

**REPORT TO: PLANNING AND TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE
4 DECEMBER 2000**

REPORT ON: BROUGHTY FERRY STUDY

**REPORT BY: DIRECTOR OF PLANNING AND TRANSPORTATION
DIRECTOR OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT**

REPORT NO: 630-2000

1 PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 1.1 The purpose of the report is to advise Committee on the outcome of the various studies carried out through the summer in relation to traders servicing, traffic flow and the traffic order review.
- 1.2 A further Study was sought on the hotel bedspace capacity for Broughty Ferry and the conclusions of that exercise are reported.
- 1.3 This report follows up recommendations in Report 363/2000.

2 RECOMMENDATIONS

- 2.1 It is recommended that:
- a the committee endorse the conclusions of the studies;
 - b authority be given to progress various traffic orders to consultation stage:
 - Brook Street to be one way eastwards between Fort Street and Gray Street.
 - Parking to be removed from Brook Street between Fort Street and Gray Street.
 - Additional parking to be provided in Brook Street east of Gray Street.
 - Parking restrictions to facilitate servicing to be extended throughout Brook Street between Fort Street and Gray Street.
 - Eight dedicated disabled spaces to be provided close to central Brook Street.
 - Taxi ranks to be provided at Gray Street north of the level crossing and in Brook Street in the area of Masonic Lodge or Safeway.
 - Corner/junction treatment detail to be implemented.
 - Public transport routes to be protected.
 - Fisher Street to be closed at Pilot Pier, Ambrose Street to be opened at its south end.
 - King Street, Fort Street, Fisher Street, Gray Street block to be access only.
 - Long Lane to be access only.
 - Long Lane to be closed at Gray Street east side.
 - Esplanade to be closed at Mill Gardens
 - Treatment for Gray Street to be considered.

3 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- 3.1 Costs associated with implementing specific proposals will be brought back to the Committee for approval.

4 LOCAL AGENDA 21 IMPLICATIONS

- 4.1 The Broughty Ferry study has addressed existing issues and identified development opportunities to secure a sustainable community. The Broughty Ferry study has addressed a

range of key themes of 'Dundee 21', the particular focus has been all aspects relating to local shopping in a pleasant environment with ease of access for all.

5 EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES IMPLICATIONS

- 5.1 The Broughty Ferry study has attempted to work through a range of parties to arrive at a solution to meet a range of needs by broad consultation in pursuit of an environment appropriate to the community's need.

6 BACKGROUND

- 6.1 Reference is made to the meetings of the Planning and Transportation Committee of 24 January 2000 Report No 3/2000 and 26 June 2000 Report No 363/2000, when it was agreed that further studies be carried out in particular a survey of traders servicing, traffic movements and traffic order review.
- 6.2 Opportunity was taken during a questionnaire survey of traders to seek views on a variety of issues relating to the study.

7 PARKING RESTRICTIONS REVIEW

- 7.1 Generally the Review is in response to the ongoing changes in Broughty Ferry eg removal of premises needing heavy servicing, changing patterns of servicing, the debate generated by the study and the proposals and suggestions brought forward by that debate.
- 7.2 The Review must tailor parking restrictions to the servicing requirement, resolve congestion and enhance shopper/visitor comfort. Servicing is of critical importance to the viability of the shopping centre. Comfort is of paramount importance to the vitality of the shopping centre.

8 ACTION

- 8.1 The key actions requiring changes to the parking restrictions are:
- potential changes to traffic flow to reduce congestion or enhance the shopping experience;
 - kerbside to be used exclusively for servicing;
 - kerbside to be used exclusively for disabled parking;
 - kerbside to be used exclusively for taxis;
 - kerbside no longer required for servicing and which may accommodate parking;
 - kerbside which can potentially accommodate parking either with or without limit of time;
 - areas where alternations to traffic flow are essential for safety, to enhance the environment or to aid public transport.
- 8.2 To achieve the above requires (see plan):
- Brook Street will be made one way eastwards in order to enhance the shopping experience by the removal of westbound traffic to release space for additional footway to accommodate planting, furniture or street café etc.
 - Parking will be removed from Brook Street which would be limited to service and buses only to further enhance the shopper environment and safety. Additional parking is being provided on the former car sales site at Queen Street. Pedestrian access to Gray Street and Brook Street from the existing Queen Street car park will be improved.
 - Additional parking to be provided in Brook Street east of the Gray Street. Experience shows that even at busy times, when there is unauthorised parking on both sides of the street two way traffic can be accommodated albeit at lower speeds. This also becomes a

traffic calming device and responds to the desire expressed in the public consultation for reduced speeds or a 20 mph zone.

- Existing parking restrictions to facilitate servicing should be retained and extended throughout Brook Street between Fort Street and Gray Street.
- Eight dedicated disabled spaces will be provided as close as practical to central Brook Street.
- The taxi rank will be split and relocated to Gray Street by the cabman's shelter and a site at the Masonic Lodge or Safeways facing west. Neither of these locations would involve the loss of on-street parking.
- The consultation draft identified a possible corner/junction treatment which could:
 - a shorten the crossing distance for pedestrians
 - b move sight lines forward to avoid parked cars
 - c as a result release additional kerbside space.

This proposal found favour in the consultation stages and should be applied as far as practical throughout the Study area. The resultant space would be time limited or unlimited depending on location. This would result in a minimum additional 75 car spaces. Depending on detailed design work, the number of additional parking spaces may be further increased. (See Appendix 1).

- Subject to discussion with operators as a result of Brook Street being one way measures, including parking being removed from one side of Westfield Road during daylight hours, will require to be taken to accommodate public transport.
- Fisher Street will be closed at Pilot Pier, Ambrose Street will be opened at its south end and the King Street/Fisher Street/Gray Street block will be restricted to access only in order to resolve the rat run problem at Fisher Street, to enhance the amenity of the riverfront and to improve safety for residents.
- Long Lane should be restricted to access only due to its width.
- Long Lane should be closed at Gray Street east side due to its narrow width, sight lines and heavy pedestrian flows in Long Lane and Gray Street.
- the road to the south and west of Mill Gardens will be closed and incorporated into Castle Green to enhance the amenity of Castle Green and improve access to Mill Gardens
- Consideration will be given for a treatment for Gray Street to secure enhancements to the shoppers experience theme.

9 TRADERS SURVEY

- 9.1 A Questionnaire Study was undertaken among the 129 traders in Brook Street, Gray Street and Union Street. Replies have been received from 113 traders (88%). The non respondents are generally the "evening economy" – restaurants and public houses.
- 9.2 The survey covered three topics general views and attitudes to Broughty Ferry, particular issues affecting individual traders and the servicing and delivery requirements and problems of individual traders.
- 9.3 The key points of the study are outlined in Appendix 2.

10 TRAFFIC SURVEY

- 10.1 Traffic counts were taken by pressure tube over a range of days reflecting school days/school holidays/weekdays/weekends etc. These have been ratified by spot checks for turning manoeuvres at key junctions.
- 10.2 Key points to the traffic survey are:
- Traffic is heavy throughout the day on Brook Street (6080 vehicles)
 - There are particular problems at peak periods where it is clear that motorists are using Brook Street, King Street and possibly Fisher Street/Douglas Terrace to avoid the various light controlled junctions along Queen Street.
 - There is a need to reduce traffic in Brook Street to enhance shopping comfort and remove servicing congestion.
 - There is a need to remove extraneous non-essential traffic using King Street or Fisher Street as a rat-run/bypass to Queen Street.
- 10.3 Actions would need to incorporate a package of works to discourage morning commuters heading for the city centre using Brook Street and King Street whilst addressing the needs of the extra traffic put back onto Queen Street, in particular protecting the public transport corridor.

11 HOTEL BEDSPACE ANALYSIS/CAPACITY STUDY

- 11.1 Following undertakings given at the public meeting, consideration has been given to an hotel, bedspace capacity study. The Director of Economic Development has concluded that it would be impractical to carry out such a study for Broughty Ferry as a stand alone exercise.
- 11.2 Due consideration has been given to the number of visitor bedspaces available in Broughty Ferry (see Appendix 3 Table 1) and the number of 5 crown hotels in Dundee city compared with the other cities (see Appendix 3 Table 2). Dundee is presently fourth of the four cities in terms of bedspaces per capita.
- 11.3 A range of additional bedspaces has been calculated for a range of scenarios in the city to take Dundee to a position alternatively third or second place in Scotland. As a consequence a requirement is identified for between 145 and 500 hotel bedspaces (see Appendix 3 Table 3).
- 11.4 Broughty Ferry is traditionally a visitor destination, therefore, it is likely that at least some of this additional accommodation would seek out sites in Broughty Ferry. Whilst in Broughty Ferry this demand can in part be met by a growth in "bed & breakfast" facilities and the upgrading of existing "bed & breakfast" facilities to hotel space, there will inevitably be development pressures for hotel sites.
- 11.5 The officers, jointly with the Community Council and other community representatives, will continue to seek to identify appropriate sites on which to develop an hotel in and around Central Broughty Ferry which will maximise the benefits and minimise the impact of such proposals. The Committee will be advised of progress in due course.

12 CONCLUSIONS

- 12.1 The above package of proposals will be implemented as an agreed programme on approval of the appropriate traffic orders.
- 12.2 Authority is sought to consult with the public on this package of proposals and the appropriate draft order.

13 CONSULTATIONS

- 13.1 The Chief Executive, Director of Finance, Director of Support Services and Director of Corporate Planning, have been consulted and are in agreement with the contents of this report.

14 BACKGROUND PAPERS

- 14.1 Broughty Ferry Traders Attitude and Servicing Survey 2000 (P&T)
Broughty Ferry Community Council Questionnaire Survey 1998 (BFCC)
Broughty Ferry Neighbourhood Forum 2000 (NRDD)
Minute of Public Meeting March 2000 (P&T)
Note of Public Comments August 2000 (P&T)
Minute of Meeting with Tourism Operators June 2000 (P&T)
SWOT Analysis March 2000 (P&T)
Traffic Counts September 2000 (P&T)
Hotel Bedspace Analysis October 2000 (P&T/EDD)
Broughty Ferry Community Profiling Survey June 2000 (BF Environment Project)
Broughty Ferry Participatory Appraisal July 1999 (BF Environment Project)
Broughty Ferry Traffic Restrictions Order (P&T)
Dundee City Off Street Parking Order (P&T)
Dundee City Taxi Stance Order (P&T)

Mike Galloway
Director of Planning & Transportation

Doug Grimmond
Director of Economic Development

KGW/DMacD/KR Temp18

24 November 2000

Dundee City Council
Tayside House
Dundee

APPENDIX 1

Corner/Junction Treatment – Parking Impact

Junction Location	Additional Parking Spaces		Reason for Later Provision
	Early	Later	
Brook Street/Westfield Road/West		4	Await detailed requirements at new surgery
Brook Street/Westfield Road/East		2	Await detailed review of public transport requirements
Brook Street/Church Street/West	4		
Brook Street/Church Street/North	3		
Brook Street/Church Street/East		4	Await detailed review of access arrangements
Brook Street/Church Street/South	4		
Brook Street/Lawrence Street/West		2	Await detailed review of access arrangements
Brook Street/Fort Street/West		4	Await detailed review of taxi/public transport stances
Brook Street/Gray Street/North	1		Await detailed review of public transport requirements
Brook Street/Gray Street/South		4	Await detailed review of public transport stances
Brook Street/Gray Street- St Vincent St		6	Await detailed review of taxi stances
Brook Street/ St Vincent Street/West	3	8	Await detailed requirements at new development
Brook Street/ St Vincent Street/East	2		
Brook Street/ St Vincent Street/South	2		
Brook Street/Cross Street/West		2	Await detailed review of access arrangements
Brook Street/Cross Street/East		2	Await detailed review of access arrangements
King Street/Church Street/West	4		
King Street/Church Street/North	4		
King Street/Church Street/East	4		
King Street/Church Street/South	4		
King Street/Lawrence Street/North		1	Await detailed review of access arrangements
King Street/Brown Street/West	3		
King Street/Brown Street/North	4		
King Street/Brown Street/East	2		
King Street/Brown Street/South		2	Await review of access arrangements
King Street/Fort Street/West	4		
King Street/Fort Street/North	4		
King Street/Fort Street/East	4		
King Street/Fort Street/South	4		
King Street/Long Lane/South		2	Await confirmation of service arrangements
King Street/Gray Street/West		2	Await confirmation of service arrangements
King Street/Gray Street/North		1	Await confirmation of service arrangements
King Street/Gray Street/East		2	Await confirmation of service arrangements
King Street/Gray Street/South	1	1	Await confirmation of service arrangements
Gray Street/King Street/Brook Street		6	Await confirmation of development details
King Street/St Vincent Street/West	4		
King Street/St Vincent Street/North	4		
King Street/St Vincent Street/East	2		
King Street/St Vincent Street/South	4		
TOTAL	75	50	

APPENDIX 2

TRADERS SURVEY

- 1 The key points of the survey relating to Broughty Ferry are generally:
 - The traders see Broughty Ferry principally as a tourist centre, shopping centre or small town.
 - The catchment of Broughty Ferry as perceived by the traders, focuses on East Dundee, South and East Angus and North Fife.
 - The key issues relate to parking with lack of parking, illegal parking, and poor enforcement of parking and traffic congestion.
 - 70% of traders feel that Broughty Ferry needs to attract more visitors. Those who feel Broughty Ferry has enough visitors cite traffic congestion, busy pavements and lack of parking as reasons for not wanting more visitors.
 - 40% of traders see a need for better quality shops, 50% seek a wider range of shops, 30% see that specific types of shops are missing from Broughty Ferry.
 - 40% want the streets to be more attractive, comfortable and safe, 35% want pedestrianisation and 40% want more visitor attractions.
 - 66% of traders want streets enhanced eg trees, banners, furniture with 15% opposed and 20% ambivalent. Other features which featured prominently were a need for more greenery, hanging baskets, pavement cafes, seating and planter tubs.

- 2 The key points of the survey relating to traders are:
 - Key locational decisions were the identification of a good trading position, and an old established business, traders who saw a gap in the market, those who are residents, an appropriate location for specialist trade, good customer base and a lively centre.
 - The traders own customer base shows some significant differences to the perceived Broughty Ferry catchment with a number of shops who have customers in Edinburgh, Glasgow, Pitlochry, Aberdeen, Dunfermline.
 - Generally all traders see business growing. Twenty-six traders expect to expand, 16 are actively seeking new larger premises in the next five years. This represents an early need for some 5,000 square metres of floorspace.
 - Eight see business contracting, three traders see businesses closing within one year and five within three years. Reasons for closure include lack of custom, proliferation of hot food licences and the Claypotts superstore.

- 3 Key points from the servicing survey are:
 - 25% of traders are serviced on a daily basis with 10% being served between twice and four times daily, twice weekly and once weekly.
 - 70% of servicing is completed within 15 minutes and 90% within 30 minutes.
 - 55% of servicing is between 8.00 am and 12.00 pm but 25% of traders have variable delivery times.
 - 80% of servicing is done by van or lorry, 10% each by car or articulated vehicle.

- All service traffic tends to use Brook Street in an easterly direction then access Gray Street to exit by King Street or by the level crossing.
- 30% of traders have no problem with their servicing, 70% find their servicing hampered by parked cars and 12% due to other servicing.
- A number of traders have parking bays alongside the store. These are often the stores requiring access by articulated trucks and for longer periods – up to one hour.
- Only a very few traders have rear servicing and only two whose rear servicing does not require access by Brook Street.
- 35% of traders offer a delivery service to customers. This is generally done by car/van and takes no more than 15 minutes.
- 75% of these deliveries are done from the street, there being no rear servicing.

4 Conclusions

The key problem area for servicing is Brook Street between Union Street and Gray Street on both north and south sides. There are problems throughout the north side of Brook Street from YMCA to the Bank of Scotland. Gray Street is a problem on both east and west sides from King Street to Brook Street junction and between Brook Street and the level crossing on the west side. There are also major problems in Union Street due to the width of the road and the nature of the businesses. There is a particular 'hot spot' at the Gray Street/Brook Street junction.

APPENDIX 3

Hotel Bedspace Analysis/Capacity Study

Table 1 – Visitor bedspace in Broughty Ferry

HOTEL	ROOMS					FACILITIES			RATING					BEDS	NIGHTS		
	single	double	twin	family	rooms	en-suite	private	shared	*	**	***	****	?	spaces	room	bed	
TOTAL	7	18	62	48	7	144	126	1	78	1	1	3	1	1	247	52560	90155

GUEST HOUSE	ROOMS					FACILITIES			RATING					BEDS	NIGHTS		
	single	double	twin	family	rooms	en-suite	private	shared	*	**	***	****	?	spaces	room	bed	
TOTAL	6	4	9	8	10	30	24	7	1	0	2	3	0	1	68	10950	24720

BED&BREAKFAST	ROOMS					FACILITIES			RATING					BEDS	NIGHTS	
	single	double	twin	family	rooms	en-suite	private	shared	*	**	***	****	?	spaces	room	bed
TOTAL	8	7	5	8	3	23	16	1	5	0	3	3	2	39	7955	13510

SUB TOTAL	21	29	76	64	20	197	166	9	14	1	6	9	3	2	354	71465	12835
------------------	-----------	-----------	-----------	-----------	-----------	------------	------------	----------	-----------	----------	----------	----------	----------	----------	------------	--------------	--------------

SELF CATERING	ROOMS					FACILITIES			RATING					BEDS	NIGHTS	
	single	double	twin	family	rooms	en-suite	private	shared	*	**	***	****	?	spaces	room	bed
TOTAL	3	1	5		6			3	0	0	0	1	2	11		3325

CARAVANS	ROOMS					FACILITIES			RATING					BEDS	NIGHTS	
	single	double	twin	family	rooms	en-suite	private	shared	*	**	***	****	?	spaces	room	bed
TOTAL	1			1	1		1						1	4		700

SUB TOTAL	4	1	5	0	1	7	0	1	3	0	0	0	1	3	15	0	4025
------------------	----------	----------	----------	----------	----------	----------	----------	----------	----------	----------	----------	----------	----------	----------	-----------	----------	-------------

TOTAL	ROOMS					FACILITIES			RATING					BEDS	NIGHTS		
	single	double	twin	family	rooms	en-suite	private	shared	*	**	***	****	?	spaces	room	bed	
TOTAL	2	30	81	64	21	20	166	10	87	1	6	9	4	5	369	71465	132410

Source: Angus & Dundee Tourist Board – Accommodation Guide 2000 All Broughty Ferry addresses

Table 2 – 5 crown hotel bedspace in Dundee

DUNDEE IN COMPARISON TO OTHER CITIES

CITY	POPULATION	5 CROWN HOTELS	BEDROOMS	BEDROOMS PER CAPITA
Edinburgh	450,000	16	2,324	0.0052
Aberdeen	216,000	7	846	0.0039
Glasgow	612,000	6	1,476	0.0024
Dundee	149,000	2	212	0.0014
4 Cities	1,427,000	31	4,858	0.0034
3 Cities excluding Dundee	1,278,000	29	4,646	0.0036

October 1998

Table 3 – Possible hotel bedspace growth in Dundee

Bedspaces required for Dundee to match the next lowest rate ie Glasgow	145
Bedspaces required for Dundee to match the 3 city average	324
Bedspaces required for Dundee to better the 3 city average ie 2 nd city	500

Equivalent of 3 - 5 quality new hotels in Dundee