

REPORT TO: PLANNING & TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE - 13 NOVEMBER 2006

REPORT ON: RAIL UTILISATION STRATEGY FOR SCOTLAND - DRAFT FOR CONSULTATION

REPORT BY: DIRECTOR OF PLANNING & TRANSPORTATION

REPORT NO: 611-2006

1 PURPOSE OF REPORT

1.1 This report outlines the purpose, content and proposals contained within the Network Rail consultation document "Rail Utilisation Strategy for Scotland" and Dundee City Council's response.

2 RECOMMENDATION

2.1 It is recommended that the Committee note the purpose, content and proposals contained within the consultation and endorse Dundee City Council's response contained in the appendices.

3 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

3.1 There are no financial implications arising as a result of this report.

4 SUSTAINABILITY POLICY IMPLICATIONS

Transport and Travel

4.1 The responses to this consultation document contained in this report are aimed at improving local rail opportunities and rail connectivity between Dundee and other major cities in Scotland. The responses thus address the sustainability Transport and Travel principle to promote opportunities for sustainable transport and encourage the use accessible public transport to reduce private car dependency.

5 EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES IMPLICATIONS

5.1 The responses to this consultation document contained in this report are aimed at improving local rail opportunities and rail connectivity between Dundee and other major cities in Scotland. The responses thus address the travel needs for all and, in particular, those who do not have access to a private car.

6 BACKGROUND

6.1 Purpose of the Rail Utilisation Strategy for Scotland

6.1.1 The purpose of the Rail Utilisation Strategy for Scotland (Scotland RUS) is to enable Network Rail and persons providing services relating to railways to plan their businesses better, and funders to plan their activities better; and to set out feasible options for network capacity, timetable outputs and network capability and the associated funding implications of those options.

- 6.1.2 The Scotland RUS seeks to optimise the use made of available route capacity as well as promote the development of further capacity through targeted interventions consistent with the level of funding that is likely to be available over the next 10 year time horizon. It will also assist Scottish Ministers in the development of their strategies for the future development of the rail network.
- 6.1.3 The extent of the rail network coverage for the Scotland RUS is the whole of the rail network in Scotland minus the East Coast Main Line (south of Edinburgh) and the West Coast Main Line.
- 6.1.4 Among other outcomes, the Scotland RUS will therefore:
- Propose options to achieve the most efficient and effective use of the existing rail network.
 - identify cost effective opportunities to improve the network where appropriate
 - enable Network Rail to develop an informed renewals and maintenance programme in line with Transport Scotland's aspirations and the reasonable requirements of train operators and other key stakeholders (including local authorities and regional transport partnerships).
- 6.1.5 This consultation draft of the Scotland RUS outlines the issues that the Scotland RUS area currently faces and those that are predicted to rise over the next 10 years. It then outlines the proposed options to be developed to address these gaps and the next steps that should be taken in each case.
- 6.1.6 The responses to this consultation document will shape the final Scotland RUS.

6.2 Summary of Dundee City Council's Response to Scotland RUS

- 6.2.1 Dundee City Council welcomes and fully supports the introduction of an hourly fast intercity service between Aberdeen and Edinburgh supplemented by an hourly semi fast stopping train between Dundee and Edinburgh to provide the local stopping service.
- 6.2.2 Dundee City Council strongly agrees with the fast Aberdeen to Edinburgh service having only one stop in Fife, but has no preference to where this one stop in Fife is.
- 6.2.3 Dundee City Council note and support the proposal for there to be a fast Glasgow to Aberdeen service and that the Anglo-Scottish services are to be retained unaltered.
- 6.2.4 Dundee City Council strongly urges that the fast Glasgow to Aberdeen service is supported by a local stopping service.

7 CONSULTATIONS

- 7.1 The Chief Executive, Depute Chief Executive (Support Services), Depute Chief Executive (Finance) and Assistant Chief Executive (Community Planning) have been consulted and are in agreement with the contents of this report.

8 BACKGROUND PAPERS**8.1** Tay Estuary Rail Study, July 2005

Mike Galloway
Director of Planning & Transportation

AL/NG/EB

27 October 2006

Dundee City Council
Tayside House
Dundee

APPENDIX A

Structure and Content of Scotland RUS Consultation Draft Document

After setting out the purpose of the Scotland RUS and the geographical extent of the rail network covered, the document goes on to set out major rail projects that have already been committed, such as Waverly Station re-modelling/upgrade and those planned such as Edinburgh and Glasgow Airport rail links.

The document then goes on to explain that although the full network is considered for the baseline analysis, when considering future gaps and options the scope of the Scotland RUS is so substantial that certain pragmatic decisions had to be taken to reduce the length of rail network considered using the following criteria: criteria performance, utilisation, engineering, growth, traffic mix and passenger journeys. The result of this exercise relevant to Dundee is that the section Dundee to Perth/Dunblane was excluded from the future gap and option analysis. This is mainly due to this section of the rail network having plenty of spare capacity. The effect of this exclusion is considered in Dundee City Council's response.

The baseline analysis shows a number of interesting figures about how the network is performing and how it is currently utilised. Of particular relevance to Dundee is:

- Dundee Station is the 6th (equal) most used Station in Scotland with 1.3 million annual journeys (Glasgow Queen St & Central Stations are top with a combined 31million annual journeys).
- 3 of the 4 least used stations are in Angus and hence Dundee's travel to work area, namely Barry Links (26 Annual Journeys), Golf Street (30) and Balmossie (136)
- Dundee has the 4th most passenger arrivals at major urban centres with 4,800 daily arrivals on an average weekday (Glasgow is top with 106,500 daily arrivals).
- Considering passenger flows between urban centres 3 of the top 10 involve Dundee: Edinburgh – Dundee (4thequal, 250,000 Annual Passenger Journeys), Dundee – Perth (7thequal, 150,000 Journeys), Glasgow – Dundee (9th, 140,000 Journeys).
- Between 0 to 5 freight trains operate per day on the Dundee to Aberdeen, Dundee to Edinburgh and Dundee to Perth sections of the rail network.
- Dundee to Perth and Dundee to Aberdeen sections of the rail network utilise between 45-59% of the available line capacity (except between Usan and Montrose where this is identified as a baseline gap in the rail network).
- Dundee through Fife utilises between 30-59% of the available capacity (Although the Forth Rail Bridge is at between 80-100% capacity).
- Dundee to Glasgow utilises between 30-79% of the available spare capacity.

The document then goes on to describe planned renewal schemes including a looping facility at Montrose/Usan to address the capacity restraint identified as a baseline gap.

The document proceeds to describe potential enhancement schemes that are under discussion with various 3rd parties, this includes such schemes as Aberdeen CrossRail, Perth Station Interchange, but excludes Dundee West Station and local rail service proposed in the Tay Estuary Rail Study. The exclusion of these schemes is commented on in Dundee City Council's response.

Having set out the purpose, scope and baseline conditions the document goes on to forecast the change in demand for rail over the next 10 years using a Strategic Demand Model and an assumption of a general 3% growth per annum over this period. For the Dundee area

(covering Invergowrie to Arbroath) the predicted change in passenger journeys during the AM peak by 2016 is a 5% decrease in journeys originating in the Dundee area, but a 5% increase in journeys terminating in the area. This is different from the detailed analysis in Appendix E to the Scotland RUS draft document which shows a 3% decrease in originating journeys and 7% increase in terminating journeys. This is commented on in Dundee City Council's response.

A prediction of future freight movements is also given. However on the Dundee to Aberdeen, Dundee to Edinburgh and Dundee to Perth sections of the rail network the number of freight trains predicted to operate remains between 0 to 5 freight trains per day in 2014/15.

These predictions are used to identify gaps in the rail network that will require to be addressed to ensure the predicted increases can be accommodated in the future rail network.

Gaps and Solutions Most Relevant to Dundee City Council

A significant number of gaps are forecasted, including several line capacities such as the Glasgow/Falkirk/Edinburgh Corridor and station capacity/remodelling requirements, for example at Haymarket Station.

In addition to the need to increase capacity at Edinburgh Waverley and Glasgow Queen Street Stations, 2 gaps that are particularly relevant to Dundee have been identified – Dundee/Aberdeen service and capacity and Edinburgh/Fife/Aberdeen performance and capacity. These gaps can be described in more detail as follows:

- Dundee/Aberdeen – The short section of single line between Usan and Montrose limits capacity and can lead to poor performance and inconsistent headways. There is no consistent stopping pattern over the corridor to meet passenger demand and it delivers journey times that are uncompetitive with parallel roads.
- Edinburgh/Fife/Aberdeen – Journey times on this corridor are uncompetitive and performance is poor. Passenger demand to Edinburgh is predicted to grow and the current combination of infrastructure and train service will not meet this demand.

The proposed solutions for both these gaps are as follows:

Dundee/Aberdeen

- Timetable recast to provide consistent stopping patterns to intermediate stations and reduce overall journey times.
- Creation of a bi-directional loop facility at Montrose/Usan single line to improve reliability and provide opportunity for additional freight services.

Edinburgh/Fife/Aberdeen

- Timetable recast to provide consistent stopping patterns to intermediate stations and reduce overall journey times between Edinburgh and Aberdeen.
- Additional signalling to enhance line capacity and reduce headways between Haymarket and Inverkeithing.

Greater detail of the recast timetabling proposed as a solution to both these gaps is given below:

- Hourly Edinburgh/Aberdeen Fast Service calling at Haymarket, Leuchars, Dundee, Arbroath, Montrose and Stonehaven. This is supplemented by,
- Hourly Edinburgh/Dundee Semi-Fast Service calling at Haymarket, Inverkeithing, Kirkcaldy, Markinch, Ladybank, Springfield, Cupar and Leuchars.

Other relevant timetable descriptions proposed that are worthwhile noting are:

- Hourly Glasgow/Aberdeen Fast Service calling at Stirling, Perth, Dundee, Carnoustie, Arbroath, Montrose and Stonehaven.
- Existing Anglo-Scottish services on the Edinburgh/Glasgow to Dundee/Aberdeen corridors are to be retained unaltered.

A further gap that has been identified and is also relevant to Dundee is that of lightly used stations, given that 3 of the 4 most lightly used stations are in Angus and thus Dundee's travel to work catchment area. The solution proposes a review of all stations that generate less than 1,000 trips per year (23 stations throughout Scotland). For these stations it is proposed to review the renewals plan together with any relevant proposals for housing or other developments to ascertain the best future strategy for these stations.

APPENDIX B

Dundee City Council's Response to Scotland RUS

Although the Scotland RUS covers the whole of Scotland, Dundee City Council's response to this consultation document concentrates on 2 aspects

- Dundee's connectivity with the three major cities of Edinburgh, Aberdeen and Glasgow; and
- the use of the rail network on a more local regional basis in the area around Dundee

CONNECTIVITY TO EDINBURGH, ABERDEEN & GLASGOW

For some time now Dundee City Council, along with many other organisations including Network Rail, have expressed dissatisfaction with the fact that the current ScotRail intercity service is trying to provide both a fast intercity service and a local stopping service. As a result the service does neither of these well. This is particularly true on the Dundee to Edinburgh service.

With this in mind Dundee City Council welcome and fully support the provision of 2 separate services – the introduction of a fast intercity service between Aberdeen and Edinburgh supplemented by a semi fast stopping train between Dundee and Edinburgh to provide the local stopping service.

Dundee City Council is also in strong agreement with the fast service having only one stop in Fife as currently it is the number of stops in Fife that makes the end to end journey time between Dundee and Edinburgh slow and uncompetitive in comparison to the car. However, Dundee City Council has no preference to where this one stop in Fife is, as work from the Tay Estuary Rail Study (TERS), indicates that the semi-fast stopping service will fulfil passenger demand for Fife to Dundee travel.

Dundee City Council also note and support the proposal that there is to be a fast Glasgow to Aberdeen service and that the Anglo-Scottish services are to be retained unaltered. However, Dundee City Council is disappointed that the Glasgow to Aberdeen service is not supplemented by a semi-fast service to provide a local stopping service, similar to Edinburgh to Aberdeen service. This results in the one service trying to provide a fast intercity and a local stopping service and it is widely agreed that this should not occur.

Dundee City Council strongly urges that the fast Glasgow to Aberdeen service is supported by a local stopping service. This is considered in more detail in the following section of this response, headed local regional stopping service.

LOCAL REGIONAL STOPPING SERVICE

Dundee City Council is extremely disappointed at the lack of a Local Regional Stopping Service in the Dundee/Tay Area and would strongly urge that this omission is reconsidered. Dundee City Council believe there are a number of reasons why this has resulted and that the logic and process of the Scotland RUS is flawed in this regard.

The omission of the Dundee to Perth/Dunblane section of the network is based on the fact that on this section of the network currently there are few incidents of substantial delays.

The current utilisation of the track capacity is 40 -59% and the passenger demand is defined by a subjective anticipated growth of only 40-59% and annual passenger numbers are lower than 1,000,000. this is considered under 2 categories; efficient use of network and passenger demand.

Efficient Use of Network

The draft consultation of the Scotland RUS document makes it clear that the *“RUS seeks to optimise the use made of available route capacity as well as promote the development of further capacity”*. In addition it is stated that the RUS will *“propose options to achieve the most efficient and effective use of the existing rail network”*.

However, while the RUS is promoting the development of further capacity, it is not optimising use of available route capacity on the Dundee to Perth/Dunblane section of the network as from the analysis it is shown that there is between 41 and 61% practical spare capacity available on this section of the network. To not use this spare capacity is hardly optimising available capacity nor is it efficient and effective use of the existing rail network – 2 of the main aims of the Scotland RUS.

Passenger Demand

The RUS forecasting assumption that local forecasts and employment changes will not make much difference to the ten year forecast is questionable in the case of Dundee.

Work undertaken in preparation of the TACTRAN RTS shows that over the period 1998-2004 there has been a growth in the number of jobs in Dundee of over 4500 and this trend is expected to continue in the future. Over the same period there has been reduction in the population of Dundee. This results in there being a significantly greater amount of travel to work into the Dundee area, which a local rail service could assist.

There are also a couple of regionally significant major development proposal currently in progress that are aimed at further increasing the economic prosperity of Dundee and arresting the population decline. The Central Waterfront Development in the immediate vicinity of Dundee Rail Station will provide over 138,000 square metres of residential, leisure, commercial and retail development. The Western Gateway Development located at the Western boundary of Dundee and within the vicinity of the new Dundee West rail station TERS proposal will provide 750 large residential properties and over 50,000 square metres of business development.

The TERS has shown that there is likely to be a significant passenger demand for a local service and the provision of this service gives a positive benefit to cost ratio.

It is noted that a number of the least used stations identified are in the Dundee/Tay area. This is likely to be a result of a lack of service availability as opposed to a lack of demand.

In addition there appears to be an anomaly in the predicted changes in AM Peak passenger journeys by 2016 in the RUS. Figure 22 indicates a 5% decrease in journeys originating from the Dundee area and 5% increase in journeys terminating in the Dundee area, however, the corresponding figure (Fig 6) in Appendix E notes a 3% decrease in originating journeys and a 7% increase in terminating journeys. This gives a difference of 4% increase in overall journeys and this anomaly needs to be investigated.

Options for a Local Rail Service

The TERS identifies a demand for an hourly service between Arbroath and Perth stopping at Carnoustie, Monifieth, Broughty Ferry, Dundee and the new proposed Dundee West station.

At a meeting in June 2006 between Dundee City Council Officers (who are also on the TACTRAN Officers Management Team) and Transport Scotland, Network Rail and Scottish Executive to discuss the TERS proposal it was agreed that there was a need to reconsider the timetabling and the position and role of the Dundee West station and that the TERS proposal would be reset within the emerging TACTRAN RTS rather than linked to Local Transport Strategies that were six year old.

There are a number of ways that a local rail service with the same local stopping pattern as outlined above can be provided.

- As outlined above, local service between Arbroath and Perth as proposed in TERS.
- A local service between Arbroath and Dunblane to make the most efficient use of a section of the rail network that has significant practical spare capacity.
- A semi-fast service between Glasgow and Aberdeen to supplement the fast service proposed by the RUS, similar to the semi-fast service proposed between Edinburgh and Dundee.
- A semi-fast service between Glasgow and Arbroath to supplement the fast Glasgow to Aberdeen service proposed by the RUS, similar to the semi-fast service proposed between Edinburgh and Dundee. This recognises the capacity constraint caused by the single line between Usan and Montrose.

For all the above reasons Dundee City Council urge that a local stopping service in the Dundee/Tay area is considered as part of the Scotland RUS. In particular it would make obvious sense to undertake timetabling work for this alongside the other timetabling work being carried out as part of the RUS.