

REPORT TO: EDUCATION COMMITTEE - 22 OCTOBER 2007

REPORT ON: EDUCATION TRANSPORT CONTRACTS - CONVEYANCE OF SCHOLARS

REPORT BY: DIRECTOR OF PLANNING & TRANSPORTATION/DIRECTOR OF EDUCATION

REPORT NO: 403-2007

1 PURPOSE OF REPORT

1.1 To report to Committee tenders for the conveyance of scholars.

2 RECOMMENDATION

2.1 It is recommended that the Committee approve the tenders detailed in Appendix 1.

3 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

3.1 The cost of awarding the contracts (Appendix 1) will result in expenditure of £205,371.00 during the academic session 2007/2008 which can be met from the Education Revenue Budget 2007/2008 and the Provisional Education Revenue Budget 2008/2009.

4 POLICY IMPLICATIONS

4.1 This report has been screened for any policy implications in respect of Sustainability, Strategic Environmental Assessment, Anti Poverty, Equality Impact Assessment and Risk Management.

4.2 The major issues identified are that through efficient tendering procedures the Council are able to minimise the number of vehicles required to fulfil our statutory requirement to provide home to school transport for scholars entitled to free school transport.

5 EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES IMPLICATIONS

5.1 Through procurement of appropriate vehicles and the provision of escort staff and personalised equipment, the Council ensures that education is accessible for all.

6 BACKGROUND

6.1 The Committee will recall that education transport is co-ordinated between the Education Department and Planning and Transportation Department with the Transport Team administering the school transport provision for entitled scholars as required under the Transport Act 1985 (63) (3A).

6.2 The Sustainable Transport Team issue school contracts on a three year cycle to benefit from best value in terms of vehicle availability, vehicle quality and stability. The tender exercise conducted in 2007 was to formally tender contracts which had been entered into on a verbal tender basis through the course of the last academic session or to meet the needs of newly entitled children.

6.3 Where the lowest tender has not been accepted a full explanation is provided in Appendix 2 of the report.

7 CONSULTATIONS

7.1 The Chief Executive, Depute Chief Executive (Support Services), Depute Chief Executive (Finance), Head of Finance and Assistant Chief Executive (Community Planning) have been consulted and are in agreement with the contents of this report.

8 BACKGROUND PAPERS

8.1 Report Number 388-2006.

Ann Wilson
Director of Education

Alan Lewis
Assistant Head of Transportation

AL/NHG/MHD/DDB

8 October 2007

Dundee City Council
Tayside House
Dundee

APPENDIX 1

Education Transport Tender 2007/2009

Contract Number	Company	Price	Notes
DSP/87	Dundee 505050 Ltd	£35.00	
	Tay Taxis Ltd	£29.00	
	Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	£38.00	
DSP/91	Dundee 505050 Ltd	£56.00	
	Tay Taxis Ltd	£51.00	
	Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	£58.00	
DSP/97	Airport Travel Dundee Ltd	£90.50	
	Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	£60.00	Note 1
	Thistle Coaches	£80.00	
DSP/103	A&R Travel's	No bid	Note 2
	Dundee 505050 Ltd	£59.00	
	Sidlaw Executive Travel	£64.00	Combined bid - Note 3
	Tay Taxis Ltd	£57.00	
DSP/106	Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	£54.80	
	Dundee 505050 Ltd	£57.00	
DSP/109	Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	£52.80	
	Dundee 505050 Ltd	£46.00	
DSP/109	A&R Travel's	No Bid	Note 2
	Sidlaw Executive Travel	£70.00	Combined bid - Note 4
	Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	£42.80	
DSP/111	Dundee 505050 Ltd	£18.00	
	Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	£24.00	
DSP/112	Dundee 505050 Ltd	£40.00	
	John Charles Cuthill	£34.00	Note 5
	Tay Taxis Ltd	£36.00	
	Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	£40.00	
DSP/113	Dundee 505050 Ltd	£26.00	
	Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	£32.00	

DSP/114	A&R Travel's Dundee 505050 Ltd Sidlaw Executive Travel Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	No Bid £16.00 £64.00 £14.00	Note 2 Combined bid - Note 6
DSP/116	A&R Travel's Airport Travel Dundee Ltd Dundee 505050 Ltd Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	No Bid £30.00 £38.00 £40.00	Note 2
DSP/117	Dundee 505050 Ltd Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	£36.00 £32.80	
DSP/121	Airport Travel Dundee Ltd Sidlaw Executive Travel Thistle Coaches	£60.00 £70.00 £75.00	
DSP/123	A&R Travel's Dundee 505050 Ltd Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	No Bid £60.00 £68.00	Note 2
DSP/125	Dundee 505050 Ltd Sidlaw Executive Travel Tay Taxis Ltd Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	£38.00 £70.00 £37.00 £40.00	Combined bid - Note 4
DSP/127	A&R Travel's Dundee 505050 Ltd Sidlaw Executive Travel Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	No bid £68.00 £70.00 £70.00	Note 2 Combined bid - Note 4
DSP/128	A&R Travel's Dundee Taxi Cab Company Ltd Sidlaw Executive Travel	No bid £52.00 £64.00	Note 2 Combined bid - Note 3
DSP/129	A&R Travel's Dundee 505050 Ltd Tay Taxis Ltd Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	No bid £48.00 £41.00 £50.00	Note 2
DSP/130	Dundee 505050 Ltd	£32.00	

	Dundee Taxi Cab Company Ltd	£30.00	
	John Charles Cuthill	£26.00	Note 5
DSP/131	Dundee 505050 Ltd	£41.00	
	Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	£45.00	
DSP/132	A&R Travel's	No Bid	Note 2
	Airport Travel Dundee Ltd	£40.00	
	Dundee 505050 Ltd	£28.00	
	Dundee Taxi Cab Company Ltd	£25.00	Note 7
	John Charles Cuthill	£22.00	Note 5
	Tay Taxis Ltd	£25.00	
DSP/133	Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	£60.00	
DSP/134	Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	£60.00	
DSP/135	A&R Travel's	No Bid	Note 2
	Airport Travel Dundee Ltd	£39.50	
	Dundee 505050 Ltd	£60.00	
	Sidlaw Executive Travel	£64.00	Combined Bid - Note 6
	Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	£65.00	
DDE/11	Dundee 505050 Ltd	£14.00	
	Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	£12.00	
DDE/17	Dundee 505050 Ltd	£22.00	
	Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	£20.00	
DDE/19	Dundee 505050 Ltd	£35.00	
	Mrs Sheilain Scullion	£30.00	
	Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	£32.00	
XDA/3	Dundee 505050 Ltd	£27.00	
	Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	£25.00	

Education Transport Tender 2007/2009

Combined Bids - Comparison

Contract Number	Company	Individual Prices	Total	Notes
DSP/103 & DSP/128	Sidlaw Executive Travel	-	£64.00	Note 3
DSP/103	Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	£54.80		
DSP/128	Dundee Taxi Cab Company Ltd	£52.00	£106.80	
DSP/109, DSP/125 & DSP/127	Sidlaw Executive Travel	-	£70.00	Note 4
DSP/109	Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	£42.80		
DSP/125	Tay Taxis Ltd	£37.00		
DSP/127	Dundee 505050 Ltd	£68.00	£147.80	
DSP/114 & DSP/135	Sidlaw Executive Travel	-	£64.00	Note 6
DSP/114	Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd	£14.00		
DSP/135	Airport Travel Dundee Ltd	£39.50	£53.50	
DSP/112, DSP/130 & DSP/132 - Price Comparison (Note 5)				
Combination 1				
DSP/112	John Charles Cuthill Dundee Taxi Cab Company	£34.00		
DSP/130	Ltd Dundee Taxi Cab Company	£30.00		
DSP/132	Ltd or Tay Taxis Ltd	£25.00	£89.00	
Combination 2				
DSP/112	Tay Taxis Ltd	£36.00		
DSP/130	John Charles Cuthill Dundee Taxi Cab Company	£26.00		
DSP/132	Ltd or Tay Taxis Ltd	£25.00		

£87.00

Combination 3

DSP/112	Tay Taxis Ltd Dundee Taxi Cab Company	£36.00
DSP/130	Ltd	£30.00
DSP/132	John Charles Cuthill	£22.00

£88.00

APPENDIX 2**Education Transport Tender Results 2007/2009 - Supporting Notes**

- Note 1** DSP/97 - The pupils allocated to this contract travel in Invacare Spectra Plus electric wheelchairs. Due to problems experienced during session 2006/2007 with restraining the pupils' wheelchairs in certain makes of wheelchair accessible taxi, a minibus capable of carrying two wheelchairs was requested in the tender specifications.
- Tele-Taxis (Dundee) Ltd have submitted the lowest price tendered on the basis of using 2 taxis to operate the contract. However it is recommended that the contract is awarded to Thistle Coaches using a 16 seat minibus capable of carrying 4 wheelchairs plus 6 passengers.
- Note 2** A&R Travel's have submitted tender documents for 10 contracts however the forms have not been completed correctly with no cost per day noted on form TS1 as required. The company cannot therefore be considered for any of the contracts.
- Note 3** Combined bid DSP/103 & DSP/128 - Sidlaw Executive Travel has submitted a price of £64.00 per day to operate Contracts DSP/103 and DSP/128 using one vehicle. As this is the lowest tender and there are no operational difficulties anticipated it is recommended that the contracts are awarded on this basis.
- Note 4** Combined bid DSP/109, DSP/125 & DSP/127 - Sidlaw Executive Travel has submitted a price of £70.00 per day to operate the three contracts using one vehicle. However, due to the specific needs of the pupils being conveyed it is recommended that the contracts are awarded to the lowest individual tenderers.
- Note 5** Contracts DSP/112, DSP/130 & DSP/132 - John Charles Cuthill has tendered for three contracts but only operates one vehicle. It is therefore recommended that he is awarded Contract DSP/130 offering the best value to the City Council.
- Note 6** Combined bid DSP/114 & DSP/135 - Sidlaw Executive Travel has submitted a price of £64.00 per day to operate both contracts using one vehicle. However, as this combination is not the lowest tender it is recommended that the contracts are awarded to the operators submitted the lowest individual bids.
- Note 7** DSP/132 - The lowest tender for this contract cannot be considered as detailed in Note 5 above. The next lowest tender is tied between two operators who have submitted the same daily rate. It is recommended that Dundee Taxi Cab Company Ltd is awarded Contract DSP/132 decided on the toss of a coin by Mark Devine witnessed by Moyra Buick and Kate Johnston.