

REPORT TO: CITY DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE - 6 DECEMBER 2010

REPORT ON: FORMER EASTERN PRIMARY SCHOOL - DRAFT PLANNING BRIEF

REPORT BY: DIRECTOR OF CITY DEVELOPMENT

REPORT NO: 649-2010

1 PURPOSE OF REPORT

1.1 The purpose of this report is to seek approval of a Draft Site Planning Brief for public consultation in order to promote and guide the reuse of the former Eastern Primary School building and site in Broughty Ferry.

2 RECOMMENDATION

2.1 It is recommended that the Committee:

- approves the Draft Site Planning Brief for consultation purposes; and
- remits the Director of City Development to consult with the local communities and interested parties on the Draft Site Planning Brief and report back on the results of the consultation within six months.

3 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

3.1 There are no financial implications for the Council in terms of this report.

4 BACKGROUND

4.1 The Education Committee at its meeting on 22 November (Report 658-2010 refers) approved the permanent relocation of the Eastern Primary School to the old Grove Academy building on Camperdown Street.

4.2 The Draft Site Planning Brief sets clear guidance for the redevelopment of the site. The key points of the Draft Site Planning Brief are:

- Promoting conversion of the Category A Listed buildings for a range of uses, though housing is considered to be the most appropriate option;
- Retaining and re-using the main school building and ancillary buildings is essential;
- Encouraging development of a small number of houses along the northern boundary of the site.

5 POLICY IMPLICATIONS

5.1 This Report has been screened for any policy implications in respect of Sustainability, Strategic Environmental Assessment, Anti-Poverty, Equality Impact Assessment and Risk Management. There are no major issues.

6 CONSULTATIONS

- 6.1 The Chief Executive, Depute Chief Executive (Support Services), Director of Finance, Assistant Chief Executive and Director of Housing have been consulted and are in agreement with the contents of this report.

7 BACKGROUND PAPERS

- 7.1 Dundee City Council - Education and Policy & Resources Committees Report No 384-2010.

Mike Galloway
Director of City Development

GH/NMcD/MM

25 November 2010

Dundee City Council
Tayside House
Dundee

DRAFT SITE PLANNING BRIEF**FORMER EASTERN PRIMARY SCHOOL SITE, BROUGHTY FERRY****1 INTRODUCTION**

- 1.1 Dundee City Council's decision in 2010 to relocate the Eastern Primary School presents an opportunity to promote the re-use of this site, which includes the category A-listed former school building in the popular residential area of Broughty Ferry.
- 1.2 This Site Planning Brief has been prepared as supplementary planning guidance to the Dundee Local Plan Review 2005. This Brief provides the planning parameters to ensure successful comprehensive quality redevelopment of the site by promoting the re-use of the existing buildings and identifying an area within the site for new development.

2 LOCATION

- 2.1 The site, in the Forthill conservation area, is within a well established and popular residential area to the immediate north of Monifieth Road at the cross-roads with St Vincent Street and Whinny Brae. The site is bounded to the north, east and west by the suburban housing of Rowanbank Gardens and Whinny Brae.
- 2.2 The site's proximity to high quality local amenities and transport connections to the city centre is excellent. The local district shopping centre amenities of Brook Street, the regular service bus stops on Monifieth Road, the train station at Gray Street, the beach and public parks are all a few minutes walk away.

3 THE SITE

- 3.1 The site extends to 0.46 Ha and comprises the category A-listed former school building, its ancillary out-buildings and the former play-ground area. The main building lies close to the west boundary of the site with the former playground to the east and north. All the ancillary buildings, which include the former toilet block, play sheds and shelters that run along the eastern boundary, as well as the boundary details, are included within the listing.
- 3.2 Near the north-west corner of the site is an electricity substation which, subject to appropriate agreements, could be relocated to a less obtrusive position. Adjacent to the substation is a single car garage with harled walls under a pitched slate roof.
- 3.3 The roadway level at Rowanbank Gardens, to the north of the site is circa 2m higher than the finished ground level of the former play-ground area.
- 3.4 Existing vehicular access is from Whinny Brae and its retention, or the formation of a new vehicular access off Rowanbank Gardens, are the only vehicular access options for the site though improvements to the width and visibility may have to be made to the existing vehicular entrance if it is to be retained.
- 3.5 The small group of trees to the southern boundary with the Monifieth Road are part of the setting of the listed building and are covered under the Forthill Conservation Area

designation. If removal of the trees is proposed notice must be given to the Council who have a period of 6 weeks to object or consent to removal of the trees.

4 THE FORMER EASTERN PRIMARY SCHOOL BUILDING

- 4.1 The former school was built to the designs of James H Langlands with William G Lammond and James H Langlands Jnr in 1911 in the Art Nouveau style for the Dundee Schools Board. The school was the first of its type in Dundee to be built with steel beams, though was otherwise traditionally constructed with "snecked bull-faced" sandstone with smooth quoins and dressings under a slate roof and with cast iron down pipes and typical 6-pane timber casement window arrangements.
- 4.2 The form of the building is basically a double height classroom on either side of a wide single central corridor arranged over 3 main floors, (ground, second and fourth), with the first and third floors as intermediary floors comprising a corridor with accommodation at either end of the building. It is thought that these two floors are an integral part of the original design whereby teaching could be surveyed by the headmaster without being noticed. A boiler room and cellar running the length of the main corridor can be accessed down steps close to the main entrance and could provide additional storage and a communal heating system.
- 4.3 The gross internal floor area is circa 2,460m² including circulation corridors.
- 4.4 The school building is considered to be in good structural order and will only cease to function as a school in 2011.
- 4.5 The buildings are listed as nationally important for their construction and architectural appearance and will probably continue to be an important reminder of schooling in the wider area. As such, it is anticipated that the original external appearance will remain largely unaltered through renovation and re-use.
- 4.6 Adaptation to the fabric of the building must be undertaken carefully and sensitively and have minimum impact on the architectural and historic interest, character and setting of the building. However, the opportunity should be taken to remove insensitive accretions such as the extensions, fire screen walls, visible wiring and inappropriate ironmongery etc.
- 4.7 The interiors of the building are listed and the sympathetic re-use of the listed buildings is likely to be a complex undertaking. It is strongly advised that prospective developers regularly liaise with the Conservation Officer in order that important internal detailing, and areas where there is more flexibility for change are agreed.

5 FUTURE USES

- 5.1 Housing is the prevailing use in the popular surrounding area and is considered an appropriate re-use this site. However, alternative uses will also be considered in terms of the Local Plan policies and in consideration of the flexibility of the existing former school building for reconfiguration.
- 5.2 Policy 30 of the Local Plan 'Visitor Accommodation' supports additional visitor accommodation within the central Broughty Ferry area to improve the attractiveness of the area for tourism, and conversion of the listed buildings to a quality hotel is another potential option for re-use.

- 5.3 Alternative uses could include office workspace, workshop/craft space, educational/community use facilities, etc. However, such uses must demonstrate that they would not adversely affect the residential character of the surrounding area.
- 5.4 Vehicular access to the site is limited and the extent of car parking may also be an impediment to a wider range of uses. Should a non-residential use be proposed for the listed buildings it is likely that the northern part of the site will not be considered for redevelopment other than for car parking to serve the re-use of the listed buildings.
- 5.5 It is likely that given the surrounding popular residential area and the potential costs involved in the re-use of the building that residential re-use is the most viable option.
- 5.6 Proposals for a comprehensive development of the entire site are required and no planning application will be accepted which does not fully address the listed building and its ancillary accommodation.

6 STANDARDS FOR NEW HOUSING DEVELOPMENT

- 6.1 Proposals for the development of housing, through either conversion or new build will be required to meet with the following standards which supersede those contained in the Local Plan.
- 6.2 This Brief provides clear planning parameters to ensure the successful comprehensive redevelopment of the site in relation to the surroundings. No planning application will be considered which does not fully address the entire site, though it is anticipated that the site can be developed in two parts:
 - a The Former School Building
 - 1 The former school building should be sympathetically and imaginatively converted in order to have minimum impact on its architectural and historic interest, character and setting. Any alterations to the listed buildings should be shown to restore or enhance their architectural character.
 - 2 The site is within the 'Suburban' and flatted developments are acceptable through conversions of buildings of merit within this area.
 - 3 Flats created within the listed buildings should have generous internal space standards with at least 2 or more bedrooms and should be in excess of 60m² internally. However, the existing internal configuration of rooms and window positions will guide the future internal arrangement and number of dwellings that can be created. It is anticipated that the internal floor areas and volumes of some dwellings will greatly exceed the Local Plan requirements and complement dwelling choice in the wider residential area.
 - 4 The general floor to ceiling heights within the former school building are double height and it is anticipated that the creation of mezzanine levels, where appropriate, within the double height space could provide attractive additional accommodation within flats. The existing layout of the former school building may offer the opportunity for vertical sub-division as well as the more typical horizontal sub-division.

- 5 Car parking must be provided at a minimum of 150%, one space dedicated to each flat with the remainder for visitor car parking, and in addition secure indoor storage for bicycles should be provided for each flat as well as appropriate stores for domestic waste and recyclable goods. It is anticipated that the out-buildings arranged along the eastern boundary could be utilised for storage and/or garaging.
- 6 Residential redevelopment proposals must plan for a high quality living environment by providing attractive outdoor space for residents whilst respecting the architectural integrity of the former school building. Communal garden space must have an area representing 10m² per dwelling within the former school building, and other areas of private, or semi-private, garden ground should be created where-ever possible.

b New Houses

- 1 A small number of new houses could be built along the northern boundary to the site. In consideration of the level difference between the site and Rowanbank Gardens this area may lend itself to the erection of 3-storey town houses which could resolve the existing level difference and provide visual harmony with the former school building.
- 2 If new houses are proposed for the northern portion of they must have 3 or more bedrooms or a minimum gross internal floor area of 100m² as well as space for at least 2 cars with 50% of houses having a garage or space for one.
- 3 For new housing at least 1 car parking space must be provided within the curtilage of each house and private houses with 3 or more bedrooms should have at least 2 car parking spaces. In addition, 50% of all houses should have a garage or space for one.
- 4 It is anticipated that all new houses will have appropriate storage for domestic waste and recyclable goods incorporated into their design.
- 5 For new houses a minimum private useable garden ground of 120m² must be provided and it is desirable that 40% of new houses have more than 160m² of useable garden ground.
- 6 All road markings associated with the existing school must be removed by the developer.

7 CONSTRUCTION MATERIALS

- 7.1 No limitation is placed on the use of new construction materials. However, it is expected that new materials used for the conversion of the listed building will be of a high quality on a 'like for like', or complementary basis, with the existing materials. Stone masonry boundary walls and railings will be retained and repaired in matching materials.
- 7.2 Materials for restoring or repairing specific features of the listed building must use the same traditional materials ie natural stone and slate, lime mortars and cast iron rainwater disposal goods. Such work should have regard to British Standard

BS7913 - Guide to the Principles of Building Conservation and to Historic Scotland's Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas 1998. In particular reference should be made to Appendix 1 paragraphs 2.1.2.4 - 1.2.11 in respect to window design and treatment, and to paragraphs 2.1.1 - 2.1.4, in relation to interiors. Whilst there is no specific mention of schools and educational buildings there is valuable guidance on the reuse and treatment of special or non-residential buildings at paragraphs 5.1 - 5.5.

- 7.3 New development within the grounds should use a palette of materials predominantly similar in colour to those of the surroundings buildings in order to provide a visual coherence. New development should draw reference from some of the architectural detailing of the listed building or be sufficiently contemporary in style to contribute a 21st century addition within the setting of a listed building. Standard kit designs are unlikely to be acceptable within the setting of the listed building.

8 SUSTAINABILITY

- 8.1 The City Council actively promotes and encourages developers to embrace sustainable development principles and the appropriate reuse of the former school building is at the heart of sustainability. In the subdivision of the building and site developers must design to maximise passive solar gain and where possible exceed the current Building Standards in relation to energy efficiency and water use.
- 8.2 To encourage recycling all dwellings should have adequate space for the storage and use of recycling bins etc. The range of existing out-buildings provides an opportunity for household and waste storage.

9 DRAINAGE

- 9.1 Early liaison with Scottish Water is recommended to ascertain the drainage requirements of the site. However, it is anticipated that surface and waste water from the former school building will use the existing drainage network and that any new housing developed on the site will connect into the existing network. There is no opportunity within the site to create a water attenuation area.

10 THE DESIGN STATEMENT AND PRE-APPLICATION MEETINGS

- 10.1 A Design Statement must be submitted with a planning application for this important site and comprehensive guidance on the preparation and content of Design Statements is provided in the Scottish Government's Planning Advice Note 68 "Design Statements".
- 10.2 The use of pre-application discussions between relevant Dundee City Council City Development Department Officers and the developer/agent is essential to ensure at the outset of the development process that the possibilities of the site are known.