

REPORT TO: BEST VALUE SUB COMMITTEE – 11TH SEPTEMBER 2000

REPORT ON: ENVIRONMENTAL & CONSUMER PROTECTION DEPARTMENT
BEST VALUE REVIEW ON STREET CLEANSING

REPORT BY: CHIEF EXECUTIVE

REPORT NO: 586 - 2000

1. **PURPOSE OF REPORT:**

1.1 This report sets out the findings of the Best Value Review of the Environmental and Consumer Protection Department's Street Cleansing Service.

2. **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

2.1 It is recommended that the Sub Committee:

2.2 Agrees the outcome of the review as contained in this report.

2.3 Notes those areas identified for continuous improvement in Section 13 or this report.

3. **FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS:**

3.1 The review accounts for 19.42% of the Environmental and Consumer Protection Budget in Financial Year 1999/2000 and 79% of the total expenditure planned for review by the department this year.

4. **LOCAL AGENDA 21 IMPLICATIONS:**

4.1 The Environmental and Consumer Protection Department is committed to sustainable development and is the lead department responsible for the development of Dundee 21.

4.2 This review was undertaken from the perspective of Dundee 21 and is consistent with the key themes; in particular helping to ensure that health is protected by creating safe, clean, pleasant environments.

5. **EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES IMPLICATIONS:**

There are no equal opportunities implications contained within this report.

6. **DEFINITION OF SERVICE TO BE REVIEWED:**

6.1 Dundee City Council provides a high quality Street Cleansing Service for its citizens and visitors. The Director of the Environmental and Consumer Protection Department is responsible for the efficient and effective cleaning operation and in particular the provision of cleansing in terms of Part IV of the Environmental Protection Act, 1990.

The Act places a duty on the Crown, Local Authorities and designated statutory undertakers, and the owners of some other land to keep land to which the public has access clear of litter and refuse, as far as practicable. The Act requires under Section 89(7), The Secretary of State to issue a Code of Practice to which those under the duty are required to have regard. (Environmental Protection Act, 1990: Code of Practice on Litter and Refuse). The Service is therefore statutory in nature and one, which must be provided for by Dundee City Council.

6.2 The Street Cleansing Service delivery includes the undernoted activities:-

- The removal and disposal of litter, refuse, debris, leaves, vegetation, animal carcasses, dead birds and excrement from roads, pavements, pedestrian precincts, shopping areas, amenity areas and car parks etc within our remit.
- The removal and disposal of windblown litter gathered on walls, fences, hedges, shrubs etc. (public property only).
- The removal and disposal of litter from shrub-beds, tree and rose planted areas for a distance of one metre from the edge of the planted area perimeter.
- The mechanical sweeping of road channels throughout the city.
- The emptying of litter bins and dog faeces bins.

The service is complimented by the enforcement of dog fouling legislation by the department's animal control officers.

6.3 The Street Cleansing activity does not include the cleaning of car parks, industrial units, and parks managed by Planning and Transportation, Economic Development and Leisure and Parks departments or areas such as retail parks etc.

6.4 The Street Cleansing staffing levels including holiday and sick relief staff are as follows:-

. **Team Leader** **1**

.	Supervisors	6
.	Chargehands	2
.	Operatives	132

7. JUSTIFICATION FOR REVIEWING THIS SERVICE:

- 7.1 Street Cleansing forms part of the defined activities contained in the Local Government Act 1998 and as such was identified for review in 1999/2000 within the Council's Best Value submission.
- 7.2 In Financial Year 1990/91 Street Cleansing together with Domestic Refuse, Trade Refuse and Vehicle Maintenance was subject to Compulsory Competitive Tendering. A contract of five years duration from 1st April 1991 to 31st March 1996 was won by the then Dundee District Council's Cleansing D.S.O.
- 7.3 Prior to the completion of the contract, and due to Local Government reorganisation the Policy and Resources Committee of 13th May 1996 agreed an exemption period, whereby the in-house D.S.O. would continue to provide the service until 1st January 1998.
- 7.4 The Street Cleansing Service is presently being delivered by the D.S.O. under the Regulations, which have extended the C.C.T. moratorium until 1st July 1999 subject to the outcome of this Best Value review.

8. REVIEW METHODOLOGY:

- 8.1 The review team consisted of a Review Team Leader (from the Personnel and Management Services Department), a Lead Officer (Operations Manager), Cleansing Services Officer and Management Services Officer.
- 8.2 The review was carried out in parallel with the Best Value Review Process established in the Council's submission to the Secretary of State for Scotland.

9. CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTORS:

- 9.1 **Stakeholders**

- 9.1.1 Stakeholders identified were the City Council's Housing Division, Housing Associations other Council departments and all Householders within Dundee City Council.
- 9.1.2 Stakeholders were consulted by means of a questionnaire to establish their views and opinions relating to the Street Cleansing Services, covering performance, improvements and critical success factors.

9.2 **Critical Success Factors**

- 9.2.1 The key critical success factors identified by our Stakeholders can be defined as Cost, Reliability and Quality.
- 9.2.2. Cost can be defined as the annual cost of providing the Street Cleansing Service per head of population.
- 9.2.3 Reliability was clearly identified as a major success factor and can be defined as stakeholders having their home neighbourhood, local shopping area and city centre cleaned on a regular basis.
- 9.2.4. Quality can be sub-divided into two sections, litter removal and litter prevention.

Litter removal includes the timely removal of all litter, glass, debris, and dog faeces etc. whereby the City Centre, Shopping areas and each Local Neighbourhood are left in a clean, safe and pleasant surround.

Litter prevention includes measures to educate school children and the public on matters relating to litter and using appropriate legislation to ensure businesses comply with EPA 1990 and where appropriate the prosecution of people who drop litter or allow their dogs to foul footpaths etc.

10. **PERFORMANCE REVIEW:**

- 10.1 Performance was reviewed by financial appraisal and the use of a Customer Survey, which measured levels of satisfaction relating to the Street Cleansing Service.

10.2 **COST:**

10.2.1 The annual cost of providing the service per head of population is available from the Best Value Audit File contained within the E.C.P.D.

10.2.2 The service has been subject to competitive tendering since April 1991. Below is the Annual D.S.O. Revenue Account for all Street-cleansing activities covering the duration of the contract from April 1991 to March 1999.

Two factors have had a significant impact on the service during the contract period.

These factors can be defined as lower costs attributed to Local Government Reorganisation in terms of reduced streets and costs attributed to inflation.

Year Ending March	Income £	Expenditure £	Surplus £	Remarks
1992	1,943,080	1,845,732	97,348	
1993	2,262,338	2,133,406	128,932	
1994	2,390,038	2,270,445	119,593	
1995	2,392,738	2,443,816	(51,078)	
1996	2,460,566	2,331,235	129,331	
1997	2,559,562	2,473,895	85,667	
1998	2,565,780	2,496,920	68,860	
1999	2,579,231	2,492,088	87,143	

10.2.3 The Revenue Account indicates that in real terms excluding reorganisation and inflation, management has, through efficient use of resources made significant financial savings within the Street Cleansing Service.

10.3 **QUALITY & RELIABILITY:**

10.3.1 A customer satisfaction questionnaire was sent to a sample of 1000 householders within the City of Dundee. The satisfaction survey completed in June 1999, included households from each Council ward. The response, which was 28%, indicated the public's willingness to express their views and opinions pertaining to street cleaning.

10.3.2 The results of the survey indicated the following levels of customer satisfaction.

- **92% of householders were satisfied with our performance with regard to cleaning the City Centre.**
- **75% of households were satisfied with our performance with regard to cleaning local shopping areas.**
- **75% of households were satisfied with our performance with regard to cleaning other pavements and footpaths.**
- **83% of households were satisfied with our performance with regard to cleaning roadways and kerbsides.**
- **59% of households were satisfied with our performance with regard to cleaning grass areas outwith parks.**
- **44% of households were satisfied with our performance with regard to the removal of dog fouling from pavements and paths.**

- **89% of households were satisfied with our performance with regard to the emptying of litter bins.**
- **93% of households were satisfied with our performance with regard to the emptying of dog-waste bins.**
- **89% of households were satisfied with the attitude of our street cleaners.**
- **81% of households were satisfied overall with our street cleaning service.**

10.3.3 The questionnaire and results relating to the Customer Satisfaction Survey are detailed in Appendix 1 and 2 of this report

11.0 **Results of Comparison**

11.1 All Local Authorities in Scotland carryout their Street Cleansing services with their respective Direct Services Organisation. Since Local Government Reorganisation nine Councils identified in the Best Value Audit File have invited tenders for the Street Cleansing Services and have received no firm bids. The cost, time and effort involved in subjecting the service to a detailed competitive tendering process is not considered cost effective to the Council if there is a significant likelihood of a nil response.

11.2 An in depth Street Cleansing benchmarking exercise is being undertaken by Glasgow City Council between Councils throughout Scotland. On completion, each Council will be given a copy of the report with details of their findings.

11.3 There are no statutory performance indicators for Street Cleansing. However C.I.P.F.A. publish comparative costing data which is contained in Appendix 3. To compare performance among Councils it is important that comparisons are made on a like for like basis. Aberdeen, Dundee, Edinburgh and Glasgow having similar circumstances in terms of population density, property concentration and City Centre composition were placed in the same family group for Street Cleansing comparisons.

The analysis of the data indicated that Dundee City Councils costs per head of population for street cleansing had reduced from £20.18 to £18.86 respectively for years 1997/98 and 1998/99, a reduction of £1.32 per person.

Whilst Dundee (£18.86), Edinburgh (£19.39) and Glasgow (£19.99) had similar costs per head of population, all three were above the national average for Councils within Scotland (£13.50).

Aberdeen, the fourth member of the family group had an extremely low cost per head of population (£9.24) which was 50% lower than that of the other family group members and £4.26 per person lower than the national average.

Costs detailed in Appendix 3 may vary for a variety of reasons i.e.

- A variance between Councils on the quality standards set in the contract specification
- A variance in the size of zones described in the "Litter Code of Practice" which impact on the frequency of cleaning different areas.
- A variance in the physical geography of each authority.
- A variance in responsibility for cleaning similar areas.

12.0 **Option Appraisal**

12.1 The Best Value Review indicated in general the in-house DSO provides its stakeholders with a quality street cleansing service, sound operational management and in most aspects high customer satisfaction levels. However only 44% of householders were satisfied with our performance with regard to the removal of dog fouling. To improve this aspect of our service, a review of current procedures will be undertaken, and a programme of continuous improvement implemented.

12.2 C.I.P.F.A. cost data analysis indicated that Dundee City Councils Street Cleansing cost per head of population compared favourably with that of other family group members, Edinburgh and Glasgow. Gross street cleansing costs for 1998/99 had reduced by £210,000 whilst income had increased by £28,000 giving an overall net reduction in expenditure of £238,000 for the year. Management will strive to become more efficient and deliver a quality reliable and cost-effective street cleansing service to all their stakeholders.

12.3 At present barriers exist to respond speedily to problems such as fly tipping, litter and dog faeces removal, graffiti and the removal of weeds. Such barriers, which exist within, and outwith the Council can be identified as:-

- Provision of existing C.C.T. contracts
- Departmental demarcation blurring responsibility
- Pressure on restricted budgets
- Disputes regarding ownership of land.

To overcome these barriers and to meet public expectation E.C.P.D. Management will investigate the options of:-

- i. A single department being responsible for the cleaning of all public land, parks, streets etc, and
- ii. The formation of a "Hit Squad" to respond timeously within a defined timescale to any problems from all areas of land the public have access to.

12.4 Information obtained from other authorities indicated that an expensive tendering exercise might result in a nil response. Given the aforementioned information the 'Best Value' option is for the Environmental and Consumer Protection department to continue to deliver the service and implement the programme of continuous improvement contained in Section 13 of this report.

13.0 **CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT:**

13.1 The Director, in considering the requirements of Best Value, recognises the need to review the Department's service delivery in terms of quality, efficiency, and effectiveness. Continuous improvement is a key element of Best Value and through self-assessment and consultation with stakeholders, the undernoted systems have been identified for a programme of review and improvement.

13.2 **MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE:**

The existing management structure, which was established in response to C.C.T., has been reorganised to achieve and maintain Best Value. The new structure is more efficient and cost effective, and divides the street cleaning and refuse collection operations. Frontline supervisors are more accountable with improved monitoring and supervision of the services.

The partial integration of Client and DSO functions has allowed the number of supervisors to be increased without any additional costs to the services. Increased supervision allows supervisors more time to communicate instructions and objectives, plan and control labour, inspect output and quality, focus on individuals strengths and weaknesses, coach and counsel staff, all to the success of the team and the departments objectives.

Following consultation with Dundee City Councils Internal Audit Department, the new structure was agreed and implemented.

13.3 **COST AND RELIABILITY:**

Effective route planning and staff motivation are two key elements of service management. The efficient and optimum use of labour, vehicles and equipment are of paramount importance in street cleaning as 69% of costs are attributed to those resources.

Street cleansing routes require to be fundamentally reviewed on a systematic basis. A management services review is currently being undertaken to this effect and will be completed by April 2001. The review is examining current levels of bonus, working practices, route size, route configuration, future areas identified for demolitions, proposed new housing developments and demographic changes to areas resulting in changes to pedestrian movements. Employee consultation is a key factor in the success of the exercise and all employees associated with the study have been consulted on the project.

A key theme of the exercise will be an emphasis on moving from the traditional barrow and brush operation and introducing further team sweeping and mobile routes allowing operatives to cover larger areas and respond to problems timeously. The introduction of these routes will have an impact on the street cleaning staffing levels with anticipated savings of £90,000 per year. The anticipated savings will be reinvested to procure more vehicles such as mechanical sweepers, which will be used to enhance the quality of the street cleansing service.

Performance incentive payment schemes are a means by which management can motivate employees to improve productivity. To achieve the Council's street-cleansing objectives all drivers, chargehands and operatives engaged within the street cleansing service are paid an incentive bonus. The average paid to each operative equates to 33% of basic pay and is based on a scheduled workload. The payment is consistent with other Councils who pay between 25% and 50% of basic pay. Current route details and bonus payments for each team are available from the Management Services office within the E.C.P.D. The present incentive payment scheme is continuously monitored, regularly reviewed and consistent with Audit Commission guidelines and will be subject to further review as part of the implementation of the single status agreement.

13.4 **QUALITY:**

Quality was identified as a critical success factor and a number of service levels highlighted as a concern by the department's customers. To improve quality the undernoted initiatives will be introduced into the department before April 2001.

a) Quality Control System:

The customer satisfaction survey indicated that 81% of households were satisfied overall with the quality of our street cleansing service. An internal quality control system which is random generated by computer was introduced in July 1999 with the aim of improving customer satisfaction by 5% in year one which is April 2001, 2% in years 2 to 5 and 1% in each subsequent year until 100% satisfaction level has been achieved.

b) Dog Fouling:

The customer satisfaction survey indicated that 44% of households were satisfied with our performance relating to the removal of dog faeces from pavements and paths. A number of initiatives have been introduced including the erection of 700 + dog waste bins in the past four years and distribution of free dog waste bags which have risen from 25,000 in 1993 to the present figure of 1,000,000 in the past financial year.

The animal control service successfully introduced a spaying campaign reducing the number of stray dogs and constantly monitor areas with a view to report dog owners for court proceedings who allow their dogs to foul pavements and footpaths. To date, over 100 offenders have been reported resulting in fines ranging from £35.00 to £75.00.

To further improve the prevention/removal of dog faeces and improve customer satisfaction by 5% per year, the following will be introduced by April 2001.

- Purchase of a KB2 Litter Master to mechanically uplift dog faeces from problem areas.
- Further research the market for the procurement of suitable equipment, which can be used efficiently and effectively by street cleaning operatives for uplifting dog faeces.

- Purchase and erection of more dog waste bins which will increase the total from 736 to 880.
- Increase the distribution of dog-waste bags.
- Respond to complaints against offenders who allow their dogs to foul pavements and footpaths within 48 hours of the complaint being recorded.
- Visit schools and community groups to discuss the problems, risks and public concern associated with dog fouling and encourage the use of dog waste bags and bins, which will ultimately alleviate the dog-fouling problem.

13.5 **LITTER BINS:**

A survey relating to the type, location and number of litterbins throughout the city will be conducted prior to April 2001 and a strategy planned to maximise the use of litterbins and alleviate potential litter problems will be developed.

13.6 **COMMUNITY INVOLVEMENT**

A public information campaign to encourage the public to use litterbins or take litter home (to prevent litter occurring in the first place) will be undertaken by April 2001. The department will explore the use of Council Libraries, newsletters, web sites, posters and leaflets to every house to promote this strategy.

13.7 **CODE OF PRACTICE ON LITTER & REFUSE:**

The objectives of the code is to provide guidance of the duties under Section 89 of the Act by establishing reasonable and generally accepted standards of cleanliness in zones throughout the City, which those under the duty should be capable of meeting.

At present various Council departments and other bodies have the responsibility for the removal of litter and dog excrement from areas managed by them. This can lead to difficulties in public perception when areas not maintained by E.C.P.D. are not cleaned to accepted standards resulting in dissatisfaction or complaints directed at E.C.P.D.

The E.C.P.D. will initiate an appropriate review with a view to the unification of standards throughout the City and developing a corporate approach to the cleaning of areas managed by Dundee City Council.

13.8 **PEOPLE AND PLACES:**

People and places is a proven management tool, which aims at achieving a quality local environment. First introduced in 1989 by Tidy Britain Group, People and Places has been successful in over 120 applications within Local Government, transportation services and private sector housing management.

People and places provide a long-term systematic and sustainable programme to improve the quality of local environments. The programme was devised by Tidy Britain Group to assist authorities in meeting the standards of environmental legislation and existing codes of practice.

People and places combines a detailed appraisal of local problems with a range of modules designed to create lasting solutions. The modular format enables People and Places to be tailored to meet the specific needs of individual programmes and clients need to purchase only the module units, which are pertinent to their requirements.

E.C.P.D. Management shall, prior to April 2001, complete a feasibility study pertaining to the opportunities, benefits and costs associated with a Peoples and Place programme.

13.9 **LEGISLATIVE POWERS:**

There are a number of powers in environmental protection, planning and public health legislation which enables Councils to require owners to tidy sites and for Councils to take steps to clear rubbish. Similarly Councils can place a duty on the occupier of certain categories of land to ensure that this land is kept clear of litter and refuse so far as practicable. This can be achieved by the introduction of a Litter Control Regulation order. Councils may also issue to occupiers of certain types of commercial or rented premises, a street Litter Control Notice with a view to preventing the accumulation of litter and refuse around any street or open land adjacent to those premises.

It is the intention of E.C.P.D. Management to pursue the use of the above legislative measures to reduce the incidence of litter.

13.10 **ABSENCE:**

Absence currently at 9% is a management concern. High absenteeism levels reduce productivity, increase unit costs and create problems for management in the day to day operation of the service. An exercise relating to absence policies and procedures will be completed prior to April 2001. The purpose of the exercise will be to develop and implement a system which aims to reduce the current level of absence to below the Local Government average of 4% by April 2002.

At present management have to include in their budgets the cost of additional staff to allow for the current levels of absenteeism. On occasions when absenteeism levels exceed that allowed for, certain street cleansing routes are not covered.

A reduction in absenteeism would not only reduce costs through reduced staffing levels but also increase reliability and quality through street cleansing routes being covered.

13.11 **TRAINING:**

The Environmental and Consumer Protection Department has its own Training Officer who produces an Annual Training Plan for the entire Department. The basis of the plan is to programme training for staff, which ultimately will create an efficient, innovative and skilled workforce to enhance current performance and ensure continual improvement. Future plans will include "training gaps" identified in the customer satisfaction survey.

Training gaps identified in the customer satisfaction survey included the following:-

- Customer care training to improve attitude of street sweepers towards members of the public.
- Barrow and brush refresher training to improve street cleansing quality and in particular removal of dog fouling.
- Training for Team Leaders in Municipal Waste Management and in particular the enforcement of Waste Management policies, which may alleviate dog fouling and litter problems.
- Training for supervisors in leadership skills whereby the Department's objectives will be achieved.

The departments training and development plan includes an evaluation procedure whereby delegates are evaluated on a short term and long term post training basis. Effectiveness is measured from the achievement of key objectives within the service delivery and corporate plans.

The department is in the initial stage of making a commitment to the Investors In People (I.I.P.) Project. Meetings have been held with Scottish Enterprise Trust and departmental induction and evaluation procedures have been reviewed as a result. In addition, a staff development review process for APT & C staff has been designed and will be extended to encompass manual staff by April 2001.

13.12 **HEALTH AND SAFETY:**

To maximize health and safety at work, all existing street cleansing activities are subject to ongoing risk assessments and safe systems of work are being established for each activity.

All street-cleansing employees will be briefed on the risks and training will be carried out on revised methods by July 2000.

14. **CONSULTATION:**

14.1 The Director's of E.C.P.D., Finance, and Corporate Planning have been consulted in the preparation of this report.

14.2 1,000 householders from a cross section of the 29 Electoral Wards within Dundee have been consulted during the preparation of this report.

15. **BACKGROUND PAPERS:**

15.1 Best Value SODD Circular 12/98

15.2 Best Value Submission to the Secretary of State for Scotland – December 1997

15.3 Policy and Resources Committee – 11th December 1997

15.4 Dundee District Council Annual Reports and Accounts 1992 to 1996

15.5 Dundee City Council Annual Reports and Accounts 1997 to 1999

Chief Executive **Date**

APPENDICES:

1. **Questionnaire to Householders**
2. **Questionnaire Results**
3. **Table of Comparisons**

Appendix 1.

The Occupier.

If calling please ask for

Reception Tel 432777

Our Ref EO/IB 1205.00

Your Ref

Date 24th June, 1999

Dear Sir/Madam,

Environmental and Consumer Protection Department
Street Cleansing - Survey

Dundee City Council is comitted to providing the quality of services our Citizens need and want. With this in mind, the Council is currently reviewing its services to find out if we are achieving value for money.

The Environmental and Consumer Protection Department is carrying out a review of the Street Cleansing Service and, as a customer, you have been specifically selected to assist us.

Your views and opinions on the service provided will be beneficial in helping us to improve, and continue to provide, a quality service to the Citizens of Dundee.

Once you have completed the Questionnaire, would you please return it in the Prepaid Envelope before Monday the 19th July 1999.

We would like to thank you for your time and effort in completing this Questionnaire and can assure you that any information you provide will be treated in the strictest confidence.

Your assistance is greatly appreciated.

Yours faithfully,

Head of Operations

Enc.

QUESTIONNAIRE

SECTION ONE: PERSONAL PROFILE

A few questions about yourself:-

Q1 NAME

.....

ADDRESS

.....

.....

POST CODE TELEPHONE NO.

Q2 Do you use? (please tick appropriate box)

Side Roads/Pavements Main Roads/Pavements

Local Shopping Areas City Centre

SECTION TWO: HOW DO YOU THINK WE ARE DOING?

Q3 Please tell us how satisfied you are with our performance with regard to each of the following:-

	Very Satisfied	Satisfied	Dissatisfied	Very Dissatisfied
Cleaning of city centre	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Cleaning of local shopping areas	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Cleaning other pavements and footpaths	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Cleaning of roadways and kerbsides	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Cleaning of grass areas outwith parks	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Removal of dog fouling from pavements and footpaths	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>

Emptying of litter bins	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Emptying of dog waste bins	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Attitude of street cleaners	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>

Q4 Overall, how satisfied are you with the street cleaning service provided by the Department?

Very Satisfied

Satisfied

Dissatisfied

Very Dissatisfied

SECTION THREE: WHAT IS IMPORTANT TO YOU?

Q5 Please list what you consider important to you in the cleaning of streets and footways:-

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

Q6 How do you think the Department could improve its street cleaning service?

.....

.....

.....

Once again, we thank you for participating in this survey and assure you that the information you have provided will be of great assistance to us in maintaining a professional and courteous service to our Citizens.

Now that you have completed the questionnaire, could you please return it, in the prepaid envelope (no stamp required), as soon as possible.

Dundee City Council

ECPD - Best Value Questionnaire Results - Street Sweeping - June 1999

Did not Very
Answer Satisfied

Q3 - How satisfied are you with our performance with regard to:

Cleaning of city centre

Cleaning of local shopping areas

Cleaning other pavements & footpaths

Cleaning of roadways & kerbsides

Cleaning of grass areas outwith parks

Removal of dog fouling from pavements and paths

Emptying of litter bins

Emptying of dog waste bins

Attitude of street cleaners

Q4 - Overall satisfaction with the ECPD street cleaning service:

E.C.P.D
STREET CLEANING
BEST VALUE REVIEW
CUSTOMER SURVEY JUNE 1999

QUESTION 5 WHAT IS IMPORTANT TO YOU IN THE CLEANSING OF STREETS, PAVEMENTS ETC.

CODE DESCRIPTION OF ANSWER

- 1 CLEANING OF DOG FOULING PROMPTLY
- 10 REMOVAL OF LITTER, GLASS, FOOD CONTAINERS ETC. PROMPTLY
- 11 REGULAR CLEANING OF HEAVY POPULATED AND FREQUENTED AREAS
- 3 PROSECUTE OFFENDERS WHO ALLOW THEIR DOGS TO FOUL FOOTPATHS ETC.
- 14 MORE SWEEPING OF PAVEMENTS USING BRUSH AS OPPOSED TO USING LITTER STICK
- 12 CONTINUE SERVICE TO SAME PRESENT STANDARDS
- 13 CLEANING STANDARDS THE SAME FOR EACH AREA
- 9 SNOW CLEARING ON A DAILY BASIS
- 5 CLEANING LOCAL SHOPPING AREAS PROMPTLY
- 7 REMOVAL OF WEEDS FROM PAVEMENT ETC.
- 6 EMPTY LITTER BINS PROMPTLY
- 22 REMOVAL OF CHEWING GUM FROM PAVEMENTS
- 4 CLEANING CITY CENTRE PROMPTLY
- 15 FRIENDLY AND GOOD OPERATIVES
- 8 REMOVAL OF LITTER FROM SHRUB BEDS
- 21 KEEP DRAINS CLEAR OF LITTER
- 23 CLEANING OF GRASS AREAS
- 26 REMOVAL OF LEAVES FROM PAVEMENTS
- 2 EMPTY DOG WASTE BINS
- 17 REMOVAL OF BIRD DROPPINGS FROM TOWN CENTRE
- 18 CLEAN BUS SHELTERS AND SUBWAYS
- 19 REMOVAL OF DEAD ANIMALS FROM ROAD PROMPTLY
- 24 REMOVAL OF GRAFFITI
- 16 MORE SUPERVISION OF STREET CLEANERS
- 20 CLEAN BACK AREA OF LOCAL SHOPS
- 25 REMOVAL OF FLY POSTING

TOTAL NUMBER OF COMMENTS

E.C.P.D

STREET CLEANING

BEST VALUE REVIEW

CUSTOMER SURVEY JUNE 1999

QUESTION 6 - HOW DO YOU THINK THE DEPARTMENT COULD IMPROVE ITS STREET CLEANING SERVICE

CODE DESCRIPTION OF ANSWER

- 1 HAVE MORE RIGOROUS POLICY TO CATCH OFFENDERS WHO ALLOW DOGS TO FOUL FOOTPATHS ETC.
- 2 MORE LITTER BINS IN LOCAL SHOPPING AREAS, SCHOOLS
- 3 EDUCATE SCHOOL CHILDREN AND PUBLIC REGARDING
- 4 MORE DOG BINS
- 5 TRADERS DISPLAY NOTICES REGARDING DISPOSAL OF FOOD CARRY CONTAINERS
- 6 PUBLICITY CAMPAIGN TO EDUCATE PUBLIC ON LITTER & DOG FOULING

- 7 PROSECUTE OFFENDERS WHO DROP LITTER
- 8 MORE LITTER BINS IN LOCAL AREAS
- 9 CLEANING OF WASTE LAND
- 10 CLEANING OF BACK AREAS
- 11 TRADERS SEAL FOOD CONTAINRS ETC.
- 12 IDENTIFY AND TARGET PROBLEM AREAS
- 13 IMPLEMENT THE ANTI LITTER LITTER LAWS
- 14 SUPPLY MORE GREEN BINS
- 15 MONITOR VANDALISM
- 16 SUPPLY MORE PARK RANGERS
- 17 MONITOR STREET CLEANING MORE OFTEN
- 18 CONTINUE SERVICE TO SAME STANDARD
- 19 TRADERS RESPONSIBLE FOR CLEANING OWN FRONTAGE
- 20 EMPLOY MORE STAFF WITH BARROWS AND BRUSHES
- 21 SPRAY WEEDS ON REGULAR BASIS
- 22 MILLINIUM ENVIRONMENTAL PROJECT TO KEEP LITTER FREE CITY
- 23 INCREASE FREQUENCY OF CLEANING
- 24 MAKE STAFF AWARE THAT THEY ARE A VALUABLE PART OF COMM.
- 25 HAVE STREET CLEANERS START EARLIER OR EVENING TO AVOID HEAVY TRAFFIC
- 26 CLEAN GRASS AREAS ON A MORE REGULAR BASIS
- 27 INCREASE FREQUENCY OF LITTER BIN EMPTYING
- 28 POWER WASH PAVEMENTS
- 29 SUPPLY STREET CLEANERS WITH DOG BAGS TO GIVE TO PUBLIC
- 30 CLEANING OF DEBRIS AFTER CAR CRASH ETC.
- 31 INSPECT OTHER CITIES AND COUNTRIES ON CLEANING METHODS
- 32 INTRODUCE A NO TOLERANCE LITTER POLICY
- 33 SEASONAL PRESS APPEALS TO KEEP PUBLIC AREAS CLEAN
- 34 CHANGE STREET CLEANERS TYPE OF UNIFORM TO T SHIRTS SWEAT SHIRTS ETC.
- 35 PUT ORNAMENTAL BINS IN SELECTIVE AREAS
- 36 IMPROVE ATTITUDE OF STREET CLEANERS
- 37 NOTICES ENCOURAGING THE USE OF LITTER BINS DOG BINS ETC.
- 38 BETTER OPERATION FOR THE REMOVAL OF DOG FOULING
- 39 DESIGNATE AREAS AS NO DOG FOULING AREAS
- 40 SUPPLY LARGE WHEELIE BINS TO TAKE AWAY FOOD SHOPS FOR THRER REFUSE
- 41 INTRODUCE QUALITY BONUS TO ENCOURAGE HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS
- 42 ENSURE LITTER BINS ARE KEPT IN BIN SPACE
- 43 A HOOVER TYPE MACHINE TO UPLIFT DOG FOULING ANFD LITTER
- 44 SATURDAY AND SUNDAY MORNING STREET CLEANING

TOTAL NUMBER OF COMMENTS

E.C.P.D

STREET CLEANING

BEST VALUE REVIEW

CUSTOMER SURVEY JUNE 1999

MISCELLANEOUS COMMENTS

CODE DESCRIPTION OF ANSWER

- 3 LENNOX GARDENS NOT CLEANED ON A REGULAR BASIS
- 13 / 65 STOP SPECIAL COLLECTION CHARGE
- 14 STOP YOUTHS PLAYING FOOTBALL LATE AT NIGHT AT DRYBURGH SHOPS
- 19 GENERAL POOR CONDITION OF BUTTARS LOAN SHOPPING AREA IN PARTICULAR OVERGROWN
- 27 RETURN TO CONVENTIONAL REFUSE COLLECTION SERVICE
- 38/27/29 UPLIFTING OF GRASS CUT BY PARKS DEPARTMENT
- 29 CLEANING OF DOG FOULING IN LOCAL PARKS
- 5/28/36/41 REPAIR BROKEN OR UNEVEN FLAGSTONES
REDUCE THE PIGEON POPULATION
- 4/49/52 THE CLEANING OF GUTTERS AND DRAINS TO ALLOW RAIN WATER TO DRAIN
- 58 PREVENTATIVE MEASURES TO SLOW TRAFFIC IN STATHMORE STREET
- 62 REPLACE REFUSE BLACK BAGS WITH GREY WHEELED BINS TO PREVENT LITTER STREWN BY D
- 67 MORE FREQUENT CUTTING OF GRASS ON KINGSWAY
- 67/75 IMPROVE CONDITION OF LANDSCAPED PERIMETER BORDERS
- 79/218/265 TAKE ACTION AGAINST OVERHANGING BRANCHES ETC.
- 94 TAKE ACTION AGAINST GENERAL POOR STATE OF PHONE BOXES
- 116 TAKE ACTION OVER OVERGROWN SHRUBS ETC. WHICH HARBOUR LITTER
- 64/124 TAKE ACTION AGAINST THE POOR STATE OF BUS SHELTERS IN TERMS OF CLEANLINESS
- 126 TAKE ACTION TO REMOVE STORED GREY REFUSE BINS FROM FRONT TO REAR OF HOUSES
- 138 TAKE ACTION AGAINST HOUSEHOLDERS WHO DISPOSE HOUSEHOLD REFUSE WITHIN CASTLE I
- 146 ENSURE FLAT FOOTWAY SURFACES WITHIN CITY TO SAFEGUARD USERS AND FOOTWARE
- 148 ALL COUNCIL / DEPARTMENTAL PERSONNEL OBSERVE AND REPORT ON A REGULAR BASIS ST
- 149/137 REGULAR CLEANING OF BROUGHTY FERRY BEACH
- 166 ENSURE WHEELED REFUSE BINS ARE KEPT IN GOOD CONDITION BY MAKING PEOPLE PAY FOR
- 175 APPORTION FINANCE TO OTHER ACTIVITIES AS OPPOSED TO QUESTIONNAIRES AND SURVEYS
- 183 TAKE ACTION AND DISCOURAGE PEOPLE FROM CYCLING ON PAVEMENTS
- 188 REMOVE SKIPS WHEN FULL
- 164/191 KEEP GRASS CUT AND TIDY BIN RECESSES AFTER REFUSE COLLECTION
- 201 LIAISE WITH PARKS DEPARTMENT REGARDING GRASS CUTTING AND CLEANING
- 203 REPLACE REFUSE COLLECTION BINS MORE QUICKLY WHEN DAMAGED BY VEHICLE
- 210 PROTECT THE ENVIRONMENT BY NOT CUTTING BACK ON WASTE PAPER COLLECTION FREQU
- 217 KEEP HOUSEHOLDERS HEDGES RAILINGS ETC. FREE FROM LITTER
- 226 TAR AREA OUTSIDE 137 FINTRY ROAD
- 204/233 TAKE OVER UNADOPTED PAVEMENTS AND FOOTWAYS AND KEEP IN GOOD CONDITION
- 251 MORE RIGOROUS MONITOR OF VANDALISM , AND CONDITION OF FLAGSTONES,ETC.
- 265 KEEP GRASS VERGES TIDY
- 279 BETTER CONDITION OF PARK AREAS

E.C.P.D.

1997/98

STREET CLEANSING

CIPFA ANALYSIS

	<u>GROSS</u>	<u>INCOME</u>	<u>NET</u>	<u>PER</u>
	<u>EXPEND.</u>		<u>EXPEND.</u>	<u>HEAD</u>
<u>ALL SCOTTISH COUNCILS</u>	£,000	£,000	£,000	<u>OF POP</u>
				£0
ABERDEEN CITY	1807	10	1797	8.32
ABERDEENSHIRE	1671	63	1608	7.1
ANGUS	1259	463	796	7.22
ARGYLL & BUTE	999	31	968	10.69
CITY OF EDINBURGH	9209	426	8783	19.52

CLACKMANNANSHIRE	572	16	556	11.39
DUNFRIES & GALLOWAY	1249	28	1221	8.29
DUNDEE CITY	3334	329	3005	20.18
EAST AYRSHIRE	1379	20	1359	11.15
EAST DUNBARTONSHIRE	1139	2	1137	10.26
EAST LoTHIAN	800	1	799	8.98
EAST RENFREWSHIRE	632	0	632	7.13
EILEAN SIAR	290	6	284	10.06
FALKIRK	1524	78	1446	10.1
FIFE	4448	133	4315	12.39
GLASGOW CITY	12969	214	12755	20.85
HIGHLAND	2226	26	2200	10.55
INVERCLYDE	1195	4	1191	13.77
MIDLoTHIAN	782	0	782	9.69
MORAY	695	19	676	7.86
NORTH AYRSHIRE	2597	536	2061	14.74
NORTH LANARKSHIRE	4640	754	3886	11.9
ORKNEY ISLES	410	0	410	20.67
PERTH & KINROSS	1815	1	1814	13.61
RENFREWSHIRE	2313	37	2276	12.77
SCOTTISH BORDERS	1002	2	1000	9.42
SHETLAND ISLES	313	17	296	12.86
SOUTH AYRSHIRE	2104	0	2104	18.32
SOUTH LANARKSHIRE	1344	598	746	2.43
STIRLING	1703	350	1353	16.19
WEST DUNBARTONSHIRE	1034	62	972	10.16
WEST LoTHIAN	1399	13	1386	9.1

<u>SCOTLAND TOTALS</u>	68853	4239	64614	12.61
-------------------------------	--------------	-------------	--------------	--------------

FAMILY GROUP

ABERDEEN CITY	1807	10	1797	8.32
CITY OF EDINBURGH	9209	426	8783	19.52
DUNDEE CITY	3334	329	3005	20.18
GLASGOW CITY	12969	214	12755	20.85