

**REPORT TO: EDUCATION COMMITTEE–24 JUNE 2013**

**REPORT ON: SCHOOL ESTATE IMPROVEMENTS IN THE MENZIESHILL AREA OF THE CITY - OUTCOME OF THE FORMAL CONSULTATION PROCESS**

**REPORT BY: DIRECTOR OF EDUCATION**

**REPORT NO: 286-2013**

## **1.0 PURPOSE OF REPORT**

- 1.1 This report details the representations made during the formal publication and consultation exercise on the above proposal and recommends that the Council proceeds with the proposal.

## **2.0 RECOMMENDATION**

- 2.1 It is recommended that the Committee approves the proposal to discontinue Hillside and Gowriehill Primary Schools and build a new 3 stream primary school incorporating a nursery provision to replace Menzieshill Nursery School.

## **3.0 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS**

- 3.1 The financial implications are as set out in Report 445-2012, "Menzieshill – New Primary School and Nursery School and Options for Menzieshill Community Centre".

## **4.0 BACKGROUND**

- 4.1.1 At its meeting of 26 November 2012, the Education Committee approved the report entitled "Menzieshill – New Primary School and Nursery School and Options for Menzieshill Community Centre " and agreed (inter alia) to remit the Director of Education to carry out the statutory consultation procedures in terms of the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010 in respect of the proposal to discontinue Hillside and Gowriehill Primary Schools and build a new 3 stream primary school incorporating a nursery provision to replace Menzieshill Nursery School. The new primary school and nursery school will be on a shared site and will have separate entrance areas. (Report No 445-2012 refers).
- 4.1.2 The proposal was advertised in the "Evening Telegraph" on Monday 28 January 2013 and all the statutory consultees received a copy of the consultation document on that date. An additional advertisement was placed in the "Evening Telegraph" on 18 February 2013 to provide notification that the closing date for the consultation had been extended to 14 March 2013. All statutory consultees received a letter to advise them of the extension to the consultation period.
- 4.1.3 A consultation meeting for parents/carers of pupils at Gowriehill Primary School, Hillside Primary School and Menzieshill Nursery School was held on the evenings of Tuesday 19 February, Wednesday 20 February and Thursday 21 February 2013 respectively. A meeting was also held for all staff at each school on those dates at the end of the school day. In addition all Parent Councils and Trade Union Representatives were consulted.
- 4.1.4 A copy of the consultation report is attached as Appendix 1, a copy of the report by Education Scotland is attached as Appendix 2 and copies of the notes of the meetings held during the consultation period are attached as Appendix 3.

## **5.0 APPROVAL OF THE PROPOSAL**

- 5.1 With regard to Gowriehill Primary School, the proposal was well supported by the staff and Parent Council. The vast majority of the parents/carers supported the proposal in principle.
- 5.2 With regard to Hillside Primary School, staff, Parent Council and parents/carers were largely supportive of the proposal, although a small number of parents expressed the view that the proposal was not a positive development for Hillside Primary School.
- 5.3 With regard to Menzieshill Nursery, a few parents and staff were largely supportive of the proposal. A few parents expressed reservations about the move to the proposed new site.

## **6.0 CATCHMENT AREAS FOR THE NEW SCHOOLS**

- 6.1 The catchment areas for Gowriehill and Hillside Primary Schools will remain as they are at present. The Director of Education will, as is normal practice across the City, keep these catchment areas under review.

## **7.0 POLICY IMPLICATIONS**

- 7.1 This Report has been screened for any policy implications in respect of Sustainability, Strategic Environmental Assessment, Anti-Poverty, Equality Impact Assessment and Risk Management. An Equality Impact Assessment has been carried out and is attached to this report.

## **8.0 CONSULTATIONS**

- 8.1 The Chief Executive, Director of Corporate Services, Head of Democratic and Legal Services have been consulted in the preparation of this report.

## **9.0 BACKGROUND PAPERS**

- 9.1 None.

MICHAEL WOOD  
Director of Education

12 June 2013

## DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL

## CONSULTATION REPORT

**TO DISCONTINUE HILLSIDE AND GOWRIEHILL PRIMARY SCHOOLS AND BUILD A NEW 3 STREAM PRIMARY SCHOOL INCORPORATING A NURSERY PROVISION TO REPLACE MENZIESHILL NURSERY SCHOOL**

This Consultation Report is available on the Dundee City Council website - [www.dundee.gov.uk/education](http://www.dundee.gov.uk/education) - and also in printed form from the following locations: Customer Services Reception Area, Dundee House; Gowriehill Primary School; Hillside Primary School; and Menzieshill Nursery School.

**1.0 BACKGROUND**

- 1.1 At its meeting on 26 November 2012, the Education and Policy & Resources Committees approved the report entitled 'to discontinue Hillside and Gowriehill Primary Schools and build a new 3 stream primary school incorporating a provision to replace Menzieshill Nursery School' (Report No 446-2012 refers). The committees instructed the Director of Education to formally consult on the proposal in terms of the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010 and report back to Committee in due course on the outcome of the consultations so that a final decision on the proposals could be made.
- 1.2 The proposal was to build a new 3 stream primary school incorporating a nursery provision to replace Menzieshill Nursery School. The new primary school and nursery school will be on a shared site and will have separate entrance areas. There is an identified need to provide new accommodation to replace Hillside Primary School, Gowriehill Primary School and Menzieshill Nursery School. The existing buildings are more than 30 years old and as a result, significant sums of money would require to be spent to keep them at a reasonable standard.

The project roll trend for Gowriehill is decreasing. Currently Gowriehill Primary School has a school roll of 130 pupils. This is an occupancy rate of 32%. The number of pupils who attend Gowriehill Primary School and live outwith the designated catchment area is 60.

Hillside Primary School has a current roll of 295. It has an occupancy rate of 80%. The number of pupils who attend Hillside Primary School and live outwith the designated catchment area is 186. Neither school has nursery provision. The nursery provision within the Menzieshill area is contained within Menzieshill Nursery and St Ninian's Primary School. Menzieshill Nursery School provides 70FTE places.

- 1.3 A number of educational benefits were identified within the proposals:
- The new school and pre-school centre will offer purpose-built learning and teaching environments for the delivery of a "Curriculum for Excellence" as well as providing state of the art nursery facilities.
  - The new build programme would replace traditional buildings with 21<sup>st</sup> Century accommodation. It would be designed to ensure improved vehicular access; would minimise capital costs by replacing three old buildings with one new build; would be more energy efficient; and would improve our carbon footprint.
  - The campus arrangement will provide quality facilities to promote physical education within the building and in the playground area. This will include a gym and mixture of hard and soft play areas to ensure that pupils can experience two hours of physical education each week regardless of the weather conditions. The nursery would have a secure playground area as well as access to the school's facilities.

- The new nursery accommodation will be access friendly to meet the needs of all children including those with restricted mobility. It will include well planned and secure outdoor play facilities.
- Pupils moving from nursery to primary one will benefit from enhanced transition links from nursery to primary one.
- The new primary and nursery school would enable the Education Department to provide future-proofed IT infrastructure to support and enhance curricular management facilities.

1.4 A number of additional considerations led to the proposal for a new 3 stream primary school incorporating a number provision.

- Road safety will be a priority in the area around the new site to ensure the safety of children and pupils and to promote ease of access. Road layouts and parking arrangements will be designed to reflect the road safety needs of users and to ensure that there are designated areas for dropping children and pupils off or picking them up.
- This proposal will benefit those children and pupils of Hillside and Gowriehill Primary Schools and Menzieshill Nursery School who have additional support needs in particular.
- Accommodation will be designed to ensure greater space and flexibility.
- The new builds will provide improved disabled access and internal lifts if required.
- Children and pupils, particularly on the autistic spectrum, will benefit from the availability of a number of break out rooms to facilitate individual and small group work as well as quieter activities.
- Pupils in Gowriehill and Hillside Primary Schools will continue to benefit from the provision of a breakfast and out of school club in Menzieshill Community Centre. Consultation is taking place with Menzieshill Out of School Care Club to agree the most relevant setting in the future. Discussion opportunities exist to include a breakfast club and an out of school club within the new school.

1.5 As a result the Director of Education was remitted to carry out the consultation procedures in terms of the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010 in respect of this proposal. The consultation programme is detailed in paragraph 2.1 below, and a summary of the main issues raised is set out in section 3.0.

1.6 A report from Education Scotland is required under the terms of the Act to address the educational aspects of the proposal. The report is attached as Appendix 1. The report states that,  
 “Dundee City Council’s proposal to discontinue education provision at Hillside and Gowriehill Primary Schools and Menzieshill Nursery School and build a new three stream primary school incorporating nursery provision offers clear benefits to the children in this area. The new build provision will facilitate the delivery of high-quality education and meet the requirements of Curriculum for Excellence better. Positive relationships and the sharing of practice across all three establishments offers potential benefits to the whole school community. Most stakeholders are positive about the proposal.”

The report concludes that,  
 “the council needs to consider what further reassurance it can provide in response to stakeholders’ concerns about location of the school, particularly the entrance, about green space, about traffic management and about staffing and staff accommodation plans for the new campus.”

1.7 The Director of Education has considered carefully the HMIE report and its implications, in particular where the report highlights specific issues raised during the consultation period. It is to be noted that the report recognises the potential benefits that will accrue from the proposed move and the positive nature of the overall responses. Having reviewed the proposal in the light of the representations and the Education Scotland (HMIE) report, it is clear that many of the highlighted issues were identified in the proposal or are referred to directly in this consultation report. The establishment of a Project Board to oversee the development of the new campus model will include representation from staff, pupils and parents and will ensure their direct contribution from the concept design stage through to the project completion. This will reflect and address issues raised in relation to the nature of the

accommodation and the design brief; the provision of quality outdoor play areas; parking and travel arrangements; the management of shared facilities and the need to preserve and maintain the unique identity of each establishment.

## 2.0 CONSULTATION

2.1 The formal consultation procedure included:

- the preparation of a Proposal Paper (28 January 2013) included with a letter to the parents/carers of young people at Gowriehill Primary School, Hillside Primary School and Menzieshill Nursery School, and to the staff of the three schools;
- information, including the Proposal Paper, was placed on Dundee City Council's website;
- an announcement of the original proposal in the local press (28 January) and of the revised consultation closing date (18 February);
- an invitation to any person to make written representation to the Director of Education;
- public meetings in the three schools (19, 20 and 21 February);
- meetings with the Parent Councils of Gowriehill Primary School (19 February), Hillside Primary School (20 February) and Menzieshill Nursery School (21 February);
- meetings with the staff of the three schools (19,20 and 21 February);
- meeting with pupils of Hillside Primary School (25 February);
- consultation with representatives of the teacher and support staff trade unions; and
- meeting with other interested body, such as Lochee Local Community Planning Partnership (19 February).

2.2 A summary of written responses is set out in Section 3.0.

2.3 A summary of oral representations received, collated as a list of 'Frequently Asked Questions/Comments', is attached as Appendix 2, and the Department's responses have been added.

2.4 In accordance with the Schools Consultation (Scotland) Act 2010 copies of all written representations and 'Frequently Asked Questions/Comments' were required to be submitted to HMLe for their consideration in the preparation of their report.

## 3.0 MAIN ISSUES ARISING FROM THE CONSULTATION, WITH RESPONSES

3.1 11 written representation were received in total on the proposal during the consultation period. Of the 11 written representations 3 were totally in favour of the proposal.

3.2 Road Safety and Safe Access for Pedestrians were highlighted as important areas to be addressed as part of the review programme. *Road safety will be designed in the area around the new shared campus to ensure ease of access for pupils and vehicles. This will be essential to ensure the safety of children and pupils attending the new nursery provision and primary school. There will be a comprehensive review of traffic movement round the site of the new campus. A travel to school plan will be developed with pupils and parents to determine safe routes to school. In addition, a review will be carried out to ensure crossing patrollers are based in the correct location.*

3.3 Size of Site and Adequate Green Space was highlighted as an improvement area to be addressed. *The size of the proposed site is significantly larger so outdoor space and play areas are not an issue. Parents, staff and pupils will be actively involved in shaping the design of the new school and nursery.*

3.4 Why is Menzieshill High School not included? *Menzieshill High School is not included because there is a finite budget and the build costs for a new secondary school would far exceed the cost of the proposed primary and nursery build.*

- 3.5 Questions were asked about school capacity and calculation of primary school capacity. *The Schools General (Scotland) Regulations 1975 state that 'each authority shall determine from time to time the maximum number of pupils which may be suitable accommodated in each room to which the regulation applies'. The Strathclyde formula of 1.7 m<sup>2</sup> per pupil in all teaching spaces was originally used until it was reviewed recently. Please note that it is the 'working capacity' that is used not the 'planning capacity' as this is only used for rateable value calculations.*

**For Working Capacity:** \* Working capacity is a measure of the efficiency of the use of education areas for classroom use. This is based on Primary 1 having a maximum pupil size of 25 pupils, Primary 2-3 30 pupils and Primary 4-7 and other additional classrooms 33 pupils. Total educational areas should exclude areas not used for class teaching i.e. small units, EHP nursery classrooms etc.

**For Planning Capacity:** Planning capacity is a measure of all education areas that were the original design intent i.e. including small units, enhanced provision, SEN, and in some cases learning support accommodation. The classroom occupancy is 33 pupils or the classroom area / 1.7m<sup>2</sup> Total education areas should include ancillary accommodation i.e. small unit but exclude nursery classrooms.

School capacities are calculated in the same way for every school but the Enhanced Provision classrooms are removed from the calculation since the number of pupils in such provision is normally less than would be the case if the classroom was being used by a mainstream class.

- 3.6 Why was St Ninian's not included as an additional school in the campus arrangement? *The focus for consultation does not include St Ninian's Primary School for a number of reasons:*
- *St Ninian's Primary School has a roll of 147 pupils and has a current occupancy level of 60%. It also has a nursery provision to accommodate 20 children each morning and afternoon session. There is further scope to extend the current level of nursery provision to cater for the rising number of pre-school children and the proposed increase in the number of nursery hours from 450 to 600 from August 2014.*
  - *A section of the existing school building is used to provide a base and office accommodation for Dundee Educational Psychology Service.*
  - *The inclusion of an additional school as part of the campus arrangements would have significantly increased the number of nursery children and pupils using the site. Given the denominational status of St Ninian's Primary School it would have increased the footprint and cost of the building programme.*
- 3.7 Questions were raised about the proposal being driven by financial savings rather than for educational and welfare benefits. *The current position in terms of school rolls and condition in the Hillside and Menziesshill area provides an opportunity to create a new build school and nursery of a high standard. In terms of cost effectiveness, it is clear there are financial efficiencies to be made when operating one building as opposed to three separate establishments with three sets of cleaning staff, janitorial staff, catering staff, energy costs and rateable values.*
- 3.8 A question was raised about the future of the existing Hillside site if the proposal goes ahead. *If the proposal is successful the land will return to the City Development Department. In every case so far the old school has been demolished and the site cleared to avoid the potential for vandalism.*
- 3.9 Has a study been undertaken as to the disposal value for the current hillside site? *There has been no study as to the disposal value for the current site. This would not be appropriate given that no decision has been taken on the future of school.*
- 3.10 Clarification was sought regarding upper and lower pupil number range for two and three stream schools. *There would be no lower limits on a school because the school roll at any given time may well be below the capacity figure. The upper limit would be based on the classes within the schools and reflect issues such as the classrooms to be used and numbers*

required for the enhanced provision. In normal circumstances the roll for a single stream school would be based on the classroom regulations relating to class size maximum of 25 pupils (P1), 30 pupils (P2 and P3) and 33 pupils (P4-P7). This would be in theory tripled for a three stream school. There is also the issue that a composite class can only have a maximum of 25 pupils. Within a new school building it would be possible to create accommodation for 3 x P1-P7 streams and include the enhanced provision as an additionality. Additionality for general purposes room(s), library and IT suite have also to be factored in.

- 3.11 A question was raised about future plans to refurbish or replace St Ninian's. At this point in time there are no plans to refurbish or replace St Ninian's.
- 3.12 Has consideration been given to the possibility of an increase in housing around Menzieshill and therefore the projected increase in school population. This will depend on the number and type of properties to be built, the timescale for completion given current market conditions and the age range of children in the families. In addition, the number of children who are enrolled as a result of placing request is an unknown quantity.
- 3.13 Has DCC costed the renewal and disposal of asbestos from Hillside Primary School. DCC has not costed the removal and disposal of asbestos from Hillside Primary School. This could not be done until the scale and extend had been assessed.
- 3.14 Clarification was sought regarding assessment of the physical condition of DCC schools. All school buildings are regularly inspections – these include:
- annual property inspections
  - structural surveys
  - fire risk assessments
  - accessibility audits
  - insurance surveys
  - maintenance contractor service reports ie fire alarms, emergency lighting, boiler services, gas soundness testing etc
  - asbestos surveys
  - water hygiene controls and log entries
  - fixed elected inspection and report
  - HMI reports
- 3.15 Why was the current Hillside site not considered for the building of the new school? The option being presented is considered to be the most effective one for the Menzieshill area for the reasons outlined in the proposal. DCC has a responsibility to maintain an overview of the school estate across the city and to ensure that the learning environment for children and young people are of the highest possible standard.

#### **4.0 THE SCHOOL PREMISES (GENERAL REQUIREMENTS AND STANDARDS) (SCOTLAND) REGULATIONS 1967**

- 4.1 The proposal meets the requirements of the above Act, and accordingly the Director of Education is not required to apply to Scottish Ministers for dispensation from the standards.

MICHAEL WOOD  
DIRECTOR OF EDUCATION

17 April 2013

## CONSULTATION PROPOSAL BY DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL

### REPORT BY EDUCATION SCOTLAND, ADDRESSING EDUCATIONAL ASPECTS OF THE PROPOSAL TO DISCONTINUE HILLSIDE PRIMARY SCHOOL AND GOWRIEHILL PRIMARY SCHOOL AND BUILD A NEW THREE STREAM PRIMARY SCHOOL, INCORPORATING NURSERY PROVISION, TO REPLACE MENZIESHILL NURSERY SCHOOL

#### 1. Introduction

- 1.1 Dundee City Council proposes to discontinue education provision at Hillside and Gowriehill Primary Schools and Menzieshill Nursery School and build a new three stream primary school incorporating nursery provision. The new primary school and nursery school will be on a shared site but will have separate entrance areas.
- 1.2 The report from Education Scotland is required under the terms of the *Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010*. It has been prepared by HM Inspectors in accordance with the terms of the Act.
- 1.3 HM Inspectors undertook the following activities in considering the educational aspects of the proposal:
- attendance at the public meeting held on Thursday 22 February 2013 in connection with the council's proposals;
  - consideration of all relevant documentation provided by the council in relation to the proposal, specifically the educational benefits statement and related consultation documents, written and oral submissions from parents and others;
  - consideration of further representations made directly to Education Scotland on relevant educational aspects of the proposal;
  - consideration of further information on all schools affected; and
  - visits to the site of Hillside Primary School, Gowriehill Primary School and Menzieshill Nursery School, including discussion with relevant consultees.
- 1.4 HM Inspectors considered:
- the likely effects of the proposal for children of the two primary schools and the nursery school; any other users; children likely to become pupils within two years of the date of publication of the proposal paper; and other children and young people in the council area;
  - any other likely effects of the proposal;
  - how the council intends to minimise or avoid any adverse effects that may arise from the proposal; and
  - benefits which the council believes will result from implementation of the proposal, and the council's reasons for coming to these beliefs.

#### 2. Consultation process

- 2.1 Dundee City Council undertook the initial consultation on its proposals with reference to the *Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010*. The consultation included an invitation for written submissions and a public meeting held at Gowriehill Primary School on 19 February 2013, Hillside Primary School on 21 February 2013 and Menzieshill Nursery school on 22 February 2013. The council consulted pupils and staff in all three establishments. Information, including the proposal paper, was placed on the council website. Consultation also took place with representatives of the relevant staff trade unions. Meetings took place with other interested bodies such as the local Community Planning Partnership.
- 2.2 Those attending the public meeting and the small number who responded to the council in writing as part of the consultation process, raised a number of concerns in relation to the proposal. These related to uncertainties around staffing in the new school, accommodation



for children with additional support needs in the enhanced provision of both primary schools, the location of the new school and traffic management and road safety.

- 2.3 Overall, staff from Menzieshill Nursery School, Hillside Primary School and Gowriehill Primary School are positive about the proposal. They feel that the new provision will offer a number of benefits, especially in relation to the enhanced facilities and available space in the new building. They are also positive about the opportunities the proposed campus will offer for improved transition from nursery into P1 and the early years as a whole. Staff from all three establishments are very positive about the wider range of staff skills and resources that will be available, and of benefit to children in the new school and their parents.
- 2.4 Staff are keen to build on the positive reputation in the community of all three establishments. All three have good garden areas which are well used by children and staff. Staff in all three establishments wish to ensure that green space is included in the plans for the new school, in order that they may build on the progress made to date in developing outdoor learning.
- 2.5 Staff are concerned about job security due to duplication of resources. The Leisure Services managers in both Hillside Primary School and Gowriehill Primary School live in accommodation on the site of the schools which would be demolished under this proposal. Currently, the managers are unclear what will happen to this accommodation and therefore, how the proposal will affect their accommodation arrangements.
- 2.6 Staff in the enhanced provision in both primary schools are keen to ensure that they are consulted over the accommodation requirements of the children with additional support needs. They are positive, however, that purpose-built accommodation will be an asset for these children, providing much needed space, break out rooms and the opportunity to integrate into mainstream classes, as appropriate.
- 2.7 A few staff are concerned about staffing, and the status of current staff, in the new school. Staff would appreciate greater clarity over staffing plans for the new campus.
- 2.8 Staff and parents in all three establishments note concerns over traffic management. Their concerns include the proximity to a busy road and narrow streets surrounding the proposed school which are already congested with hospital parking. The council is aware of this issue and is committed to addressing these concerns. They note that road layout around the new site will be planned to emphasise safe access and egress for pedestrians and drivers. School crossing patrols will be provided to ensure safety on the main roads. A full School Access Strategy will be developed which will look at a range of safety issues.
- 2.9 Staff from both primary schools have raised reasonable concerns about the impact of the proximity of a busy public house and chemist and the number of people who may be using these establishments, on the safety of children. They feel that this could be overcome by the appropriate location of the main entrance to the school.
- 2.10 Overall, most parents from Hillside Primary School are very positive about the proposed move to a new building. A few parents feel strongly that other sites have not been given due consideration. They are concerned about the size and location of the proposed new school. A few feel that the distance to travel to the campus, taking into consideration the busy roads, will be difficult for some, particularly those at the furthest away points of the catchment area.

### **3. Educational aspects of the proposal**

- 3.1 Dundee City Council sets out a number of potential educational benefits in its formal proposal documentation. The three buildings of Hillside Primary School, Gowriehill Primary School and Menzieshill Nursery School are showing deterioration consistent with their construction date and use. Both Gowriehill and Hillside Primary Schools are almost 50 years old. Menzieshill Nursery School is over 30 years old. The education authority has provided estimated costings for maintaining the three establishments. Major capital works would be required over the medium to long term to keep the schools operational, with consequential disruptive effects on education provision. The heating and ventilation system in all three establishments need

constant repair. The council has set out how it can make savings which would make funding available to contribute to the cost of the new build proposal. Children in all three establishments will benefit from greatly improved and energy efficient accommodation which is better suited to teaching and learning in the 21<sup>st</sup> century.

- 3.2 The educational benefits statement clearly describes how the proposal will support the delivery of Curriculum for Excellence. There is currently no pre-school provision in either Hillside Primary School or Gowriehill Primary School. The location of Menzieshill Nursery School on the same campus has the potential to improve meaningful liaison across the early level of Curriculum for Excellence from nursery to Primary 1. Staff across the early stages and beyond will be able to work together, sharing ideas and expertise.
- 3.3 The new purpose-built nursery will include more spacious indoor and outdoor play areas. A dedicated outdoor play area will be created for pre-school children. The new primary school building will have quality facilities to promote physical education within the building and in the playground areas, thereby enabling staff to provide two hours of quality physical education per week in all weathers.
- 3.4 Pupils will benefit from the inclusion of a breakfast club and an out-of-school club and will no longer be required to travel to and from Menzieshill Community Centre to access these services.
- 3.5 The new primary and nursery campus would enable the education department to provide a more appropriate information and communications technology structure to support and enhance the curriculum, as well as supporting aspects of school management.
- 3.6 The proposal sets out clearly how children with additional support needs would be supported more effectively by having more flexible accommodation, providing quiet areas and breakout rooms to facilitate individual and group work.
- 3.7 The proposed campus would achieve significant financial savings to the council at a time when all councils have to seek efficiencies. Moreover, by reducing the annual expenditure of maintaining school buildings which will continue to deteriorate, the council will be able to use the financial savings to contribute to the overall benefit of children and young people elsewhere in the city.
- 3.8 The completion date for the new campus is 2016 therefore there will be no impact on children enrolling over the next two years. Children not yet attending primary school but due to start in Primary 1 in August 2013 will begin their education in the existing accommodation and, if the proposal goes ahead, will move to the new campus in 2016.
- 3.9 Other users in the community will benefit from the facilities on offer on the new campus. The accommodation will house facilities such as meeting rooms which will enhance parental and community partnership.

#### **4. Summary**

Dundee City Council's consultation process has allowed all stakeholders to express their views and have them considered. The council's proposal to discontinue education provision at Hillside and Gowriehill Primary Schools and Menzieshill Nursery School and build a new three stream primary school incorporating nursery provision offers clear benefits to the children in this area. The new build provision will facilitate the delivery of high-quality education and meet the requirements of Curriculum for Excellence better. The long term savings have the potential to benefit the educational experience of all children in the city. Positive relationships and the sharing of practice across all three establishments offers potential benefits to the whole school community. Most stakeholders are positive about the proposal.

At this point, the council needs to consider what further reassurance it can provide in response to stakeholders' concerns about location of the school, particularly the entrance,

about green space, about traffic management and about staffing and staff accommodation plans for the new campus.

**HM Inspectors  
Education Scotland  
March 2013**

**DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL EDUCATION DEPARTMENT  
SCHOOLS CONSULTATION (SCOTLAND) ACT 2010**

**FORMAL CONSULTATION ON THE PROPOSAL TO DISCONTINUE HILLSIDE AND  
GOWRIEHILL PRIMARY SCHOOLS AND BUILD A NEW 3 STREAM PRIMARY SCHOOL  
INCORPORATING A NURSERY PROVISION TO REPLACE MENZIESHILL NURSERY SCHOOL**

**RECORD OF MEETING WITH GOWRIEHILL PRIMARY SCHOOL PARENT COUNCIL - TUESDAY  
19 FEBRUARY 2013 AT 6.00PM**

**Present:** Lina Waghorn, Head of Education, (Pre-school, Primary, Communications and Culture), Lorna Ferry, Acting Education Manager, (Recorder), Head Teacher, Principal Teacher, Parental Involvement Officer and 3 members of Parent Council.

Lina outlined the reasons for the proposal. Gowriehill Primary School roll is falling and this number encompasses placing requests. There is an annual Review of school estate which looks at state of building, short and long term repair, capacity roll. There is a wish to replace all old schools over time. Consideration is given to the projected needs of the area and to the current establishments.

Lina repeated the proposal which has not changed from the informal proposal. The merged school and the nursery are separate settings in one building but can work together as appropriate. There will be individual offices, drop-off areas, etc. Benefits include location of Breakfast Club and Out of School Care Club and nursery. The new building will be more eco-friendly and will have facilities such as gym hall, toilets, staffroom etc. Nursery -> P1 transition will be facilitated.

She outlined the consultation process and the purpose of the present meeting within that process. She explained that at the end of the formal consultation all comments are collated and prepared for Education Scotland before being put forward to Education Committee, 27 May 2013, for decision. She indicated the desired timeframe which is proposed as an entry date for the new school of August 2016. It takes time to plan, tender and build and then time for staff and pupils to plan together.

**Comment**

It is felt that Hillside stakeholders want to stay on their own site. The Parent Council feel somewhat insulted by recent press articles. The Parent Council feel that the opposition is unfounded. It is felt that a new school will help with the regeneration of the area.

**Q** Which site has been identified?

**A** The site has been identified. A map was provided for clarification.

**Q** Why is St Ninian's RC Primary School not included?

**A** There was not room for a school of over 400, a nursery and a denominational school. It is more effective to merge the two primary schools and build a new nursery on the shared campus.

**Q** What about staff ratios?

**A** The Head Teacher post will be negotiated or interviewed. Staff will be allocated as per staffing guidance.

**Q** Is it a 'done deal' – if opposers dig their heels in, will a new school be built elsewhere?

**A** The collated comments will be considered in a balanced way.

**Q** Are there plans to make children attend their catchment school rather than Placing Requests?

**A** Lina explained the current process. She confirmed that all pupils who currently attend Hillside and Gowriehill will be considered as Priority 1 for the new school.

**Q** Will the Janitor's house be retained?

**A** This issue will be explored and the decision distributed.

**Q** Will there be a new Menzieshill High School.

**A** No.

## **RECORD OF MEETING WITH GOWRIEHILL PRIMARY SCHOOL PUBLIC MEETING - TUESDAY 19 FEBRUARY 2013 AT 7.00PM**

**Present:** Lina Waghorn, Head of Education, (Pre-school, Primary, Communications and Culture), Lorna Ferry, Acting Education Manager, (Recorder), Head Teacher, Principal Teacher, Parental Involvement Officer and 10 parents from Gowriehill Primary School (including Parent Council) 2 parents from Hillside Primary School.

Lina outlined the reasons for the proposal. Lina repeated the proposal which has not changed from the informal proposal. She outlined some of the benefits:

- Improved school accommodation for children in the area.
- Better facilities for staff. Nursery will get like for like in terms of planting etc. The nursery roll will stay at 70/70.
- Car parks for parents/visitors and car parking staff.
- £11.5 million to be invested in the area. People like to live near a new school.

Lina outlined the consultation process and the purpose of the present meeting within that process and indicated the desired timeframe which is proposed as an entry date for the new school of Autumn 2016. Start of build is Spring 2015 – completion in Spring of 2016 and opening in Autumn 2016.

### **Comments**

- Gowriehill Primary School community all in favour
- Very positive – we want this for our community.
- The children will benefit.
- It would be good to have a new school in the west of the city.
- We would want the whole area to be regenerated.
- Pleased to hear about plans to include community centre.
- It's a no 'brainer'.
- Confusion from reading 2 Head Teachers and 2 separate entrances. Some people have read that as the schools are going to stay separate.

**Q** There are no playing fields marked on the map.

**A** There might be artificial grass provided. There will be play areas.

**Q** Is there an option for Menzieshill Community centre to be attached to the school?

**A** Menzieshill Community Centre is currently consulting on 3 options.

## **RECORD OF MEETING WITH GOWRIEHILL PRIMARY SCHOOL STAFF - TUESDAY 19 FEBRUARY 2013 AT 3.30PM**

**Present:** Lina Waghorn, Head of Education, (Pre-school, Primary, Communications and Culture), Lorna Ferry, Acting Education Manager, (Recorder) and 10 members of staff.

Lina outlined the reasons for the proposal. Gowriehill Primary School roll is falling and this number encompasses placing requests. Lina repeated the proposal which has not changed from the informal proposal. She outlined the consultation process and the purpose of the present meeting within that process. She explained that at the end of the formal consultation all comments are collated and prepared for Education Scotland before being put forward to Education Committee for decision.

She indicated the desired timeframe which is proposed as an entry date for the new school of Autumn 2016.

The merged school will have a new name, uniform, logo, etc. and the merged roll will be 400+. Lina described how the merged building would work. Each individual establishment is protected by secure entry. Pick-up/drop-off will be considered at the planning stage. Lina drew attention to similarities between Ballumbie Campus and the proposed campus. The new Campus will house two enhanced provisions. The Breakfast Club and Out of School Care Clubs will operate from the proposed Campus. Shared CPD will be a possibility. Facilities will be enhanced through Dance Studios, staffroom, toilets, etc. There is a saving to be made in merging schools. Staffing will be discussed nearer the opening date.

### **Comments**

- Steep hill should be considered in reconfiguring roadways.

**Q** Will we know the outcome of the consultation by the end of March 2013?

**A** Stakeholders will be informed when a decision has been made.

**Q** Will environmental issues be considered before building?

**A** Access strategy, Travel plan, cycle paths, walkways will all be discussed.

**Q** When are school houses to be discussed?

**A** Lina will look into that and respond.

**Q** What will happen to the Gowriehill Primary School site?

**A** It will revert to City Development.

**Q** What will happen if the merger goes through and the Hillside parents feel it is all down to Gowriehill's decreasing roll. There may be discord.

**A** The comments will be considered and the views of all will be considered. Lina assured the staff that the decision has not been made solely on roll numbers.

**Q** Why was there no Education Department response after the Hillside article?

**A** Stewart Hunter did give it a short response.

**Q** At what number would the Gowriehill Primary School roll have to be before it was decided to merge before the new build?

**A** This is not relevant since the current roll is so low.

**Q** What happens if there is staff excess before the merger?

**A** Usually schools are staffed a little more generously to support merger. Staff can be offered a move. Length of service is taken into account.

**Q** What happens to the two Head Teachers?

**A** If both Head Teachers want post there will be competitive interview or there may be discussions about negotiating.

**Q** Will both PTs in enhanced provision remain.

**A** Yes.

**Q** Why can people who have applied for early retirement not get to go to facilitate merger?

**A** Equity across the city.

**Q** Are we going to have only one Head Teacher between two schools?.

**A** While this is not the plan, it could be considered.

**Q** Letters have gone out to residents adjacent to the proposed site to say that new houses will be built there. How will this work?

**A** The site is large enough to accommodate the school and proposed family houses.

**Q** Is regeneration of the area planned?

**A** This has happened in previous new builds.

**Q** Will the area be on a slope?

**A** This will be designed and landscaped closer to the build.

**Q** Can we bring the cherry trees?

**A** Trees can be taken to the new site.

**Q** Do we get to take eco-flag and status to new school?

**A** Current status will be taken into account when re-applying in the merged school.

**Q** Why was St Ninian's RC Primary School not included in the proposal?

**A** It would need to be a stand alone and there would not be space for merged school, denominational school and nursery.

**Q** What is the timescale?

**A** Consultation complete on 14 March 2013. Education Committee on 27 May 2013. Lina will present findings at Education Committee.

## **RECORD OF MEETING WITH HILLSIDE PRIMARY SCHOOL PARENT COUNCIL - WEDNESDAY 20 FEBRUARY 2013 AT 6.00PM**

**Present:** Michael Wood, Director of Education, Lorna Ferry, Acting Education Manager, (Recorder), 7 members of Parent Council, Head Teacher, Depute Head Teacher and Taletta Jamieson, Parental Involvement Officer

Michael outlined how the proposal has been developed. This has involved a review of the whole area of Menzieshill. In order to re-invigorate an efficient school estate a number of sites have been considered. It is the wish of the Council to provide a quality environment for learning. School estate requires to be fit for purpose. Enhanced provision in new school would be better provision as it would be purpose built. Everything will be new and offer a quality environment for learning.

Michael offered to organise a visit to a new build school eg Ballumbie, which is purpose built.

### **Comments**

- A range of opinions – some who would like to stay at Hillside even if it is not refurbished because of a loyalty to the school. Some would welcome the proposal.
- The current site does not lend itself to more pupils.
- Members talked about why traffic flow could not be sorted at the current site.
- All agree that the facilities need to be upgraded and that the new school will be better but there are concerns about location and merger with Gowriehill PS.
- One member stressed how positive she felt about the proposal.
- Another felt that as long as Head Teacher and staff move to the new school it will be fine.
- Members of the Parent Council raised issues relating to placing requests in both schools.
- Some members felt that some of the e-mails that had gone out might have given the impression that pupils in Hillside and Gowriehill are not equal.
- Members feel "it's a done deal" – the new build will go ahead.
- Householders are concerned about what will be built on the Hillside site.
- Data shows that there has not been a serious accident in the area around Hillside.
- One member feels there has been a poor flow of information.
- One member feels that the proposal is not based on accurate information.

### **POI**

Hillside Primary School has 60 children who live in the Gowriehill Primary School catchment area. There are 198 pupils in Hillside as a result of Placing Request. Consultation – comments to Education Scotland (for 3 weeks). Report then goes on website for 3 weeks. Report then goes to Committee – no earlier than June 2013.

**Q** Why not just refurbish each school? On the map provided by the Director, the nursery has not been included and if it was the whole area would amount to over 2 hectares. The school, Menzieshill High School and nursery is felt, by some parents, to be one site.

**A** Could not reuse the Hillside site as the current site is 1.4 hectares. A new school requires 1.8 hectares.

**Q** Why not extend Hillside as was done at Forthill. Is it to save the reputation of Gowriehill? It was suggested that the proposal has been put forward because the proposed site would not be suitable for housing whereas the current site could be used for housing.

**A** The issue is about the school rolls and the potential to build a new school to accommodate both existing schools. It is unfair to be critical about the reputation of Gowriehill given that time has not been spent in the school or indeed that the reputation is based on third party information.

**Q** Is bigger better? It is understood that it will be more financially effective, but would it be better for learners?

**A** The roll of the new school would be around 392. The Director feels that that is a workable number and that promoted staff would be increased to reflect the larger roll. He outlined the range of joint working and joint planning which would take place prior to moving.

**Q** Why would we choose a school that did not have a good reputation as Hillside does now?

**A** A school's reputation is built through hard work. No guarantee that Jackie Campbell or any member of staff would stay at the school regardless of proposal. A lot of hard work would go in to build and maintain the reputation.

**Q** Why don't Gowriehill Primary School pupils go to St Ninian's RC Primary School.

**A** It is not possible to merge a denominational and a non denominational school.

**Q** What about the traffic flow at the proposed site?

**A** There will be much work done on the Travel Plan.

**Q** Would there be a pitch/grass? Parent Council do not wish to leave their current grass area.

**A** There will be a balance between soft and hard playground as well as grass.

## **RECORD OF MEETING WITH HILLSIDE PRIMARY SCHOOL PUBLIC MEETING - WEDNESDAY 20 FEBRUARY 2013 AT 7.00PM**

**Present:** Michael Wood, Director of Education, Lorna Ferry, Acting Education Manager, (Recorder) and 48 parents including a small number of Elected Members. Other Elected Members had given apologies.

Michael outlined how the proposal has been developed. This has involved a review of the whole area of Menzieshill. In order to re-invigorate an efficient school estate a number of sites have been considered. It is the wish of the Council to provide a quality environment for learning. Michael offered to organise a visit to a new build school which is purpose built. Gowriehill Primary School staff and parents are in favour of the proposal.

### **Comments**

- Some expressed the view that they 'Can't believe we are arguing about not giving our children the opportunity to have a new school'.
- Others were very keen to retain their current building and population.
- Almost all could see the benefits of a new school but not on the proposed site.
- I can see the new school being a catalyst for regeneration of the area.



- A resident spoke to say that the Project Board works very hard and have lots of detailed discussions even where not everyone agrees.

**Q** Will pupils be consulted?

**A** Pupils will be given information and consulted week beginning 25 February 2013.

**Q** Pupils with ASN do not like change. Would there be tensions by putting two school populations together

**A** Staff will work with all children to prepare them for the move.

**Q** We do not want pubs in close proximity to school.

**A** The school site will have a high perimeter fence. Many schools continue to operate well in proximity to pubs.

**Q** There is a lack of detail and really just an outline plan in what has been brought to the consultation. Can you take all the comments and come back with a more detailed plan?

**A** If we had brought a more detailed plan it may have felt like "a done deal". The process is that there should be six weeks of consultation before the findings are sent to Education Scotland. A report is then sent to Education Committee by the end of May. Michael again offered a visit to a new school.

**Q** Concerns that funding may not stretch to all that the school will need and a feeling that the new school may not be as good as it is being described

**A** Michael outlined the processes which shape the development. The proposal gives a commitment for a three stream primary school with a nursery attached.

**Q** What about staffing?

**A** There will be a Head Teacher and Depute Head Teacher x 2 and Principal Teacher x 2 and a Head Teacher for the Nursery. Staffing will be allocated according to roll.

**Q** Would it not be cheaper to refurbish Hillside than build a new school?

**A** The proposed site is a bigger site than the current Hillside. We know that some people might not want to do anything but however the refurbishment was done it would still be a 50 year old school. It would cost millions to refurbish Hillside.

## **POI**

Costs for other possible sites and proposals have not been accurately assessed

The size of the current and proposed sites are not comparable because the nursery site has not been taken into account

**Q** What is going to be done with the school when empty?

**A** It will be demolished.

**Q** Why is Ancrum Road still standing and being used while the more modern schools are being closed?

**A** It would be ideal to build new schools across the city, but this has to be phased.

**Q** Where is funding coming from?

**A** From Capital funding.

**Q** Gowriehill Primary School will be approximately 28% full next session. Why not close it down?

**A** This is part of the proposal which is being presented tonight.

**Q** Resident asked how long she would have to look at the derelict site where Hillside currently sits.

**A** The site will be flattened and become a Council Asset.

**Q** Would the area be landscaped after flattening?

**A** Yes it would be grassed.

**Q** Parents choose to bypass Gowriehill Primary School to come to Hillside. How do you know parents will choose to send their children to the new school?

**A** Evidence from other new build projects is that families are happy to have their children attend the new schools. There is no evidence that rolls change when children move to new build school.

**Q** Reputations take time to build. While we understand that much work will be done to build the reputation of the new school some parents would prefer to send their children to a school that already had a good reputation

**A** Parents have the right to choose a school for their child to attend.

**Q** We have chosen the school because of the staff not the building.

**A** The new school will have staff from Hillside but staff teams change all the time.

**Q** What will be done about car parking and traffic flow? Because of Placing Requests, parents live further away and this increases traffic. Traffic currently moves slowly around the school because of congestion problems. At the new site St Ninian's RC Primary School will add to the traffic and Ninewells staff will park in any available space.

**A** We will take every step to ensure that traffic flow is assessed and planned for.

**Q** What is planned for the Menziesshill Community Centre?

There are two options for Community Council. A member felt that there were three options. Michael will investigate.

**Q** In the new school plan there would be an Out of School Care Club. Will the people who currently run the club lose their jobs? One hundred and six parents have confidence in the current club and the people who work there. Walking to and from the schools has not caused an issue

**A** Staffing will be discussed at a later stage of the process.

**Q** Was the proposed site the only site considered? Was it chosen to fail?

**A** The proposal to be discussed tonight is as outlined. Other sites were considered but were not suitable.

**Q** Why can you not extend or build a new school on the site?

**A** The existing site is not considered large enough for the proposed new school size. It would also be the case that the current pupils would have to be decanted out of the school into another location for the duration of the build.

## **POI**

If the nursery, Hillside and a large bit of grass on Yarrow Terrace were used as the site, it could accommodate the new school.

No assessment of the current site has been undertaken.

Old Folks Home derelict on Dickson Avenue – drop-off point for parents.

**Q** Why do you not adopt the loop system from the States?

**A** I do not have sufficient knowledge of the loop system to answer this question.

## **RECORD OF MEETING WITH HILLSIDE PRIMARY SCHOOL PUPILS - MONDAY 25 FEBRUARY 2013**

**P1a, P1b, P2 and P2/3:** How do you feel about getting a new school and for the merger to go ahead?

Yes / Good 70

No / Not Good 10

Not sure 6

Don't mind 0

**P3 and 3/4** How do you feel about getting a new school and for the merger to go ahead?

Yes/Good Idea 25  
 No/Not a good idea 19  
 Not sure 6  
 Don't mind 0

**P4/5, P5:** How do you feel about getting a new school and for the merger to go ahead?

Yes / Good 9  
 No / Not Good 11  
 Not sure 0  
 Don't mind 0

**P5/6, P6/7, P7:** How do you feel about getting a new school and for the merger to go ahead?

Yes / Good 3  
 No / Not Good 60  
 Not sure 10  
 Don't mind 0

**Room 5 & 6** (Enhanced Provision)

Yes / Good 11  
 No / Not Good 2  
 Not sure 7  
 Don't mind 0

**School Total**

Yes / Good 118  
 No / Not Good 102  
 Not sure 29  
 Don't mind 0

**P1a, P1b, P2 and P2/3**

Positive

- Happy it will be near some of our houses
- We will make new friends
- We will have all new things
- We will get a big gym hall
- It will be near the community centre

Worries

- What if all the teachers don't fit in the school
- Further to walk
- Friends may not be in class
- What if new children aren't nice
- What if there is no grass
- Not a big playground
- No Trees
- New teachers can be scary

**P3**

- Really like this area.
- Like this school just the way it is.
- Where did they get the idea?
- Would be easier as it is just up the road.
- I live close to Hillside Primary and would need to get a bus to the new school.
- I like this school

- Looking forward to meeting new people and to make new friends.
- Make even more friends
- This school is nice as it is.
- Hillside is close to my house.
- Want to keep this school because I like it the way it is.
- Be with friends Gowriehill Primary School.
- Everything would be new and we know where everything is here at Hillside.
- Closer to school and easier for walking.
- Not be able to get to new school in time as it is too far away.
- I like the playground here at Hillside.
- Closer to the community centre and going to clubs.
- How can they not close Gowriehill and they come here?
- Will it be the same teachers?
- Worried about pupils from Gowriehill annoying me.
- Don't want new school near the park.
- What about the Head Teacher?
- I have friends at Gowriehill.
- School is nice how it is.
- Will miss the playground.
- Won't know where things are in the new school.
- Would like a new school closer to my home.
- Will miss the wall displays.
- Easier for walking
- Too far away.

#### **P3/4**

- Why do we need another school and need to move?
- Will we have the same ties?
- Will the pupil council be the same in the new school?
- Will the teachers still be the same?
- Will the Head Teacher still be the same?
- Where will we learn for the next three years?
- What will the school building look like?
- I don't like the look of the building at Victoria Park.
- I would like to make new friends.
- Don't want to move, all my brothers and sisters have been to Hillside.
- Will the new school have grass?
- Will we learn the same things as Gowriehill?
- I am happy to move as I have friends at Gowriehill already.
- Will the adventure playground go to the new school?
- I don't want to move as the new school will be further away from my house. Will the cooks still be the same?
- Will we still have buddies?
- Will there be separate gates for the nursery?
- Will we still have an eco-group
- If we move will we still have the green eco flag?
- Will there be a fence between Gowriehill and Hillside?
- Will we still have clubs?
- Will the classrooms be bigger?
- Will you still have the same teachers?
- Will we still have French?
- Will we still have a stage?
- Will we still have green time choices?
- Will there still be a gym hall?
- Will there still be a quiet area/shelter?

**P4/5 and P5**

- Will there be 2 head teachers?
- Can we keep Mrs Campbell as our HT?
- What will the school Badge look like?]
- Will we get a bigger playground?
- Will there be sports facilities /swimming pool?
- Will all the teachers be the same?
- Will all the classes be mixed?
- Why are we getting put into another school?
- We will have further to travel as we live close to Hillside.
- I don't think it's in a nice area. Lots of police cars in the area, broken glass lying about, really close to a pub, busy road already, lots of bus stops blocking crossing of road.
- Graffiti already on back of pub so the school will probably get vandalised too.
- People from the pub/people hanging about in gangs modelling bad behaviour to young children.
- Blaring music from the pub especially at night (while teachers are working.)
- My mum is a close friend to the owner of the pub and he doesn't blare the music.
- Worried about the distance to walk to and from the new school, especially at night and winter.
- More of a temptation to go to the shops because there are more of them.
- Needles on the ground beside The Rock bar
- Will the opening times of the school be later if we've further to walk to school?
- Lots of drug addicts by the chemist.
- Don't want to move from the nice area of Hillside P.S. Would be happy for a new school if it was in this nice area.
- We've just got the Sensory Garden and the Climbing Wall. It would be such a waste.
- Knock the student houses down and build here.
- If there are too many teachers would some of them lose their jobs?
- There are boys that go to Gowriehill who are well known bullies and I'm worried about that.
- Closer to the after school club (Community Centre.)
- A bigger gym hall with lots of equipment

**P5/6, P6/7, P7**

- Will we have to go to another school while the new one is being built? Like Harris going to Rockwell.
- What's the schools name?
- What about Mrs Campbell, will she be our head teacher?
- Out of all the schools why Hillside and Gowriehill?
- Will the new school be as big as Menzieshill High?
- What will happen to the nursery?
- Will the unit still be there?
- What will be the badge/tie/colours?
- Out of all the places, why there?
- What would happen to the sites the schools were knocked down on?
- Will there be 2 janitors or will Ged lose his job?
- New adventure area?
- Will the building stick to budget?
- What will happen to the sport teams?
- Will Mrs McMillan be the new DHT at the new school because she just got here?
- Big building, will we get a big playground too?
- What would happen to Steven and our cooks?
- What about our Sensory garden?
- What about Ged's house?
- What will happen to the hillside hippo motto?
- What about Tam's house?
- Will Gowriehill pupils be in our class?
- Will Hillside teachers teach Gowriehill pupils?
- What are they going to do with the land at Hillside and Gowriehill?
- Would it affect the levels of education?

- Could we not move the school to the old flats?
- Numbers in class, will they be big classes?
- Would there still be Dalguise?
- There is an old people's home beside it, what will happen?
- Will breakfast club be on?
- Will we get green time?
- What will happen to RCT?
- Will there be computers?
- How can we go to home dinners when it is far away?
- What will happen to the Adventure play area because we've only been on it a few times?
- What will happen to the office ladies?
- How many people will there be?
- Memories/belonging
- Will all our teachers come or will any teachers lose jobs?
- Whole family attended here don't want it knocked down
- I don't think they should move to behind the pub because of vandals
- Gran moved close to Hillside so she could have pupils at Hillside, pointless move
- Building historical
- Too many pupils in the new school
- Hillside is a popular school
- Will effect brothers and sisters
- Will make less schools across Dundee
- Location of school just now is close to family homes
- Less selection of schools
- We're getting knocked down to help Gowriehill, not fair
- School has done well
- 50 years, why will we knock it down?
- Hillside is really good, want siblings to experience it
- 9 o'clock drug addicts go to the chemist
- Daily routines affected because of travel time longer to get to school
- Cost of petrol, busy road, less houses
- Friendships affected
- Getting me and my brother to school in the morning is a problem(Harris, new school)
- Family helped build this school
- P6 pupils won't graduate in Hillside
- This school has a really good reputation of behaviour
- Good building, would be a shame to waste it
- Possible fights because pupils don't get along from both schools
- Bad location, pub, chemist, busy road
- People might not want to come because bad area and dangerous
- Not a nice area
- It's going to cost more money to build than to keep separate
- We have a perfect pitch and playground, why waste it, we might not get the same
- What about the MUGA pitch
- Not fair on new p1's and p2's moving after they have just got used to a new school
- Would have to find a new route from new to school to MHS.
- Hard to walk from new school to MHS due to busy roads.
- Waste of money to knock it down
- There could be more bullying
- People bullied me when I was little and went to Gowriehill they don't here
- Little brother wants to walk to school himself and Mum says he could in p5 but he won't be able to at new school
- We have a good reputation
- If successful the council will save money and be able to put this into other buildings in the city
- Merge equals better facilities
- I know the person who made Hillside's badge and I want his memories to live on because he died.
- Sirens from the hospital since we are near it.

- I think we should merge so we can have football.
- If they can't find a good area why not keep the schools.
- It will be harder to get in the football team etc.
- It will take longer to walk to school and my little brother won't get to walk.
- Lots of wasted resources
- It will be harder to get there.
- I think you should keep Hillside because it has been a great school and I have learnt so much.
- We just got new playground games painted and an adventure playground, climbing walls and a sensory garden.
- Our playground is big will we get a bigger one and all the grass
- It's nearer the shops

### **Room 5 & 6 (Enhanced Provision New School – Comments, Concerns, Suggestions.) Classrooms (EP)**

- Bigger classrooms
- Better display walls
- Nicer lighting
- Door to playground
- More computers in classrooms
- New tables, chairs, curtains
- New toys ie Ben 10 stuff, Toy Bear
- Time-out room (to calm down)
- Sensory room (to chill out-lava lamp, music, bubble tube)

### **Lunch Hall**

- Big canteen separate from assembly hall
- More tables
- Nicer cups/plates/cutlery
- More cooks
- Packed lunch area
- Vending machines
- Hot chocolate
- Bigger tuckshop area

### **Assembly Hall**

- Big screen so everyone can see & can be used for special film screenings
- Sound & lighting system
- Tiered seating & real stage

### **PE Hall**

- Bigger Changing Rooms with Showers/Baths
- Smarter PE kit
- Better equipment
- Swimming pool

### **Playground**

- Better enclosed playground
- Gordon the train from Thomas (playground/garden.)
- adventure area with a slide, swings, roundabout, climbing frame, trampoline
- All-weather football pitch, tennis court, mini-golf, basket ball net, bikes

### **Other Features**

- New name; Ninewells Primary, Gowhill Primary, Watertower Hill Primary, Menziesshill Primary
- New school colours; Purple (red & blue)
- More teachers
- Luxurious staffroom/lounge with dishwasher/TV/Costa coffee machine
- Common room with TV, dartboard, snooker table, Playstation and wii (take turns/reward)
- School pet/aquarium

- Intercom & Tannoy
- Elevator with code
- Lockers
- More storage space

## **RECORD OF MEETING WITH HILLSIDE PRIMARY SCHOOL STAFF - WEDNESDAY 20 FEBRUARY 2013 AT 3.30PM**

**Present:** Michael Wood, Director of Education, Lorna Ferry, Acting Education Manager, (Recorder) and 14 members of staff.

Michael outlined the proposal including the benefits, financial aspects, transitions, traffic flow and car parking. Michael clarified that the enhanced provisions could provide better facilities than the current adapted classrooms.

The consensus is that a new school presents positive opportunities. Staff identified many benefits. They are committed to the principles of the proposal. A small number of concerns about the practicalities and information flow were raised.

### **PROPOSAL**

**Q** Will we get everything we need eg. if the windows cost more will some other aspect suffer?

**A** There is a budget of £11.5 million. The Project Board has reps from parents, staff and pupils and will discuss the more detailed use of budget.

**Q** What is the estimated life of the new school?

**A** In PPP schools they are leased for 30 years.

**Q** Why could we not do the same as Forthill?

**A** The site is smaller.

**Q** Will the proposed school be the same as Camperdown PS?

**A** Each school will be built to suit the site.

**Q** Will there be a large grass area?

**A** There will be a large play area through not necessarily all grass.

**Q** How many pupils will the school be built for?

**A** Up to 560 pupils.

### **ENHANCED PROVISION**

**Q** Will enhanced provision be ASD specific? Will 2 enhanced provisions cause a higher ratio of children within ASN in each mainstream class?

**A** EP will be ASD specific. There will be two enhanced provisions and each one will have a Principal Teacher.

**Q** What about drop-off area for enhanced provision?

**A** This will be discussed in a range of ways if the proposal is taken forward. Staff were encouraged to visit new schools to see what works. They will then be in a position to put forward informed views at the planning stage.

### **STAFF**

**Q** What will happen regarding 2 Head Teachers?

**A** This will be discussed nearer the time. There is a no redundancy policy. It could go to competitive interview or be negotiated. Head Teachers are already involved in joint and Cluster initiatives.

**Q** Will the majority of staff move to the new school? When will this be clarified?

**A** Staffing will be allocated according to roll. This should be done at an early stage.



**Q** What about support staff?

**A** A review of support staff which includes the piloting of the PESA post is currently being undertaken and this will relate to Support Staff across the city. There may be some latitude in staffing allocation in order to facilitate the merger.

### **COMMUNITY**

**Q** What will happen regarding the Menzieshill Community Centre?

**A** There are 2 options – refurbish current building or build a smaller centre.

### **POI**

New housing is planned for Earn Crescent.

## **RECORD OF MEETING WITH LOCHEE LOCAL COMMUNITY PLANNING PARTNERSHIP - TUESDAY 19 FEBRUARY 2013 AT 1.00PM**

**Present:** Lina Waghorn, Head of Education, (Pre-school, Primary, Communications and Culture), Lorna Ferry, Acting Education Manager, (Recorder)

### **Proposal**

Lina outlined how the proposal had been developed and described the formal consultation process.

Hillside and Gowriehill Primary Schools and Menzieshill Nursery School to be closed and a new build provided. New campus to be built incorporating a merged primary school and a nursery school. The nursery will have a Head Teacher and own entrance. The merged school will have a new name, uniform, badge, etc. Much improved facilities eg. gym. Enhanced provisions will move with the schools. Consultation is done and all information is collated. The end of the consultation is Thursday 14 March 2013.

Lina made it clear that the proposal she had described related only to the school and nursery building.

Elected members make the decision about whether the proposal will be taken forward.

**Q** Is the community being consulted on the location?

**A** The consultation meetings are open to the public

## **RECORD OF MEETING WITH MENZIESHILL NURSERY SCHOOL PUBLIC MEETING - THURSDAY 21 FEBRUARY 2013 AT 7.00PM**

**Present:** Lina Waghorn, Head of Education, (Pre-school, Primary, Communications and Culture), Charlotte MacCrimmon, Education Manager, (Recorder) and approximately 22 parents from the nursery school and Hillside PS.

### **RATIONALE**

When did the talks start for this proposal?

What category (school estate) is Menzieshill Nursery School?

Has refurbishment of all 3 buildings been considered?

So there's no chance regarding the possibility of a refurbishment of all 3 buildings?

Could it be considered that Gowriehill Primary School children are split between Hillside PS and one other primary school rather than this proposal?

Why, if nursery school is stand alone, will it be attached to the primary school?

Why was a shared facility between Gowriehill PS and St Ninian's RC Primary Schools not considered – even if they cannot be merged?

Why can Gowriehill Primary School children not be moved to spare rooms in St Ninian's RC Primary School? This must have been done in the Blackness Road Campus.

Is St Ninian's RC Primary School due for refurbishment? What category of building is it? (school estate).

Is it not the case that only 10% of the St Ninian's RC Primary School children are Roman Catholic?

What is the capacity for Hillside PS?

Can you explain how school capacity is calculated?

Do you include enhanced provision in the capacity calculations?

I have spoken to Michael Wood and he says that if you took the enhanced provision rooms out of the equation you would have capacity in Hillside Primary.

Michael Wood agreed that the figures are skewed at Hillside because of the enhanced provision.

Is there (the likelihood that) anyone in the community will raise opposition to this proposal?

### ***COST***

£11.5 million – does that include the Community Centre?

Two years ago £2 million was spent on Gowriehill Primary School's heating and now you are going to close it.

What will happen with the 3 empty buildings?

Will the building of these schools create jobs for Dundee people?

### ***SITE***

The proposed site is close to a pub (and a chemist). I can't think of other schools in Dundee (located) close to a pub.

I am more worried about the chemist, not the pub. Whatever time I go to that area there are "junkies" there. I wouldn't let my children go to those shops alone because of that.

You put in a complaint (about this) and things don't get done.

I can't go to the Post Office without running into a "junkie". They would steal from a child.

It's just not safe for kids to be near the chemist.

If "junkies" were not there, it would be an ideal site.

Where was the previously proposed site to be?

Do you know what the planned house building (next to this proposed school site) will be?

Will you ensure that there would be appropriate roads/access at new site?

Ninewells Hospital staff parking is a problem already. They might use the school car park.

2.5 hectares site – how much will be (allocated to) school/nursery buildings?

Is there an existing new school on a similar size of site that we can go and see?

Will the nursery be open-plan?

Will the nursery garden have the same (features)?

Will there be grassy areas for Sports Days, etc. so that the children won't have to leave the school grounds for Sports Day.

I don't want 1 teacher with 30 kids going out of grounds to walk to another sports area. It takes time to walk the children from the school to another area for sports and back again.

Can you build on the Hillside PS site instead of the proposed site? That is a better area.

I am happy about a new school but not in that location.

### **PEOPLE**

I don't think that the 2 schools' populations will successfully merge - to a certain degree.

Will all of the teaching staff go to the new primary school?

A lot of Menzieshill Nursery School children go to other schools in Dundee. Will this change?

Transition from the nursery school to new school: will the nursery close on a Friday and move to the new nursery school on the Monday?

Have you spoken to the nursery staff?

Will the nursery really stay the same (type of setting) in the new school?

Security in existing new schools is excellent.

Will the Out of School Care Club move from Menzieshill High School to the new site? The Breakfast Club too?

How will this arrangement affect St Ninian's RC PS children who currently use the Out of School Care Club?

Will the school provide its own Breakfast Club rather than be operated by a parent run committee?

There is conflict in some schools where there are 2 Breakfast Clubs.

### **COMMUNITY CENTRE PLANS**

I am on the Community Centre Management Team and although we know about the 3 schools' proposals, we still don't know about the Community Centre. I feel in the dark about this.

There is a proposed meeting on 12<sup>th</sup> March with architects to tell us more/show options regarding the community centre. We hope to know Community Centre plans by May.

We are planning to invite David Dorward to come to a meeting if there is still no information by April 2013.

We are aware that some schools in Scotland have Community Centres on campus but that accessing the Community Centre during the day is problematic.

Being in the dark regarding the Community Centre plans is unsettling for the community.

## **RECORD OF MEETING WITH MENZIESHILL NURSERY SCHOOL STAFF MEETING - THURSDAY 21 FEBRUARY 2013 AT 6.00PM**

**Present:** Lina Waghorn, Head of Education, (Pre-school, Primary, Communications and Culture), Jan Smith, Quality Improvement Officer, (Recorder), Isobel Fleming, Head Teacher and 6 members of staff.

Lina Waghorn repeated the proposal, outlined the consultation process and the purpose of the present meeting within that process, and indicated the desired timeframe which, all things being equal, would result in an entry date for the new school of August 2016.

Lina gave historical reasons for the proposal. Dundee City Council wants to provide new nursery accommodation for as many children as possible.

Parking around Hillside is a growing concern.

Questions were invited.

### ***Design and Layout***

#### ***Will nursery be like Balgay Hill in design?***

No, their site is restricted in size.

#### ***Will nursery have greater capacity?***

No, like for like build.

#### ***Will there be safe car parking for staff?***

There should be adequate parking – this is the case in existing new builds.

#### ***What are the benefits?***

Breakfast Club and Out of School Care Club will be on site.

Clerical support will be onsite if the need should arise.

Nursery on same site as primaries should lead to smoother transition/development opportunities.

Improved ICT infrastructure.

Improved storage facilities/washing facilities.

Improved school office/heating.

#### ***What about the garden area?***

You will be able to take your garden equipment/no restrictions for space.

There will be grass.

Sensory garden and vegetable garden will continue

#### ***What is the timeline?***

Consultation finishes on 14 March 2013.

Information goes to Education Scotland for their perusal. Report is then taken to Education Committee – 27 May 2013. Councillors will then make a decision to accept/reject/amend. Building work will start in January 2015 leading to opening in August 2016.

#### ***What are chances of Hillside parents influencing a negative decision?***

Approximately 20 parents are resistant this so this is a very small minority.

All parents and staff at Gowriehill are in favour.

***What about the shops and the surrounding environment? (Pubs, chemist, etc)***

Council are committed to creating a positive environment. Will not spend a huge sum on a new build and leave a poor environment. The existing school buildings go to City Development once empty. Parking will make it safer for children. No issues for nursery, but this is an issue for primaries.

***Will you consult with wider community?***

Public consultation took place last night. Lina attending Community Centre to speak to Police, etc. Staff will have representation on the Project Board.

**Appendix 1**  
**DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL**

Equality and Diversity Rapid Impact Assessment Tool

Part 1

|   |  |
|---|--|
| <p><b>Date of assessment</b> June 2013</p>  | <p><b>Title of document being assessed</b><br/><b>Report 286-2013</b></p> <p><b>School Estate Improvements in the Menzieshill Area of the City – Outcome of the Formal Consultation Process</b></p>  |
| <p>1) This is a new policy, procedure, strategy or practice being assessed<br/>(If yes please tick box) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/></p>         | <p>This is an existing policy, procedure, strategy or practice being assessed?<br/>(If yes please tick box) <input type="checkbox"/></p>   |
| <p>2) Please give a brief description of the policy, procedure, strategy or practice being assessed.</p>  | <p>This report details the representations made during the formal publication and consultation exercise on the above proposal and recommends that the Council proceeds with the proposal.</p>  |
| <p>3) What is the intended outcome of this policy, procedure, strategy or practice?</p>   | <p>To discontinue Hillside and Gowriehill Primary Schools and build a new 3 stream primary school incorporating a nursery provision to replace Menzieshill Nursery School.</p>   |
| <p>4) Please list any existing documents which have been used to inform this Equality and Diversity Impact Assessment.</p>                              | <p>A report (258-2012) was approved by committee in June 2012 to enter into informal consultation by seeking the views of staff, parents and the community for improvements to primary school and community facilities in the Menzieshill area. The report set out the options under consideration.</p> <p>The committee report on the School Estate report (254-2012) provided an update of the school estate in Dundee. It was the follow up to the School Estate report (539-2011).</p> <p>Statutory consultation procedures in terms of the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010</p>   |
| <p>5) Has any consultation, involvement or research with protected characteristic communities informed this assessment? If yes please give details.</p> | <p>During the period August to October 2012, there was informal consultation with each school community involving staff, pupils, parents and carers through Parent Councils; the Local Community Planning Partnership; the local community; community centre users and key community stakeholders. The Director of Education attended a meeting of the Local Community Planning Partnership. The Head of Education (Primary) undertook a programmed series of meetings as part of the informal consultation process.</p> <p>The formal consultation began with an advert in the Evening Telegraph on 28/1/2013 and appropriate letters were sent to statutory consultees. Meetings were held with staff, parents/carers, Parent Councils and Trade Union Representatives. The outcome of the consultation is attached as part of the Report.</p> |

|   |   |
|---|---|
| <p>6) Please give details of council officer involvement in this assessment.<br/>(E.g. names of officers consulted, dates of meetings etc)</p>  | <p>Michael Wood, Director of Education<br/>Lina Waghorn, Head of Education<br/>Paul Clancy, Head of Education<br/>Janet Robertson, Head of Support Services</p> |
| <p>7) Is there a need to collect further evidence or to involve or consult protected characteristics communities on the impact of the proposed policy?<br/><br/>(Example: if the impact on a community is not known what will you do to gather the information needed and when will you do this?)</p> | <p>The formal consultation process has afforded all stakeholders an opportunity to contribute.</p>  |

Part 2

Which protected characteristicscommunitieswill be positively or negatively affected by this policy, procedure or strategy?

NB Please place an X in the box which best describes the "overall" impact. It is possible for an assessment to identify that a positive policy can have some negative impacts and visa versa. When this is the case please identify both positive and negative impacts in Part 3 of this form.

If the impact on a protected characteristiccommunitiesare not known please state how you will gather evidence of any potential negative impacts in box Part 1 section 7 above.

|   | Positively                          | Negatively               | No Impact                           | Not Known                |
|---|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|
| <b>Ethnic Minority Communities including Gypsies and Travellers</b> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| <b>Gender</b>   | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| <b>Gender Reassignment</b>  | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| <b>Religion or Belief</b>   | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| <b>People with a disability</b>                                     | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| <b>Age</b>  | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| <b>Lesbian, Gay and Bisexual</b>                                    | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| <b>Socio-economic</b>   | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| <b>Pregnancy &amp; Maternity</b>                                    | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| <b>Other (please state)</b>   | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> |



## Part 3

|   |  |
|---|--|
| <p><b>1) Have any positive impacts been identified? (We must ensure at this stage that we are not achieving equality for one strand of equality at the expense of another)</b></p>  | <p>The new build provision will facilitate the delivery of high-quality education and meet the requirements of Curriculum for Excellence better. The long term savings have the potential to benefit the educational experience of all children in the city. Positive relationships and the sharing of practice across all three establishments offers potential benefits to the whole school community. Most stakeholders are positive about the proposal.</p> <p>The establishment of a Project Board to oversee the development of the new campus model which will include representation from staff, pupils and parents and will ensure their direct contribution from the concept design stage through to the project completion. This will reflect and address issues raised in relation to the nature of the accommodation and the design brief; the provision of quality outdoor play areas; parking and travel arrangements; the management of shared facilities and the need to preserve and maintain the unique identity of each establishment.</p> |
| <p><b>2) Have any negative impacts been identified? (Based on direct knowledge, published research, community involvement, customer feedback etc. If unsure seek advice from your departmental Equality Champion.)</b></p>  | <p>The consultation process highlighted a number of concerns which are detailed in the attached report. Each of these concerns will be addressed by the Project Board.</p>   |
| <p><b>3) What action is proposed to overcome any negative impacts? E.g. involving community groups in the development or delivery of the policy or practice, providing information in community languages etc. see Good Practice on DCC equalities web page</b></p>                                 | <p>The Project Board and experience based on existing campus sites will be taken into account to support a positive outcome.</p>   |
| <p><b>4) Is there a justification for continuing with this policy even if it cannot be amended or changed to end or reduce inequality without compromising its intended outcome? (If the policy that shows actual or potential unlawful discrimination you must stop and seek legal advice)</b></p> | <p><b>If yes please give further details</b></p>   |
| <p><b>5) Has a 'Full' Equality Impact Assessment been recommended? (If the policy is a major one or is likely to have a major impact on protected characteristicscommunitiesa Full Equality Impact Assessment may be required) Seek advice from your departmental Equality Champion.</b></p>        | <p>No</p>  |

|  |  |
|--|--|
| <b>6) How will the policy be monitored?<br/>(How will you know it is doing<br/>what it is intended to do? e.g.<br/>data collection, customer survey<br/>etc.</b> | Progress will be monitored by the Project Board. |
|--|--|

## Part 4



Name of Department or Partnership: Department of Education and Department of Leisure and Communities

**Type of Document**

|                                      |                                     |
|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| <b>Human Resource Policy</b>         | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| <b>General Policy</b>                | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| <b>Strategy/Service</b>              | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| <b>Change Papers/Local Procedure</b> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| <b>Guidelines and Protocols</b>      | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| <b>Other</b>                         | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |

**Contact Information**

|                                      |                                      |
|--------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| <b>Manager Responsible</b>           | <b>Author Responsible</b>            |
| Name Michael Wood                    | Name Michael Wood                    |
| Designation Director of Education    | Designation Director of Education    |
| Base Dundee House                    | Base Dundee House                    |
| Telephone 433701                     | Telephone 433071                     |
| Email michael.wood@dundeecity.gov.uk | Email michael.wood@dundeecity.gov.uk |

|  |  |                          |
|--|--|--------------------------|
| <b>Signature of author of the policy:</b>          |   | <b>Date 12 June 2013</b> |
| <b>Signature of Director/Head of Service area:</b> |  | <b>Date 12 June 2013</b> |
| <b>Name of Director / Head of Service:</b>         | <b>Michael Wood</b>  |                          |
| <b>Date of next policy review:</b>                 |  |                          |