

REPORT TO: BEST VALUE SUB-COMMITTEE - 26 February 2002

REPORT ON: BEST VALUE REVIEW OF THE MACKINNON CENTRE

REPORT BY: CHIEF EXECUTIVE

REPORT NO: 176-2002

1.0 PURPOSE OF REPORT

1.1 This report is the result of a Best Value Review into the Social Work Department's Mackinnon Centre.

2.0 RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that:-

2.1 The Mackinnon Centre continues to provide and support a range of services to people with physical disabilities whilst continuing to support the development of the range of choices and opportunities available in the community.

2.2 The Sub-Committee agrees with the proposals for continuous improvement. In summary these are to:-

- increase the number of service users
- increase the number of new users
- improve the individual focus of service delivery
- improve the quality of information service
- improve support for carers
- increase public awareness of disability through training and links with voluntary organisations.

3.0 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

3.1 This review accounts for 1.05% of the Department's Revenue Budget at a budget cost examined of £850,300 (9% of the total review expenditure).

4.0 LOCAL AGENDA 21 IMPLICATIONS

4.1 This review was undertaken from the perspective of Local Agenda 21, in particular:-

- facilities accessible to all
- access to the skills, knowledge and information which enable everyone to play a full part in society.
- all sections of the community are empowered to participate in decision making.
- opportunities for culture, leisure and recreation are readily available to all.

5.0 EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES IMPLICATIONS

- 5.1 This Centre provides services which assist and support people with physical disabilities to retain and maintain independence and access to community facilities that they may otherwise not have.

6.0 DEFINITION OF THE SERVICE REVIEWED

- 6.1 The Centre is a purpose-built resource providing a service primarily to the Tayside area for adults aged 16-64 with physical disabilities and/or progressive illness. The Centre is specifically designed to meet the needs of people with physical disabilities, the majority of whom (72% currently) have acquired a disability through either trauma or illness. The Centre provides a range of services for people with physical disabilities to develop or regain self-confidence and the necessary skills with which to improve or maintain their abilities to be as independent as possible. It also provides respite care that is a valuable support to both individuals and their carers. The Centre currently comprises a Skills Centre, a 12-bed residential respite unit, the Ability Centre (an Accredited Disabled Living Centre providing advice and information on all aspects of disability) and a team of two social workers who provide support and counselling to people with disability and their carers.
- 6.2 It is a major component of the department's strategy in fulfilling its obligation under the National Health Service and Community Care Act (1990) and the Chronically Sick and Disabled Persons (Scotland) Act 1972.
- 6.3 All services are currently provided in response to assessed needs, having been assessed and referred by a Care Manager, with the exception of the Ability Centre which operates on an open access basis. It also has a role to promote the interests of people with disabilities in general and to increase the awareness of disability in the wider community.
- 6.4 Benefits of this purpose-built centre include a unique environment specifically designed for people with physical disabilities, staff trained to assist and support both physical and emotional needs, personal development plans and support for carers. The Centre also has links with other agencies to improve and promote social inclusion. These include local pubs, clubs and societies; voluntary organisations related to disability eg Head Injury Trust for Scotland, Headway, Arthritis Care, Riding for the Disabled and other organisations eg Community Centres, and the Applied Computing Micro Centre, University of Dundee.

The Centre staff comprises:

Resource Manager	SCP 37-40
Programme Planning Co-ordinator	SCP 31-34
Service Development Officer	SCP 31-34
6 Skills Officers	SCP 23-26
Manager Community and Residential Resource	SCP 35-38
2 Senior SCOs	SCP 27-30
7 SCOs - Respite Care	SCP 16-23
Community Disability Team of 2 qualified Social Workers	SCP 27-35
Ability Centre Manager	SCP 35-38
13 support staff – drivers, escorts, kitchen and domestic staff	Various grades
Administration and clerical staff.	Various grades

- 6.5 The Skills Centre provides programmes of support for people by;
- helping those with acquired disability to take the first steps in rebuilding their lives, rediscovering and relearning how to deal with the tasks of day to day living.
 - helping others, particularly those with progressive illness, by providing support in managing day to day living tasks in the face of increasing difficulty.
- 6.6 Beyond this, for some, it is a stepping stone to the pursuit of interests outwith the Centre, either at home, in the community, in education or in employment. For many, support will be required in a range of forms over a period of time, for others, it will be a bridge towards other things.
- 6.7 The Respite Unit provides valuable support to both the individual and carer and for many the physical environment provides relief from the physical stresses in addition to the social benefit. The regular availability of respite individually tailored to the user's needs also enhances the quality of life whilst at home.
- 6.8 The Ability Centre is an accredited Disabled Living Centre whose purpose is to provide advice and information related to practical aspects of disability to people with disabilities, their carers and professional staff. It provides specialist advice, access to extensive information data bases, and demonstration equipment.
- 6.9 The Disability Team assists with coping with loss through disability, confidence building and planning for the future, working with both the individual and their carers and immediate family.

7.0 JUSTIFICATION FOR REVIEWING THIS SERVICE

- 7.1 The service is being reviewed to consider whether it is providing a best value service which meets the requirements of people with physical disabilities by assisting and supporting them to maximise or maintain their independence and achieve an improved quality of life.

8.0 REVIEW METHODOLOGY

- 8.1 The review team was led by a Team Leader (Personnel and Management Services), the Lead Officer (Business and Quality Manager, Social Work) and three officers within the Social Work Department including the Service Manager responsible for, and the manager of, the Mackinnon Centre. An officer of the Finance Department also assisted in this review.
- 8.2 The process consisted of consultation, market testing, benchmarking and option appraisal.

9.0 CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTORS

9.1 Stakeholders:

- People with physical disabilities who use the Mackinnon Centre.
- People with physical disabilities who are potential users of the Mackinnon Centre.
- Professionals who use the Centre to enhance their own services to users.

- Carers of people with physical disability.
- Angus Council, Perth and Kinross Council, Dundee City Council and other local authority users.
- People who require information on all aspects of disability.

9.2 **Consultation:**

9.2.1 Consultation was carried out initially using a priority search exercise followed by questionnaires, some of which were completed through structured interviews (see appendices). Group discussions also took place with both users and non-users of the Mackinnon Centre.

9.2.2 The Director of Social Work and the Manager of Community Care Services were also consulted.

9.3 **Critical Success Factors**

9.3.1 The items checked in the priority search exercise were grouped to provide the following critical success factors:-

- A Quality of service
- B Tailored to individual needs or individualised service provision.
- C Promote integration and enhance quality of life
- D Cost

10.0 **PERFORMANCE REVIEW**

10.1 **CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTOR A - Quality of Service**

10.1.1 The satisfaction level is high for quality of service provided by the Mackinnon Centre. There were many positive comments made about the value of services provided, a typical comment being, "Puts you back in touch with everything in life you thought was gone".

Table 1

Critical Success Factors		Performance Indicators	Current Performance	
			Very Satisfied	Satisfied
A	Quality of Service	Percentage of users satisfied that service provided meets their expectations and needs	85%	12%

10.1.2 The Skills Centre currently has 174 users on the register. In the ten years since the Centre opened, 768 people referred are known to have left the service.

The reasons are:-

Inappropriate referrals	48
Achieved aims	197
Ill-health	211
Move to other service	87

Declined initial place	68
Poor attendance	35
Charging/Cost of Service	105
Other	<u>17</u>
	768

10.1.3 This range of outcomes reflects that for 495 users the Centre has provided a bridge to other things, or has provided a longer term means of maintaining them in the community for as long as possible. This is consistent with the aim outlined in para 6.1 above. The numbers who left due to charging did so over a short period of time. This was similar to changes elsewhere with department services. People were either reassessed or found other ways to meet their needs.

10.1.4 The large number of those who have engaged with the service have achieved their personal aim and this matches the Quality of Service performance.

10.1.5 With regard to respite, Scottish Office research in 1995 identified the poor availability of good quality respite provision for people with physical disabilities. The majority of resources were regarded as unsuitable as they are within long-term units, hospital settings or nursing homes. It further argued for the continuing development of specific respite facilities for people with disabilities as part of a range of resources. The Mackinnon Centre is still one of only a small number of such resources in Scotland.

10.1.6 A correlation between quality and satisfaction was evident in the assessment of the critical success factors - see Table 1 above and Table 2 below.

10.2 CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTOR B - Tailored to Individual Needs

Table 2

Critical Success Factors		Performance Indicators	Current Performance	
			Very Satisfied	Satisfied
B	Tailored to Individual Needs.	1 Percentage of Skills Centre users satisfied that content and delivery of skills programmes meet their individual requirements.	• 85%	• 13%
		2 Percentage of Ability Centre users satisfied with quality of information and advice given.	• 84%	• 16%
		3 Percentage of Respite Service users satisfied with availability and flexibility of respite.	• 93%	
		4 Percentage of carers satisfied with availability and flexibility of respite.	• 100%	

10.2.1 **Critical Success Factor - B1**

The Skills Centre programme allows the user to identify an area(s) of leisure or independent living activity in which they wish to develop a skill or interest. This may or may not be an activity they are already familiar with. The user in conjunction with the Skills Officer will identify an activity level and expected outcomes from the programme or modify it to match individual needs. The chosen activity then is the vehicle to achieve skill recovery, skill acquisition (or skill maintenance for those with degenerative conditions). The core skills and skill components are detailed in Appendix A.

Given the broad aim of maximising independence through personal achievement, the Mackinnon Centre will identify areas for improvement by the practice of constant review of individual programmes in conjunction with Care Managers. This will ensure that resources are appropriately targeted and to monitor the performance indicators identified through this review.

10.2.2 **Critical Success Factor - B2**

Although people who access Social Work and Occupational Therapy Services will be given information about the Ability Centre there may be many others who would benefit but who are unaware of the service.

Given the Council's statutory duty to provide information, the effectiveness of the Ability Centre's publicity needs to be evaluated. In addition, the Scottish Accessible Information Forum has just published standards for the provision of information for people with disabilities.

A review will therefore identify improvements. This review will take account of the Council's Information Strategy, the general commitment to community information networks and the current availability of other information outlets. Issues relating to the accessibility of the service will also be addressed within this review.

This will be undertaken by means of a research project linked to the Diploma in Community Care and a member of staff is being sponsored to carry this out.

10.2.3 **Critical Success Factor - B3**

The flexibility of choice available to those using the respite unit is extensive. Users can opt for occasional use or a regular pattern. Lengths of stays also vary from a few days to a fortnight. This is reflected in the positive comments and high level of satisfaction expressed. This flexibility in itself impacts with respect to occupancy levels. Although there were 136 users of respite and 440 separate admissions during 98/99 which reflect a steady increase over the last three years, occupancy was still just below the immediate target of 80%.

Further improvement and an expansion of the user base along with a review of the balance between flexibility and cost efficiency was required. The Centre has stopped booking single overnight stays as they generated occupancy inefficiencies. It expanded the user base by introducing a number of users with learning disabilities. The use of respite by Fife residents has further reduced operational costs for Dundee. In the financial year 1999/2000 it achieved 80% occupancy and anticipates that the new target of 85% will be met in the year 2000/2001.

10.2.4 **Critical Success Factor - B4**

The availability of respite is intended to reduce demand for other services, eg nursing home and residential care, by relieving stress as well as enriching the lives of users, many of whom are otherwise socially isolated. The development of direct support to carers is a potential means of enhancing this support. A carers support group has been formed and proposals for developing supported preparation stays for users and carers (to assist carers in developing their skills and understanding to manage disability) are underway. The fact that users, carers and Care Managers comment positively regarding the Centre is also a measure of the direct benefits of the service.

10.3 **CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTOR C - Promote Integration And Enhance Quality of Life**

Table 3

Critical Success Factors		Performance Indicators	Current Performance
			Satisfied
C	Promote integration and enhance quality of life.	Percentage of current users who report that they have acquired useful skills as a consequence of attendance at the Mackinnon Centre.	76%
	The above is aggregated from user satisfaction in one or more of the following areas:-		
		Getting out and about	61%
		Access employment	22%
		Leisure & Recreation	35%
		Education opportunities	35%
		Using shops, pubs and libraries	48%
		Pursuing hobbies	52%
	Managing at home	35%	

10.3.1 The fact that virtually all users of the Skills Centre are satisfied with the content and delivery of skills programmes, (Table 2) contrasts with the lower percentage who can identify the specific skills or abilities which they have acquired CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTOR - C). Given the emphasis which users put on “opportunities for self-achievement”, “dignity and respect”, and “maximising independence” (see Priority Search Results- Appendix B) it is perhaps not surprising that the general feeling of improved well-being can be more readily acknowledged than specific learning or its applications.

10.3.2 However, the Centre must continue to improve its focus and thus its performance against this indicator.

10.3.3 The absence of suitable transport, poor access and the lack of necessary personal care support are all reasons why people with physical disabilities have difficulty in

accessing various community facilities. This makes integration and social inclusion more difficult.

10.3.4 The Mackinnon Centre must continue to work with other groups and partnerships to create more opportunities for social inclusion and to change public attitudes towards disability. This will assist and support the development of resources which might be used either complementary or subsequent to attendance at the Mackinnon Centre.

10.3.5 Examples of working relationships which have been developed to promote the above are:-

- links with the Employment Disability Unit to provide advice on disability issues and to provide support to any users considering a return to employment (to our knowledge seven former users have left to take up employment).
- links with Anton House which provides recreation to ensure people have a range of experience. For some it also provides the opportunity to pursue an interest in the long-term when they no longer wish or require the structure of the programme at the Mackinnon Centre. Recreational facilities at the Mackinnon Centre are more focused allowing people to explore opportunities or may also be linked as part of a care programme.
- links with educational facilities to ensure users can follow through interest established at the Mackinnon Centre (approximately 25 had pursued education opportunities after having attended the Mackinnon Centre prior to the launch of the joint initiative with DCFE which has encouraged significantly more people, (others do so and also continue to attend the Mackinnon Centre).
- A range of links with the University of Dundee, Applied Computing Micro Centre, supporting work aimed to develop augmented communication systems for people with disabilities. This work is of major long-term significance to improve the integration of people with disabilities.

10.3.6 Although good, these links must be further strengthened to achieve continued improvement with regard to meeting individual requirements. The importance of assisting people to explore all options is acknowledged and this is identified within the continuous improvement proposals.

10.4 **CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTOR D - Cost**

	Critical Success Factors	Performance Indicators	Current Performance
			Operating Cost to the Council
D	Cost	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cost per service user per session (half day). • Cost per service user per week respite (based on 80% occupancy). • Cost per service user – Ability Centre 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • £35.06 • £623.12 • £25

10.4.1 Costs were comparable with other service providers. Targets have now been set for usage and throughput. The operational structure will be reviewed on an ongoing basis to ensure continuing operational efficiency. Job descriptions are being reviewed as vacancies arise to ensure that recruitment reflects the developing nature of the service. During the course of the review approximately £85,000 of staff costs have been removed by this process. The expansion of user groups into the areas of learning disabilities (already established in respite) and mental health (under discussion for day services during 2001) will produce further net savings to the department whilst improving service delivery.

10.5 **Added Value**

10.5.1 The Centre in its role as a community resource currently gives access to its facilities for a number of community groups which provide support, training or activities to specific interest groups of people with physical disabilities. This is seen to be in keeping with the general ethos of promoting the interests of people with disabilities. The Centre already has links with groups providing support to people with disabilities and other resource providers. It must continue to review the effectiveness of these links and to add to them by extending the use of the Centre by other groups in order to continue to be a focal resource for people with disabilities.

10.5.2 The facilities at the Mackinnon Centre are unique in the Dundee area and maximum use of these must be made. However, at certain times of day, particularly evening when the Centre is underused, opportunities exist for the Centre to become more of a community resource available for various activities both related and unrelated to skill development.

10.5.3 It is recognised that within the community there are many restrictions placed on people with physical disabilities. The Mackinnon Centre already provides disability awareness training. Involvement in the delivery of this training is creating life opportunities for a number of people with disabilities and will lead to income generation once established.

10.5.4 As part of the accreditation process the Ability Centre has met standards for display and demonstration equipment, advice and information set by the Disabled Living Centre Council. Accreditation also provides access to subsidised training and equipment from commercial outlets. In the 18 months since accreditation approximately £10,000 worth of demonstration equipment has been given or loaned to the Centre by virtue of its status.

11.0 **RESULTS OF COMPARISON**

11.1 The Mackinnon Centre is the only one of its kind in this geographical area providing the co-ordinated range of services designed to provide support to people with physical disabilities which enable them to improve and/or maintain independence. A substantial majority reported benefit against one or more factors within the consultation exercise.

11.2 **Summary of Day/Skills Services**

11.2.1 There are outwith Dundee facilities which provide broadly similar day services to people with a range of disabilities. Some of these were contacted for comparison purposes.

- 11.2.2 Cost and service comparisons have been made with four other Centres.
- 11.2.3 Detailed information is available in Appendix C.
- 11.2.4 Direct comparison has to take into account that the structure of services, the actual client group, the supplementary supports and local organisational links are all different.
- 11.2.5 Service A is the nearest comparable in terms of quality and range and has a similar cost. Any differences could reasonably be accounted for by smaller geographical catchment and smaller numbers.
- 11.2.6 Service B has a more limited range of services and is of lesser quality. They are aware of this and are in the process of planning a major service development in new premises within two years.
- 11.2.7 Service C use external staff to carry out structured work, with the Centre staff providing a base of day care. As cost of external staff is allocated elsewhere it does not show against Centre's unit costs to our knowledge.
- 11.2.8 Service D is cross subsidised from other areas of the organisation's activities. There is also a more fixed population of users with a strong day care focus.
- 11.2.9 Core time available for direct service delivery are similar. See Appendix E. The Mackinnon Centre operates the Skill Centre for 4½ days per week. The Centre staff are also involved in training, equipment demonstrations, disability awareness training and communication support which is focussed on the remaining ½ day. This time is also used for programme development, planning, supervision and community visits. Other Centres appear to deal with these issues by early closing or programming free time for staff. They do not appear to achieve the same degree of additional activity by these methods.
- 11.3 **Respite Care**
- 11.3.1 As regards respite care, facilities and services vary and the Mackinnon Centre compares favourably with all other benchmarked services. Detailed information is available in Appendix D.
- 11.3.2 Service A provides a service focused on a specific need and cannot provide regular respite.
- 11.3.3 Service B is included to make comparison with cost of good quality holiday accommodation. It cannot offer to meet individual needs.
- 11.3.4 Service C provides comparable quality of care. It is however part of a longer term care setting. On cost it is subsidised by the long-term unit which charges £749.
- 11.3.5 Services D and E provide care within a nursing home setting which imposes limits in the degree to which needs can be met given that the primary focus is on long-term care.

11.3.6 Services F and G provide a range of respite options not unlike the Mackinnon Centre. Service G was quoted as a model of excellence by the Scottish Office Research Report (1995).

11.4 **CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTOR A - Quality of Service**

11.4.1 Mackinnon Centre provides a service to the highest number of users both in overall usage and daily attendance. The daily figure is possible with the use of half day attendance. Service B commented that their limited ability to provide half day opportunities means some people are not fit enough to attend or alternatively have to 'rest' half of the day.

11.5 **CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTOR B - Tailored to Individual Needs**

11.5.1 The Mackinnon Centre is the only unit which requires a vocational qualification for its skills unit staff. It also provides specific attendant support to meet the individual care needs of users. The absence of this in Service B was acknowledged as a service shortfall and was regularly disruptive to service. This suggests that the quality of personal care and service input may be higher at the Mackinnon Centre, and there is a high level of user satisfaction on these factors.

11.5.2 Comparison of the Ability Centre was made with other Disabled Living Centres. Five of the six DLC's in Scotland are managed by the Local Authority. The remaining one is managed by the Health Service. Two other Centres run by Health Services have ceased to operate as DLC's within the last year.

11.5.3 The Dundee Carers Centre provides a general information service for people with disabilities. This Centre currently works with the Ability Centre to provide a complementary service but as it largely uses volunteers it cannot provide professional advice and information. The arrangement of having complementary arrangements is supported by the Scottish Office research report "Supporting Disabled People in Scotland" which argues against "one stop shops" with preference for better networking between organisations.

11.5.4 The Ability Centre and two other Centres have a dedicated member of staff responsible for providing information, advice and assessment whilst the others use Occupational Therapists to carry out this function as part of their range of responsibilities. In order to increase flexibility the Ability Centre offers appointments outside office hours for those who may have work or carer commitments.

11.6 **CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTOR C - Promote Integration and Enhance the Quality of Life**

11.6.1 Three of the other Centres as well as the Mackinnon Centre have close links with colleges who provide tutors for various courses within the Centres. In the other Centres educational staff are providing additionality as they are responsible for their particular group. Difficulties were reported as the Centre Management could not guarantee the availability or the timing of college staff. The links between the Mackinnon Centre and the Dundee College of Further Education have the specific aim of integration. The links with the University are aimed to improve practice and facilities through research.

11.6.2 Three Centres, including the Mackinnon Centre, are available to various other groups for evening use.

11.7 CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTOR D - Cost

11.7.1 Identified transport costs were only available for one other unit. It is believed that the Mackinnon Centre has the highest transport costs because it covers the largest geographical area and serves the largest population. (Perth & Kinross Council and Angus Council pay their transport costs as part of recharge arrangements).

11.7.2 The cost of service delivery at the Skills Centre generally matched the cost of services A and C which provide the nearest equivalent service comparison. Since this comparison, staff costs have been reduced at the Mackinnon Centre and the user base is expanding.

11.7.3 For respite care the costs advised reflect actual operating costs for D, E, F and G whilst A, B and C reflect charge to the customer/Authority. Charge to the customer may reflect different accounting or subsidy arrangements.

11.7.4 Mackinnon Centre has similar or cheaper costs to those providing comparable service.

11.8 Research

11.8.1 This report has drawn on information from;

- A priority search exercise which was conducted on current users, carers and other stake holders. Its aim was to establish the most important aspects of the service from the users' perspective.

In this exercise "staff who listen and communicate well", "being treated with dignity and respect", "the right to control decisions", "good communication between staff and users" rated most highly whilst "access to mainstream facilities", "additional facilities such as catering", "access to educational opportunities", "access to employment opportunities" rated lowest on the scale (full listing in Appendix B).

- The customer satisfaction survey following this showed a generally high level of satisfaction with the service. Lower figures were reported when users were asked to link the experience of attending the Mackinnon Centre with specific outcomes in their lives. Given that for the majority of people it is easier to acknowledge an experience of improved well-being rather than identify a specific improvement this is not surprising.
- The Scottish Office research report "Supporting Disabled People in Scotland – An Overview of Health and Social Work Services" by Kirsten Stalker and Stuart Reddish published in 1994. The report broadly concluded that services for people with disability were being given a low priority, there is insufficient flexibility in some services, support is generally based on 'need' rather than 'entitlement' and aspects of policies undermine one another eg costs of care.

11.8.2 Overall, the research concluded that planning should take into account the views of disabled people; good access to information will allow people to make informed choices; day facilities should focus on promoting independence; Independent Living Schemes, flexible domiciliary services, and good quality respite care are fundamental components of support to people with disabilities.

11.8.3 References are made throughout the report to these three items.

11.9 **Income Generation**

11.9.1 Detailed consideration of income generation was not part of the review group's original remit. However during the course of the review a number of income generation issues have emerged which require further consideration and decision and will be dealt with within the departmental review of charges for services.

11.10 **Conclusion**

11.10.1 The Mackinnon Centre provides a range of services which are not available in any other facility in the area. The service aims are consistent with Agenda 21 particularly;

“access to the skills, knowledge and information needed to enable everyone to play a full part in society”,

and the Council's values particularly;

“treat(ing) everyone with fairness, respect and dignity and take action where there is inequality”,

“form(ing) partnerships with any group or body which can make a positive contribution, and providing leadership and support as required”, and

“work(ing) as a team to offer a co-ordinated and effective service”.

11.10.2 Overall, satisfaction is high although links with other community resources require to be strengthened in a way which enables individuals to reach their full potential for independence, skills acquisition and integration in the wider community. Consultation indicates that the majority believe they have been assisted in one respect or more and receive a service which is suited to their individual needs. The Centre also continues to add to the range of services and facilities with whom it collaborates. Regular monitoring needs to be maintained in conjunction with Care Managers.

11.10.3 The Mackinnon Centre is an important and successful element of the service provision for people with physical disabilities. Its impact can only be evaluated when considered within the range of other services available eg Home Care, Personal Assistance Schemes and Long-term Residential Care as these are all components of the quality services which Dundee has established.

11.10.4 On the basis of information available the quality of service within the Skills Centre is as high as any other Centre provides and the content and structure of programmes is more substantial than most and the qualifications of staff are generally better. Costs were broadly similar bearing in mind the difficulties of obtaining like with like comparison. However the balance between skills staff and support staff must remain under review in order to adapt to changing demands.

- 11.10.5 Respite is intended to reduce demand for other services by relieving stress as well as enriching the lives of users many of whom are socially isolated. The model of respite at the Mackinnon Centre is one which is endorsed by research, provided at a high quality and at a cost which is competitive compared to other similar services.
- 11.10.6 The Ability Centre has been relatively recently established at the Mackinnon Centre following its transfer from the Nethergate. There is clearly need for improvement in how people become aware of what the service has to offer. Therefore an immediate leaflet and poster exercise is underway covering all Council and Health Service access points and specialist Housing Associations. Alongside this a comprehensive review of information service delivery will be undertaken.

12.0 OPTION APPRAISAL

Following the performance review and comparisons, the key issues considered are:-

12.1 To Cease to Operate the Centre

- 12.1.1 The removal of the Centre would result in more people at home with increased social isolation, greater pressure on carers, greater dependence and a degeneration of life skills. Dundee would also lose a physical resource, parts of which cannot be replicated elsewhere. It would create increased demands on health services and social care services and would be acting against social inclusion policy. All the users have been assessed as requiring day services or respite care. Alternative services would need to be commissioned to meet these needs.

12.1.2 This option is therefore rejected.

12.2 Operate Centre with a Focus on Employment Preparation

- 12.2.1 An employment focus would allow a narrower, more focused programme to be developed. Such programmes could potentially be extended to those whose needs do not require attendance at the Centre as it is currently. However, any such work potentially overlaps on work carried out by the Employment Disability Unit which exists exclusively for that purpose.
- 12.2.2 This shift would also be inappropriate for older service users and those with progressive illnesses who are looking to develop or maintain life skills. "access to employment opportunities" is the lowest ranked factor for current stakeholders whereas "opportunities for self-achievement" and "individual independence" are ranked highly (Appendix B). A broader life skills approach is also more likely to promote social inclusion and Agenda 21 objectives as well as reducing the burden on social care.
- 12.2.3 **This option is therefore rejected** as employment support is available elsewhere, eg EDU, and it would not address the needs of the vast majority of users. Nevertheless, strong links and regular sessions with EDU staff will be maintained.

12.3 **The Further Promotion Of Social Inclusion Linked To The Continuing Review of The Structure Of Day Services.**

12.3.1 **Option recommended is to continue to develop and improve the current model.** The Social Work Department have considered links and the availability of mainstream resources. Other resources do not provide similar support or access. They can work in a complimentary manner. The Centre has demonstrated consistently that it can support significant numbers of people to re-establish or maintain their community links. The staff can also work with a wide variety of other groups and services. Given the importance of this issue even greater emphasis needs to be placed on it in the programme of activities.

12.4 **Improved Support For Carers**

12.4.1 Options considered were; refer the issue to Care Managers, establish a carer's group, look to the Carer's Centre for input or to take no action. The absence of a formal support arrangements for carers of the Mackinnon Centre's users is acknowledged. Whilst the expectations and statutory responsibilities towards carers has increased, Care Managers are not in a position to provide the level of support which is required, whilst to date carers have not identified overall with the work of the Carer's Centre.

12.4.2 **The option to establish a carer's group within the Centre has been taken forward.** This will ultimately be self- supporting and make its own decisions regarding links with the Carer's Centre or other carer's support organisations.

12.5 **Improving Delivery of Information Services to People with Disabilities**

12.5.1 **Options have been considered and a decision has been made to undertake a detailed review of information services** as described elsewhere in the report. This review will consider the options and take forward recommendations for improving information services for people with disabilities.

12.6 **Further Improved Usage of Respite Care**

12.6.1 The options considered have been consideration of other models of respite care provision through the service comparison exercise, consideration of the opinions expressed in the Scottish Office Research Report and the consultation undertaken with current users.

12.6.2 Generally, the conclusion is that the current model of practice for the provision of respite care is a good one. However, consideration must be given, in consultation with Care Managers, as to the needs of those clients not currently accessing the Mackinnon Centre with the aim of ensuring that all service users who require respite have access to it in some form.

12.6.3 The option chosen is therefore to further develop the current model of provision.

13.0 **CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT PROPOSALS**

13.1 The Centre will be a linchpin in the community, co-ordinating services for people with physical disabilities by;

CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTOR A - Quality of Service

- 1 Continuing to expand the user base both in terms of numbers and geographical area. Aim to achieve 30 new users every year. (Proposals 9 and 12 also apply).
Manager
Mackinnon Centre By April 2002

CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTOR B1 - Tailored to Individual Needs

- 2 Reviewing staffing roles at such times as vacancies arise and restructure staffing to ensure that recruitment reflects changing service delivery needs. (As described in 10.8).
Service Manager By April 2002
- 3 Promoting awareness of the Ability Centre through strategic advertising in Council and Health Service access points, housing and disability groups, aiming to achieve increase of 20% in usage of Ability Centre and thus the provision of individual responses over the next two years by the above initiative.
Manager,
Ability Centre By Sept 2001

CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTOR B2

- 4 Formally reviewing the operation of the Ability Centre within the context of the Council's statutory duty to provide information to people with disabilities. This will achieve higher level of usage of information services. The review will be carried out by the Manager of the Ability Centre.
Manager,
Ability Centre By Sept 2001

CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTOR B3

- 5 (Proposal 1 applies).

CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTOR B4

- 6 Piloting and evaluating the use of carer preparation packages in the respite unit.
Manager,
Mackinnon Centre By Sept 2001
- 7 Formally establishing a carers support group for all Centre users by September 1999. (Proposals 9 and 12 also apply)
Manager,
Mackinnon Centre Completed

CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTOR C - Promote Integration and Enhance Quality of Life

- | | | | |
|----|---|------------------------------|--|
| 8 | Maintaining the current figures of users moving on from the Skills Service. A target of 30 was set for 1999/2000 and was met. We aim to increase this in year 2000/2001 by a further 20% and to continue at this level annually. | Manager,
Mackinnon Centre | By April 2002 |
| 9 | Continuing to provide disability awareness training with consideration being given to extending this service to departmental and Council staff by September 1999. The option of extending this to other public service and commercial outlets has now been developed. | Manager,
Mackinnon Centre | Already piloted.
New targets being established. |
| 10 | By supporting an increase in the number of voluntary organisations and community groups using the Mackinnon Centre to support people with disabilities. | Manager,
Mackinnon Centre | By April 2002 |
| 11 | Ensuring that all Skill Centre users are advised of the education and training options available to them. | Manager,
Mackinnon Centre | In place in review programme. |
| 12 | Supporting the initiative with Dundee College of Further Education to increase opportunities for people with disabilities to access education (this will include assisting in disability awareness training to education staff, providing an outreach access point for the college and providing information to people with disabilities via the Mackinnon Centre). | Manager
Mackinnon Centre | Launched
Autumn 1999 |

- | | | |
|--|--------------------------------------|--|
| <p>13 Ensuring that all Skill Centre users are advised of the support which is available to them towards employment. In pursuance of this, the Centre will continue to organise employment information sessions in conjunction with the Employment Disability Unit. To date a very small number of people have made use of this opportunity.</p> | <p>Manager,
Mackinnon Centre</p> | <p>In place in review process. First information event held July 1999.

Further event held in July 2000.</p> |
|--|--------------------------------------|--|

CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTOR D - Cost

(Proposals 1, 3 and 9 apply).

- | | | |
|--|--|----------------------|
| <p>14 Considering the criteria for use of the respite unit increasing the usage. The introduction of clients with a learning disability has broadened the user base in Dundee. Advertising has also encouraged more users from outwith Tayside thus increasing occupancy and income.</p> | <p>Head of Service
Service Manager</p> | <p>By Sept 2001</p> |
| <p>15 Increasing occupancy to 80% within this financial year with continuing increase in the following year. This target was achieved to April 2000. The aim this year is to achieve further increase towards 85% and to maintain at this level.</p> | <p>Manager,
Mackinnon Centre</p> | <p>By April 2002</p> |
| <p>16 This will have the overall effect of reducing unit costs by increasing usage both in terms of the volume of service provided and the numbers of users benefiting.</p> | | |

14.0 CONSULTATION

The Director of Social Work has been consulted on this report.

Current and previous users of the Mackinnon Centre, carers and care managers were consulted on this report.

15.0 BACKGROUND PAPERS

Resources Committee – 11 December 1997

16.0 SIGNATURE

Chief Executive

Date

Appendices

- Appendix A: Core Skills and Skill Components
- Appendix B: Priority Search Results
- Appendix C: Benchmarking Results (Skill Centre)
- Appendix D: Benchmarking Results (Respite Unit)
- Appendix E: Core Operating Time Comparisons

Drawing & Batik

Adventurousness / Experimentation
 Diplomatic Skills / Sensitivity
 Fine Motor Skills
 Hand-eye co-ordination
 Lateral thinking
 Mistake realisation
 Self advocacy/opinion forming
 Self Awareness

Crafts

Access Public Facilities
 Awareness
 Cleanliness
 Hygiene
 Initiative
 Measuring
 Money Management
 Perceptual Awareness
 Planning
 Social Skills
 Visual Awareness

Communications

Collaboration with Micro Centre & Speech & Language Therapy Departments
 Community Facilities Use
 Computer & Software Use
 Educational / Social Visits / Tours
 Game Based Exercises to improve Memory etc.
 Innovative Techniques
 Oral & Written Exercises
 Participating / Initiating Awareness
 Practical Crafts
 Preparing / Participation in Awareness Raising Workshops
 Raising Workshops
 Belief in own ability to change attitudes / break down barriers
 Use range of IT medias to effect such change.

Keyboard

Chord Identification
 Chord Sequencing
 Melodic / Chordal Interplay
 Rhythmic Identification
 Rhythmic Initiation
 Rhythmic Manipulation
 Sound Identification
 Sound Initiation

Music

Assessment Work
 Computer Access
 Disability Awareness Seminars
 Equipment Maintenance
 Hardware Drivers
 Harmonic Structure
 Historical Knowledge
 Idea Collation
 Instrument Layout
 Instrument Maintenance
 Listening Skills
 Melodic Structure
 Mental Challenges
 Module Structuring
 Music Awareness
 Musical Structuring
 Perceptual Awareness
 Physical Challenges
 Quantization Awareness
 Raw Material Collation
 Rhythmic Structure
 Social Skills
 Textural Awareness
 University Guest Lecturing.
 Volunteer Assessment
 Volunteer Monitoring
 Volunteer Placement

Access Community Facilities

Accountability Skills
 Community Safety
 Mobility in the Community
 Money Management
 Road Traffic Skills
 Social Stimulation
 Vulnerability

Animation - Video

Comprehension
 Self Awareness

CORE SKILLS - Encouraged in all Areas

Adaptation Equipment / Skills
 Awareness in General
 Behaviour Management
 Budgeting
 Cleanliness
 Cognitive Skills
 Communication listening / conversation
 Confidence building / Self Esteem
 Co-ordination Honing
 Creative Process Awareness
 Decision Making
 Dexterity
 Hygiene
 Imaginative
 Initiative Skills
 Judgement Skills
 Knowledge / Understanding of the Area Rules etc.
 Life Skills
 Literacy / Numeracy
 Memory
 Motivation
 Motor Skill Challenges
 Organisational Skills
 Problem Solving
 Reasoning Skills
 Resourcefulness
 Self Valuing Skills
 Sequencing Skills
 Social Awareness / Interaction
 Social Skills
 Team Work / Sharing
 Time Management
 Self-expression (visually / verbally) Concentration
 Health & Safety
 Mobility
 Spatial Awareness

Picture Framing

Accuracy
 Cleanliness
 Flexibility
 Planning
 Presentation Skills
 Quality Control
 Self Reliance

Photography

Mistake realisation
 Stamina
 Stress Management
 Upper Body Strength

Ceramics

Fine Motor Skills
 Hand-eye co-ordination
 Self Awareness
 Stress Management

Guitar

Barre Chords
 Bass Work
 Chord Theory
 Electric Guitar
 Equipment Theory
 Finger Picking Skills
 Flat Picking Skills
 Nylon String Changing
 Open Tunings
 Physical Features of Instrument
 Steel String Changing
 String Gauge Awareness
 Strumming Skills
 Tuning Practices & Procedures

Computer Work

Accessing Procedures
 Asio and Direct-X Awareness
 Comprehension
 Computer Awareness
Computer Graphics
 Computer Literacy
 Controlling Remote Devices
 Data Storage & Access Skills
 Flexibility
 Hand-Eye co-ordination
 Information Gathering Skills
 Innovation
 Interface Awareness
 Keyboard Skills
 Mastering Techniques
 MIDI Knowledge
 Mouse Skills
 Multi Media Awareness
 Planning
 Presentation Skills
 Production Skills
 Program Knowledge
 Sampling Knowledge
 Self Reliance
 Sound Construction
 Utilise Plug-Ins

General Health & Personal Presentation

Advice
 Birth Control
 Contraception Awareness
 Diet
 Emotional Support
 Health Awareness
 Hygiene
 Independent Living
 Links with Tayside Health Promotion Centre
 Physical Support
 Presentation Skills
 Self Assertiveness Skills
 Sexual Awareness
 Sexually Transmitted Diseases
 showering / Bathing
 Skin/Hair/Hand/Nail/Eye/Dental Care

Sports

Accepting Success / Defeat
 Awareness
 Encouraging / Supporting Others
 Initiative
 Participation
 Perceptual Awareness
 Responsibility as Captain
 Social Skills
 Tactics Training
 Visual Awareness
 Encouragement / Support
 Fitness
 Links with Community Sports Team
 Observation Skills
 Participation
 Perceptual Awareness
 Personal Ability Skills
 Stamina

Gardening

Foundation Building (Grounding)
 Planning
 Self Reliance
 Tool Use

Independent Living

Awareness of Services (doctors etc)
 Diet
 Home Management
 Hygiene
 Laundry
 Links with Dundee University Virtual Reality Shopping
 Menu Planning
 Public Transport
 Reading Recipes
 Repetitive Work (Memory)
 Shopping

Kitchen

Access Public Facilities
 Body Image
 Clock Reading
 Giving Choice
 Money Management
 New Ways of Working
 Shopping
 Weighing & Measuring
 Word Board
 Word Book
 Word Finding

Homecrafts

Concept of colour/texture, design, techniques
 Knowledge of craft materials & techniques
 required to achieve desired effect / finish
 Assessing value and pricing effectively for

Projects

working with other organisations & individuals
 Liaison with University on specific projects and
 Broughty Ferry Environmental Project
 Realisation of own potential to influence and effect
 social and political decision making process

Women's Issues Discussion Group

Taking Ownership of Dealing with own personal issues difficulties
 Joining with Other Women to Express and Exchange Experiences/Solutions
 Relaxation and Stress Management Techniques
 Practical Health

APPENDIX B

MACKINNON CENTRE - BEST VALUE REVIEW

PRIORITY SEARCH EXERCISE

Item Listing in Overall Order of Priority

Filename: swdisab

Item	Mean Rank	Std. Err.
Staff who listen and communicate well	10.5	0.74
To be treated with dignity and respect	10.9	0.81
Right to control decisions which affect my life	11.4	0.74
Good communication between staff and users	13.0	0.83
Facilities which maximise user's independence	13.3	0.76
Staff skilled and trained in disability awareness	13.6	0.88
Residential respite available when needed	13.8	0.91
Opportunities to meet other people socially	13.9	0.88
Opportunities for self-achievement	14.0	0.92
Maximising individual independence and potential	14.2	0.81
Comfortable and pleasant surroundings	14.5	0.85
Appropriate activities that people want	14.6	0.78
Accessible transport to a facility	14.8	0.92
Staff who you can feel confidence in	14.9	0.89
Be treated by staff as they'd wish to be treated	15.0	0.87
A fair cost	15.4	1.00
Opportunities to regain skills	15.6	0.90
Active user involvement in planning services	15.9	0.87
Access into and throughout the building	15.9	0.89
Access to specific skills tutors (eg art)	15.9	0.94
Opportunities to learn new skills	16.3	0.84
Access to advocacy, rights information and advice	16.4	0.94
Accessible and convenient location	16.8	0.82
Ongoing measurement of user satisfaction	17.2	0.86
Day Care facilities	18.2	0.92
Up-to-date equipment and technology	18.5	0.92
Helps users to access mainstream facilities	19.1	0.76
Having additional facilities such as catering	19.6	0.85
Access to educational opportunities	20.3	0.74
Access to employment opportunities	21.7	0.78

APPENDIX C

SKILLS CENTRE COMPARISON COSTS

MACKINNON CENTRE	A	B	C	D
<p>A £35.06 per half day session including transport. £25.51 per session excluding transport.</p> <p>B £30.05 per session including transport £21.87 per session excluding transport</p> <p>BUDGET = £473,307</p>	<p>(No session cost available).</p> <p>BUDGET = £494,700</p>	<p>£55.00 per day including transport.</p> <p>£35.00 per day excluding transport.</p> <p>BUDGET = £346,000</p>	<p>£41.50 per client per day.</p> <p>N.B. This figure is excluding transport costs.</p> <p>BUDGET = £460,000</p>	<p>£163.00 for 10 sessions. £16.30 per session.</p> <p>N.B. There is a substantial CROSS SUBSIDY from Residential Unit.</p>

NB Costing A is based on actual activity.

Costing B is based on official capacity (70 per day) using revenue budget and therefore will provide the most direct comparison with other services.

NO OF USERS / ATTENDANCE PER DAY

MACKINNON CENTRE	A	B	C	D
174 on register	80 on register	106 on register	86 on register	85 on register
66 attend per day (Combination of full day and part day attendance)	40 attend per day (Combination of full day and part day attendance)	25 attend per day (Full day service)	45 attend per day (Combination of full day and part day attendance)	? attend per day (Combination of full day and part day attendance)

NUMBER OF STAFF DELIVERING SERVICE

MACKINNON CENTRE	A	B	C	D
% Manager, Programme Planning Co-ordinator	Manager, Depute and Senior DCO	Manager and Depute	Manager, Team Leader and Senior DCO	1 Assessment Manager
Programme Planning Officer 7 F/T Skills Officers	9 F/T Day Care Officers	5 F/T Day Care Officers	9 Day Care Officers	9 F/T Day Care Officers 4 P/T Day Care Officers
5 P/T Attendants	No attendants in post although hoping to employ 2 F/T Care Attendants.	No dedicated attendants.	No dedicated attendants.	1 F/T Assistant Care Worker (Dedicated attendant).

TRANSPORT PROVISION

MACKINNON CENTRE	A	B	C	D
<p>3 F/T Drivers 1 F/T Escort 3 P/T Escorts</p> <p>All above are also involved in Care Support.</p> <p>3 buses for city pick ups. DCC funded taxis for Angus and Perth.</p>	<p>1 F/T Driver 2 P/T Drivers 3 P/T Escorts</p> <p>2 buses and "Chairman" accommodating 2/3 wheelchairs.</p>	<p>4 drivers and 4 escorts are available. However only 1 bus and 1 driver are housed at the Centre, the rest are part of the Council Fleet and are employed by the Transport Section.</p>	<p>10 Transport staff each contracted to 20 hours per week</p> <p>5 buses</p>	<p>2-4 buses</p>

APPENDIX D

RESPITE UNIT COMPARISONS

Service	Operating Cost pppw	Charge pppw	Facility
Mackinnon Centre	£640	£550	12 respite only
A		£490	14 bed holiday breaks for specific group with emphasis on nursing care.
B	£630	£630	Hotel accommodation – no personal care.
C	£586	£586	Respite provided within long-term care complex.
D	£400-£700	Varies depending on level of need	Respite care in long-term nursing home. (Cost linked to dependency).
E	£600-£700	Varies depending on level of need	2 respite places in 29 bed nursing home (cost linked to dependency).
F		£639	12 respite beds within 20 bed unit.
G	£650-£700		4 bed respite unit for parents with disabilities.

APPENDIX E

CORE OPERATING TIME COMPARISONS

CENTRE	STAFF HOURS	CLIENT HOURS	PLANNING TIME	SUPERVISION TIME	STAFF MEETINGS	STAFF TRAINING
WHITE TOP	8:45 – 5:00 5 days per week	9:15/9:30 – 3:00 5 days per week	8:45 - ?	Not happening as planned	Early morning – only time	None other than what is arranged centrally
KEMBACK STREET	8:45 – 4:00	8:45/9:00 – 3:00/4:00	Preparation time 2hrs / week / staff	1 x month during preparation time	Tuesday 3:30 p.m. difficult	2 / 3 full days per year
DUDHOPE	8:45 – 4:00	9:00 / 9:30 – 3:00 / 3:40	½ day / week / staff staggered	1 hour per month during file time	Whenever – very difficult	2 full days per year
C	8:45 – 4:15 ½ Hour lunch	9:30 – 3:30 3:00 on Friday	½ day per week for preparation and filing	Once in 6 weeks – ad hoc	Bi-monthly clients home at 1:30 on meeting days	Centrally provided – staff are released
A	8:45 – 4:15 ½ hour lunch	9:00 – 3:45 3:00 Friday	Rota for allocated time either morning or afternoon	Time allocated 3:00 onwards or 10:00 – 10:30	Friday 3:00 once a month staff meeting Centre closes at 2:00	Centrally provided staff are released
B	8:40 – 4:05 Mon to Thursday Friday 8:40 -2:00 / 3:00	9:00 approximately – 3:00	3:00 – 4:00 Mon to Thurs Once every 2 months full staff	Every two months one hour depends on programmes	Closed for 1 full day per year for planning	Personal Development Plan – In House 3:00 – 4:00
MACKINNON	8:45 – 5:00	9:15 – 4:00 Wednesday 12:15	Wednesday afternoon	Wednesday afternoon (rotational)	Wednesday afternoon or after 4:00	Wednesday afternoon in House or when centrally supplied.