

**REPORT TO: Education Committee - 8 June 2009**

**REPORT ON: Tenders Received**

**REPORT BY: City Architectural Services Officer**

**REPORT NO: 321-2009**

## **PURPOSE OF REPORT**

This report details tenders received and requests a decision on acceptance thereof.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS**

Approval is recommended of (1) the acceptance of the tenders submitted by the undernoted contractors and (2) the undernoted total amount, including allowances, for each project:

| <b>Project Reference</b> | <b>Project</b>   | <b>Contractor</b>                       | <b>Tender Amount</b> | <b>Total Amount</b> | <b>Finance Available</b> |
|--------------------------|--|---|----------------------|---------------------|--------------------------|
| 09-7026                  | Longhaugh Primary School Annexe - Boiler Replacement                   | Taylor Mechanical Services Ltd., Dundee | £34,655.17           | £39,594.17          | £50,000.00               |
| 08-6040                  | St Lukes & St Mathews Primary School - Upgrade Kitchen/Servery Phase 2 | Dundee Contract Services                | £23,000.00           | £26,277.00          | £26,277.00               |
| 09-7025                  | Frances Wright Nursery - Boiler Replacement                            | Scan Building Services Ltd., Dundee     | £90,515.18           | £104,533.18         | £104,533.18              |
| 09-6010                  | Longhaugh Nursery School - Disabled Toilet & Electrical Upgrade        | George Martin (Builders) Ltd., Dundee   | £39,113.09           | £45,530.09          | £45,530.09               |
| 08-6042                  | St.Vincent's Primary School - Upgrade Toilet Provision                 | Dundee Contract Services                | £12,000.00           | £14,023.00          | £14,023.00               |
| 09-6011                  | Glebelands Primary School - Replacement Windows Phase 2                | Dundee Contract Services                | £43,750.00           | £49,985.00          | £50,000.00               |
| 09-6013                  | Barnhill Primary School - Servery Improvements                         | Dundee Contract Services                | £70,000.00           | £79,975.00          | £79,975.00               |
| 09-6006                  | Ancrum Road Primary School - Servery Improvements                      | Dundee Contract Services                | £37,000.00           | £42,272.00          | £42,272.00               |
| 09-6012                  | Menziesshill High School - Replacement Fire Doors                      | Dundee Contract Services                | £8,753.00            | £10,000.00          | £10,000.00               |

## **FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS**

The Head of Finance has confirmed that funding for the above projects is available as detailed on the attached sheets.

## **POLICY IMPLICATIONS**

This Report has been screened for any policy implications in respect of Sustainability, Strategic Environmental Assessment, Anti-Poverty, Equality Impact Assessment and Risk Management. Any issues are detailed on the attached sheets.

## **CONSULTATIONS**

The Client Department has been consulted with regard to policy implications and the Chief Executive, Depute Chief Executive (Support Services), Depute Chief Executive (Finance) and Head of Finance have also been consulted in the preparation of this report. Any issues are detailed on the attached sheets.

## **BACKGROUND PAPERS**

Unless stated otherwise on the attached sheets, there are no background papers.

## **FURTHER INFORMATION**

Detailed information relating to the above Tenders is included on the attached sheets.

**Rob Pedersen**  
**City Architectural Services Officer**  
**29 May 2009**

**321-2009**

**EDUCATION COMMITTEE - 8 JUNE 2009**

| CLIENT                                | Education   |                   |                | Education   |                   |  | Education   |                    |                |
|---------------------------------------|---|-------------------|----------------|---|-------------------|--|---|--------------------|----------------|
| <b>PROJECT REFERENCE</b>              | 09-7026   |                   |                | 08-6040   |                   |  | 09-7025   |                    |                |
| <b>PROJECT</b>                        | Longhaugh Primary School Annexe   |                   |                | St Lukes & St Mathews Primary School  |                   |  | Frances Wright Nursery  |                    |                |
| <b>DESCRIPTION OF WORKS</b>           | Boiler Replacement<br>The works comprise the removal of the existing boiler system and the installation of a new gas fired boiler, pipework, associated equipment and control system. |                   |                | Upgrade Kitchen/Servery Phase 2<br>The works comprise general upgrading and improvements to the layout including new equipment and some re-used equipment from redundant schools. |                   |  | Boiler Replacement<br>The works comprise the removal of the existing boiler system and the installation of a new gas fired boiler, pipework, associated equipment and control system. |                    |                |
| <b>TOTAL COST</b>                     | Several Works   | £34,655.17        |                | Several Works   | £23,000.00        |  | Several Works   | £90,515.18         |                |
|                                       | Allowances  | £4,939.00         |                | Allowances  | £3,277.00         |  | Allowances  | £14,018.00         |                |
|                                       | <b>TOTAL</b>  | <b>£39,594.17</b> |                | <b>TOTAL</b>  | <b>£26,277.00</b> |  | <b>TOTAL</b>  | <b>£104,533.18</b> |                |
| <b>FUNDING SOURCE</b>                 | Capital   |                   |                | Capital   |                   |  | Capital   |                    |                |
| <b>BUDGET PROVISION &amp; PHASING</b> | 2009/2010   | £50,000.00        |                | 2009/2010   | £26,277.00        |  | 2009/2010   | £100,000.00        |                |
| <b>ADDITIONAL FUNDING</b>             | None  |                   |                | None  |                   |  | Balance met from the overall allowances for Replacement Heating Systems in the Education Department's Capital Estimates 2009/2010.  | £4,533.18          |                |
| <b>REVENUE IMPLICATIONS</b>           | Annual capital financing costs  | £3,044.00         |                | Annual capital financing costs  | £2,020.00         |  | Annual capital financing costs  | £8,036.00          |                |
| <b>POLICY IMPLICATIONS</b>            | There are no major issues.  |                   |                | There are no major issues.  |                   |  | There are no major issues.  |                    |                |
| <b>CONSULTATIONS</b>                  | There are no major issues.  |                   |                | There are no major issues.  |                   |  | There are no major issues.  |                    |                |
| <b>TENDERS</b>                        | Four invited; four received   | <i>Received</i>   | <i>Checked</i> | Negotiated contract, not to exceed :  |                   |  | Five invited; five received   | <i>Received</i>    | <i>Checked</i> |
|                                       | 1 Taylor Mechanical Services Ltd., Dundee   | £34,648.67        | £34,655.17     | 1 Dundee Contract Services  | £23,000.00        |  | 1 Scan Building Services Ltd., Dundee   | £90,245.18         | £90,515.18     |
|                                       | 2 Jaydee Heating and Electrical, Dundee   | £34,971.00        | £35,087.00     |   |                   |  | 2 Taylor Mechanical Services Ltd., Dundee   | £92,074.53         | £92,074.53     |
|                                       | 3 Scan Building Services Ltd., Dundee   | £39,471.78        | £39,463.76     |   |                   |  | 3 Jaydee Heating and Electrical, Dundee   | £97,489.00         | £97,489.00     |
|                                       | Highest Tender  | £39,931.89        |                |   |                   |  | Highest Tender  | £125,384.50        |                |
| <b>RECOMMENDATION</b>                 | Acceptance of lowest tender   |                   |                | Acceptance of offer   |                   |  | Acceptance of lowest tender   |                    |                |
| <b>ALLOWANCES</b>                     | Professional Services   | £4,939.00         |                | Professional Services   | £3,277.00         |  | CDM Co-ordinator  | £1,119.00          |                |
|                                       |   |                   |                |   |                   |  | Professional Services   | £12,899.00         |                |
|                                       | <b>TOTAL</b>  | <b>£4,939.00</b>  |                | <b>TOTAL</b>  | <b>£3,277.00</b>  |  | <b>TOTAL</b>  | <b>£14,018.00</b>  |                |
| <b>SUB-CONTRACTORS</b>                | Angus Insulation Ltd., Montrose   | Insulation        |                | None  |                   |  | Angus Insulation Ltd., Montrose   | Insulation         |                |
|                                       | Bruce Jamieson Electrical Contractors, Dundee   | Electrical Work   |                |   |                   |  | Bruce Jamieson Electrical Contractors, Dundee   | Electrical Work    |                |
|                                       | MCE Scotland Ltd., Dundee   | Controls          |                |   |                   |  | MCE Scotland Ltd., Dundee   | Controls           |                |
|                                       | RG Cumming, Dundee  | Painterwork       |                |   |                   |  | JRF Chimneys Ltd., Glenrothes   | Flue System        |                |
|                                       | Land & Building Services Ltd., Dundee   | Builderwork       |                |   |                   |  |   |                    |                |
|                                       | ADT Fire & Security, Dundee   | Alarm Work        |                |   |                   |  |   |                    |                |
| <b>BACKGROUND PAPERS</b>              | None  |                   |                | None  |                   |  | None  |                    |                |

**EDUCATION COMMITTEE - 8 JUNE 2009**

| CLIENT   | Education  |                   |                | Education   |                   |  | Education  |                   |  |
|--|--|-------------------|----------------|---|-------------------|--|--|-------------------|--|
| <b>PROJECT REFERENCE</b><br><b>PROJECT</b>                     | 09-6010<br>Longhaugh Nursery School  |                   |                | 08-6042<br>St.Vincent's Primary School  |                   |  | 09-6011<br>Glebelands Primary School   |                   |  |
| <b>DESCRIPTION OF WORKS</b>                                    | Disabled Toilet & Electrical Upgrade<br>The works comprise the provision of a front entrance access ramp with new automatic door and entrance screens. Also includes a new disabled toilet facility and a new separate WC facility.                    |                   |                | Upgrade Toilet Provision<br>The works comprise the provision of a disabled toilet facility in the school. |                   |  | Replacement Windows Phase 2<br>The works comprise the replacement of existing windows to several classrooms in the school. |                   |  |
| <b>TOTAL COST</b>  | Several Works  | £39,113.09        |                | Several Works   | £12,000.00        |  | Several Works  | £43,750.00        |  |
|  | Allowances   | £6,417.00         |                | Allowances  | £2,023.00         |  | Allowances   | £6,235.00         |  |
|  | <b>TOTAL</b>   | <b>£45,530.09</b> |                | <b>TOTAL</b>  | <b>£14,023.00</b> |  | <b>TOTAL</b>   | <b>£49,985.00</b> |  |
| <b>FUNDING SOURCE</b><br><b>BUDGET PROVISION &amp; PHASING</b> | Capital<br>2009/2010   | £18,875.00        |                | Capital<br>2009/2010  | £14,023.00        |  | Capital<br>2009/2010   | £50,000.00        |  |
| <b>ADDITIONAL FUNDING</b>                                      | Balance met from the Education Department's Revenue Budget (Accessibility & Early Years)   | £26,655.09        |                | None  |                   |  | None   |                   |  |
| <b>REVENUE IMPLICATIONS</b>                                    | Annual capital financing costs   | £1,757.00         |                | Annual capital financing costs  | £1,306.00         |  | Annual capital financing costs   | £3,371.00         |  |
| <b>POLICY IMPLICATIONS</b>                                     | There are no major issues.   |                   |                | There are no major issues.  |                   |  | There are no major issues.   |                   |  |
| <b>CONSULTATIONS</b>   | There are no major issues.   |                   |                | There are no major issues.  |                   |  | There are no major issues.   |                   |  |
| <b>TENDERS</b>   | Four invited; four received  | <i>Received</i>   | <i>Checked</i> | Negotiated contract, not to exceed :  |                   |  | Partnering project :   |                   |  |
|  | 1 Muirfield (Contracts) Ltd., Dundee   | £30,090.47        | £30,124.97     | 1 Dundee Contract Services  | £12,000.00        |  | 1 Dundee Contract Services   | £43,750.00        |  |
|  | 2 George Martin (Builders) Ltd., Dundee  | £39,113.09        | £39,113.09     |   |                   |  |  |                   |  |
|  | 3 Alexander Oastler Ltd., Dundee   | £40,918.55        | £40,918.55     |   |                   |  |  |                   |  |
|  | Highest Tender   | £42,971.77        |                |   |                   |  |  |                   |  |
| <b>RECOMMENDATION</b>  | The lowest tender was examined in detail and errors in pricing were discovered. The contractor declined to stand by his offer and therefore it is recommended that the lowest valid tender is accepted, that of George Martin (Builders) Ltd., Dundee. |                   |                | Acceptance of offer   |                   |  | Acceptance of offer  |                   |  |
| <b>ALLOWANCES</b>  | Building Warrant   | £520.00           |                | Professional Services   | £2,023.00         |  | Professional Services  | £6,235.00         |  |
|  | Professional Services  | £5,897.00         |                |   |                   |  |  |                   |  |
|  | <b>TOTAL</b>   | <b>£6,417.00</b>  |                | <b>TOTAL</b>  | <b>£2,023.00</b>  |  | <b>TOTAL</b>   | <b>£6,235.00</b>  |  |
| <b>SUB-CONTRACTORS</b>   | CARE Ltd., Dundee  | Electrical Work   |                | None  |                   |  | None   |                   |  |
| <b>BACKGROUND PAPERS</b>                                       | None   |                   |                | None  |                   |  | None   |                   |  |

**EDUCATION COMMITTEE - 8 JUNE 2009**

| CLIENT   | Education  | Education  | Education   |
|--|--|--|---|
| <b>PROJECT REFERENCE</b><br><b>PROJECT</b>                     | 09-6013<br>Barnhill Primary School   | 09-6006<br>Ancrum Road Primary School  | 09-6012<br>Menzieshill High School  |
| <b>DESCRIPTION OF WORKS</b>                                    | Servery Improvements<br>The works comprise general upgrading and improvements to the layout including new equipment and some re-used equipment from redundant schools. | Servery Improvements<br>The works comprise general upgrading and improvements to the layout including new equipment and some re-used equipment from redundant schools. | Replacement Fire Doors<br>The works comprise the replacement of existing fire doors including re-use of existing ironmongery and associated alarm system. |
| <b>TOTAL COST</b>  | Several Works £70,000.00<br>Allowances £9,975.00<br><b>TOTAL</b> £79,975.00  | Several Works £37,000.00<br>Allowances £5,272.00<br><b>TOTAL</b> £42,272.00  | Several Works £8,753.00<br>Allowances £1,247.00<br><b>TOTAL</b> £10,000.00  |
| <b>FUNDING SOURCE</b><br><b>BUDGET PROVISION &amp; PHASING</b> | Capital<br>2009/2010 £79,975.00  | Capital<br>2009/2010 £42,272.00  | Capital<br>2009/2010 £10,000.00   |
| <b>ADDITIONAL FUNDING</b>                                      | None   | None   | None  |
| <b>REVENUE IMPLICATIONS</b>                                    | Annual capital financing costs £6,148.00   | Annual capital financing costs £3,250.00   | Annual capital financing costs £769.00  |
| <b>POLICY IMPLICATIONS</b>                                     | There are no major issues.   | There are no major issues.   | There are no major issues.  |
| <b>CONSULTATIONS</b>   | There are no major issues.   | There are no major issues.   | There are no major issues.  |
| <b>TENDERS</b>   | Negotiated contract, not to exceed :<br><br>1 Dundee Contract Services £70,000.00  | Negotiated contract, not to exceed :<br><br>1 Dundee Contract Services £37,000.00  | Property Maintenance and Small Works Partnership, cost estimated :<br><br>1 Dundee Contract Services £8,753.00  |
| <b>RECOMMENDATION</b>  | Acceptance of offer  | Acceptance of offer  | Acceptance  |
| <b>ALLOWANCES</b>  | Professional Services £9,975.00<br><br><b>TOTAL</b> £9,975.00  | Professional Services £5,272.00<br><br><b>TOTAL</b> £5,272.00  | Professional Services £1,247.00<br><br><b>TOTAL</b> £1,247.00   |
| <b>SUB-CONTRACTORS</b>   | None   | None   | None  |
| <b>BACKGROUND PAPERS</b>                                       | None   | None   | None  |