

REPORT TO: PLANNING AND TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE –
25 AUGUST 2003

REPORT ON: STATUTORY UNDERTAKERS PERFORMANCE IN DUNDEE 2002/2003

REPORT BY: DIRECTOR OF PLANNING AND TRANSPORTATION

REPORT NO: 509-2003

1 PURPOSE OF REPORT

1.1 The purpose of this report is to:

- a Provide an annual report on the performance of Statutory Undertakers operating in Dundee in 2002/2003 based on inspections of their road works as required under the New Roads and Street works Act 1991 (NRSWA).
- b Update the Committee on the results of the latest local and national coring programmes of Statutory Undertakers reinstatements.

2 RECOMMENDATIONS

2.1 It is recommended that the Committee note the continued poor performance of Statutory Undertakers in Dundee, based on visual inspection regime, local coring and national coring for last year.

3 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

3.1 There are no financial implications because Statutory Undertakers are charged the prescribed national fee of £15.50 for each sample inspection (£20.00 proposed from 1 October 2003) up to the prescribed level of 6% of an estimated agreed workload at five different stages of their works. For failed cores Statutory Undertakers are also charged for up to three further inspections at £31.00 each spread over a new two-year guarantee period. For coring purposes, Statutory Undertakers are charged only for the cost of failed cores plus a standard fee of £31.00 for staff and administration costs. Statutory Undertakers are responsible for carrying out their own reinstatements and remedial works.

4 LOCAL AGENDA 21 IMPLICATIONS

4.1 The quality of Statutory Undertakers reinstatements on roads and footways will influence the riding and walking quality of the public road network which can have a significant effect on or benefit to all road users.

5 EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES IMPLICATIONS

5.1 The quality of the footway network in the city is a vital component to a barrier free environment for the mobility impaired.

6 BACKGROUND

6.1 There are three forms of inspection viz:

- visual (from observations made on part/completed work)
- Local Coring Programme (a physical slice “core” is taken through the reinstatement and the “core” can then be measured and analysed)
- National Coring Programme (a compilation of an average figure taken from all Roads Authorities in Scotland for their coring programmes).

From the three separate methods engineering staff determine what they think is happening from the visual inspections, what is happening locally from the Local Coring Programme and can then determine if there is a problem at a local or national level with work practices from the National Coring Programme.

- 6.2 Full details and tables are displayed in the appendices however in summary the findings are as follows.

7 STATUTORY UNDERTAKERS PERFORMANCE BASED ON VISUAL INSPECTION REGIME (SEE APPENDICES 1 AND 2 FOR DETAIL)

- 7.1 Although the minimum required standard of performance of 90%, based on the random sample inspection regime, was achieved by all Statutory Undertakers, it has been found that this regime alone does not accurately reflect the quality of reinstatements. Some of the reasons for this are that the sample inspections are visual, the majority of works are not witnessed by the Roads Authority due to the sample size being limited, the movement of Undertakers' contractors and that they are on site for relatively short periods.

- 7.2 It is therefore only after coring the bituminous materials that the depth of layers, degree of compaction and type of materials used can be accurately measured against the specification. Dundee City Council has therefore continued to have their own annual local coring programmes and is continuing to participate in the biannual national coring programmes detailed below. However, it should be noted that coring does not reveal what is below bituminous material.

8 STATUTORY UNDERTAKERS PERFORMANCE BASED ON LOCAL CORING PROGRAMME (SEE APPENDIX 3 FOR DETAIL)

- 8.1 The average pass rate last year for all Undertakers was 44% and shows no apparent improvement compared with the previous year's local coring results. However, on compaction and tolerance of bituminous layer thickness, Undertakers have improved by 32% compared to previous year. In contrast, a new problem was discovered last summer as Undertakers' contractors were using footway asphalt in carriageways, in contravention of the specification and without the knowledge of Undertakers or the local Roads Authority. The wrong material accounted for 36% of all local core failures last year, ie the pass rate would have been 80% if footway asphalt was not used in carriageways. On discovery of this problem, Undertakers instructed their contractors to stop this practice from November 2002 but unfortunately some contractors continued this practice until March 2003 when the last local cores were taken. For this reason the size of the local coring programme will be increased this year and for some Undertakers all their works reinstated since November 2002 may be cored and any wrong materials will be replaced at the Undertakers' cost until this practice stops. If this problem is eradicated, Undertakers expect to approach the 90% minimum required standard of performance on coring.

9 STATUTORY UNDERTAKERS PERFORMANCE BASED ON NATIONAL (SCOTTISH) CORING PROGRAMME (SEE APPENDICES 4, 5 AND 6)

- 9.1 The overall Dundee result of 32% is below the national average of 45% and far from satisfactory. However, as in local coring mentioned above, there are improvements (26% compared to previous programme) on compaction and bituminous layer thickness in Dundee but there is the new problem of footway asphalt used in carriageways. It should therefore be noted that the pass rate would have been 60% if footway asphalt was not used in carriageways. This, however, is still seen as a poor performance.
- 9.2 The overall national result of 45% (56% if footway asphalt was not used in carriageways) shows a small overall improvement in comparison with the last programme but is still very disappointing and even though the utility companies have introduced various measures these have not filtered through for the desired improvement in performance. Another high level improvement plan is being drawn up by the utilities to be agreed with the Scottish local Roads Authorities at the next RAUC(S) meeting in September 2003.
- 9.3 Because of these disappointing results it has been agreed that the national programme will continue and the next one will start after April 2003, coring samples of permanent works reinstated between 1 October 2003 and 31 March 2004.

10 PROGRESS OF STATUTORY UNDERTAKERS SINCE THE ISSUE OF IMPROVEMENT NOTICES

- 10.1 Since the issue of Improvement Notices by Dundee City Council on 25 June 2001, progress meetings have been held every 3 to 6 months, individually with British Telecom, Scottish & Southern Energy, Scottish Water, Telewest and Transco to discuss progress of their action plans and to monitor their implementation. All these Statutory Undertakers did introduce, to various degrees, improved quality assurance systems followed by their own monitoring. However, this is taking longer than expected and it is also very difficult for the Roads Authority to persuade Statutory Undertakers to increase their level of direct supervision of their contractors which it is felt would significantly increase the quality of workmanship. It is intended to continue with regular progress meetings with each utility company for the foreseeable future and to monitor their performance by continuing both the local and national coring programmes.

11 CONSULTATIONS

- 11.1 The Chief Executive, Depute Chief Executive (Support Services), Depute Chief Executive (Finance), and Assistant Chief Executive (Community Planning) have been consulted and are in agreement with the contents of this report.

12 BACKGROUND PAPERS

- 12.1 Report No 310/2000 – Statutory Undertakers Performance in Dundee 1999/2000 was presented to Planning and Transportation Committee on 22 May 2000.
- 12.2 Report No 338/2001 – Statutory Undertakers Performance in Dundee 2000/2001 was presented to Planning and Transportation Committee on 25 June 2001.
- 12.3 Report No 319/2002 – Statutory Undertakers Performance in Dundee 2001/2002 was presented to Planning and Transportation Committee on 27 May 2002.

Mike Galloway
Director of Planning & Transportation

Iain Sherriff
Head of Transportation

IFS/AL/FV/KM

4 August 2003

Dundee City Council
Tayside House
Dundee

Appendix 1 shows the results of random sample inspections of each Statutory Undertaker in Dundee, together with annual figures from previous years for comparison.

APPENDIX 1

SAMPLE INSPECTION RESULTS (MAINLY VISUAL)

SUMMARY OF 2002/2003 PERFORMANCE OF STATUTORY UNDERTAKERS IN DUNDEE

Statutory Undertaker	Agreed Units of Inspection	Sample Inspection Pass Rate				Annual Pass Rate
		First Quarter	Second Quarter	Third Quarter	Fourth Quarter	
Atlantic Telecom	No works	-	-	-	-	-
British Telecom	233	88% (15/17)	94% (17/18)	94% (16/17)	100% (18/18)	94% (66/70)
Cable & Wireless	No works	-	-	-	-	-
Scottish Water	880	92% (61/66)	95% (35/37)	100% (66/66)	91% (84/92)	94% (246/261)
Scottish & Southern Energy	440	94% (31/33)	100% (29/29)	100% (37/37)	97% (32/33)	98% (129/132)
Telewest	293	100% (22/22)	93% (14/15)	100% (26/26)	92% (23/25)	97% (85/88)
Thus	100	100% (4/4)	100% (3/3)	0% (0/1)	100% (3/3)	91% (10/11)
Transco	826	100% (61/61)	100% (35/35)	100% (77/77)	97% (73/75)	99% (246/248)

Notes

- 1 Inspection figures in brackets, eg (15/17) represent number of passes divided by the number of sample inspections.
- 2 The number of sample inspections carried out annually is 6% of the Agreed Units of Inspections at each of 5 different stages, eg for BT $5 \times 6\% \times 233 = 70$.
- 3 Thus (former Scottish Telecom) had limited volume of works in Dundee over the last year, hence only 11 inspections were carried out.

Statutory Undertaker	Annual Sample Inspection Pass Rate (%)				
	1998/1999	1999/2000	2000/2001	2001/2002	2002/2003
Atlantic Telecom (no works)	-	-	-	-	-
British Telecom	94	87	94	90	94
Cable & Wireless	-	100	100	-	-
Scottish Water	97	92	97	90	94
Scottish & Southern Energy	92	95	94	91	98
Telewest	56	89	91	90	97
Thus	90	100	100	100	91
Transco	95	97	94	95	99

Appendix 2 shows the number of other defects, reported by members of the public or found during routine Roads Authority inspections, together with a list of common causes of failures.

APPENDIX 2

NUMBER OF DEFECTS (2002/2003) REPORTED BY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC OR FOUND DURING ROUTINE ROADS AUTHORITY INSPECTIONS

Statutory Undertaker	First Quarter	Second Quarter	Third Quarter	Fourth Quarter	Total
Atlantic Telecom					
British Telecom			3		3
Cable & Wireless					
Scottish Water	3	1	8	4	16
Scottish & Southern Energy	1	1		1	3
Telewest	1		1		2
Thus					
Transco	2		2	3	7

CAUSES OF FAILURE	No of Failures Found/Reported During 2002/2003	
	By Sample Inspection	By Public or Routine Inspection
Signing and Guarding Defects	14	
Wrong Material	7	6
Surface Depression	1	18
Trips	2	3
Open Joints	2	1
Surface Cracking		1
Backfill Defects		1
No Edge Sealant	1	1
Lining not Replaced	1	
Total	28	31

Appendix 3 shows the results of the local Dundee Coring Programme during 2002/2003 with figures from previous two years for comparison. All cores were selected randomly from permanent reinstatements in carriageways less than one year old from 1 April 2002 to 31 March 2003.

APPENDIX 3 – LOCAL DUNDEE CORING PROGRAMME 2002/2003

Statutory Undertaker	Core Description/ Site Selection	Core No	Pass		Fail-Monitor						Fail-Replace					
			No	%	Com-paction	Layers	Materials	Others	TOTAL		Com-paction	Layers	Material	Others	TOTAL	
									No	%					No	%
Atlantic Telecom	No Works/No Cores															
British Telecom	Randomly Selected	9	4	44%					0		2	1	1	1	5	56%
Cable & Wireless	No Works/No Cores															
Scottish Water	Randomly Selected	33	13	39%					0			2	18		20	61%
Scottish & Southern Energy	Randomly Selected	15	9	60%					0		2	1	3		6	40%
Telewest Broadband	Randomly Selected	11	2	18					0		1	4	4		9	82%
Thus	Randomly Selected	1	1	100%					0							
Transco	Randomly Selected	33	16	48%					0							
TOTAL 2002/2003	Randomly Selected	102	45	44%					0	0%	6	13	37	1	57	56%
Totals 2001/2002	Randomly Selected	56	26	46%	6	3			9	16%	9	11	1		21	38%
Totals 2000/2001	Random and Targeted	97	24	25%	3	17			20	21%	8	45			53	54%

Notes

Pass = Reinstatement in compliance with NRSWA Specification.
 Fail-Monitor = Defects of minor nature, requiring further 2-year monitoring.
 Fail-Replace = Outwith NRSWA Specification, requiring replacement of blacktop materials and a further 2 year guarantee period.

Appendices 4, 5 and 6 show the results of the latest National Coring Programme with summary sheets for Dundee and for all local Roads Authorities and all Statutory Undertakers in Scotland respectively, together with totals from the previous two national programmes for comparison. These results were approved at the June 2003 meeting of the Roads Authorities and Utilities Committee (Scotland) (RAUC(S)). All cores were selected randomly from works reinstated between 1 September 2001 and 31 March 2002, with the majority in carriageways as against footways.

APPENDIX 4 - ROADS AUTHORITIES AND UTILITIES COMMITTEE

DUNDEE RESULTS FROM NATIONAL CORING PROGRAMME 2002

Statutory Undertaker	Core No	Pass		Fail-Monitor						Fail-Replace					
		No	%	Com-paction	Layers	Materials	Others	TOTAL		Com-paction	Layers	Material	Others	TOTAL	
								No	%					No	%
British Telecom	5	0	0%					0		1	2	1	1	5	100%
Scottish & Southern Energy	9	6	67%					0		1		2		3	33%
Scottish Water	18	5	28%					0		2	2	9		13	72%
Telewest Broadband	6	1	17%					0		2	2		1	5	83%
Thus	5	1	20%					0		2	1	1		4	80%
Transco	17	6	35%					0		6	1	4		11	65%
TOTALS 2002	60	19	32%					0	0%	14	8	17	2	41	68%

TOTALS 2000	44	4	9%	1	11			12	27%	8	18	2		28	64%
TOTALS 1998	60	26	43%					18	30%					16	27%

APPENDIX 5 - ROADS AUTHORITIES AND UTILITIES COMMITTEE (SCOTLAND)

NATIONAL CORING PROGRAMME 2002 - SCOTLAND SUMMARY BY ROADS AUTHORITY

ROADS AUTHORITY	CORE			FAIL-MONITOR : AGREED Yes - (All)						FAIL - REPLACE : AGREED Yes (All)					
	PASS			Com- paction	Layers	Material	Others	TOTAL		Com- paction	Layers	Material	Others	TOTAL	
	No.	No.	%					No.	%					No.	%
Aberdeen City	94	67	71.3%	5	5		2	12	12.8%	5	10			15	16.0%
Aberdeenshire	108	75	69.4%	9	6	2	4	21	19.4%	5	7			12	11.1%
Moray	28	22	78.6%	3	1	1		5	17.9%	1				1	3.6%
Highland	68	37	54.4%	4	3	1		8	11.8%	2	17	4		23	33.8%
TOTAL for NOSRAUC	298	201	67.4%					46	15.4%					51	17.1%
Angus	73	30	41.1%		7	33		40	54.8%		1	2		3	4.1%
Clackmannanshire	20	7	35.0%	2				2	10.0%	4	3	2	2	11	55.0%
Dundee City	60	19	31.7%					0	0.0%	14	8	17	2	41	68.3%
Falkirk	23	1	4.3%					0	0.0%	3	8	9	2	22	95.7%
Fife	127	1	0.8%					0	0.0%	25	26	53	22	126	99.2%
Perth & Kinross	52	22	42.3%		3			3	5.8%		5	19	3	27	51.9%
Stirling	46	10	21.7%					0		15	3	18		36	78.3%
TOTAL for Tayforth RAUC	401	90	22.4%					45	11.2%					266	66.3%
Borders Council	37	19	51.4%	2	2			4	10.8%	1	12	1		14	37.8%
City of Edinburgh	78	54	69.2%	4			1	5	6.4%	2	14	3		19	24.4%
East Lothian	49	35	71.4%	1	5			6	12.2%		8			8	16.3%
Midlothian	73	59	80.8%					0	0.0%	2	11		1	14	19.2%
West Lothian	94	56	59.6%				3	3	3.2%	7	1	1	26	35	37.2%
TOTAL for SERAUC	331	223	67.4%					18	5.4%					90	27.2%
Argyle & Bute	39	7	17.9%	11	21	5	2	22	56.4%	1	10	8		10	25.6%
Dumfries & Galloway	60	15	25.0%	2	7	1		10	16.7%	13	21		1	35	58.3%
East Ayrshire	39	23	59.0%	3	3			6	15.4%		10			10	25.6%
East Dunbartonshire	47	28	59.6%	4	2			6	12.8%	7	6			13	27.7%
East Renfrewshire	43	20	46.5%		11			11	25.6%	3	8	1		12	27.9%
Glasgow City	188	71	37.8%	1	19		1	21	11.2%	21	57	1	17	96	51.1%
Inverclyde	54	15	27.8%			8	8	16	29.6%	10		2	11	23	42.6%
North Ayrshire	52	25	48.1%	5	6			11	21.2%	2	14			16	30.8%
North Lanarkshire	16	7	43.8%	5	5			5	31.3%	4	4			4	25.0%
Renfrewshire	87	28	32.2%	3	23			26	29.9%	5	21	6	1	33	37.9%
South Ayrshire	33	17	51.5%	5				5	15.2%		6		5	11	33.3%
South Lanarkshire	157	63	40.1%	7	29	2	2	40	25.5%	9	41	4		54	34.4%
West Dunbartonshire	64	25	39.1%	4		4		8	12.5%	10	21			31	48.4%
TOTAL for SWRAUC	879	344	39.1%					187	21.3%					348	39.6%
TOTALS 2002	1909	858	44.9%	80	158	57	23	296	15.5%	171	353	151	93	755	39.5%

Totals 2000	1503	577	38.4%
Totals 1998	1544	664	43.0%

APPENDIX 6

ROADS AUTHORITIES AND UTILITIES COMMITTEE (SCOTLAND)

NATIONAL CORING PROGRAMME - SCOTLAND SUMMARY 2002 - BY STATUTORY UNDERTAKER

Statutory Undertaker	CORE	PASS		FAIL-MONITOR : AGREED Yes - 281						FAIL - REPLACE : AGREED Yes					
	No	No	%	Com-paction	Layers	Material	Others	TOTAL		Com-paction	Layers	Material	Others	TOTAL	
								No	%					No	%
British Telecom	236	113	47.9%	9	13	7	5	31	13.1%	22	40	13	17	92	39.0%
Cable & Wireless	28	9	32.1%		6		1	7	25.0%	2	6		4	12	42.9%
Scottish Power	193	66	34.2%	13	10	1	2	21	10.9%	28	56	14	8	106	54.9%
Scottish Water	567	195	34.4%	26	63	21	8	111	19.6%	48	127	68	23	261	46.0%
Scottish & Southern	60	36	60.0%	3	6	3		10	16.7%	4	4	6		14	23.3%
Telewest	53	20	37.7%	1	1		2	4	7.5%	6	9	7	7	29	54.7%
Thus	62	35	56.5%	8	3			9	14.5%	9	12	1		18	29.0%
Transco	599	338	56.4%	12	40	21	4	74	12.4%	42	85	41	23	187	31.2%
186K	22	8	36.4%		10			10	45.5%	1	3			4	18.2%
NTL	51	15	29.4%		5	4	1	10	19.6%	9	8	1	8	26	51.0%
OMNE	38	23	60.5%	8	1			9	23.7%		3		3	6	15.8%
TOTALS 2002	1909	858	44.9%	80	158	57	23	296	15.5%	171	353	151	93	755	39.5%