

REPORT TO: POLICY AND RESOURCES COMMITTEE – 24 JUNE 2013
REPORT ON: SCOTTISH LOCAL GOVERNMENT BENCHMARKING OVERVIEW
REPORT BY: CHIEF EXECUTIVE
REPORT NO: 252-2013

1 PURPOSE OF REPORT

This report introduces members to the annual Scottish Local Government Benchmarking Framework and recommends how it should be followed up and reported on in future years.

2 RECOMMENDATIONS

The Committee is recommended to:

- 2.1 Remit the Scrutiny Committee in future years to review the comparisons.
- 2.2 Include the indicators used in the study in the Council's self assessment report published annually, as part of measuring continuous improvement in line with the Council Plan and the Accounts Commission's statutory direction on reporting performance indicators
- 2.3 Instruct Directors to include the indicators relevant to their department in their Service Plan annual report to ensure continuous improvement is monitored each year.

3 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

None

4 MAIN TEXT

- 4.1 To assist each local authority deliver Best Value the Scottish Society of Local Authority Chief Executives (SOLACE) initiated a joint benchmarking project with the Improvement Service to agree a list of indicators that can be produced each year as part of a benchmarking framework. Following a two year process of research and consultation the first annual publication was issued in March 2013. The information is available to the public on the Improvement Service website and includes data for 2010-2011 and 2011-2012.
- 4.2 The first edition of the local government benchmarking framework provides figures on 54 measures of local government cost, performance and customer satisfaction for each local authority to enable comparison. The Appendix provides an analysis of the data for Dundee City Council, showing how Dundee sits compared to the average and the minimum and maximum figure from the set of 32 local authorities.
- 4.3 An overview report by the Improvement Service highlighted some key findings on local government services in general and how best to consider the comparability of the information. The national overview report highlights the key finding that cost related indicators are almost uniformly down and performance indicators are generally up. This is significant evidence that Scottish local authorities are reducing costs and protecting front line service performance.
- 4.4 Care is being taken to advise users of the information that it is not a simple league table across all indicators and 32 local authorities. There are clearly differences in urban and rural settings and the demographics of each local authority differ in terms of deprivation, age and mobility. These factors affect different services in different ways. Where relevant the urban and SIMD deprivation rankings have been given in the Appendix. The point of the exercise is to prompt Councils to seek to understand if there is an opportunity to learn

more about how a potentially comparable local authority is providing a service at lower cost or delivering higher performance. The benchmarking framework will develop each year and aims to develop new insights into what levels of cost and performance are achievable. It is recommended that this report is considered by the Scrutiny Committee on an annual basis.

- 4.5 Over the years the Accounts Commission have been scaling back the number of national performance indicators that they specify as statutory indicators. The purpose of this has been to enable the local government sector to develop its own set of indicators. Following agreement by SOLACE, the Accounts Commission have endorsed the approach and have included it as part of the statutory direction. In effect this provides a statutory requirement for all councils to participate in the benchmarking study. Dundee City Council has for many years reported annually on the comparable indicators and it is recommended that any new indicators from this framework augment those reported in the annual performance self assessment.
- 4.6 To ensure that each department is taking on board any scope for improvement annually or in comparison with other authorities, it is recommended that they feature in annual departmental service plan reports from next year.
- 4.7 The paragraphs below give an overview, based on feedback from officers, on how Dundee City Council compares and where there is enough scope in the range of figures from comparable authorities to follow up enquires with peers to learn more about the cause of the differences.

4.8 Children's Services

There are twelve indicators in this service area and Dundee improved over the two years in four (33%) and was above the average for Scotland in four (33%) and above average within a subset of councils that also have higher levels of multiple deprivation in four (33%). The cost per pre school place is the second lowest of the group of councils with high levels of deprivation. Dundee's educational attainment levels reflects the high proportion of deprivation and the council is taking steps to improve its early intervention, early years services and prevention strategies to ensure children's capacity to achieve at school is increased. Figures for the past five years show continuous improvement in attainment across all Dundee schools.

4.9 Corporate Services

There are eight indicators in this group and Dundee improved over the two years in seven of them (88%) and was above the Scottish median in three (38%) and three (38%) in the urban comparable group of 18 councils. Dundee has one of the lowest democratic core costs and has one of the best records of paying invoices in 30 days. The per capita cost of collecting council tax is one of the highest but it is generally comparable with the other cities and Dundee's smaller population increases the unit cost per dwelling.

4.10 Social Work

There are four indicators in this group and Dundee has improved in two (out of three with an annual comparison) over the two years but is generally below the median for Scotland. Costs for home care are one of the highest in Scotland and further investigation is underway on this data.

4.11 Culture and Leisure

There are six indicators in this group and Dundee compares better than the Scottish average in five of them. In relation to cost per visit, Dundee's sports facilities are the third best value for money in Scotland.

4.12 Environmental Services

There are eighteen indicators in this section and Dundee compares better than the national and urban group average in ten (55%). Customer satisfaction with street cleaning and the street cleaning performance is one of the highest amongst the urban authorities but it is also one of the highest costs per 1000 population. The percentage of waste arising that is recycled is one of the lowest of urban authorities. The percentage of roads (Class a, b, and c) that require maintenance is one of the lowest in the country. The figures reveal that over two years Dundee reduced its costs of parks and open spaces per 1000 population by 15% but is still spending more than the Scottish average. Customer satisfaction with parks and open spaces is higher than the Scottish average. Performance with handling noise complaints is high.

4.13 Housing

There are five indicators in this group and over the two years Dundee significantly improved in four of them. Taking account of the local authorities that have high levels of deprivation, and considering that data from Glasgow and Inverclyde is not included for Housing services, Dundee is performing comparatively well in the percentage of council dwellings meeting the Scottish Housing Quality Standard and the percentage of council houses that are energy efficiency.

4.14 Corporate Assets

There are two indicators in this set regarding the condition of the council's operational property assets. Both have improved and one is above the national and urban average.

5 **POLICY IMPLICATIONS**

This report has been screened for any policy implications in respect of Sustainability, Strategic Environmental Assessment, Anti-Poverty, Equality Impact Assessment and Risk Management. There are no major issues due to the nature of the report.

6 **CONSULTATIONS**

All Directors have been consulted on this report.

7 **BACKGROUND PAPERS**

2013 Scottish Local Government Benchmarking Overview Report - Improvement Service

Improvement Service / SOLACE Benchmarking Data Set April 2013

Produced by:

Information & Research Team
Chief Executive

Contents

Page No.

Contents

Introduction	6
Children's Services	7
Cost Per Pupil	7
Attainment	8
Looked After Children	9
Corporate Services	10
General	10
Council Tax	12
Social Work	13
Culture & Leisure	15
Sports Facilities	15
Library Visit	15
Museum Visits	16
Environment Services	17
Waste / Street Cleaning	17
Roads Maintenance	18
Parks / Open space	19
Domestic Noise Complaints	19
Housing Services	21
Corporate Assets	22

Introduction

This document used the Improvement Service / SOLACE Benchmarking data that was published in April 2013. The report uses a fixed table layout to highlight aspects of the Dundee City performance in each indicator. The table headings used within this document are:

Example table

Indicator	Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank in Scotland	Rank in SIMD group	Rank in Urban Group
Democratic Core Costs per 1,000 population	10/11	£30,224	£5,033.60 to £346,294.60	2 nd	12	4	9
	11/12	£24,566	£11,448.50 to £383,911.1	1 st	6	3	5

What this table shows:

Indicator:

Name of the indicator being analysed

Year:

Each indicator shows data for 10/11 and 11/12 (where available)

Range:

Shows the range between the lowest and highest number between all 32 Local Authorities

Quartile:

25% groupings of Local Authorities by rank.

1st Quartile = Highest 25% ranked Local Authorities

4th Quartile = Lowest 25% ranked Local Authorities

Rank in Scotland:

Dundee City Performance ranked against all 31 other Local Authorities

i.e. the table above says DCC was ranked 12th out of 32 in 2010/11

Rank in SIMD: Dundee City Performance ranked against 7 other Local Authorities that share the same deprivation characteristics These are:	Rank in Urban Group: Dundee City Performance ranked against 17 other Local Authorities that classed as Urban within the Improvement Service Benchmarking publication		
Clackmannanshire	Clackmannanshire	North Lanarkshire	Glasgow City
North Ayrshire			
West Dunbartonshire	East Dunbartonshire	Inverclyde	Midlothian
North Lanarkshire			
Inverclyde	East Lothian	West Lothian	Edinburgh City
Renfrewshire			
Glasgow City	North Ayrshire	Fife	Aberdeen City
	South Lanarkshire	Renfrewshire	East Renfrewshire
	West Dunbartonshire	Falkirk	

Children's Services

Cost Per Pupil

Indicator		Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank in Scotland	Rank in SIMD group
	Cost per Primary School pupil	10/11	£4,732	£4,242.40 to £8,608.20	2 nd	14	3
		11/12	£4,552	£4,120.80 to £8,765.00	2 nd	9	4

Service comments

The cost per pupil is determined by a number of factors including school roll, staffing levels and operational costs. The cost per pupil will vary from school to school and is higher in the smallest schools. The reduction in the overall size of the school estate and the move to an increased number of campus sites in the short to medium term will impact on pupil costs.

Indicator		Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank	Rank in SIMD group
	Secondary cost per pupil	10/11	£6,840	£5,321 to £12,385	4 th	25	7
		11/12	£6,761	£5,346 to £12,826	4 th	26	8

Service comments

The secondary cost per pupil is influenced by the size and scale of each secondary. There are a number of secondary schools in the city which have a pupil population of less than 1000, less than 750 and in two cases less than 600.

Indicator		Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank in Scotland	Rank in SIMD group
	Cost per pre-school place	10/11	£3,144	£2,058 to £6,611	2 nd	14	1
		11/12	£2,949	£2,105 to £4,769	2 nd	16	2

Service comments

The cost per pre-school place has a median ranking. The cost at the top end has reduced significantly from £6611 in 10/11 to £4769 in 11/12.

Attainment

Indicator		Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank in Scotland	Rank in SIMD group
	% of pupils gaining 5+ Awards at Level 5	10/11	27%	24% to 61%	4 th	31	7
		11/12	26%	26% to 67%	4 th	32	8
	% of pupils gaining 5+ Awards at Level 6	10/11	20%	15% to 49%	4 th	26	3
		11/12	20%	16% to 53%	4 th	28	5
	% of pupils gaining 5+ awards at Level 5 by SIMD (Pre-Appeal)	10/11	13.0%	10% to 25%	3 rd	20	8
		11/12	12.4%	0% to 34%	3 rd	23	8
	% of pupils gaining 5+ awards at Level 6 by SIMD (Pre-Appeal)	10/11	7.4%	0% to 27%	2 nd	16	7
		11/12	6.6%	0% to 32%	3 rd	24	8
	% of adults satisfied with local schools	10/11	81.2%	75% to 96%	4 th	25	6
		11/12					
	Proportion of Pupils Entering Positive Destinations	10/11	88.7%	85% to 93%	3 rd	18	4
		11/12	90.0%	85% to 96%	2 nd	16	3

Service comments

The selected indicators represent the top level of awards in the SQA system. They do not reflect the improved attainment across all other SQA measures and are very limited in scope.

At a national level, the performance of S4 pupils is measured against a number of specific outcomes based on performance in Access 3 and Standard Grade examinations. The performance of pupils in Dundee has increased across all measures over the last 5 years and the ongoing aim for schools is a continued rise in pupil attainment across each measure. The pre-appeal results for 2012 show increases in almost all S4 measures. For the first time, pupil performance at English and Maths at Level 3 has now reached 93% both meeting our target and matching performance of our comparator authorities. The situation is similar for pupils attaining 5 passes or more at Level 4 and the performance at level 5 has remained the same as last year. Progress has been made but it is recognised that there is headroom for further improvement and this is a focus area across our schools.

The overall performance of S5 pupils in the 2012 Higher examinations saw increases in all the level 6 measures. The attainment of any S5 group is largely based on the strength of the group's performance in the previous year's S4 examination diet. With this in mind the performance of S5 from their S4 baseline was good. It is important to note that S5 pupils do not take Standard Grade courses and that many pupils now undertake Intermediate Courses (these are not listed as key measures at the end of S5) or a two year Higher course leading to the examination at the end of S6. This is why the performance data for the end of S6 sets out a clearer picture of overall pupil performance since by the end of S6, 30% of pupils now leave school with three or more Highers while 20% of pupils leave with five or more Highers.

Our performance against our benchmarked authorities in STACS has improved year on year over the last 5 years. It is accepted that Dundee and Glasgow have no authorities that are in the 'very close' category because of the levels of deprivation in the city.

Positive destinations continues to rise in the city and now has moved for the first time above 90% and is now above the national average.

Due to the restrictions of the present statistical systems for examination results a completely new format of results is being prepared for session 2013/14. We are currently looking at the introduction of this new system and the implications for the city.

Looked After Children

Indicator	Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank in Scotland	Rank in SIMD group
Weekly gross costs per 'Looked After' Child in a residential setting	10/11	£3,123	£1,401 to £12,615	3 rd	23	7
	11/12	£3,172	£1,697 to £10,519	3 rd	23	7
Weekly gross costs per 'Looked After' Child in the community	10/11	£243	£48 to £446	3 rd	20	7
	11/12	£287	£52 to £405	3 rd	23	7
Balance of care for looked after Children: % of children being looked after in the Community	10/11	93.8%	77.8% to 95.5%	1 st	3	2
	11/12	93.6%	76.9% to 94.8%	1 st	3	2

Service comments

Dundee City Council plans to collaborate with Loughborough University and 2 other local authorities in Scotland to pilot the use of a 'Cost and Consequences of Placing children in care' model. The model offers the potential to examine the relationship between the costs and outcomes of social care interventions in a way that will allow detailed analysis of expenditure on children looked after in residential and community settings.

Dundee City Council's Kinship Carer scheme replaces the Link Carer scheme established in 1997 and provides for the assessment and approval and support to relatives or friends caring for looked after children placed apart from their birth parents. This and a continuing commitment to family based care for children and young people wherever possible is reflected in the third place ranking for community based care.

Corporate Services

General

Indicator	Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank in Scotland	Rank in SIMD group	Rank in Urban Group
Democratic Core Costs per 1,000 population	10/11	£30,224	£5,033.60 to £346,294.60	2 nd	12	4	9
	11/12	£24,566	£11,448.50 to £383,911.1	1 st	6	3	5

Service comments

This is an amalgamation of different costs and services which are not managed as one discrete item. The figure and Rank in Scotland is considered to be satisfactory.

Indicator	Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank in Scotland	Rank in SIMD group	Rank in Urban Group
Central Support services as a % of Total Gross expenditure	10/11	4.6%	2.2% to 9.3%	2 nd	16	6	10
	11/12	4.1%	2.7% to 7.8%	2 nd	9	6	8

Service comments

This is an amalgamation of different costs and services which are not managed as one discrete item. The figure and Rank in Scotland is considered to be satisfactory.

Indicator	Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank in Scotland	Rank in SIMD group	Rank in Urban Group
% of Invoices that were paid within 30 days	10/11	95.1%	74.0% to 95.6%	1 st	3	2	3
	11/12	92.6%	79.6% to 97.0%	1 st	7	4	7

Service comments

There has always been a strong commitments to the timeous payment of suppliers, particularly local ones. This is reflected in continuing sound performance

Indicator/s		Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank in Scotland	Rank in SIMD group
	Days Lost per FTE Employee	10/11	10.0	7.4 to 13.9	3 rd	20	4
		11/12	9.9	7.6 to 13.5	3 rd	24	6

Service comments

Days lost per FTE employee - The Strategic Management Team considers the rolling 12 month absence levels across all departments of the Council, at its monthly meeting. The figures are also shared and discussed with the trade unions monthly. There is recognition that improvement is desirable. The absence management procedure is currently under review and all interested parties are being consulted. The intention is to focus more on improving attendance with earlier intervention and involvement of Serco, the Occupational Health provider appointed last year.

Indicator/s		Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank in Scotland	Rank in SIMD group
	Percentage of employees in the highest 2% of earners that are female	10/11	32.8%	12.1% to 54.8%	4 th	26	8
		11/12	33.3%	24.6% to 54.8%	3 rd	24	8
	Percentage of employees in the highest 5% of earners that are female	10/11	38.4%	23.8% to 57.7%	4 th	27	8
		11/12	40.5%	21.3% to 60.1%	4 th	28	8

Service comments

The numbers of employees affected are relatively small, with the result that a few people of either gender leaving and/or being replaced by someone of the opposite gender can have a noticeable effect. Our percentages in both categories have improved over the two years shown, but in one case our rank in Scotland got worse. We are always working from the employees that we already have, so reduced turnover and non filling of some posts are factors that tend to perpetuate the status quo. As always the Council endeavours to appoint the best candidates to vacant posts.

Council Tax

Indicator		Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank in Scotland	Rank in SIMD group	Rank in Urban Group
	The cost per dwelling of collecting Council Tax	10/11	£22.26	£4.20 to £26.60	4 th	31	8	18
		11/12	£20.37	£3.00 to £24.20	4 th	31	8	18
	Percentage of income due from Council Tax received by the end of the year	10/11	92.9%	92.3% to 97.6%	4 th	31	7	17
		11/12	93.3%	92.6% to 97.9%	4 th	31	7	17

Service comments

Dundee City Council is a relatively small urban authority which means it does not benefit from the same economies of scale as others with regard to cost per dwelling. However over the period shown, performance has improved in both areas and this will continue to be targeted.

Social Work

Indicator		Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank in Scotland	Rank in SIMD group
	Home Care Costs per Hr (Over 65)	10/11	£23.54	£7.60 to £31.10	3 rd	24	7
		11/12	£25.36	£8.00 to £29.50	4 th	27	8
	% of people 65+ with intensive needs receiving care at home	10/11	30.5%	11.1% to 54.5%	3 rd	21	7
		11/12	31.4%	12.2% to 51.3%	3 rd	20	7
	% of Adults satisfied with social care of social work services	10/11	61.3%	46.9% to 84.4%	3 rd	21	7
		11/12	Data from the Scottish Household Survey is only published every 2 years. The next set of data will be published in August 2013.				

Service comments

Home Care Costs per Hr (Over 65)

Concern has been raised nationally as to the consistency of approach taken by local authorities in calculating the Local Financial Review (LFR) figures which form the basis of expenditure used to calculate the above benchmark figures. The LFR is currently being reviewed.

A number of factors have impacted upon the movement of Dundee's indicator from 2010/11 to 2011/12. Investment in the service increased by over £300k, primarily as a result of the Older People's Change Fund, however given the necessary process of transition, this did not result in an instant significant increase in the number of weekly home care hours delivered. Indeed the weekly snapshot figures used to compare the 2 years reduced significantly from 2010/11 to 2011/12 resulting in a further increase in the unit cost. This is inconsistent with the levels of demand being experienced and appears to have been an unusually low week.

Further investigatory work will be undertaken with benchmarking partners to identify why the differences have arisen, taking into consideration the shape of service delivery including the balance of in-house/external service provision (lower cost provision), enablement services and progress towards self directed support.

% of people 65+ with intensive needs (+10 hours of care per week) receiving care at home

Models of service provision are being revised to shift the balance of care from residential care to care at home and we are striving to provide services that are rehabilitative and preventative.

Homecare is one of many types of care which increases independence and assists people to live safely in their own homes for longer. The need for high packages of homecare will reduce as complimentary services such as enablement rehabilitate or prevent deterioration of health. This has allowed us to target resources to those most in need.

In Dundee homecare consists of practical supports and also personal care, therefore the denominator is larger than some areas which offer only personal care, so caution should be taken when benchmarking.

% of Adults satisfied with social care of social work services

Service users' views are gained by inviting them onto strategic planning groups, asking them to complete satisfaction surveys and by investigating complaints. We recently asked service users and carers to complete a satisfaction survey. 81% of carers and 88% of service users reported that they were happy with the service they receive. We are conscious that internal survey results are more positive than findings from the Scottish Household Survey reported above, however we are also aware that internal surveys target people in direct contact with our services. We will continue to use feedback from surveys and consultation to improve how we deliver services.

Indicator	Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank in Scotland	Rank in SIMD group
Self directed support (SDS) spend on adults 18+ as a % of total social work spend on adults 18+	10/11	0.7%	0.3% to 5.2%	4 th	25	5
	11/12	0.8%	0.4% to 18.0%	4 th	26	6

Service comments

Forthcoming legislation on Self Directed Support will give people more direct control over the organisation and delivery of their services.

The introduction of self directed support will require a more flexible approach to financial management, while the external market and the contractual frameworks within which they operate will have to adapt to respond to the need for more personalised services. This will be a key challenge for the service over the planning period.

The number of people receiving SDS is expected to rise considerably once these changes have been applied.

Culture & Leisure

Sports Facilities

Indicator		Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank in Scotland	Rank in SIMD group
	Gross cost per attendance at sports facilities	10/11	£1.89	£1.20 to £10.20	1 st	3	2
		11/12	£2.72	£1.40 to £10.20	1 st	3	2
	% of adults satisfied with leisure facilities	10/11	80.2%	56.2% to 96.8%	2 nd	11	3
		11/12	Data from the Scottish Household Survey is only published every 2 years. The next set of data will be published in August 2013.				

Service comments

Being ranked 3rd in Scotland for the gross costs per attendance at sports facilities is an excellent result for Dundee.

The overall rank of 11th in Scotland for satisfaction is also good. This position is improved even further when the local household survey carried out by Dundee is compared with Scottish Household Survey data.

Again, the Scottish Household Survey presents a slightly less favourable picture than the Dundee Community Planning Survey which has shown consistent and very high level of satisfaction with the Leisure and Sport Service in the City.

Library Visit

Indicator		Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank in Scotland	Rank in SIMD group
	Cost per library visit	10/11	£3.61	£1.60 to £7.10	2 nd	15	5
		11/12	£3.25	£1.40 to £7.30	2 nd	13	4
	% of adults satisfied with libraries	10/11	87.3%	74.6% to 92.5%	2 nd	10	3
		11/12	Data from the Scottish Household Survey is only published every 2 years. The next set of data will be published in August 2013.				

Service comments

The Scottish Rank position of 15 in 2010/11 has been improved to 13 in 2011/12.

In part this reflects the savings achieved through the establishment of Leisure & Culture Dundee.

Again, the Scottish Household Survey presents a slightly less favourable picture than the Dundee Community Planning Survey which has shown consistent and very high level of satisfaction with the Library and Information Service in the city.

Museum Visits

Indicator		Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank in Scotland	Rank in SIMD group
	Cost per museum visit	10/11	£5.84	£0.30 to £23.90	3 rd	19	5
		11/12	£5.83	£0.20 to £24.40	3 rd	22	6
	% of adults satisfied with museums and galleries	10/11	73.1%	46.9% to 96.6%	2 nd	15	5
		11/12	Data from the Scottish Household Survey is only published every 2 years. The next set of data will published in August 2013.				

Service comments

The cost for museum visits is a composite figure which includes Leisure & Culture Dundee facilities along with facilities operated by Dundee Heritage Trust.

As a city with cultural facilities as part of its key visitor and tourist strategy, Dundee has continued to invest in museums and cultural attractions. Unlike some other city destinations in Scotland, the majority of costs of museum visits are met locally with little direct financial support from Government. Taken together, this explains the higher than average expenditure on museums.

Environment Services

Waste / Street Cleaning

Indicator/s		Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank in Scotland	Rank in SIMD group	Rank in Urban group
	Gross Waste collection cost per premise	10/11	£67.21	£52.80 to £171.80	1 st	6	6	6
		11/12	£78.42	£50.20 to £184.90	2 nd	15	8	10
	Gross Waste disposal cost per premise	10/11	£85.86	£64.90 to £271.40	2 nd	13	4	9
		11/12	£87.36	£51.70 to £279.10	2 nd	12	4	8
	% of total Household Waste arising that is recycled	10/11	34.6%	17.8% to 49.8%	3 rd	23	6	14
		11/12	31.8%	17.0% to 54.5%	4 th	26	7	17
	Net cost of street cleaning per 1,000 population	10/11	£31,943	£5,505.90 to £34,499.70	4 th	31	8	17
		11/12	£31,002	£6,688.90 to £33,957.10	4 th	31	8	17
	% of adults satisfied with refuse collection	10/11	85.5%	71.2% to 93.1	2 nd	12	4	6
		11/12	Data from the Scottish Household Survey is only published every 2 years. The next set of data will published in August 2013.					
	% of adults satisfied with street cleaning	10/11	79.8%	65.8% to 81.2%	1 st	3	1	1
		11/12	Data from the Scottish Household Survey is only published every 2 years. The next set of data will published in August 2013.					
	Overall Cleanliness Index	10/11	72	69 to 84	3 rd	23	5	10
		11/12	75	72 to 82	2 nd	12	1	3
	Cost of trading standards and environmental health per 1,000 population	10/11	£26,142	£10,596 to £72,813	3 rd	21	8	16
		11/12	£24,105	£10,751 to £81,778	3 rd	23	8	17

Service comments

The recorded recycling levels for household waste have been adversely affected by a recent change in the reporting methodology. This is due to a number of factors including the reclassification of the Energy-from-Waste incinerator plant residues, bottom ash aggregate, into the new category of "Recovery". However it is clear from the above that significant change is required in our recycling strategy to achieve the challenging targets being set by the government within the Zero Waste Plan and the associated Regulations. Work is underway to develop the existing strategy.

Satisfaction levels with the quality of street cleaning operations are extremely high and the council is ranked 3rd in Scotland. This is borne out by the recent Citizen Survey in 2012 which recorded satisfaction levels of 96% with this service. However whilst the costs of street cleaning have reduced since the previous period more work is required to analyse the level of costs for this service. It is worth noting that since the creation of the new Environment department in 2011, a number of organisational changes have been implemented, or are in the process of being introduced, to create greater efficiency in this area of service.

Roads Maintenance

Indicator/s		Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank in Scotland	Rank in SIMD group	Rank in Urban group
	Cost of maintenance per kilometre of roads	10/11	£12,412	£2,809.10 to £25,562.60	3 rd	24	5	10
		11/12	£8,317	£2,350.80 to £18,018.20	3 rd	17	4	7
	Percentage of A class roads that should be considered for maintenance treatment	10/11	20.7%	17.1% to 50.6%	1 st	3	1	2
		11/12	21.4%	17.9% to 51.8%	1 st	4	1	2
	Percentage of B class roads that should be considered for maintenance treatment	10/11	18.9%	18.9% to 62.4%	1 st	1	1	1
		11/12	18.7%	18.7% to 67.4%	1 st	1	1	1
	Percentage of C class roads that should be considered for maintenance treatment	10/11	16.3%	16.3% to 59.9%	1 st	1	1	1
		11/12	16.5%	14.2% to 64.8%	1 st	2	1	1

Service comments

The road condition results reported are positive in relation to other authorities. The financial information reported by SOLACE does not correlate with that currently held by SCOTS/APSE and will need to be investigated further with the various parties to clarify the source of the information and to ensure consistency. It should also be noted that the indicator 'Cost of maintenance per kilometre of roads' relates to investment per km (ie it is a simple indicator of the total budget spent divided by the length of adopted road). It is not a measure of the competitive cost of actual works.

With the recent increases in DCC capital budgets for adopted roads over the next 4 years this aims to ensure that Dundee's overall road condition does not deteriorate. See City Development Committee Report 430-2011.

As part of the Roads Maintenance Partnership's continual improvement and monitoring process, Dundee are active members of SCOTS Road Groups and have been working with SCOTS and APSE along with the other 32 Scottish Authorities to develop both Financial and Performance Indicators (PIs). There are regular meetings with the PI groups and following the recent results received for 2011/12, "Family Groups" have been set up to review and understand the results and share best practice with similar authorities. For the purpose of SCOTS/APSE, Dundee's family group is the "City Group" which includes Aberdeen, Edinburgh and Glasgow, as these are of the same City nature, experiencing the same challenges to manage their networks. Dundee are taking an active role in this group to establish best practice and improve where ever possible.

Parks / Open space

Indicator		Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank in Scotland	Rank in SIMD group
Cost of Parks and Open Spaces per 1,000 population	2010/11	£40,730	£3,436.40 to £56,416	3 rd	20	2	
	2011/12	£34,726	£4,639.60 to £58,724.70	3 rd	18	2	
% of adults satisfied with parks and open spaces	2010/11	85.6%	71.0% to 92.0%	1 st	5	1	
	2011/12	Data from the Scottish Household Survey is only published every 2 years. The next set of data will be published in August 2013.					

Service comments

As the note states regarding satisfaction with the quality of parks and open spaces, the Scottish Household Survey results are only published every 2 years. However from the Council's Citizen Survey 2012, satisfaction levels of 95% for Parks and Open Spaces were recorded and therefore it is anticipated that the 2012/13 results will continue to show a strong performance in this area.

It is pleasing to note that this high level of satisfaction has been maintained whilst the costs of maintaining parks and open spaces have reduced by 15% from the previous period. It is worth noting that since the creation of the new Environment department in 2011, a number of organisational changes have been implemented, or are in the process of being introduced, to create greater efficiency in this area of service.

Domestic Noise Complaints

Indicator/s		Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank in Scotland	Rank in SIMD group	Rank in Urban Group
The number of complaints of domestic noise received during the year settled without the need for attendance on site	10/11	303	3 to 6027	2 nd	16	6	12	
	11/12	319	1 to 4904	3 rd	18	6	13	
The number of complaints of domestic noise received during the year requiring attendance on site and not dealt with under Part V of the Antisocial Behaviour	10/11	157	0 to 605	1 st	8	2	8 (of 17)	
	11/12	194	0 to 738	1 st t	5	2	5 (of 17)	
(Domestic Noise) Average time (hours) between time of complaint	10/11	0.3	0.2 to 1.2	1 st	2	1	2 (out of 17)	
	11/12	0.3	0.3 to 1.0	1 st	2	1	2 (out of 17)	

	and attendance on site, for those dealt with under the ASB Act 2004							
	(Domestic Noise) Average time (hours) between time of complaint and attendance on site, for those requiring attendance on site	10/11	9.0	0 to 475	2 nd	10	4	7 (out of 16))
		11/12	8.8	0.1 to 255	2 nd	12	5	8 (out of 16)

Service comments

It is pleasing to note that there has been a consistently strong performance recorded in dealing with noise complaints particularly for those complaints relating to the ASB Act 2004.

Housing Services

Indicator		Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank in Scotland	Rank in SIMD group	Rank in Urban Group
	Current tenants' arrears as a percentage of net rent due	10/11	9.6%	2.6% to 11.6%	4 th	25	6	16
		11/12	10.0%	2.8% to 11.2%	3 rd	24	5	15
	Percentage of rent due in the year that was lost due to voids	10/11	3.1%	0.3% to 3.1%	4 th	26	6	16
		11/12	2.1%	0.4% to 3.7%	3 rd	24	5	15
	Percentage of dwellings meeting SHQS	10/11	35.7%	2.9% to 85.9%	3 rd	20	4	13
		11/12	55.7%	15.1% to 89.0%	3 rd	21	4	14
	Percentage of repairs completed within target times	10/11	88.4%	83.7% to 98.3%	3 rd	19	5	12
		11/12	90.6%	82.3% to 98.2%	3 rd	21	5	13
	Percentage of council dwellings that are energy efficient	10/11	63.2%	30.5% to 95.7%	3 rd	21	4	13
		11/12	76.7%	42.9% to 100%	3 rd	18	4	11

Note for above Table

Housing Services **SIMD** Benchmarking group has 6 Local Authorities

Housing Services **Urban** benchmarking group has 16 Local Authorities

Service comments

Current tenants' arrears as a percentage of net rent due

A comprehensive review is currently underway within the Rent Recovery service which is looking at processes, procedures and enhancements to our IT systems. Performance on arrears is monitored on a weekly basis and is reviewed monthly by the Arrears Management Group. Benchmarking Dundee within the 26 authorities reported in the draft SOLACE Benchmarking Analysis, 58% of authorities reported an increased percentage of their current tenants in arrears from 2010/11 to 2011/12.

Percentage of rent due in the year that was lost due to voids

While our ranking has only marginally improved, performance has improved significantly (1% reduction) in the period. Efforts continue to further improve Days to Let performance. Dundee City Council's reduction in void loss is the second largest across all Councils.

Percentage of dwellings meeting SHQS

Progress towards meeting the SHQS is elemental with properties passing when all elements, i.e. kitchens/bathrooms, energy efficiency and security are met. The Council is operating the Tenement Management Scheme to facilitate the installation of controlled entry systems in mixed tenure properties. In April, 2012 55.7% of DCC properties met the SHQS, at April 2013 this has increased to 81%.

The SHR has carried out focussed scrutiny work into the Council's progress towards meeting the SHQS by 2015. The SHR saw that the Council is continuing to work towards meeting the Standard and mitigating the financial risks and other challenges it faces. SHR do not intend to undertake any further scrutiny on this during 2013/14.

Percentage of repairs completed within target times

While actual performance has improved between 10/11 and 11/12 our ranking has worsened, implying that other Local Authorities have improved more. The Repairs Partnership performance is regularly reviewed and monitored and a quarterly Health Check (covering performance, finance, value for money and tenant satisfaction) is reported to the Housing Best Value Group.

Percentage of Council dwellings that are energy efficient

At April, 2012 76.7% of the Council's properties are compliant with the energy efficiency standard for SHQS, this has increased to 91% at April 2013. Work is continuing through installation of efficient gas central heating systems and CESP/ECO schemes, the most recent being the Kirk Street ECO project to ensure compliance with the energy efficiency standard under SHQS. These improvements tackle and reduce fuel poverty within the City and reduce the carbon footprint.

Corporate Assets

Indicator/s		Year	DCC Figure	Range	Quartile	Rank in Scotland	Rank in SIMD group	Rank in Urban group
	Proportion of operational buildings that are suitable for their current use	10/11	80.2%	46.8% to 90.1%	2 nd	15	4	9
		11/12	81.7%	46.2% to 92.3%	2 nd	16	6	9
	Proportion of internal floor area of operational buildings in satisfactory condition	10/11	79.5%	46.7% to 98.0%	3 rd	22	6	13
		11/12	80.2%	39.3% to 98.0%	3 rd	21	4	11

Service comments

These statistics indicate this Authority's performance is above average. Performance is improving. The Property Asset Management Plan should assist in further improvement. The property division is a member of the Scottish Benchmarking Group.