

REPORT TO: PLANNING AND TRANSPORT COMMITTEE - 9 MARCH 2009

REPORT ON: ROAD MAINTENANCE AND MINOR WORKS PARTNERSHIP AGREEMENT

REPORT BY: DIRECTOR OF PLANNING & TRANSPORTATION

REPORT NO: 138-2009

1 PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 1.1 This report provides an update on progress and performance of the trial Road Maintenance Partnership between Dundee City Council and Tayside Contracts on the delivery of Road Maintenance and Minor Works Services and seeks approval to establish a formal Partnership for a period of 3 years.

2 RECOMMENDATION

- 2.1 It is recommended that the Committee:-
- a Agree to the establishment of a formal partnership scheme for a 3 year period to 31 March 2012.
 - b That the Director of Planning and Transportation be remitted to report back annually to Committee on the progress and performance the Partnership.

3 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- 3.1 There are no direct financial implications arising from this report.

4 BACKGROUND

History

- 4.1 Reference is made to Article IV of the Planning and Transport Committee of 13 August 2007 when approval was given for a two year extension of a trial partnership with Dundee City Council and Tayside Contract for the provision of a roads maintenance and minor works service. The present partnering agreement ends on the 31 March 2009, following what has been a successful extension period.

Progress

- 4.2 Following the approval to extend the partnership term, a Roads Maintenance Partnership Manager (RMP Manager) was appointed in January 2008, reporting to an Executive Board comprising of two senior officers from Dundee City Council and two senior officers from Tayside Contracts. Between January 2008 and April 2008 the Executive Board and RMP Manager, implemented a formal structure necessary for taking the Partnership forward, developed a partnership agreement and most importantly, identified the priority areas to be addressed.
- 4.3 Lessons learned from the Street Lighting Partnership were taken on board. It was recognised that for the Partnership to function most effectively, staff had to be fully integrated and work out of the same office. Alterations were made to existing accommodation at Tayside Contracts Fairmuir Depot and at the end of April 2008,

Dundee City Council roads maintenance staff moved into the combined road maintenance office.

- 4.4 Although the Executive Board and RMP Manager had identified areas for development, a workshop was set up in mid April 2008 involving everyone at all levels within the Partnership. Following the day long workshop, priority areas for development were identified and working groups set up to move them forward. The immediate priority areas identified for development were:
- a **Service Integration:** Review duplication of processes, look at current process and map what happens to establish better systems.
 - b **Service Improvement: - Gully cleaning operation:** Establish a system that records the cleaning of gullies more accurately and makes best use of existing resources.
 - c **Service Improvement - Annual, collection of grit bins:** Review of the current practice of collection and distribution of grit bins on an annual basis.
 - d **Pothole Repairs:** Review of current procedures for pothole repairs from identification to completion, with a view to establishing KPI's for repairs.
 - e **Asset management:** Establish a computerised asset management system and the production of a Roads Asset Management Plan.

These areas have developed well over the period and details of progress are included in Appendix 1.

- 4.5 As well as the areas identified above, the partnership has continued the development of areas previously identified in the August 2007 report. Continuing to know the committed levels of work has allowed Tayside Contracts to invest in dual purpose vehicles that can be used for operational and winter services and this has resulted in a reduction of winter services operating costs. GPS recording equipment in main line gritters has continued to show its value in dealing with public liability claims and monitoring the level of service. The jointly operated monitoring system for winter maintenance operations has been expanded further to include the recording of grit bin information, removing the need for reconciliation of costs, thereby considerably reducing administration and staff time as well as providing daily updates of actual costs.
- 4.6 The integration of staff within the same office has been paramount to the progress and in developing the areas above. Although not as easy to identify direct benefits, it is clear that communication of information first hand and joint working has assisted in delivering a more coherent service.

Performance - Key Performance Indicators

- 4.7 In order to monitor the progress and performance of the Partnership a set of Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) have been developed. This will enable the Partnership to monitor self improvement but also compare against other local authorities. KPI's relating to the approved Service Plan 2007–2011 have been monitored and financial KPI's have been established for various structural maintenance works and also minor works. The results of these are included in Appendix 1 but in summary, the Partnership is performing well and achieving most of the targets set.

- 4.8 The Partnership is a member of the Highway Works Benchmarking Club and a member of APSE (the Association of Public Sector Excellence) and it is proposed to develop comparisons against other local authority road services in due course.

Future Areas to be Developed

- 4.9 A number of further areas of potential development have been identified and will be actively pursued.
- Review the winter maintenance service provision, with a view to rationalising mainline and footway gritting routes.
 - Joint working group set up to rationalise winter services standing charges.
 - Following successful laboratory trials, continue to progress the potential use of ash waste from the Baldovie Waste to Energy Plant in bituminous mixes.
 - Potential composting of waste products from the reed bed recycling system for gully waste thereby avoiding sending this waste to landfill.
 - Continue the review of the current procedures for pothole repairs with a view to using alternative repair materials and expanding the use of the Rapid Rhino first-time 'permanent' repair system and other proprietary methods.
 - Continue to work together to establish further KPI's and drive down the unit cost of repairs, reinvesting savings back into the road network.
 - Gain national recognition for the Partnership's levels of service and service approach to Road Maintenance provision.
 - Continue to establish a computerised asset management system and produce a Roads Asset Management Plan.

5 CONCLUSION

- 5.1 The continuation and further development of the partnering arrangement is seen as a crucial step in freeing up staff resources to move forward other road maintenance initiatives, offering opportunities for continued efficiency savings.
- 5.2 The Partnership has developed well over the past 2 year period and there are many positive developments and improvements either taking place or identified for review. It is therefore proposed to agree a new partnership scheme based on the success of the pilot arrangement. In order to fully realise potential developments, it is recommended that a 3 year partnering arrangement be agreed to March 2012, with an annual report produced detailing the progress, performance and achievements of the Partnership.
- 5.3 The establishment of the partnership also meets the Scottish Government objectives to increase partnership working in line with its Efficient Government agenda.

6 POLICY IMPLICATIONS

- 6.1 This Report has been screened for any policy implications in respect of Sustainability, Strategic Environmental Assessment, Anti-Poverty, Equality Impact Assessment and Risk Management. There are no major issues.

7 CONSULTATIONS

- 7.1 The Chief Executive, Depute Chief Executive (Support Services), Depute Chief Executive (Finance), Assistant Chief Executive (Community Planning) and the Managing Director of Tayside Contracts have been consulted and are in agreement with the contents of this report.

8 BACKGROUND PAPERS

- 8.1 Report No 294-2007 to the Planning and Transport Committee of 13 August 2007.

Mike Galloway
Director of Planning & Transportation

Fergus Wilson
City Engineer

FW/DMcK/EH

17 February 2009

Dundee City Council
Tayside House
Dundee

PROGRESS AND PERFORMANCE REPORT

1 Priority Areas Developed to Date

1.1 **Service Integration**

- a In April 2008, the partnership moved from contract rated work to an open book actual cost reimbursable arrangement, with any efficiency savings reinvested in maintaining the road network.
- b Payment processes between Dundee City and Tayside Contracts were reviewed and systems put in place to ensure payment certificates were passed and processed without delay. This enables the partnership to keep a better control of expenditure and management of budgets and ensures the cash flow to Tayside Contracts is maintained reducing any unnecessary overdraft payments. As the works are checked and agreed before payment is raised, this reduces staff time in checking and amending payments. This is an ongoing process and is continually being reviewed to ensure maximum efficiency of staff is being achieved.

1.2 **Service Improvement – Gully Cleaning Operations**

- a With in excess of 20,000 gullies requiring to be cleaned twice a year within Dundee City, and the current resource of two gully machines only able to clean approximately 18,000 twice annually, a group was remitted to review the process from first principles.
- b Involving operatives engaged on a daily basis, the working group were asked to review current beats, establish how often the gullies are cleaned, how often they need to be cleaned, what areas are not covered by the current beats, identify black spots etc.
- c This review process is ongoing and it is intended to revise the current policy to meet the actual cleaning requirements, with the resource available and still maintaining a quality service. The use of GPS on gully emptying vehicles has been introduced to help monitor the service, obtain a clear record of how many and where the gullies are and develop an improved emptying regime based on need rather than frequency. Information gathered from the GPS will be used in the development of the asset management system and plan.

1.3 **Service Improvement – Annual collection and distribution of grit bins**

- a The annual collection and distribution of grit bins costs approximately £80,000 per annum. The Partnership decided to review the collection and distribution policy with a view to not collecting and distributing the grit bins in 2008/09 and therefore reducing the annual costs.

- b Criteria were established with regards what would necessitate bringing in a grit bin if a complaint was received. Following the establishment of the criteria, a decision was taken in early May 2008 to trial leaving the 600 plus grit bins out on site.
- c Over the period of May to October 2008, (when there would normally be no grit bins on the street), the partnership received approximately twenty calls from members of the public and elected members asking why the grit bins had not been collected. Of the twenty calls received and following discussions, only six bins were required to be uplifted.
- d At the beginning of October the grit bins were inspected for damage to determine any replacement requirements and also to establish which needed to be filled in preparation for winter. The net saving following replacement and topping up which would normally be carried out at redistribution was £60,000. Only 15 bins required to be replaced.
- e Based on the success of this trial, it would be the intention to leave the grit bins out in future and monitor closely the amount of queries/complaints and how many bins required to be collected. This associated with any damage and topping up would continue to be monitored and evaluated.

1.4 Pothole Repairs – Review current procedure for pothole repairs

- a Potholes within the road network have always been at the centre of complaints in relation to the condition of the roads. They also contribute to a large number of public liability claims received by Dundee City Council.
- b In order to address this priority issue, the partnership carried out a complete process review of how potholes were identified, prioritised for repair, repaired and monitored. A group was set up to review the current process, engaging all involved, and using the new road maintenance code of practice, 'Well-maintained Highways' as a guide to developing new criteria. This resulted in the establishment of the following revised classification of category 1, 2 and 3 potholes along with acceptable response targets which are set at a higher level than that suggested within the code of practice.

Revised Criteria for Category 1, 2 & 3 potholes

Pothole Category	Target time for Repair	Performance Target %
Category 1	Repair within 3 hours	90%
Category 2	Repair within 3 days	85%
Category 3	Repair within 28 Days	80%

- c The table below details how many potholes have been identified between October and December 2008, with the targeted response and actual response information. This information ties in with the approved Departmental Service Plan 2007–2011 key objective of *"Improving the overall management and maintenance of the road asset"*.

Category 1, 2 & 3 Potholes Identified and Completed - October to December 2008

	Cat 1 (3Hrs) Identified & Completed	Cat 2 (3 days) Identified & Completed	Cat 3 (28 days) Identified & Completed	Total Identified & Completed
Oct 08	5 (5 100%)	77 (77 100%)	290 (270 93%)	372 (352 95%)
v 08	3 (3 100%)	51 (51 100%)	338 (326 97%)	392 (380 97%)
Dec 08	17 (17 100%)	90 (90 100%)	162 (132 82%)	269 (239 89%)
Total	27	218	790	1035

- d The Partnership is continuing to review and develop the pothole process, a policy/guidance document is being prepared detailing the various classification criteria and how it is to be dealt with. Ongoing development is taking place considering alternative processes, materials to be used in repairing potholes and the continuing use of the rapidrhino system to carryout permanent repairs first time.

Summary of Rapidrhino first time permanent pothole repairs – April to December 08

Rapid rhino (2008/ 09)	Apr 08	May 08	Jun 08	July 08	Aug 08	Sep 08	Oct 08	Nov 08	Dec 08	Total
No. in Month	183	228	272	127	181	284	109	128	137	1649
Ave Per/Day	12	14	17	16	14	18	18	14	12	13.5

- e Although it has not been possible to establish if the revised strategy of dealing with potholes has had a direct correlation in reducing public liability claims received, it is the intended to monitor this closely with the Council's insurance team through quarterly reviews.

1.5 Asset Management

The Asset Management of the Council's road related assets is currently being developed through SCOTS (the Society of Chief Officers for Transportation for Scotland) on behalf of all Scottish Roads Authorities including Dundee City Council. The aim is to develop a common roads asset management framework across Scotland. A consultant was appointed in early 2008 on a four year commission to assist in the development of the framework. Dundee City Council is represented by the Depute Roads Maintenance Partnership Manager on the SCOTS task group taking this forward. A computerised asset management system has now been purchased and will be populated with inventory in due course. Winter maintenance gritting routes have been added to the system which will assist in route optimisation. Road and footway inspection regimes are being reviewed against the new Code of Practice with the intention of the routes being rationalised and included in the system.

2 Progress Against Departmental Service Plan Objectives

Detailed below are further KPI's measured which tie in with the approved Departmental Service Plan 2007–2011.

2.1 Achieve Best Value in the procurement of road maintenance works

- Average cost of a pothole repair
- Average cost per metre square of carriageway resurfacing

Average Cost	2007/08 (Actual)	2008/09 (Target)	2008/09 (Actual)
Pothole patch repair (temporary)	£26.27	£28.63	£23.27
Pothole patch repair (Permanent - Rapidrhino)	£50.89	£55.47	£37.93
Square metre of carriageway resurfacing	£17.49m ²	£19.06m ²	£16.84m ²

Although there has been a reduction in costs in these areas, comparison with other authorities is required, to obtain a true measure. Work is continuing to establish KPI's associated with the Highway Works Benchmarking Club, along with those measured by the Association of Public Sector Excellence (APSE) and the Society of Chief Officers Transport Scotland (SCOTS). It is evident that work is required to ensure KPIs are developed with these bodies that can be measured and compared consistently across authorities.

2.2 Minimise the adverse impact road maintenance has on the environment

The use of recycled materials is well established on Dundee City Council road maintenance schemes and this has continued to be driven forward throughout the Partnership. No virgin aggregates are used in footway or carriageway sub base layers with recycled materials being used instead. Tayset has been approved for use in all footway works and selected carriageway schemes, demonstrating both financial and environmental savings.

Use of Recycled Material	April 07 to Dec 07 (2007/08)	April 08 to Dec 08 (2008/09)
Material returned for Recycling	6663T	7577T
Recycled Sub Base Used	2909T	3145T

Potential Saving with use of Tayset in Footways in 2009/10:-

Proposed Binder In Footway (2009/10)	Environmental Saving @ 25Kg CO ₂ Per/t	Financial Saving @ £7 Per/T
1920T	= 48,000Kg CO ₂	= £13,440.00

Potential Saving with use of Tayset in Carriageways in 2009/10:-

Proposed Binder In Carriageway (2009/10)	Environmental Saving @ 25Kg CO ₂ Per/t	Financial Saving @ £7 Per/T
7340T	= 183,500Kg RCO ₂	= £51,380.00

Combined footway and carriageway savings in 2009/10 of:-

Proposed Binder In Footway & Carriageway (2009/10)	Environmental Saving @ 25Kg CO ₂ Per/t	Financial Saving @ £7 Per/T
9260T	231,000Kg CO ₂	£64,829.00

3 Other Key Performance Indicators

Summary of Roads Maintenance Partnership Average Cost of Repair/sqm for Structural Works

Information for 2008/09 - April 08 to December 08

JOB TYPE	2007/08 Actual for all Jobs	2008/09 Target RMP Jobs	2008/09 Actual RMP Jobs
FOOTWAY WORKS	£29.12	£31.74	£34.48
OVERLAY	£12.28	£13.39	£12.41
RESURFACING	£17.49	£19.06	£16.84
RETREAD	Not available	£11.68	£9.80
NIMPACTOCOTE	Not available	£6.82	£6.70
RALUMAC	Not available	£4.81	£5.20
STANDARD PATCHING	£49.37	£53.81	£33.07
RHINO PATCHING	£28.85	£31.45	£33.22

Summary of Roads Maintenance Partnership Costs for Minor Works

Information for 2008/09 - April 08 to December 08

JOB TYPE	2007/08 Actual for all Jobs	2008/09 Target RMP Jobs	2008/09 Actual RMP Jobs
MONTHLY GULLY ORDERS	£4.24	£4.62	£4.35
MONTHLY POTHOLE ORDER	£26.27	£28.63	£23.27
MONTHLY RAPIDRHINO ORDERS	£50.89	£55.47	£37.93