REPORT TO: BEST VALUE SUB-COMMITTEE – 1ST NOVEMBER 2000

REPORT ON: BEST VALUE REVIEW OF HERITAGE SERVICES

REPORT BY: CHIEF EXECUTIVE

REPORT NO: 676-2000

1 PURPOSE OF REPORT

This reports the Best Value Review of Heritage Services, Arts and Heritage Department.

2 RECOMMENDATIONS

The sub-committee agrees:-

- 2.1 That the management of Arts and Heritage Facilities should continue to be provided by the Arts and Heritage Department but that Trust status should be investigated for Broughty Castle and Mills Observatory (as previously agreed in the Arts and Heritage Service Plan).
- 2.2 A voluntary donation entrance scheme will be developed.
- 2.3 Development proposals will be drawn up for McManus Galleries for discussion with the Heritage Lottery Fund
- 2.4 Software will be selected and purchased to computerise the collections with a view to digitisation and the department will aim to continue participation in the Scottish Cultural Resource Access Network (SCRAN)
- 2.6 Advertising leaflets will be produced and dedicated advertising budgets will be set up for all Facilities.
- 2.7 Opening hours at Broughty Castle will be subject to review.
- 2.8 Minor improvements and repairs will be carried out at Broughty Castle, Mills Observatory and Camperdown House as detailed in paragraphs 14.2.7 14.2.10 and 14.4.1
- 2.9 An education policy will be written and an education strategy developed for curriculum based education.
- 2.10 A technology plan will be developed covering the use of Interactive Computer Technology (ICT), Audio, PA and lighting.
- 2.11 Telephone booking for events will be implemented at McManus Galleries.
- 2.12 Charges will be introduced for enquiries from commercial organisations as outlined in paragraph 14.5, photographic charges will be revised and a further review will look at the provision of the enquiry service in more detail.
- 2.13 An annual visitor survey will be carried out at all Facilities open to the public. A survey of non–users should be carried out every 5 years and Evaluation Forms should be introduced to monitor satisfaction with events and for facility hires.
- 2.14 Catering provision will be reviewed as part of development plans at Mills and Broughty Castle and the cafe at McManus Galleries will be re-franchised.

3 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- 3.1 This review accounts for £ 834,000 (22.03 %) of the Department's Revenue Budget and is 100% of the total review expenditure planned in this department for 1999 to 2000.
- 3.2 The cost of implementing the recommendations contained in this report would be £72,596 in the financial year 2000-2001.

£17,498 which can be met from the Arts and Heritage departmental revenue budget \pounds 10,000 which can be met from the Arts and Heritage capital budget \pounds 23,098 to be met from sponsorship and grant aid

£22,000 relates to recommended expenditure not contained within existing budgets, which covers recommendations 14.2.2, 14.2.5, 14.2.10 and 14.6.2 detailed below. These recommendations will only proceed if additional finance is found from internal or external sources.

- 3.3 Income from improvements in subsequent years is estimated at £33,000, although this is not guaranteed.
- 3.4 There would be recurring costs of approximately £4,000 every 5th year for the non-user survey.

4 EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES IMPLICATIONS

4.1 Opportunities for culture, leisure and recreation are readily available to all.

5 LOCAL AGENDA 21 IMPLICATIONS

The review was undertaken from a perspective of local agenda 21. In particular, resources are to be used efficiently and waste minimised.

6 DEFINITION OF SERVICE REVIEW

6.1 Heritage services include the following buildings open to the public:

McManus Galleries

The department's main City Centre Facility, housing displays on three floors of art, history and natural history. The building includes a cafe, shop and full disabled access. A programme of some 10 changing exhibitions and 150 events per annum are provided together with a picture hire service, gallery hire service and enquiry service for the public. Six storage areas house the city's collections of art, history and natural history.

Broughty Castle

Is a 15th century fort owned by Historic Scotland, administered by Dundee Arts and Heritage, housing displays on 4 floors of local history, whaling, sea shore life and military history.

Mills Observatory

Is an Astronomical Observatory, built in 1932, situated in Balgay Park. It houses displays on astronomy and space exploration together with a viewing telescope. Viewing of the night sky and regular planetary evenings are held.

And the following buildings which are not open to the public:

Camperdown House

An 1820s Greek Revival, country mansion designed by the architect William Burn, for the first Earl of Camperdown. In the ownership of the City Council since 1948, but currently closed to the public.

St. Mary's Tower

A late 15th century Steeple, part of the City Churches complex in the city centre. Closed to the public during the period of the Best Value Review.

Collections Outstore

Large and oversized collections are housed in an outstore within the city boundaries.

6.2 Staffing

Heritage services are provided by 8 officers made up as follows

Heritage Facilities Team 1

- 1 x Team Leader
- 2 x Heritage Programme Officers
- 1 x Heritage Development Officer

Responsible for buildings and activities at McManus Galleries, Camperdown House and the Collections Outstore and for the provision of specialist expertise in the fields of Archaeology, Art, Costume and Textiles, Coins and Medals, Decorative Arts (ceramics, silver, glass), Ethnography, Egyptology, Industrial History, Social History, Numismatics, Photographs and Archives.

Heritage Facilities Team 2

- 1 x Team Leader
- 3 xHeritage Programme Officers

Responsible for buildings and activities at Broughty Castle, Mills Observatory and St. Mary's Tower and the provision of specialist expertise in the fields of Botany, Geology, Mammals, Birds, Insects, Fish and Reptiles.

Technical, Marketing and Design and Front of House Staff who are not part of this review provide support in the delivery of services.

- 6.3.1 The review includes all staffing, events and activities associated with these buildings excluding front of house staffing, building maintenance and other building services which will be subject to separate review in 2001- 2002. Technical Services underwent Best Value Review in 1998. Marketing and Design will be subject to review in 2000 - 2001
- 6.3.2 Key areas for review include:
 - -- Facilities and Displays
 - -- Events
 - -- Facility Hire
 - -- Enquiry Service

7 JUSTIFICATION FOR REVIEWING THE SERVICE

Heritage services have been selected For Best Value Review as a high value and frontline public service.

8 REVIEW METHODOLOGY

- 8.1 The review team consisted of the Review Team Leader (from Personnel and Management Services), the Lead officer (Team Leader Heritage Facilities 1), the Team Leader Heritage Facilities 2, the Team Leader Technical Services and a Designer.
- 8.2 The review methodology involved defining and delineating services under review, consultations with stakeholders, benchmarking and option appraisal.
- 8.3 Consideration was given to market testing against Independent trusts, but there is no local authority in Scotland where the whole service is provided by the private sector.
- 8.4 Consideration was given to market testing of services provided by Dundee City Council Museums against Dundee Heritage Trust, but comparisons were not found to be valid as Dundee Heritage Trust does not offer the diversity, complexity and wide range of services, the breadth and scale of collections or the specialist and multi-disciplinary expertise provided through Dundee Arts and Heritage.
- 8.5 A consultation exercise was carried out with users to determine satisfaction levels through visitor questionnaires. Details are contained in Appendices 1-6

9 STAKEHOLDERS

9.1 The main stakeholders were identified as the visiting public, events participants and users of services such as the enquiry service and facility hire. Other stakeholders were identified as Dundee City Council, other Museum and Heritage bodies, staff, friends and volunteers and Grant aiding bodies

Information from stakeholders was gathered by a series of visitor satisfaction questionnaires distributed to: visitors to McManus Galleries, visitors to Broughty Castle, visitors to Mills Observatory, enquiry service users, events customers, facility hire customers

10 CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTORS

- 10.1 The critical success factors have been identified as
 - Cost` to the customer and to the Council

Quality the level of service and its provision as perceived by the stakeholders

User satisfaction as gauged by visitor questionnaires and visitor comments and complaints and visitor numbers.

11 PERFORMANCE REVIEW

11.1 Performance was reviewed by analysing the results of the customer surveys, which allowed assessment of the stakeholders' perceptions of service quality and satisfaction. Cost was reviewed in terms of the cost to the Council. Quality was reviewed by analysing the results of a benchmarking survey (see 11 below).

11.2 Facilities satisfaction survey (McManus, Broughty Castle, Mills Observatory)

The survey revealed that all three facilities have a regular repeat clientele, which demonstrate a generally high level of satisfaction with existing facilities.

78% of those at McManus, 76% of those at Mills and 67% of those at Broughty Ferry rated the attraction as very good or excellent

Approval ratings for staff helpfulness, knowledge, politeness and efficiency ranged from 70 to 90% at all venues.

53% of visitors at McManus and 52% of those at Mills but only 16% of those at Broughty, rated the shop as well-stocked,

Full results are contained within Appendices 1-3

Specific areas of dissatisfaction or poor performance were as follows:

11.2.1 Advertising

A very high proportion of visitors knew about facilities because of "word of mouth " or because "it has always been there" or "because they knew about it". Only 17% at Broughty, 28% at Mills and 32% at McManus had heard about it from a published source, paid advertising or other media. It is therefore extremely difficult for new visitors to find out about facilities.

During the period of the review, there was no specific marketing budget for any Facility. No promotional leaflet had existed for any Facility for over a year during the period of the review. The only advertising for Facilities was through the department's publication, The Accent or from exhibition and event budgets.

The Accent was found to be a fairly successful means of advertising events with 13% of events attendees having heard about the event from the publication, but only 1% of visitors to Broughty Castle, 0% of visitors to McManus Galleries and 0% of visitors to the Mills Observatory had heard about the facility via the Accent.

Poor publicity is thought to be one of the major reasons for declining visitor figures at facilities (see 11.2.6 below).

11.2.2 Opening hours

Opening hours at McManus and Mills Observatory were found to be satisfactory by the majority of users but at Broughty Castle, 32% found them poor or very poor and only 37% found them good or excellent. No less than 36 respondents specifically stated that they found the 11a.m. opening time to be too late and the detailed nature of these comments suggest the opening hours are both a deterrent and inconvenience to visitors.

11.2.3 Displays and facilities

A widespread comment was that levels of facilities were not as expected in a modern development. Specific mention was made by many respondents of lack of computers and other high-tech facilities, lack of hands on facilities and the lack of resources for children.

At both Mills and Broughty Castle the lack of refreshment and toilet facilities were specifically highlighted as problems to be addressed in any future development.

Only 36% of visitors rated the cafe at McManus as good or excellent

11.2.4 Other specific areas of weakness highlighted by the survey were:

Toilets at Mills Observatory Lack of telescopes and binoculars on the viewing platform at Mills Observatory Lack of refreshments at Broughty Castle and Mills Observatory.

11.2.4 Admission Charges

50% of visitors at McManus Galleries, 60% of visitors at Mills and 69% of visitors at Broughty Castle were prepared to pay an admission charge. When asked what level of charge they were prepared to pay the majority of responses favoured an entrance charge of \pounds 1.

11.2.5 Visitor Figures

Visitor figures at McManus and Mills have seen a steady decline over the last 4 years. This is partly explained by a national fall in visits to tourist attractions across Scotland, which has been particularly marked in Tayside, but also reflects poor publicity, visitor perceptions that displays and facilities are not up to modern standards and competition over the period from new attractions such as Verdant works and DCA. The increase in visitors at Broughty Castle may be partly explained by more high profile marketing by Historic Scotland of attractions nationally.

	1996/97	1997/98	1998/99	1999/00	%change 96-00
McManus	131255	111440	97009	92791	-29.3%
Broughty	35246	38980	42281	38289	+7.95%
Mills	15605	12985	14811	12457	-20.2%
Total	183106	163405	154101	143537	-21.6%

Verdant Works n/a	31122	28313	25579	-17.8%
Discovery Point 100473	82950	77192	75245	-25.1%
DCA	n/a	n/a	370025	n/a
DCA (exhibition galleries only)	n/a	n/a	88022	n/a

11.3 Facility Hire

Previous hirers of facilities at McManus and Camperdown House were questioned regarding their use of and satisfaction with the provision of facilities over the previous year. The total number of lets for the year was 10 at Camperdown and 8 at McManus Galleries. There were no lets at either Broughty Castle or Mills Observatory in the previous year.

Very high levels of satisfaction (80-90%) were recorded in the following areas: Staff handling of enquiries, Level of information received, booking arrangements, access arrangements, navigation around the building, arrangements for disabled users, cleanliness, decoration, power supply, seating, furnishings, facilities.

60% of users felt that the hires represented value for money. 20% of users felt the costs for hire of Camperdown House were too high

70% of users said they would use the service again

Specific problems were identified with door access at Camperdown House and heating at Camperdown House.

Full results are contained in Appendix 4

11.4 Events

Survey returns were received from participants at eight events (total attendees 119) held at McManus Galleries in July and August, three exhibition talks/demonstrations aimed at adults, three workshops for children and two public lunchtime gallery talks. No events were held at Broughty Castle or Mills Observatory during the period of the survey.

91% of participants rated the event as good or excellent
85% rated delivery as good or excellent
95% said the event was at the right level for them
90% said the event was good value
82% said access was good or excellent
95% said staff were helpful
79% said staff were efficient and knowledgeable
88% rated staff as polite.
Event facilities were rated as good or excellent by 78% of respondents and 95% said they would come to another event

Full results are contained in Appendix 5

The only discernible levels of dissatisfaction were with booking procedures where 62% rated them as good or excellent but 12% rated them as poor. All dissatisfied respondents had wished to pay for tickets by phone but were unable to do so

11.5 Enquiry service

There were over 1500 postal, telephone and in-person enquiries in the year 1998- 1999. Surveys were sent out to known users of the service over the last year

75% of respondents were happy with the time taken to answer the enquiry
97% found the information provided suitable
94% of respondents found staff helpful
95% thought staff were knowledgeable
100% thought staff were polite
89% thought staff were efficient.
80% rated the service as an important one for the Arts and Heritage department to provide.

70% of service users residents outside Dundee, but only 33% of those resident within Dundee, would be prepared to pay for the enquiry service. 45% of respondents thought that £1- £2 was an adequate fee for the service.

Full results are contained in Appendix 6

12 COMPARISON

- 12.1 There was no scope to market test as there were no other comparable providers
- 12.2 In May 1999, Dundee Arts and Heritage took part in the Cultural Heritage National Training Organisation's national benchmarking survey of museums including over 370 University, Local authority, Central government, Ministry of Defence, Charitable and Private organisations.

Organisations benchmarked in 21 different areas.

12.2.1 Dundee Arts and Heritage scored in the upper quartile (above average) in the following benchmarks:

Access to the Site and Collections (Mills and McManus)
Information Users Receive (All Facilities)
Knowledge and experience of Staff (McManus)
Forward Planning (All Facilities)
Recognition by Regulatory Bodies (All Facilities)
Service to the Community (All Facilities)
Viability of the Organisation (All Facilities)
Financial Controls and Accountability (All Facilities)
Management Controls (All Facilities)

12.2.2 Dundee Arts and Heritage scored in the lower quartile (below average) in the following benchmarks:

Benchmark 4	Monitoring Public Response to Opportunities for Enjoyment
	and Learning (All facilities)
Benchmark 6	Measuring User Satisfaction (All Facilities)
Benchmark 7	Access for Education (Mills and Broughty Castle)
Benchmark 8	Links with the Curriculum (All Facilities)
Benchmark 10	Research Facilities (All Facilities)
Benchmark 14	Meeting Terms of Reference (Mills and Broughty Castle)
Benchmark 18	Application of Technology
Benchmark 20	Opportunities for Networking (Mills)

12.2.3 Analysis of the reasons behind areas of poor performance concluded as follows:

12.2.3.1 Benchmarks 4 and 6

No visitor satisfaction or attitudinal survey has been carried out in the department since 1994

12.2.3.2 Benchmarks 7 and 8

The withdrawal of the seconded teacher and the Education Department Grant from Dundee City Council Education Department since 1996, means that the Arts and Heritage department now offers only unguided tours to schools and, at McManus, the use of the education room.

11.2.3.3 Benchmark 10

There are no dedicated research spaces or facilities at any of the buildings, due to lack of space.

11.2.3.4 Benchmark 18

There are no public computing facilities or interactives on offer at any of the buildings. The development of these is dependent on the computerisation of information and records. Less than 50% of the department's collection records are available in computerised form and these do not include any of the art or local history records. Further development is constrained by lack of software, hardware and staff time.

There are no permanent Galleries with film or video displays. Video is used in temporary exhibitions, but is of restricted quality.

Only at McManus are there audio facilities, including PA or induction loops for the hearing impaired. These are restricted to three out of eight Galleries.

11.2.3.5 Benchmark 20

Opportunities for networking at Mills are restricted, as staff are required to be present during opening hours.

13 OPTIONS APPRAISAL

13.1 Trust status

Trust status was considered for Heritage Services as a whole but was rejected on the basis of their complexity and diversity. Given the distinctive and discrete nature of the services and the manageable size of the units, however, Broughty Castle and Mills Observatory could possibly benefit from Trust status and that this should be investigated. This has previously been agreed as part of the Arts and Heritage Service Plan and is currently being explored.

13.2 Admission Charges

Consideration was given to the introduction of charges at facilities, but was rejected on the following grounds:

Museums introducing charges lose between 40% and 50% of their visitors. Lost visitors come disproportionately from the ranks of the socially excluded and children.

Additional administrative costs would be involved in the collection of charges. Legal opinion holds that, unless set up using the 1964 Education Act, Scottish local authorities are not empowered to charge for entrance to Museums or Galleries.

13.3 Donation Income

Consideration was given to raising the level of income by the introduction of a voluntary donation system whereby visitors are asked to make a contribution to the service at a suggested level. This system is encountered in some museums and in the majority of English cathedrals where a very high donation rate has been achieved. There would be costs associated with setting this up and some logistical difficulties which would need to be overcome (e.g. providing access to those using Cafe or shop), but assuming total visitor figures of 150,000 per annum, and allowing for a percentage take-up of 25% of adults, a more aggressive donations policy might provide an income in the region of £30,000 per annum. This compares with the current income from donation boxes for 1999- 2000 of approximately £3,000.

13.4 St Marys Tower

St. Mary's Tower has been the subject of a separate review and was opened to the public in July 2000 in partnership with the operators Dundee Heritage Trust, Lend Lease (developers of the new Overgate) and Scottish Enterprise Tayside.

13.5 Camperdown House

Camperdown House has been subject to a separate review as part of the Greater Camperdown Working Group. A lottery application is currently being prepared in association with the Friends of Camperdown House to take the development forward.

13.6 Broughty Castle

The shop at Broughty Castle could be enlarged to carry a greater variety of stock. A major retail development would involve a redesign of the gallery at a cost of approximately £50,000 and is not recommended, however the existing shop area on the first floor could be enlarged by removing the existing civic displays at a cost of £6000. Increased income in the region of £2000 per annum could be expected as a result of development

13.7 Events

The possibility of payment by credit card was investigated at McManus but concluded that the costs could not be justified by the volume of sales even taking into account shop purchases.

Discussions with Dundee Contemporary Arts and Dundee City Council Finance Department has proved that tickets for events at McManus could be sold through DCA or the Caird Hall box-office. Further discussions are ongoing to look at the detailed implementation of this.

13.8 Hires and Lets

The service currently makes a small surplus. Consideration was given to whether the level of lets could be raised at existing facilities or extended to facilities not currently hiring.

To build or extend business, financial implications have been identified in building works, publicity and marketing costs, increased staffing costs and increased building management costs. Given the current low level of income, this was not deemed cost effective especially as it was unlikely that sufficient additional business could be raised to cover additional staff costs.

13.9 Enquiry Service

The option of charging for enquiries was looked at.

Surveys of other local authority, independent and National Museum services were carried out to determine levels of activity and charging.

A comparison with photographic charges by other local providers was also carried out.

While bearing in mind constraints regarding public service and reciprocal arrangements, the introduction of charges for Commercial Organisations using the enquiry service is recommended and the option of further extension of charges should be further investigated.

Charges for photographs provided as part of the enquiry service should be revised and updated.

14 CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT PROPOSALS

Unless otherwise stated, these items are not contained within existing revenue budgets and will require to be resourced from additional internal or external sources.

14.1 **Donation Income**

Proposals have been brought forward to introduce a Voluntary Donation Entrance scheme to McManus, Broughty Castle and Mills Observatory. If implemented, the scheme might generate income of up to £30,000 per annum. Target date: October 2000

14.2 Development of Facilities

14.2.1 The long-term redevelopment of McManus is currently being looked at and an application to the Heritage Lottery Fund is planned for January 2001. £10,000 has been identified in the capital budget for 2000-2001 to progress the bid with a target external income of £5,000,000 over the period 2002-2005.

As part of the Department's three-year plan, it is intended to investigate Trust status with a view to establishing Broughty Castle and Mills Observatory as independent trusts. A report will be prepared by March 2001 No costs are associated with this.

- 14.2.2 An IT bid for the selection and purchase of software for the computerisation of collections at a cost of £2000 from existing budgets is planned for 2000 – 2001. Target date for purchase: February 2001
- 14.2.3 A SCRAN project, putting the Orchar collections on line will be completed by August 2000 and a second bid to SCRAN is planned for the Camperdown collections in May 2000. The costs of the current SCRAN project is £18,479 of which £10,706 is grant aid from SCRAN with the balance being met from the Orchar Trust monies.

Anticipated costs for the second project are £3096 of which £2098 will be met from grant aid and sponsorship with the balance met from the existing departmental revenue budget

- 14.2.4 Advertising leaflets for all facilities will be produced. A provisional cost of £28,000 has been identified, of which £14000 will be met from within existing revenue budgets and the balance met from the European Regional Development Fund grant. The first leaflet was published in July 2000 and their success will be measured by increased attendance figures (see 13.2.15) and by the numbers of surveyed visitors reporting their use.
- 14.2.5 Specific revenue advertising budgets should be established for facilities. A figure of £10,000 per annum is recommended. If implemented budgets should be in place by April 2001and their effectiveness measured by increased visitor figures over the year 2001-2002 (see below at 13.2.15.)
- 14.2.6 Opening Hours Broughty Castle It is recommended that consideration should be given to opening Broughty Castle at 10.30a.m.and that this should form part of the review of front of house staff in July 2000 with costs being absorbed from within existing budgets.
- 14.2.7 Painting of the toilets and other minor repairs at Mills Observatory has been scheduled or the forthcoming financial year at a cost of £2000 to be met from existing revenue budgets.
 Target date: October 2000
- 14.2.8 A fixed pay telescope is recommended at Mills Observatory for reasons of safety and administration. Investigations are currently continuing into the feasibility of this. Installation costs in the region of £500 have been identified, with subsequent running costs being self-financing. Target report date of October 2000
- 14.2.9 Ways of providing catering facilities at Broughty Castle and Mills Obsevatory will be investigated by a small group which will bring forward recommendations and the Cafe at McManus, which was between franchisees at the time of the survey, is to be re-franchised, improving public services and increasing income to the Council. Details of this commercially sensitive information are held in the audit file. Target: September 2000
- 14.2.10 The shop area at Broughty Castle should be enlarged at a cost of £6,000. Based on existing income per square foot this should generate additional income of £2000 per annum. Target: March 2001
- 14.2.11 The Department will produce a written education policy and in liaison with Dundee City Education Department identify ways of funding and delivering curriculum based as well as non-curriculum based education activities in facilities to increase usage of facilities by schools. No costs are associated with this. Report date April 2001 with impact measured by the number of school visits in 2001-2002
- 14.2.12 The department will produce a technology plan covering the use of ICT, audio, PA and lighting in facilities and across the department as a whole and identify a suitably qualified member of staff to take the plan forward. No costs are associated with this. Target date April 2001
- 14.2.13 Visitor figures for the department will increase by 5% per annum or a total increase of 25% over 5 years, dependent on the above recommendations being carried out

14.3 Events

14.3.1 The feasibility study on telephone sales of tickets will report by May 2000. No costs are associated with this

14.4 Facility hire

14.4.1 As part of a programme of ongoing improvements, the provision of a doorbell and additional heating at Camperdown will be provided next financial year from existing revenue budgets. Target date September 2000

14.5 Enquiries

- 14.5.1 Enquiries from commercial organisations will be re-charged at a rate of £18 per hour. Income of approximately £500 per annum is expected Target date October 2000.
- 14.5.2 Photographic charges to the public should be increased. Increased income of £500 per annum is anticipated. See Appendix 7 for new charges.
- 14.5.3 A working party will review the issue of charges for other enquiries and report by October 2000.

14.6 **Consultation with Public**

- 14.6.1 An annual Visitor Survey to measure visitor satisfaction with facilities and services should be carried out at all facilities. This could be carried out internally, with support from Personnel and Management Services at no extra cost. Target date: December 2000
- 14.6.2 An external consultant should carry out a survey of non-users every 5 years. There would be a recurring cost in the region of £4000 every 5th year Target date for first survey: April 2001
- 14.6.3 Evaluation forms should be distributed at events and on the completion of hires. No costs are associated with this. Target date: immediate implementation
- 14.6.4 Visitor figures will continue to be monitored.

15.0 **CONSULTATION**

15.1 The Director of Finance and the Director of Arts and Heritage have been consulted on this report.

16.0 BACKGROUND PAPERS

16.1 Best value submission to the Secretary of State Scotland December 1997. Policy and Resources Committee, 11 December 1997.

Chief Executive

Date _____