

**REPORT TO: DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL EDUCATION COMMITTEE – MARCH 19<sup>th</sup> 2001**  
**REPORT ON: Education for Citizenship**  
**REPORT BY: DIRECTOR OF EDUCATION**  
**REPORT NO: 188 - 2001**

**1.0 PURPOSE OF REPORT**

1.1 The purpose of this report is to outline details of the Education Department response to the consultation paper: "Education for Citizenship"

**2.0 RECOMMENDATIONS**

2.1 It is recommended that the Education Committee note and approve the contents of the response to this consultation which is appended to this report.

**3.0 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS**

3.1 Nil

**4.0 LOCAL AGENDA 21 IMPLICATIONS**

4.1 Education for citizenship is fundamental to supporting access to the skills and knowledge needed to enable everyone to play a full part in society

**5.0 EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES IMPLICATIONS**

5.1 Education for citizenship promotes the inclusion and participation of all

**6.0 PROPOSAL**

6.1 It is proposed that the response to the paper "Education for Citizenship" is approved and that further work is developed in line with the recommendations made in this response to further promote education for citizenship within all early years services and primary and secondary schools. Members will note the highly relevant comments made by young people who represent their schools on the Dundee Pupil Council. The production of this response has renewed interest in and focus on this important area of work. Much good work is already underway and there is now an opportunity to consolidate and strengthen this. An outline of proposals for developing education for citizenship is contained within the response.

**9.0 CONSULTATION**

9.1 This report has been the subject of consultation with the Directors of Support Services, Neighbourhood Resources and Development and Finance.

**10.0 BACKGROUND PAPERS**

No background papers, as defined by Section 50D of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973 (other than any containing confidential or exempt information), were relied on to any material extent in preparing the above Report.

.....  
Director of Education

.....  
Date

**DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL EDUCATION DEPARTMENT**  
**Response to “Education for Citizenship” A Paper for Discussion and Consultation**  
**February 2001**

**1.0 Introduction**

This response has been produced on behalf of Dundee City Council Education Department by a Working Group involving representatives from central support services and early years, primary and secondary schools. In addition the Dundee Pupil Council was consulted and feedback from the young people is an important aspect of this response.

The opportunity to take part in this consultation has been welcomed. We also acknowledge the helpful and informative opportunities for participation provided by national and regional seminars.

**2.0 Summary of Key Points**

The wide definition of citizenship as a shared issue of wide public interest and concern is welcomed. We support strongly the view that ensuring that young people can participate fully as citizens is a key function of education.

The following is a summary of key points in relation to the paper.

- Much good work is already being undertaken within Dundee’s schools and early years services to promote the citizenship agenda. The paper has established a renewed context and focus for this work.
- Schools and early years services play a central role in education for citizenship. However we strongly concur with the view expressed in the paper that citizenship is a shared and fundamental responsibility for the whole community. Work in relation to the Dundee Community Learning Plan and the Community Plan is particularly relevant as linked mechanisms to promote young people’s involvement as citizens.
- The climate and culture of schools create a highly influential context for citizenship. We acknowledge the challenge facing schools currently managing a complex and wide ranging agenda. Citizenship has major implications for the curriculum, the role of educators and the place of schools within the community.
- Young people themselves must be involved in the development of education for citizenship. They must feel confident and empowered as active citizens.
- Citizenship underpins the educational process- and should therefore be an integral aspect of it. We agree strongly that education for citizenship is fundamentally about experience- ‘a way of being’, and that the knowledge content must reflect that context. We would maintain however that there is a body of knowledge relevant to citizenship. The development of skills, capabilities and informed attitudes can be fostered effectively through particular curriculum areas.
- Whilst welcoming the broad and integral focus, we also recognise the challenge in this to ensure that the citizenship agenda is clearly evident in curriculum planning and delivery and in all aspects of the wider life of the schools.
- Several current educational agendas, such as Education for Work and Health Education 5-14, link with and overlap with citizenship. There is important work to be done both nationally and locally to ensure coherence across these agendas.
- This is an important time in the development of Scottish education. We believe that the Citizenship agenda is challenging and has the potential to play a key role

in supporting young people's fullest participation in society. However, the implementation and development of the ideas contained within the paper is dependent on action at all levels within the Scottish education system; it cannot be progressed if it becomes simply a further imposition and burden on teachers.

### 3.0 Response to Consultation Questions

**Page 1** *The paper argues that schools and pre- five centres have key roles to play in educating young people for active and responsible citizenship. What is your view?*

Agree strongly. However the whole community shares responsibility and parents have a key role to play. The young people representing secondary school pupils at Dundee Pupil Council gave an interesting perspective on this, arguing that their attitudes had been strongly influenced by those of their parents. In addition the media is a powerful influence in informing views and attitudes.

**Page 2** *A broad view of the meaning of citizenship is advocated here. How far do you agree with this view?*

We welcome the broad view described- and would argue strongly that it is important to contextualise citizenship within the wider framework of day to day school business. This was recognised by young people in Dundee to be more significant than "lessons" in citizenship.

The wide ranging scope of the citizenship agenda and the implications for several aspects of school life and curriculum could lead to fragmentation. It is important that there is effective curriculum planning to ensure that the different cross curricular strands are woven together. The delivery of national policies is particularly relevant here- improved coherence at national level would help schools and early years services to make appropriate connections. The idealism clearly reflected in the paper is compelling but also represents a challenge in terms of establishing a practicable and manageable framework for implementation.

**Page 3** *This section describes a number of key characteristics of effective citizenship responsible citizenship. How far do you agree with these statements? How far do you agree with these statements? What additions or modifications would you wish to make?*

Agree. A suggested additional characteristic is: "confidence to agree sensitively with, defend or support an unpopular decision or view".

**Page 4** *Education for citizenship should aim to develop capability for thoughtful and responsible participation in political, economic, social and cultural life. How far do you agree with this statement of the overall goal of education for citizenship?*

Agree with this strongly. However we would emphasise the continued need for education to work towards the development of empowered, confident and articulate young people who are able to challenge where necessary. This means that schools and early years services require to create a culture and ethos where the views and opinions of children and young people are actively sought, promoted and debated, even when these may challenge some strongly held alternative views.

The whole field of political literacy requires careful thought. It is important that education for citizenship promotes young people's capacity to support and challenge the system and to act upon **their** beliefs and values.

The culture and ethos will require to be based on an awareness of the nature of power, the exercise of power and the power inequalities which exist in our society.

**Page 5** *What are your views on the approach described here and in more detail in Annex A to defining and exemplifying knowledge and understanding associated with capable citizenship?*

This list is comprehensive. It must be open-ended however and not interpreted as prescriptive. The key issue and the one which is of greatest concern to teachers is the need for a planned and supported approach to ensuring that these areas are covered within appropriate contexts.

***What are your views on these statements and the more detailed statements in Annex B about the skills and competences required for capable citizenship?***

As with the above there is little to argue about in relation to these statements. Once again however the key point is the challenge placed on schools and early years services to develop systematic approaches which allow this area to be effectively covered across a range of curriculum aspects.

**Page 6 *What are your views about these statements (values and dispositions)?***

Agreed in general terms. The culture and ethos of schools and early years services is particularly important in relation to the fostering of these values and dispositions.

A key issue is in relation to the need for young people to be able to express their own values. A more controversial element of this is the debate about the role schools and early years services have in promoting particular “desirable” values (and of course there is then an important debate about what desirable values and who decides what values are desirable).

***The Review Group concluded that creativity and enterprise are important aspects of capability for citizenship. What are your views about the description of these offered here?***

This is an important aspect of effective citizenship. More work is required however to support the development of this area and to establish relevant and meaningful contexts in which to apply these outcomes.

**Page 7 *What are your views about the idea that education for citizenship is an entitlement for every young person?***

Agree. Entitlement carries responsibilities and choices. The level at which an individual exercises his/ her entitlement as a citizen is a matter of personal choice- an interesting question is do individuals have the right to opt out of active citizenship?

**Page 7 *What are your views on the four means by which education for citizenship can take place?***

Agree in general terms- however it is important to emphasise the broad range of opportunities available to promote education for citizenship. Raising the profile of citizenship is important to ensure that good opportunities are not missed in the everyday life of the school/ early years service.

**Page 8 *What are the implications of an inclusive, participative ethos for teaching and learning and for educational establishments?***

This is an essential aspect of education in all settings and a great deal of work is underway in Dundee’s early years services and schools. Again this issue is closely connected with a culture and ethos which aims to be inclusive and participative and which is closely and effectively monitored from a range of perspectives to measure progress and identify weaknesses. The roles and responsibilities of teachers are referred to throughout the document. However this is an agenda important to and inclusive of all people working in schools; ancillary staff, parent and voluntary helpers and visiting specialists and support staff.

***This section sets out essential features of learning related to citizenship and proposes a set of key learning experiences that should be part of each young***

***person's entitlement. How far do you agree that these features and experiences are essential to education for citizenship? Are there key features and essential experiences you would like to see added?***

This is a useful list and these features are and can be delivered in a range of ways. There are numerous strands across a range of curriculum areas which can be pulled together to create these experiences- and this remains the challenge.

**Page 10 *What comments do you have on opportunities for citizenship within the 3-5 Curriculum?***

Children are citizens from the moment of birth. Home experiences and influences are of central importance. The expanding early years and childcare sector is providing a range of provision for children from the first year of life and it is important to recognise that education for citizenship starts much earlier than three. Work with young children in the context of their families (an expanding area within this Council) also strengthens the role and involvement of parents in promoting the fundamental skills and attitudes required for citizenship. This section of the paper could have been strengthened by an acknowledgement of the wider scope of early years services and a clearer focus on the role of parents and the important link between early years and family settings.

The early years are a key time for developing a broad range of skills, competences and attitudes which establish life long patterns. The 3-5 Curriculum Framework sets out a range of outcomes which can and do promote citizenship in meaningful and relevant contexts. Much of the day to day business of early years services is about promoting personal, social and emotional development and developing children's self knowledge and empathy with others.

A final point in this section; there is no consistent terminology within the paper to describe services, - "pre school", "pre fives", "pre five centres" and "early education centres" are used to describe the same or similar services. Quite apart from this confusion, most early years professionals object to the underlying implication that early years services are only valued as pre cursors of something coming next, i.e. formal education.

***What comments do you have on opportunities for education for citizenship within the 5-14 curriculum?***

We would agree that the 5-14 curriculum already offers important opportunities for education for citizenship. However there is an ongoing debate and concern about the demands of this curriculum and the responsibility and workload this places on teachers. Auditing, planning, implementing, monitoring and quality assuring so many different aspects, issues and agendas is a significant challenge for teachers. It is therefore important that education for citizenship is not presented as yet another subject area to implement but as an integral aspect of the curriculum (in other words to show how the various curriculum aspects can contribute to the citizenship agenda rather than squeezing citizenship into or out of each of them).

Considerable work has already been undertaken in Dundee to map the various curriculum areas which underpin education for citizenship. Some key areas are summarised as follows:

- **Environmental Studies**

- People in the Past
  - People and Place
  - People in Society
  - Skills in Social Subjects

In particular through the Developing Informed Attitudes strand much of the knowledge and understanding and skills can be integrated with education for citizenship. These aspects raise pupil's awareness of political structures and foster their interest in becoming politically involved.

- **Personal and Social Development**

This part of the curriculum is fundamental to pupil's development as citizens as laid out in the consultation document. The pupil is encouraged to become more independent and aware of his/ her own abilities, preferences and needs. Opportunities are provided for group work to demonstrate the value of teamwork.

- **Mathematics**

Provides opportunities for problem solving through rational and logical approaches. This raises the pupil's confidence to attempt problems, learn from their mistakes and persevere in the face of challenge.

- **Religious and Moral Education**

The attainment outcome "The natural world" explores man's responsibility to and interdependence with the earth from Level A.

"Relationships and Morals" builds up an awareness of caring for oneself and others and involves pupils in examining justice, rule making and values such as honesty.

The outcomes "Christianity" and "Other world religions" provide an insight into the beliefs of others and respect for different views.

The strand "Moral values and attitudes" looks at rules of different religions and the need for these rules in communities. It also highlights common principles in the rules/ laws of different religions.

- **Language**

From Level A children are encouraged to talk and write about their ideas and to listen to and read those of others. This is central to the development of articulate and literate citizens.

**Page 11** *An approach is proposed here to ensuring continued opportunity for learning related to citizenship post- 14. What are your views on this approach?*

Between 14 and 18 the curriculum continues to offer much that will promote aspects of education for citizenship. However with subject choice- taking effective at the end of S2 many pupils do not choose Modern Studies which is currently best placed to develop political literacy.

Young people at the Dundee Pupil Council also recognised this and stated that course work increasingly became more closely focused on subject areas often not leaving time to look at wider issues which may be relevant to the citizenship agenda. In particular they suggested that RE and Social Education could be developed more effectively to provide opportunities for all pupils to examine issues related to citizenship.

There is therefore a need for a review of curriculum provision in this respect. However we strongly agree with the view expressed in the paper that the solution to this is not to stipulate a single course of "citizenship education" as part of the core programme.

Representatives at the Pupil Council also reflected a concern held by many teachers in stressing the importance of promoting attainment agendas **alongside** the wider aspects of school life such as the building of an inclusive ethos which recognises and celebrates the diverse achievements and contributions of all pupils. At times they felt that the constant striving to raise attainment targets and achieve exam results overshadowed the other areas of school life often at a cost in terms of the self- esteem and confidence of less academic pupils.

A final relevant perspective voiced strongly by several representatives was that they had often to wait until they became senior pupils to begin to feel that they were regarded as citizens within the school. They felt this was too late and that it was important for schools to reflect meaningfully the citizenship of all children and young people.

***What are the implications of this approach to curriculum design and management?***

It is important to reflect on the comments made above- the current pressure on schools is enormous- curriculum design and management takes time- a hard pressed resource. National and local guidance will be required, effective teacher support built into any development plans and above all a more rational and streamlined approach to the introduction of national agendas would be highly welcome.

***Page 12 Particular importance is placed on interactions between schools and their local communities as a way of providing effective education for citizenship. In your view, how might such interactions be fostered and used to greatest effect?***

Practical steps such as Education for Work strategies, visits to local council chambers, bringing community representatives into schools, teaching staff representing the school on local community forums so that there is an increased reciprocity of awareness of school and community issues. This issue is a concern to pupils who recognise that their schools do not always have public sympathy and who feel that they are often judged too harshly and that there is a need for more acceptance and tolerance of young people. However there was also a stated commitment to trying to improve this situation and a belief that practical contributions to the community such as performing for elderly people or helping in the nursery school were effective ways of building community support for the school.

### 3.0 Implications and Next Steps

The final section of the consultation paper focuses on the implications and next steps by asking the following final questions:

***What are the implications for the content and organisation of the curriculum?***

***How does education for citizenship relate to other social and educational priorities, such as social inclusion and improving achievement?***

***Should education for citizenship be assessed and accredited? If so, in what ways?***

***What are the professional development implications for teachers and other practitioners?***

***How can the enthusiasm and commitment of staff be fostered and supported?***

This has informed the debate about how education for citizenship can be taken forward in Dundee and this is summarised below.

#### Curriculum

##### 0-5

Work ongoing to develop a quality framework for care and education of children aged 0-5 will reflect the need to promote the skills and competences fundamental to education for citizenship.

##### 5-14

Considerable work is currently ongoing to develop guidance for staff in implementing new 5-14 documentation. This takes account of the wide ranging demands on teachers and can consider the citizenship agenda as part of the process, drawing out key elements, describing the knowledge and competences which require to be developed and showing examples of how this could be done across the curriculum.

Individual school audits will also identify existing opportunities and further potential for promoting education for citizenship.

##### Post 14

A review of curriculum planning and implementation at this stage is required. Social education and Religious Education aspects could be strengthened by a stronger focus on education for citizenship and could be developed to promote this agenda more effectively.

**The development of strategic policy framework and staff guidelines for use across the 0-18 curriculum would support the development of a continuous and progressive approach to implementation of education for citizenship.**

#### Assessment of education for citizenship

We believe that the culture and ethos of schools is more influential in promoting education for citizenship than any "taught" component. We are therefore strongly of the view that education for citizenship should not be formally assessed or accredited. This is not to devalue the important knowledge that pupils can be taught in education for citizenship, particularly in relation to social justice, the legal system and political literacy. In addition examples of good citizenship should always be recognised.

#### Staff Development implications

Firstly teachers should be supported in identifying the good work already underway in schools and early years services. In service courses on particular aspects of the body of knowledge relevant to citizenship would also be helpful. However the focus already strongly in evidence in the Dundee Directory of Staff Development Opportunities for teachers and



support staff will support the development of inclusive education and positive school ethos – fundamentally important to education for citizenship.

The key challenge is to represent this agenda as an opportunity to draw together several strands. This would be supported by the development (nationally and locally) of high quality curriculum materials.

#### **Additional Recommendations**

- Provide continued support for Dundee Pupil Council and promote the establishment of Pupil Councils within all secondary schools
- Ensure that the work and issues of school Pupil Councils can be represented within the city wide Pupil Council and that emerging issues can be effectively addressed at school, department and council level.
- Establish a range of approaches to more fully involve children in decision making at primary and early years levels and support the piloting of Primary School Pupil Councils
- Continue to celebrate the wide ranging achievements of Dundee's children and young people
- Continue to improve opportunities to consult with children and young people and involve them in decision making
- Support active participation in citizenship within the school and the local community
- Conduct school/ early years service audits to identify existing good practice and curriculum opportunities to promote education for citizenship
- Develop coherent and progressive curriculum frameworks to ensure that education for citizenship is promoted throughout the whole school/ early years service

#### 4.0 Summary of Feedback from Dundee Pupil Council

##### Some overarching issues

The representatives at the Dundee Pupil Council:

- Recognised the need for schools to demonstrate the principles of education for citizenship in their everyday practice
- Recognised that pupils not taking Modern Studies courses after S2 missed out on opportunities to examine issues relevant to citizenship
- Stated that the paper could have been drafted to make it more relevant to pupils and that there was not enough consultation with young people in the preparation of the paper

In response to discussion about the knowledge, skills and qualities required for effective citizenship pupils listed:

- listening to the views of others
- debating and negotiating
- effective communication
- working co-operatively
- being considerate and encouraging of others
- learning from experience
- making informed choices
- showing interest in a range of topics
- global awareness
- effective learning
- decision making processes
- learning about and understanding other people's needs and circumstances
- encouraging links with the local community
- life experience
- confidence that your opinion is worth listening to
- acting on the opinions of others
- dealing with conflict

Reflecting what young people currently do at school relevant to education for citizenship:

- social events
- pupil councils
- school trips
- communication to raise awareness
- development of organisational skills
- management skills
- peer tutoring and supporting younger pupils
- visits from and communication with local MPs
- work experience
- enterprise groups
- participation in school clubs and groups
- study support