

**REPORT TO: PLANNING AND TRANSPORT COMMITTEE - 11 JUNE 2007**

**REPORT ON: DUNDEE CITY REGION RETAIL STUDY - IMPLEMENTATION**

**REPORT BY: DIRECTOR OF PLANNING & TRANSPORTATION**

**REPORT NO: 263-2007**

## **1 PURPOSE OF REPORT**

1.1 To seek the Committee's agreement to a programme of implementation measures arising from the Dundee City Region Retail Study.

## **2 RECOMMENDATION**

2.1 It is recommended that the Committee agrees to the proposed actions set out in this report and its appendix.

## **3 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS**

3.1 There are no financial implications directly associated with this report.

## **4 SUSTAINABILITY POLICY IMPLICATIONS**

4.1 The report covers the following sustainability principles:

- Compliance with Environmental Legislation;
- Transport and Travel;
- Built Environment;
- Strategic Environmental Assessment; and
- Anti Poverty.

## **5 EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES IMPLICATIONS**

5.1 The report includes recommendations which seek to ensure that the population as a whole has convenient access to a suitable standard of shopping provision.

## **6 BACKGROUND**

6.1 At its meeting held on 8 January 2007 the Committee considered Report 8-2007 on the Dundee City Region Shopping Study. The study had been undertaken on behalf of the City Council by Colliers CRE. The report set out the context for the study and summarised its key findings. The Committee noted these findings and remitted the Director of Planning and Transportation to produce a further report assessing the study's findings and advising on implementation measures for the relevant elements of the study. This report addresses that remit.

## **7 INTRODUCTION**

7.1 Report 8-2007 indicated the retail study's remit as comprising the following:

- a review of existing key policies against relevant national trends, commercial pressures and the potential implications of revised national policy on town centres and retailing (SPP8);
- a quantitative statistical analysis of retail floorspace requirements over the periods of 2005-2011 and 2012-2017;
- an indication of how any floorspace requirements which may be identified can be accommodated in a manner which does not harm the vitality and viability of the city, town and district centres;
- a qualitative assessment of the city region's main shopping centres (including district centres) and major out of centre shopping facilities (including the retail parks). This exercise to cover the settlements of Alyth, Arbroath, Blairgowrie, Brechin, Carnoustie, Coupar Angus, Cupar, Dundee, Forfar, Glenrothes, Kirriemuir, Montrose and St Andrews;
- in the case of Dundee's city and district centres, carry out an assessment of the contribution of small speciality shops towards the vitality and viability of these centres;
- in the light of the above assessment, consider the future of these shopping centres and indicate measures which could assist their attraction and competitiveness;
- carry out a review of the goods range restrictions applying to the retail parks and other out of centre shopping locations within the city region and indicate where there is a need for any adjustments to the current approach to these controls; and
- assess the Gas Holder Site in East Dock Street, Dundee and advise upon its possible contribution towards meeting future retail requirements.

7.2 The study's conclusions on a number of these matters include findings or recommendations which require follow up action by the City Council. The following section of this report together with the Appendix briefly set out the study's provisions in respect of these issues and recommend follow up actions for the Committee's approval.

## **8 STUDY CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDED FOLLOW UP ACTIONS**

### **8.1 Review of Existing Key Policies**

#### **a Study Conclusions**

The study examines existing key retail policies against the changing context provided, among other things, by evolving national Policy (SPP8) and changing trends relative to retailing. The main conclusions arising from this exercise were as follows:

- while the Dundee and Angus Structure together with the Dundee Local Plan Review largely reflect the NPPG8 Guidance on which they were based, the

recent publication of SPP8 (which supersedes NPPG8) raises new matters which will need to be addressed in future plans;

- the "town centres first" adopted by the City Council has been instrumental in attracting investment to the city centre;
- the investment in out of centre developments, including Kingsway West, has been successful, without prejudicing development in the city centre;
- market forces have contributed to the decline of certain district centres and future planning policies should seek to reverse this decline - there is a need to consider whether town centre strategies are required for these centres; and
- there is a need to consider whether it is necessary to provide in future for "retail trade parks" trading in, for example, tiles, plumbing and other building supplies.

b Proposed Actions

- in order to reflect the provisions of SPP8 future development plans will identify and define the roles of "commercial centres" (see under the heading "Retail Parks" in the Appendix to this report);
- while the value of town centre strategies for the struggling centres is recognised, considerable work has now been devoted to preparing physical regeneration frameworks for these centres (Albert Street, Hilltown and Lochee). However, consideration will be given to whether further action is appropriate in the context of SPP8 (see also under the heading "District Centres" in the Appendix to this Report); and
- while it is not clear whether sufficient market demand exists for the creation of "retail trades parks" in Dundee, this will be kept under review and pursued, if appropriate, in the course of future plan preparation.

8.2 Quantitative Retail Need

Report 8-2007 noted the crucial role of this part of the study. By forecasting future retail floorspace needs for the city, this provides a basis for planning how these needs will be accommodated. The forecasts provide indications of the amount of retail floorspace that the city can hope to support in the years 2011 and 2017. This is broken down into the following:

- convenience goods (food and other day to day purchases); and
- comparison goods (non food).

The comparison goods element is broken down further into bulky goods (furniture, carpets etc) and non bulky goods (clothing, footwear, leisure goods, other personal purchases etc).

Study Conclusions

The detailed future floorspace requirements are set out in detail in Report 8-2007. However, the key conclusions can be summarised as follows:

a Bulky Comparison Goods

- there is significant scope to accommodate additional bulky goods floorspace provision over the period till 2011 and also between 2011 and 2017;
- in addition to out of centre provision, this includes a generous provision for city centre bulky goods floorspace; and
- the Gas Holder site in Dock Street should be identified for bulky goods retailing in the longer term, following redevelopment at the Stack and the Travel Dundee site.

b Non Bulky Comparison Goods

- there is scope for steady growth in the city centre's non bulky goods floorspace over both the period up to 2011 and from 2011 until 2017;
- future available expenditure will be insufficient to support non bulky goods floorspace provision in out of centre locations; and
- it is also likely to be insufficient to support additional non bulky floorspace provision in the district centres.

c Convenience Goods

- future available expenditure does not indicate any scope for significant additional convenience goods floorspace provision (ie beyond existing commitments) within the city over the period up to 2017; and
- it also suggests that the city now has the benefit of a good supply of convenience goods floorspace and that additional foodstore provision is not require to meet a capacity requirement (although there may be further opportunities to improve the distribution of that provision).

Proposed Actions

a Bulky Comparison Goods

- subject to the satisfaction of the relevant provisions of the Dundee Local Plan Review Policy 26A relating to the Gas Holder site, Dock Street, support the redevelopment of the site for bulky goods retail warehousing. This will include the requirement that the site is redeveloped in conjunction with the redevelopment of the Bus Depot site to its west which is currently allocated for bulky goods retailing;
- proceed on the basis that the city centre bulky goods requirement will be accommodated within standard city centre type shop units as opposed to retail warehouses.

b Non Bulky Comparison Goods

- continue to support the locations identified in the Dundee Local Plan Review as priority locations for new comparison floorspace, provision, ie Overgate Centre, Forum Centre and Wellgate Centre;
- investigate the scope to accommodate comparison floorspace provision within the Central Waterfront Development; and
- examine the potential of the south eastern sector of the city centre to accommodate any remaining requirements.

c Convenience Goods

- in the light of the identified generous provision of convenience goods floorspace and the committed foodstores yet to commence trading, no further provision should be made for major foodstores meantime. Any planning applications for such developments will be considered against current Local Plan policies.

8.3 Qualitative Analysis of Retail Centres

The study includes qualitative assessments of the City Centre and other major retail destinations throughout the city and beyond. This includes analysis of their strengths, weaknesses, roles and recommendations for their improvement. Given the detailed nature of these assessments, they are addressed separately in the Appendix to this Report.

8.4 Goods Range Restrictions

For a number of years, Dundee's retail parks and most of its major out of centre shopping destinations have been subject to a range of goods restrictions. These are geared to safeguarding the vitality and viability of the City Centre and the District Centres by preventing potentially damaging diversion of trade in goods ranges which are vital to their survival. The goods range restrictions are incorporated into the Local Plan's policies and are applied to individual developments by either legal agreements or planning conditions.

The study remit included the requirement to reassess the goods range restrictions and advise on their continued relevance. The key conclusions from this exercise are outlined below.

a Study Conclusions

- the goods range restrictions have been successful, are appropriate and should not be changed; and
- the growth of non food sales in supermarkets can impact on existing centres. It is therefore positive that Dundee has restrictions on these sales in place.

b Proposed Actions

- in the light of the above, no amendments are proposed in respect of the current goods range restrictions; and
- future requests for amendments to goods range restriction should continue to be addressed in the light of the relevant Local Plan policies.

**9 CONCLUSIONS**

9.1 The implementation of the study findings will require action over a number of areas and will have significant implications for future retail provision across the city. While some of the proposed actions are relatively straightforward, others will require considerable additional research and negotiation. The Committee will be advised as appropriate as these matters are progressed.

**10 CONSULTATIONS**

10.1 The Chief Executive, Depute Chief Executive (Support Services), Depute Chief Executive (Finance), Assistant Chief Executive (Community Planning) and Director of Economic Development have been consulted and are in agreement with the contents of this report.

**11 BACKGROUND PAPERS**

11.1 The Dundee City Region Shopping Study 2006 (Colliers CRE).

11.2 Committee Report 8-2007 - Dundee City Region Shopping Study.

Mike Galloway  
Director of Planning & Transportation

Ian Mudie  
Planning

IGSM/AB/KM/R6

10 May 2007

Dundee City Council  
Tayside House  
Dundee

## APPENDIX 1

## SHOPPING CENTRE RECOMMENDATIONS AND PROPOSED NEXT STEPS

Study Recommendations	Proposed Actions
<b>City Centre</b>	
Ensure that future planning policy seeks to protect the city centre as the major retail destination in the region in line with SPP8 guidance.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• acknowledge the City Centre's special role in the forthcoming City Region Plan and also in the Local Development Plan for the city; and</li> <li>• ensure that future Development Plans continue to resist proposals which could impact adversely on the City Centre's role.</li> </ul>
Give consideration to measures to support the continue presence of independent retailers in the city centre.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• acknowledge the role performed by independent city centre retailers in the future Local Development Plan for the city; and</li> <li>• consider possible support measures for such shops in the context of the City Centre Strategy (see below).</li> </ul>
Address the issue of limited representation of department stores.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• where feasible, examine scope for new department store provision when providing for identified retail floorspace requirements in the city centre; and</li> <li>• ensure that the future Local Development Plan for Dundee recognises the potential for new department store provision in the city centre.</li> </ul>
Increase floorspace provision in the City Centre by utilising the redevelopment opportunity presented by the Forum Centre.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• ensure that the future Local Development Plan for Dundee retains the current Local Plan's recognition of the retail development potential of the Forum Centre; and</li> <li>• produce an updated Site Planning Brief for the Forum Centre.</li> </ul>
In keeping with SPP8 guidance, produce a town centre strategy for the city centre.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• develop city centre strategy in partnership with the City Centre Action Group and in consultation with other relevant interests; and</li> <li>• ensure that the relevant elements of this strategy are reflected in future Development Plans.</li> </ul>
<b>District Centres</b>	
a <u>Lochee</u>	
Explore how major refurbishment or redevelopment within the District Centre can be promoted in order to provide a catalyst for the regeneration of the area. The Highgate Centre opportunity should be examined in this context.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• these matters are currently being pursued in the context of the Lochee Physical Regeneration Framework.</li> </ul>

Study Recommendations	Proposed Actions
<p>Given the approval for proposals to regenerate the Stack Leisure Park, emphasis should be placed on improving pedestrian linkage along Methven Street. If the new development is not suitably integrated with the District Centre then possible spin off benefits may be lost.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• this is recognised in the current Local Plan for the city and approval for the Stack proposals was linked to the need for improvement of the Methven Street link;</li> <li>• the improvement of this link will continue to be pursued in the context of the Stack proposals.</li> </ul>
<p>Improve entrances to Lochee from the Sinclair Street car park in order to encourage visitors.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• the draft redevelopment proposals incorporated in the Lochee Physical Regeneration Framework envisage significant changes to the car parking provision to the west of the shopping centre. Potential improvements to the links to Lochee High Street will be examined in the context of the redevelopment proposals.</li> </ul>
<p>The results of the Lochee Physical Regeneration Project should feed into a Town Centre Strategy along the lines advocated in SPP8.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• a number of the elements of a Town Centre Strategy are already addressed in the Consultative Draft of the Lochee Physical Regeneration Framework. However, consideration will be given to whether additional measures might be appropriate in the light of the provisions of SPP8.</li> </ul>
<p><b>b</b> <u>Perth Road</u></p>	
<p>Protect the area in its primary role as a provider of local and speciality shopping provision and encourage the retention of its independent retailers.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• ensure that measures for the improvement of the centre (Local Plan Proposal 5 - District Centres) have regard to these aims;</li> <li>• acknowledge the role performed by such retailers in the District Centre in the future Local Development Plan for the city; and</li> <li>• provide support for appropriate complementary visitor facilities with the centre.</li> </ul>
<p><b>c</b> <u>Hilltown</u></p>	
<p>The primary development led opportunity within the centre lies within the retail area occupying the former Bow Bridge Works site. This presents an opportunity for a discount food retailer and could provide a catalyst for the regeneration of the area.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• the availability of this development opportunity will continue to be brought to the attention of retail operators and developers.</li> </ul>
<p>Future planning policy should seek to encourage the occupancy of units and continue to promote a diversity of uses within Hilltown. Consideration should be given to the means of increasing the size of retail units in order to create more attractive retail floorspace.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• consideration will be given to the possibility of promoting the targeted upgrading, remodelling and expansion of existing units in order to achieve these aims. This could include the potential scope for grant assistance to assist in securing these improvements.</li> </ul>



Study Recommendations	Proposed Actions
<p>The possibility of reducing the extent of the District Centre boundary should be examined. There is scope to reduce the boundary to the south and to consider alternative ground floor uses (eg housing) for the excluded area.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>review the District Centre boundary and incorporate the revised boundary into the future Local Development Plan for the city. This will aim to focus commercial investment on a more tightly defined District Centre and encourage alternative uses in what is currently the failing part of the centre.</li> </ul>
<p>Develop a Town Centre Strategy for the centre in accordance with guidance in SPP8.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a number of the elements of a Town Centre Strategy are already addressed in the Consultative Draft of the Hilltown Physical Regeneration Framework. However, consideration will be given to whether additional measures might be appropriate in the light of the provisions of SPP8.</li> </ul>
<p>d <u>Albert Street</u></p>	
<p>Increased trade may be attracted to the shops in Albert Street from the new edge of centre Lidl foodstore in Dura Street. This will be dependent on pedestrian linkages of a high standard.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>assess the standard of existing pedestrian linkages between the Lidl site and Albert Street and consider scope for improvements.</li> </ul>
<p>The centre's core area lacks continuity due to interruption of shopping uses by ground floor residential uses. Consideration should be given to allowing change of use of such residential uses.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>the existing Local Plan policies would not preclude such changes of use in suitable circumstances. In addition, Policy 38 provides explicit encouragement for new shops uses in District Centre. No further action is therefore proposed in this instance.</li> </ul>
<p>Develop a Town Centre Strategy for the centre in accordance with guidance in SPP8.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>the Stobswell Neighbourhood Regeneration Framework (2002) effectively addresses this requirement and its various provisions are currently being implemented.</li> </ul>
<p>e <u>Broughty Ferry</u></p>	
<p>The assessment of Broughty Ferry indicates that it is performing well and is benefiting from the ongoing improvements arising from the Broughty Ferry Study. Against this background, no specific recommendations are put forward in relation to this centre.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>noted.</li> </ul>
<p><b>Retail Parks</b></p>	
<p>a <u>Kingsway West</u></p>	
<p>The assessment of Kingsway West notes its success and its various strengths. As a result, no specific physical actions are recommended for this retail park.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>noted.</li> </ul>
<p>Future development plans should recognise the retail park as a commercial centre in line with the provisions of SPP8.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>agreed. This will be pursued, as appropriate, in the context of the forthcoming Dundee City Regional Plan and the subsequent Local Development Plan for the city.</li> </ul>

Study Recommendations	Proposed Actions
b <u>Kingsway East</u>	
<p>The assessment notes the less than ideal layout of the retail park and the limited architectural appeal of a number of its buildings. However, no specific actions are recommended in respect of these issues.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>noted. The City Council would have difficulty in directly addressing these issues at present. However, if scope for change at the Retail Park should arise in the future then the opportunity to pursue these matters should be considered.</li> </ul>
<p>Future Development Plans should recognise the retail park as a Commercial Centre in line with the provisions of SPP8.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>agreed. This will be pursued, as appropriate, in the context of the forthcoming Dundee City Region Plan and the subsequent Local Development Plan for the city.</li> </ul>
c <u>Gallagher Retail Park, East Dock Street</u>	
<p>The assessment highlights the success of the Gallagher Retail Park and the high quality environment which it offers. However, it also indicates that its pedestrian links with the city centre involve a number of obstacles and road crossing points.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>the issue of pedestrian links within the city centre will be addressed when preparing the city centre strategy.</li> </ul>
<p>Future development plans should recognise the retail park as a Commercial Centre in line with the provisions of SPP8.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>agreed. This will be pursued, as appropriate in the context of the forthcoming Dundee City Region Plan and the subsequent Local Development Plan for the city.</li> </ul>
<b>Centres Outwith Dundee</b>	
<p>The retail study includes assessments of a range of other shopping centres falling outwith Dundee, but within its retail catchment. These include details of their strengths and weaknesses and possible opportunities.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>it is proposed to consider these assessments and recommendations with the City Region planning partners in the course of preparation of the Dundee City Region Plan.</li> </ul>