 | P3 | P4 | P5 | P6 | P7 | TOTAL | Distance (miles) to Ardler/St Fergus | Distance (miles) to Brackens | Additional mileage | %Difference |
|---------------------------|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|-------|--------------------------------------|------------------------------|--------------------|-------------|
| Aberlady Crescent | | 1 | | | | | | 1 | 6.0 | 6.1 | -0.1 | -1.64 |
| Appleby Place | | 1 | | | 1 | | | 2 | 0.7 | 0.8 | -0.1 | -12.50 |
| Balgowan Avenue | | | 2 | | | 2 | | 4 | 1.4 | 1.1 | 0.3 | 27.27 |
| Barassie Court | | | | 1 | | | 1 | 2 | 0.4 | 0.6 | -0.2 | -33.33 |
| Barns Neuk | | 1 | | 1 | | | | 2 | 4.4 | 4.6 | -0.2 | -4.35 |
| Belmont Street, Newtyle | | | | | | 1 | | 1 | 7.3 | 7.7 | -0.4 | -5.19 |
| Benvie Gardens | | | 1 | | | | | 1 | 3.2 | 3.9 | -0.7 | -17.95 |
| Bruce Road | | | | | 1 | | | 1 | 1.3 | 1.5 | -0.2 | -13.33 |
| Carnoustie Court | | 1 | | | | | | 1 | 0.5 | 0.7 | -0.2 | -28.57 |
| Carradale Drive | | | | | | | 1 | 1 | 6.4 | 6.5 | -0.1 | -1.54 |
| Charleston Drive | | | | 1 | | | | 1 | 3.0 | 3.6 | -0.6 | -16.67 |
| Clelington Road | | | | | | 1 | | 1 | 1.9 | 2.5 | -0.6 | -24.00 |
| Cox Gardens | 1 | | | | | | | 1 | 0.9 | 0.5 | 0.4 | 80.00 |
| Drumlanrig Drive | | | | | 1 | | | 1 | 3.6 | 3.8 | -0.2 | -5.26 |
| East Links Place, B/Ferry | | | | 1 | | | | 1 | 6.8 | 7.0 | -0.2 | -2.86 |
| Eskdale Avenue | | | | | | | 1 | 1 | 1.0 | 0.8 | 0.2 | 25.00 |
| Fairbairn Street | | | | 1 | | | | 1 | 2.5 | 3.1 | -0.6 | -19.35 |
| Findale Street | | | 1 | | | | | 1 | 3.9 | 4.1 | -0.2 | -4.88 |
| Finella Place | | | | | | | 1 | 1 | 3.8 | 4.0 | -0.2 | -5.00 |
| Foggyley Gardens | | 1 | | | | | | 1 | 2.1 | 2.7 | -0.6 | -22.22 |
| Gorrie Terrace | 2 | 1 | | | | | | 3 | 1.3 | 0.5 | 0.8 | 160.00 |
| Graham Terrace | | | | | 1 | | | 1 | 2.5 | 2.7 | -0.2 | -7.41 |
| Gullane Avenue | 1 | | | | 1 | | | 2 | 0.4 | 1.0 | -0.6 | -60.00 |
| Haldane Terrace | | 1 | 1 | | | | | 2 | 1.4 | 1.1 | 0.3 | 27.27 |
| Harestane Grove | | 2 | 1 | 1 | | 1 | 2 | 7 | 1.9 | 1.1 | 0.8 | 72.73 |
| Hazelwood Close | | | | 1 | | | | 1 | 1.4 | 1.7 | -0.3 | -17.65 |
| Heather Gardens | | | 1 | | | | | 1 | 1.9 | 1.3 | 0.6 | 46.15 |
| Heathfield Wynd | | 1 | | | 1 | | | 2 | 0.6 | 0.6 | 0.0 | 0.00 |
| Helmsdale Crescent | | | 1 | 1 | 1 | | | 3 | 1.7 | 1.4 | 0.3 | 21.43 |
| Helmsdale Drive | | | | | 1 | 1 | 1 | 3 | 1.8 | 1.3 | 0.5 | 38.46 |
| High Street, Lochee | 1 | | 1 | | | | | 2 | 2.3 | 3.0 | -0.7 | -23.33 |
| Isla Street | | | | 1 | | | | 1 | 2.4 | 3.0 | -0.6 | -20.00 |
| Kinghorne Terrace | | | 1 | | | | | 1 | 2.3 | 2.6 | -0.3 | -11.54 |
| Kingsway East | | | | | | 1 | | 1 | 3.2 | 3.3 | -0.1 | -3.03 |
| Lansdowne Square | | | | | 1 | | | 1 | 1.9 | 2.5 | -0.6 | -24.00 |
| Leyshade Court | | | | | | | 1 | 1 | 3.7 | 3.9 | -0.2 | -5.13 |
| Loftus Place | | | | | 1 | | | 1 | 1.2 | 0.7 | 0.5 | 71.43 |
| Montgomerie Avenue | | | | | 1 | | | 1 | 4.1 | 4.3 | -0.2 | -4.65 |
| Mount Feredith, Forfar | | | | 1 | | | | 1 | 14.9 | 15.1 | -0.2 | -1.32 |
| Prieston Road | | 1 | | | | | | 1 | 2.0 | 1.5 | 0.5 | 33.33 |
| Rockwell Place | | | 1 | | 1 | | | 2 | 1.9 | 2.4 | -0.5 | -20.83 |
| Rosemount Road | | 1 | 1 | | | | | 2 | 0.9 | 1.3 | -0.4 | -30.77 |
| Sidlaw Court | | | | | 1 | | 1 | 2 | 1.3 | 0.6 | 0.7 | 116.67 |

| | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|-------------------------------|---|----|----|----|----|----|----|-----|------|------|------|--------|
| St Fillans Road | 1 | 1 | 1 | | | 4 | 1 | 8 | 0.9 | 0.6 | 0.3 | 50.00 |
| St Giles Terrace | | | 1 | | | | | 1 | 0.9 | 0.4 | 0.5 | 125.00 |
| St Kilda Place | 1 | | 1 | | | | | 2 | 0.9 | 0.4 | 0.5 | 125.00 |
| St Marys Road | | | | | 1 | | | 1 | 1.0 | 0.6 | 0.4 | 66.67 |
| St Monance Place | | | 1 | 1 | | | 1 | 3 | 0.9 | 0.4 | 0.5 | 125.00 |
| St Ninian Place | 1 | | | | | 1 | | 2 | 0.7 | 0.4 | 0.3 | 75.00 |
| St Ninian Terrace | 1 | | 1 | 3 | 2 | | 1 | 8 | 0.8 | 0.5 | 0.3 | 60.00 |
| Strathmartine Road | | | | | | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1.1 | 0.4 | 0.7 | 175.00 |
| Strathmore Avenue, Kirriemuir | | | 1 | | | | | 1 | 18.4 | 18.6 | -0.2 | -1.08 |
| The Beeches | | 1 | | | | | | 1 | 5.0 | 5.2 | -0.2 | -3.85 |
| Thurso Crescent | | | | | 1 | | | 1 | 3.6 | 4.0 | -0.4 | -10.00 |
| Turriff Place | | | 1 | | | | | 1 | 0.6 | 1.0 | -0.4 | -40.00 |
| Westlodge, Strathmartine | | | 1 | | | | | 1 | 1.5 | 0.9 | 0.6 | 66.67 |
| Wiston Place | | 1 | | | | | | 1 | 1.6 | 2.0 | -0.4 | -20.00 |
| Yeamans Lane | | 1 | | | | | | 1 | 2.3 | 3.0 | -0.7 | -23.33 |
| | 9 | 16 | 20 | 14 | 17 | 13 | 13 | 102 | | | | |

| | | |
|---|------------|-------------|
| | No. | % |
| Greater Travelling Distance | 58 | 56.9 |
| Lesser Travelling Distance | 44 | 43.1 |
| | 4 | |
| Total Residing Outwith Catchment | 102 | 100. |
| | 0 | |