

DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL

REPORT TO: SOCIAL WORK AND HEALTH COMMITTEE – 9TH SEPTEMBER 2013

REPORT ON: KEMBACK STREET ADULT RESOURCE CENTRE – CONSULTANT REPORT

REPORT BY: ALEX DAVIDSON, INDEPENDENT CONSULTANT

REPORT NO: 367 - 2013

1 INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 The Social Work and Health Committee on 23 March 2013 approved the planned consultation with service users and carers regarding future support for adults with a learning disability in relation to the Director of Social Work's recommendation to the Council to close Kemback Street Adult Resource Centre and to reinvest/re-provision services through the amalgamation of day service provision using the capacity at Wellgate Day Support Service and through development and use of other appropriate services. The consultation provided a range of methods to ensure a fair and proper opportunity to understand the reasoning for the proposed closure, and to hear the views of service users and their family carers on the proposal.

2.0 BACKGROUND

- 2.1 Dundee City Council, like all other Scottish local authorities are involved in continuous review of their services, based on the principles of the Christie Commission, best value and Government policy, and the ongoing impact of financial pressures. Services in social care provide difficult challenges, particularly the developing integration agenda, and that of personalisation through the Social Care (Self-Directed Support) (Scotland) Act 2013. The nature of services to people with a learning disability and their family carers has been subject to a 10 year policy "The same as you?" from 2000 - 2010, now replaced with a further strategy 'the keys to life' which recognises the changes which have occurred, and those which remain a challenge.

There are 1,114 adults known to services with a learning disability in Dundee.

- 2.2 Kemback Street Adult Resource Centre was opened in 1985, purpose built for its time and reflecting the move from 'work based' workshop buildings to those based on a social and educational focus. Some of the current service users have attended since that date, and the majority have a long connection with the building and some staff. Many more service users now access different forms of support arising from the 'Same as You' policy, independent living, work, voluntary activity, and there is a further emphasis on continuous learning and personalised services, supported by advocacy and a rights agenda.

3.0 POLICY CONTEXT

- 3.1 **National Policy**, *The same as you? (SAY) (Scottish Executive, 2000)*
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/1095/0001661.pdf> encouraged local authorities to review their day care services. It said that the role of day centres should change to increasingly become resource centres. It proposed that nobody should go to a day centre full-time, and instead should use it as a base to identify and participate in activities in the wider community. It promoted that day centres or support services should become more community focused by helping people with learning disabilities to access continuing education and development, real jobs, achieve their desired outcomes and become more involved in their communities. 'The same as you?' while advocating 'resource centres' did

not provide any definition or prescription and many day centres simply renamed provision without addressing the fundamental challenge and change required. A subsequent report 'Make my Day' addressed some of this debate.

<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2006/04/24103440/0>

- 3.2 The launch of the revised Learning Disability Strategy for Scotland in June of this year, **The keys to life - Improving Quality of Life for People with Learning Disabilities** asserts that *'The past 13 years has seen a considerable change in the way day services are delivered, and it is clear that most local authorities and their partners have embraced the vision set out in 'The same as you?'. A range of models are now in place across Scotland, some of which involve little or no contact with day centres, and others that involve an appropriate balance of centre-based and community activities.*

There has been a gradual decline in the number of people with learning disabilities attending day centres in Scotland, from 8,300 in 1998, to 6,164 in 2011. This has been accompanied by an increase in the number of adults with learning disabilities getting alternative day opportunities. In 2011, 10,286 people accessed alternative day opportunities and 65% of this group (6,695) did not use day services at all. 1,400 people with learning disabilities still attend day services 5 days a week. This includes people with profound learning disabilities and complex needs for whom there are limited options available to access alternative day opportunities.

The key point to note from the evidence is that day services are now much more person-centred and based around the assessed needs and wishes of people with learning disabilities themselves, taking into account the views of their carers.

However, it is clear that for many people, day opportunities will continue to play an important part in the overall support arrangements. In terms of the future and ongoing development of day opportunities, local authorities and their partners should aim to have in place arrangements for individuals to access a comprehensive network of day services and resources that meet needs across the spectrum of learning disabilities.

In this context, services should continue to make progress towards community-based models of care and to support people currently dependent on buildings-based care to graduate into alternative opportunities." The keys to life" Scottish Government 2013.
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2013/06/1123/9>

"The keys to life", Recommendation 27 continues this thrust and charges: **"That by June 2018 the Scottish Government in partnership with local authorities, the Third Sector and people with learning disabilities and carers review and further develop day opportunities that are person-centred, assets-based and values driven and that take account of staffing, education, employment and transport issues."**

A number of further recommendations are also of note. Recommendation 35, on Carer resilience; Recommendation 40, on further and continuing education; Recommendation 41, on supported employment; and Recommendation 42, on voluntary activity.

4.0 MAIN TEXT

4.1 Consultation Process

It was proposed that both collective and individual consultation should take place, and that an independent consultant should be employed to validate the consultation, and to give consideration to wider factors in relation to the Kemback Street closure proposal.

The consultation has focused on listening to carers and service users views on the proposal, and to have the Social Work Department present its thinking and evidence for the proposal, given that a number of issues have already been well rehearsed, primarily at the Partnership in Practice Review event in 2012 where the possible closure of Kemback Street Adult Resource Centre was presented. An opportunity to review the current

individual needs and aspirations of service users and the support offered to service users and carers has been a central part of the consultation.

The current consultation has involved a number of different strategies, questionnaires, individual interviews and group meetings.

- A meeting with the Kemback Street Action Group and the Independent Consultant (attended by the representatives from the Scottish Learning Disability Alliance and Downs Syndrome Scotland).
- Two meetings with carers have been held which gave an opportunity to explain the Social Work Department position.
- Questionnaires were issued and, as some carers expressed negative views on the questionnaire, an invitation to write to the Department in addition to the questionnaire if carers wished was given.
- Individual meetings (and care assessments) with family carers and their relative service users (with an advocate if wished), assisted by prior individual work with service users and Kemback Street staff;
- Meetings with service users in group settings assisted by Kemback Street staff members, speech therapist, and assistive communication aids and using materials prepared by service users and staff service users.
- Offers of renewed carers assessments were made to individual family carers (with 5 individual carers requesting an assessment) ,
- Two meetings with the Kemback staff group, one involving management, and a subsequent meeting with staff and the independent consultant.
- A meeting with a limited number of carers from Wellgate Day Centre.
- A meeting with the Down's Syndrome representative at her request.
- Further consultation and examination of issues raised in respect of the proposed closure have been undertaken with a wider set of agencies by the Independent Consultant supported by Social Work staff where appropriate (*Appendix 1*).

The previous process had followed a similar format, following from the Committee decisions taken in 2012, (Committee reports 23 January 2012, 28-2012; 26 March 2012 149-2012); and finally a report on the initial consultation was provided on 29 October 2012 which detailed that staff meetings had been held; an appraisal on the Kemback Street building had been carried out; some 67 individual meetings had been held involving Kemback Street and Out and About service users; and revised care packages agreed. Issues raised during this consultation were that service user friendships and relationships be protected and described how these would be supported through any transition. This in the view of the author was a major commitment, reflecting the reputation of Dundee for rigorous engagement and consultation on learning disability services in the past.

Particular issues were raised after the Committee decision taken in March 2013, following a letter from Mr George Stewart of the Kemback Street Action Group, being received by the Care Inspectorate in respect of communication in Kemback Street ARC and how "the provider has failed to take reasonable steps to communicate with service users and their representatives about future changes in the service". These were:

- How communication methods were used (i.e. letters sent to family carers by the centre rather than by post, a traditional practice)
- Access to reports by internet only

- Communication support to service users; attention to communication styles; additional support needs etc
- The use of ambiguous language
- The lack of specific individual care planning
- The need for attention to transfer arrangements if closure was pursued.

These issues were all addressed in the current consultations: with arrangements for written communication to be provided to all carers, even when the service user was in a care settings other than the family home; communication support and techniques being used (speech therapy, Talking Mats, use of known and trusted staff); and offers of carer assessments; and individual and collective meetings with users and carers.

4.2 **Learning Disability Service Spend in Dundee**

Current Dundee City Council spend on learning disability services is a mix of independent sector spend and directly provided services as noted below. The largest proportion is spent on care at home and housing support reflecting the thrust of national policy and the successful engagement of housing resources for this group of users. A significant but reducing spend remains in supporting service users in care homes. Approximately 65% of Learning Disability services are provided by external voluntary or independent sector providers, and cater for some specialist services and resources.

Current spend on day services and support is within a mixed economy with the independent sector providing for behaviours which challenge services, and autistic spectrum services. Spend on employment support and in college support, add to the pattern of services.

Category of Service	Internal %	External %
Care at home/ Housing Support	44.3	63.4
Care Home	11.4	18.2
Community Social Care	2.7	0.0
Respite	7.5	4.7
Day Support	5.1	7.9
Day Support (Centres)	23.8	4.1
In college student support	0.0	1.8
Total Day Support	28.9	13.7
Employment Support	5.2	0.0
Overall Total	100	100

4.3 **Previous Consultation and Engagement**

The Council and its partners (NHS and independent and Voluntary Sector) have produced a range of consultation reports on the Same as You, the Partnership in Practice (PiP) Agreements, and which were produced with service user and carer involvement, and reported to Social Work Committees (521-2001; 789-2004; 659-2007). These have involved significant numbers of stakeholders, service users and carers, largely through annual PiP events. Numbers attending have usually exceeded 150 people but some 255 were involved in 2012. Previous consultation styles have been through the PiP and agreement reached that "It is recommended that there should be only one large information

sharing and consultation event each year” (Dundee Partnership in Practice Review 2011 Consultation Report). The final full Partnership in Practice (PiP) Agreement was agreed in 2007-2010, and PiP events have been carried out each year while guidance from central government was awaited on the new strategy during the following two years.

The Council has invested strongly in service user led consultation and engagement through Advocating Together Dundee, involving considerable service user contact. This continuing and dedicated peer consultation and engagement offers a valuable means of engaging service users.

Whether the PiP engagement strategy is sufficient for ongoing committed consultation and engagement is a theme to return in the recommendations, particularly as the new National Strategy has now been launched.

4.4 Carers Strategy

The Council is currently revisiting the Carers Strategy with partners in Health, Housing and other agencies, and with the direct involvement of carers and their representative organisations. The carers of people with learning disabilities are largely outside this strategy having been engaged through the Partnership in Practice consultations. No single carer organisation has the responsibility for learning disability services.

4.5 Day Supports and System Capacity

Dundee City Council retains a number of building based resources, providing a continuum of support services including Kemback Street Adult Resource Centre and Wellgate Support Centre, with additional centres for older people, and for people with complex needs and behaviours which challenge. There has been a drop in numbers using both Wellgate and Kemback similar to usage elsewhere in Scotland as alternative day opportunities have developed. Both centres are now running at reduced capacity, each with the capacity to absorb the other, with some limited staffing adjustment. Wellgate and Kemback both provide 2 sessions per day, with Wellgate registered for 42 (Care Inspectorate) places per day, and 41 current users and Kemback has 60 registered (CI) places per day, and 35 current users. Usage is flexible as some users use the centres 5 days per week and others two or three 'sessions/days' per week.

There has been a question about the 'capacity' of the centres. It is important to note that although a centre like Kemback can accommodate 60 people at one time not all service users attend 5 days per week. The capacity is set by the Care Inspectorate with the provider, and largely reflects a shared view on numbers but does not imply anything other than the maximum number to be accommodated at one time. The capacity can be subject to review and adjustment, and would look at the nature of the accommodation and staffing. Both centres are currently running below their full numbers/capacity, reflecting the mix of usage varying from a small and decreasing number using the centre on five days to those who would use it for a small number of activities or sessions.

Actual attendance varies significantly from 'capacity', and in the main service users are attending or wish to attend activities which are outwith the building in inclusive settings. There are very few occasions, if ever, when the centre has all service users in attendance as they pursue activities in the community and the centre has very few users present in the building on most days.

Wellgate Centre has a lower 'capacity'/number for historical reasons and could be subject to adjustment if this were required in the future. It is suggested that the Department pursue a higher number of service users/capacity figure with the Care Inspectorate to enable greater use for sessional and focussed activities and 'classes', and to support personalised service user usage in the future.

The consultation event which involved service users and their families has identified the pattern of resource need required if Kemback Street Centre were to close, and has also worked to ensure that the needs of Wellgate Centre users are met.

4.6 Building Costs

Following discussion with staff from Social Work Finance and City Development, the following material was provided and confirmed by the author on site visits.

There has been an appropriate if limited option appraisal on buildings, identifying and assessing the condition and where practical refurbishment that could satisfy a common brief. The estimated cost of these works was £480,000 for Kemback Street, and £416,000 for Wellgate.

However, the Kemback Street building has a range of internal operational constraints that could not be contained within this appraisal such as different access levels, some 'dead' spaces in the atriums and a number of 'pinch points' throughout the building. These constraints such as the narrow corridor and pinch points at various locations cannot be improved without significant structure alteration and layout of the building; the split level within the building with no opportunity to raise floor levels; and the resultant mobility issues with stairs and platform lift. The external garden is accessed by stairs and steep ramp with no opportunity of creating a level access to the garden area without the construction of new ramps, and which further restricts the development and use of this building at an affordable cost.

Wellgate has similarly some necessary improvements, largely in personal care areas but without the major likely costs in Kemback Street.

4.7 Revenue Expenditure

The total annual revenue budget for Kemback Street is £459,050 while the equivalent figure for Wellgate is £515,600. These figures cover the day to day running costs of the services.

The proposed closure programme would result in the release of resources from the above budget for Kemback Street, along with the revenue budget for the Out and About Service of £307,060 giving a combined total of £766,110 per annum. The proposals allowed for the full reinvestment of this resource into Learning Disability Services through funding the cost of alternative services for existing service users and to fund service developments outlined in the Learning Disability future development plan.

4.8 Wellgate Day Support Service

Wellgate which was opened for learning disability services in 2005 has no internal obstacles or development needs, and while the external access is not great due to different street levels and lift/ramp arrangements it has nevertheless been used as a day centre for both older people and latterly learning and physically disabled people and there are generally no complaints raised or reported by service users and regulation agencies. It is well placed for access to city centre activities. Safety issues have been raised by Kemback Carers Campaign Group regarding the closeness to bus services, and the impact of stigmatisation for service users, due to the location on bus routes, but these issues were not reported in the meeting with Wellgate carers. There is no evidence of these issues being raised at any of the regular carers meetings which are usually well supported.

4.9 Travel, Parking and Transport

Both centres have access to transport provided by the Council and have good public transport connections. Currently 16 service users do not access Dundee City Council transport to Kemback Street, and 8 are independent travellers; and 14 service users travel to Wellgate not using Dundee City Council transport with one travelling independently. Wellgate has good access to the City Centre and its attractions and resources, and the new Olympia Centre. The two Council provided vehicles are now coordinated through shared management of both centres, providing integrated transport options across the services. There have been issues regarding Kemback Street staff taking on driving duties, and these currently largely fall to Wellgate staff. The age and disability profile of the Wellgate service users indicates a higher need for access to disabled transport.

Parking facilities are better (and free) at Kemback Street.

4.10 **Complex Needs, PMLD and people with behaviours which challenge**

White Top Centre provides supports and services for people with complex disability needs; although there may be future pressures for complex need provision. The Council has robust procedures for forward planning and commissioning for young people in transition, currently around 30 young people per year, and with Education colleagues begins planning from year 10 in a child's life. The Social Work Department has arrangements to monitor the impact of older service users and the need for appropriate services. Changing aspirations have seen a decline in demand for places in 'traditional' day supports and demand for more aspirational day supports, housing, and personalised models.

The Council regularly considers transitional issues through the Adult Services Strategic Commissioning Intentions Report. The changing nature of models of support is illustrated in the following table.

Support Model	No of Service Users 2008	No of service users 2011/12
Care Homes	93	67
Day Centres	290	252
Alternative Day Supports	120	412
Accommodation with Support	121	162
Employment	160	478
Further Education	165	315

The growth of personalised and less institutional forms of support through alternative day supports, accommodation with support homes, employment and further education have made a significant impact on national and local aspirations on service model changes with better outcomes. The introduction of the Social Care (Self Directed Support) (Scotland) Act 2013 in 2014 will progress these personalised models further.

4.11 **Care Inspectorate**

The recent inspections grades for each centre are noted below. On the whole Wellgate has scored marginally higher than Kemback Street, most recently in grades awarded in 2013, although there may be mitigating circumstances given the impact of potential closure. Nevertheless in the accompanying text in reports the quality of Wellgate environment is positively referred to across reports, Kemback had issues with wheelchair use, and access to external gardens, and toilet decoration. The toilets were subsequently decorated.

	Quality of Care/support	Quality of environment	Quality of staffing	Quality of management and leadership
Kemback Sept 2008	3	3	4	3
January 2010	4	3	4	4
October 2010	4	3 (environment issues)	- (area not inspected)	-
October 2011	4	3	-	-
February 2012	4	4	-	-
March 2013	4	4	4	4
Wellgate Sept 2008	4	4	4	4

January 2010	5	-	4	-
November 2010	5	-	-	-
January 2012	4	-	-	-
March 2013	5	5	5	5

4.12 Profile and Programme

Analysis of the centre's programme illustrates a number of issues:

	Kemback Street	Wellgate
Capacity (Care Inspectorate)	60	42
Actual Numbers	35 (comprising a mix of full and part day sessions)	41 (comprising a mix of full and part day sessions)
Five Day attendance	8	8
% of time outwith centre	28%	56%
No with complex needs	18	34
Staff numbers	6.5 FTE + Senior	7.5 FTE +Senior

Currently 25 separate activities are offered by Kemback Street, with 41 offered by Wellgate Centre. Detail of this difference is included in Appendix 2

4.13 The current mix of complexity of need for service users in both buildings has been analysed as below:

Complexity: Same as You categorisations:		
	Kemback Street	Wellgate
Physical disabilities	6	10
Sensory impairment	20	16
Profound & Multiple disability	0	0
Challenging behaviour	11	9
Offending behaviour	0	0
Autistic spectrum disorder	5	3
Ethnic minority issues	0	0
Ageing	4	12
Life limiting conditions and those with palliative care needs	4	6
Mental health	27	20
Downs Syndrome	11	11
Cognitive and behavioural changes due to a possible deteriorating illness such as dementia	5	6
Cognitive and behavioural changes due to a possible deteriorating illness such as dementia in people with Downs Syndrome	5	5

4.14 Out and About Service

The Department has also moved to provide the service 'Out and About' in a different form through existing personalised services (Inclusion, supported accommodation models and three separate purchased services). This has been achieved by reassessing service user needs and planning alternative support with other providers. Costs for this have been met from re-provisioning service costs, and staff have been deployed to a variety of settings within social work services.

4.15 Supported Accommodation

A large number of service users are now supported in their own homes – in a supported accommodation model, with care and support provided by both the Council and Independent sector providers. There has been a move over time to support individuals 24/7, through care and support, with service users making use of City wide activities, sport, leisure and cultural activity, or based on volunteering and employment. The Council is keen to pursue this model of support for service users in line with the thrust of personalised services, and to have this personalised model adopted for all who would wish it, rightly so in the opinion of the author.

4.16 Age Profile

The age profile of service users is as below. This demonstrates the decline in school leavers choosing a day centre as an option in recent years. It also demonstrates that there are a number of service users in their 40s and 50s most of whom have received a day centre model of support for some years.

Service User Profile – Age	Kemback Street	Wellgate
18 – 20	0	0
20 – 29	3	2
30 - 39	8	2
40 – 49	16	10
50 – 59	8	17
60-69	0	6
70-79	0	4
80+	0	0

4.17 Action Group Issues

Issues raised by the Kemback Street Action Group and from meetings are as noted below:

- Alleged run down of activities prior to decision on closure
- Transport withdrawal
- Option appraisal on the two buildings, usage, costs, purpose built, facilities etc
- Building comparison, view that Wellgate was built for older people
- User and disability access to Wellgate
- Lack of opportunity to view Wellgate
- Previous works and spend programme on Kemback Street
- Current demand issues, service users moving on, and demand from young people's transitions
- Continuity of continuing (college) education courses
- Carers view of the need for such resources as against individual service
- View of supported accommodation model, which was felt could lead to service users being isolated and uninvolved
- Capacity and numbers in both buildings
- Possibility of change of use of Kemback Street to a community centre
- Concern that site was being primed for development
- Impact of charging policy
- How would users and staff transfer for continuity and support
- How would savings be used
- Nature of informing carer's and service users – letters need to be posted to home address of carer rather than the service user taking them home
- Importance of consistent programme and relationships with staff

4.18 Issues from Questionnaires

All service users and carers were given a questionnaire, and while there was opposition to it at the carers meetings some 32 were returned and subject to analysis. One family chose to write directly to the independent consultant.

Some quotes
<p>Things to do in the day time and evening:</p> <p><i>As we know everyone is different, A for instance requires a structured day but is happy to spend evenings at home with his television and computer. As far as evenings go they are seen to by myself, and his Dad, and other family members, his day at Kemback is what is important to him. Evening activities are few and far between.'</i></p> <p>Should have choice of different things to do:</p> <p><i>'Everyone should be encouraged to make choices again with appropriate support.'</i></p> <p>Chances to work and do voluntary activity:</p> <p><i>'B sees the centre as his work. For those who can benefit from this kind of activity it is very important. It must be within the scope of the person's ability.'</i></p> <p>Chance to go to college or have workplace training:</p> <p><i>'But not everyone is suitable to go to college so Kemback Street should stay open and be an option for him. I think it is good to have the chance to go to college. In today's economic climate 'ordinary people' struggle to get employment, what chance have people with learning disabilities, and what happens when the training course ends?'</i></p> <p>A special place to meet friends, get advice and learn new things:</p> <p><i>'They should provide a safe and secure meeting place where people could feel a sense of ownership and familiarity and thus find confidence to reach out and form friendships with their peers.'</i></p> <p>People might want different things at different times in their lives:</p> <p><i>'Older people may be left behind in increasingly under-used day services. Depends on your health.'</i></p> <p>Chance to do the same thing for years:</p> <p><i>'C gets unsettled at any change regardless of how small. He knows where he is and what he has to do, he then feels in control. SMALL CHANGES GOOD, BIG CHANGES BAD.'</i></p> <p>What do you think about the idea that Kemback Street ARC might be closed:</p> <p><i>'My son has been attending for 24 years and has enjoyed every day of it, he meets his friends and he misses routine which the centre provides. If it closes it will affect for a time his confidence and ability to function in a group.'</i></p> <p><i>'This is a valuable resource for service users with learning disabilities. It should develop as a hub from which the needs of the community can be met. The routine of getting up, preparing for and 'going to work' is beneficial to his needs and gives him a sense of normality rather than feeling different from his siblings.'</i></p> <p><i>'Professionals like doctors and social workers are experts on how to deliver health and social care needs but it is the vulnerable people themselves who are the experts of their own needs.'</i></p>

4.19

Staff issues

Two meetings were held with staff, one with management present and a further meeting with the independent consultant subsequently at the primary request of management and indirectly the Kemback Action Group.

Issues raised were on the nature of the previous decision making process and consultation, on the likely impact of any closure on service users, and on the issue of staff redeployment. The main issues for staff were the possible impact on service users, and their involvement in and understanding of issues, and the potential to ensure carer and advocacy involvement. Other issues raised on the closure proposal have been addressed above and included the suitability of building/s, costs, staffing issues, access – internal and external, and the possibility of the building being a hub for other activity or a community centre.

Issues regarding redeployment are for the Council through its human resources policy.

4.20 Group Consultations

Two group meetings were held for service users, facilitated by staff from the centre, speech therapy, and using communication tools. 21 service users took part and very positive and supportive views on the centre were shared and a loud message to 'Keep it open'. A fuller report is available on this consultation.

4.21 Continuing Education

Lifelong learning opportunities are provided by Dundee College, in their new campus building at Gardyne Road and in other inclusive settings across the City. This building is well suited to the needs of service users and offers an enriching and integrated environment for service users. Concerns were made by carers in relation to transitions within and in and out of such training and developmental opportunities.

4.22 Employment and Supported Employment

Employment and particularly supported employment has always been well developed and recognised in Dundee, having played a major part in developing national policy and practice. Currently 68 people with a learning disability are in Employment Support of 15 hours and under, and 5 in employment for 16 hours and above. Other people have successfully progressed to employment and voluntary work without support.

4.23 Advocacy and support

There has been limited advocacy support within the carers sector, and considerable support to service users through self advocacy models, built on solid foundations and reaching out into service areas and organisations. Issues raised by Advocating Together project are equity in provision across needs, potential isolation and lack of flexibility in some supported accommodation and support provision, the need for age appropriate and individual support and a concern for real employment.

4.24 Personalisation

Self Directed Support policy in Dundee has still to be fully developed, and the current consultation on Statutory Guidance on care and support is being progressed. Currently 10 service users are supported through Direct Payments and there is likely to be a rise in take up of the new approach from implementation in 2014.

4.25 Charging Policy Impact

There was some suggestion from the Carers meetings that the introduction of the Charging Policy for day support had an impact on take up of services. The Department has continued to audit the impact of charging on this group in line with eligibility criteria and service user and carer needs.

4.26 Continuity of Service

During the initial consultation regarding the closure and a move to alternative supports the Department offered a guarantee of continuity of service, and that nothing would change without a full review of individuals needs, and a carers assessment being completed.

Despite this having been explained in the original individual meetings this message appears to have been lost in the subsequent campaign but has now been explained at individual and group meetings in the current consultation.

4.27 Health Support

Health services are directly involved in supporting day support activity through the work of the joint team, and in particular by nursing and Allied Health Professional staff, speech therapists, and the specialist music and art therapists employed in the NHS team. The latter posts are unique in the view of the writer. Such support recognises the complexity of health issues faced by people with a learning disability, and the pressure on family carers. Assistance will be provided to service users during any subsequent change if necessary.

4.28 Older Service Users Needs

A significant factor in the role of current day support services in Kemback and Wellgate are the numbers of older service users, and their 'older' family carers. There are very real pressures for carers in continuing to provide care after a whole lifetime of providing such support to relatives. The role of consistent and stable day support, and of forward planning for supported accommodation is critical to the continuation of this care relationship. Care homes in general do not offer appropriate support for the age and stage of older learning disability service users. People with older carers are among the priorities in Dundee for housing with appropriate support. There has been an improvement in waiting times recently and although young people are still not always able to access housing when they need it there is significant progress despite the rise in demand as a result of private care home closures.

4.29 Other services input

Involvement of other LA services, independent and voluntary services. The Central Library has a dedicated area for users with additional support needs, with a selection of multi sensory materials; and a computer suite fitted with accessibility aids and assistive software. Other activities are provided by the Dundee Community Learning Disability Recreation Team, the Dundee Sports Team and Disability Sports, Dundee Healthy Living Initiative, and the Duke of Edinburgh Awards Group.

4.30 Evenings and weekend services/support

There was reported to be a lack of evening and weekend opportunities, and of voluntary sector supports for people with a learning disability. A number of individuals and groups noted the support from Special Olympics activity, and local drama groups, but more often there was a need to see enhanced opportunities in evenings and weekends.

4.31 Care Inspectorate Notification

The Council will require to advise the Care Inspectorate of any decision to close the resource and to advise what arrangements will be in place to ensure that users of the service will continue to receive a service which meets their individual needs and helps them achieve their outcomes. This will be greatly assisted by the Outcomes materials used during the current consultation which will enable comparison through review.

5.0 CONCLUSIONS:

5.1 Clarity of Purpose and Outcomes

A continuing theme in relation to day services/activities and opportunities is the clarity of purpose of the service. Clearly service users continue to value the services provided – and they clearly meet the Talking Points outcomes (an community care outcomes framework based on extensive research), feeling safe, having things to do, meeting people, staying as well as you can, and with change outcomes, improved confidence and morale, improved mobility and reduced symptoms. For carers the service provides Talking Points outcomes

in meeting quality of life for the cared for person, but also by maintaining the health and well being of the carer, providing for a life of their own and with known limits to choices in caring. For carers there is the potential to use their skills and expertise in partnership with services, and through positive relationships with practitioners, within flexible and responsive services.

Service users are critical of day centres as they see them limiting and hiding users needs from view in congregate services, away from the inclusion offered by alternative approaches.

The 'programmes' of centres still focus on congregate activities in the main, with a mixture of social and recreational activity, drawn from lists of potential activities, 'and there is little evidence about the outcomes achieved by different models of provision, and many forms of day service are largely unevaluated. Critically there needs to be a continuing focus on social inclusion for a marginalised group within our society' (McConkey).

Mencap (2000) argued that *"there will always be a place for building-based services – even if more of these are resource centres and most activities take place elsewhere"*. Rather the emphasis has been on defining more clearly the clientele that is served by day centres and the specific services provided by the Centre

The Mental Health Foundation (1996) proposed that centres *"should be encouraged to evolve from within, developing services tailored to the individual needs of their users.... Those who attend should be offered an individual contract with the centre, setting out the nature of the services they will receive, to be reviewed regularly."*

'It has proved very difficult to offer carers a guaranteed five-day service all year round in ways other than through attendance at the same day centre. This more than anything, may account for the resilience of the centre-based service model, especially when the views of the person with learning disability are not sought or heard.' Mencap.

5.2 **Conclusions on the Consultation**

The Council and Social Work Department have given considerable thought to, and engagement with service users and carers; both in meetings with groups and through a set of individual meetings, questionnaires and discussion with other services and organisations. Full reports on the group meetings and individual assessments/meetings have been prepared and circulated appropriately and carry more detail than that contained in this report, and will form the response from the Director of Social Work to the Chief Executive and to the Council's Committees.

A range of assistive techniques and communication aids were used to assist the consultation to enable participation and to hear and understand service user views, and a helpful focus on outcomes through the engagement process was used and which will allow tracking changes over time.

Arrangements for families to visit Wellgate have been made and 10 carers have done so with good feedback (some improvement in decoration and colour, personal care areas, and street noise reduction are recommended by carers)

There is a very clear attachment to the Kemback Street service for both service users and their families, which is in no way surprising given the length of time service users have attended and the relationship carers have with the staff and the activities. A large number of service users have attended for upwards of 15 years, with developed friendship networks and relationships with both fellow users and staff. Carers have equally strong affiliations with staff and with other families through their lifetime of caring responsibility and through their own networks.

The balance of opinion from the consultation was a strong desire to see the centre continue to function but qualified by the accepted need to see change in the nature of its activities, wider access, and opportunities. There was a strong commitment to, and

recognition of the issues which face service users in the community and of the challenges to other carers, which they felt would be exacerbated by the closure.

A smaller number of carers and service users recognised that equally there are good reasons for the Department to consider the closure of the Kemback building and a move to maximise use of capacity in the day centre service while releasing resources to invest in continuing development of new personalised services in line with national policy.

'Kemback Street Centre's existence has given service user's the stability, security and confidence to face the outside world; it has given them 'order' in their fractured world. Without places such as Kemback Street ARC service users with their complex needs will have less opportunity for social interaction and will be more likely to experience isolation, deprivation and a narrowing of their world.' **Service user's mother.**

The above report on the consultation and on the wider factors in learning disability services, and it appears that the value of the consultation has been recognised.

5.3 **Conclusions on the Department's proposal to close Kemback Street Adult Resource Centre**

The proposal to close the centre followed from a range of previous consultations within the framework of the PiP planning, which in the writer's view should have been made the closure proposal more explicit, and engaged with carers in an early and more rigorous way. This is however never easy for stakeholders, especially when a closure is proposed.

The recommendation followed from considerable analysis of current national policy, changes in local practice arising from the national policy, service user involvement and their wish for more inclusive and supportive services, and the pressures to ensure that needs and outcomes are met in line with eligibility, resources available, and best value.

The role of building based day services sits within a wider system of support including personalised housing with support, employment, volunteering, and further education opportunities. In Dundee within this system there is overcapacity in this particular building based style of service and support, for people with mild to moderate needs, while there is rising demand for alternative and equitable support for other service users needs.

The Out and About service has been easily incorporated in to existing personalised services. The proposal therefore allows for considerable funds to be released to support and to develop existing alternative and new services which should ensure equity and opportunity of access for adults requiring support within the overall structure.

The proposed move to Wellgate Centre will secure the day centre service in a suitable building which does not require significant investment for this group of service users, and which can continue to meet their needs.

Staff resources to meet the larger number of Wellgate Centre users should be carefully examined, and it will be helpful to match across some known staff during the transfer process if the proposal is agreed.

In the view of the writer the proposal to close the centre, which in the short term will be difficult for some service users, is the better option for the future development of a range of resources and opportunities for service users which will in turn assist carers in their caring role.

Adequate support for service users will allow the adjustment to be made, while continuing to access familiar activities and staff support.

RECOMMENDATIONS

- The publication of the 'keys to life' provides an opportunity to revisit and revise engagement with carers in learning disability services, and the Council and partners should use their robust User Involvement Strategy, and appropriate, inclusive and co-productive methods to further develop engagement.
- Reconfirm the Social Work Department's information and communication strategy for ongoing connection to service users and carers to inform the above activity. This would be aware of communication needs and assistive tools. The National Standards for Community Engagement provide a set of measurable performance for engagement.
- A strategy for support of older carers should be developed with the Carers Centre and Advocacy services to best support future consultation.
- A continued assets approach to future development, involving wider partnership with arts, cultural and sports organisations, the voluntary sector to develop an infrastructure for inclusive day services should be developed, using the City of Culture application as a key opportunity for future development and legacy. Services should continue to develop on an assets based approach, localising activities and support services (such as the proposed Drop in Centre and further self advocacy and involvement).
- Relationships to Community Planning regarding the issues for disability and learning disability in the wider community should be addressed (travel, access, services and activity, inclusion, health improvement and support).
- Age appropriate support needs should be specifically examined given the current use of traditional day service models.
- The Learning Disability Service should continue its approach to develop service responses based on an outcomes approach.
- In the event of a decision to close the Centre, transfer arrangements, and guarantee of continuity of service (based on agreements reached with individuals and families) should be closely managed, involving current staff (and if appropriate specialist support from health services) in the short term to help service user moves.
- Meetings dedicated to carers issues, as currently developed and used, for example, in Wellgate Centre should continue, as should dedicated focus for carers in developing the 'keys to life' strategy

Despite the difficulties arising from the consultation it has been a pleasure to work with so many people committed to learning disability services and to the needs of service users and carers. Their openness and acceptance is appreciated.

APPENDIX 1

Other Consultees

- Down's Syndrome Scotland
- Advocating Together, The Inclusion Group Dundee
- Dundee Carers Centre
- Dundee Independent Advocacy Service
- PAMIS
- Barnardo's Scotland
- NHS Learning Disability Service
- Dundee College
- Dundee City council Employment Support Service
- Education Service Future Needs Additional Support for Learning, Education
Department Dundee City Council

APPENDIX 2

Current Centre activities

Activity	Kemback	Wellgate	Activity	Kemback	Wellgate
Pampering / Nail art	X	X	Relaxation in building		X
Swimming	X	X	Help drop in		X
Newsletter group	X	X	Photography		X
Creative / art group	X	X	Snooker	X	X
All day activities		X	DIWC art group		X
DIY		X	Knitting / sewing	X	X
DIY in B&Q		X	Mini bus outing		X
Lady of Sorrows Lunch Club		X	Pool/darts/dominoes		X
Library – story telling		X	Walking group – Baxter park	X	X
Library – computers		X	Dancing / Movement & Dance	X	X
Baking		X	Chaplaincy concerts		X
Flower decorating		X	Pub group		X
Gardening		X	Gym at Douglas Sport Centre	X	
Local History		X	Yoga in centre	X	
Drumming	X	X	Canvas Art	X	
Carpet Bowling – Douglas neighbourhood centre		X	Computers in centre	X	
Film making	X	X	Finmill - Boccia	X	
Places of interest – social	X	X	Tai chi	X	
Golf		X	Zumba	X	
Bazorg		X	Current affairs	X	
Wii/xbox	X	X	Drama at Dundee Rep	X	
Relaxation – sensory room Central Baptist Church		X	Menzieshill – recreation group	X	
Kitchen group		X	Musical time	X	
Chair exercise / keep fit	X	X			
Employability/social skills		X			
Sports Group		X			
Literacy Group		X			
Brooksbank lunch club		X			
Music	X	X			

- The same as you <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/1095/0001661.pdf>
- The Keys to Life
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2013/06/112>
- SCIE Day services
<http://www.scie.org.uk/publications/guides/guide16/>
- DHSS REPORT Northern Ireland
<http://www.dhsspsni.gov.uk/auditlearningdisabilitychpt4-2.pdf>
- Talking Points.
<http://jitscotland.org.uk>